BEFORE THE

NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

THE TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

and

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER,
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA (GET-UP) A/W AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

Case No. 04-RC-199609

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice, before THE HONORABLE MARY LEACH, Hearing Officer, at the National Labor Relations Board, Region 4, 615 Chestnut Street, 7th Floor, Courtroom 3, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, on Tuesday, June 20, 2017 at 10:31 a.m.
APPENDICES

1 On Behalf of the Employer:
2
3    DANIEL V. JOHNS, ESQ.
4    MEREDITH SWARTZ DANTE, ESQ.
5    BALLARD SPAHR LLP
6    1735 Market Street
7    51st Floor
8    Philadelphia, PA 19103
9
10 On Behalf of the Petitioner:
11
12    AMY ROSENBERGER, ESQ.
13    WILLIS, WILLIAMS & DAVIDSON
14    1845 Walnut Street
15    24th Floor
16    Philadelphia, PA 19103
17
18
19
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WITNESS</th>
<th>DIRECT</th>
<th>CROSS</th>
<th>REDIRECT</th>
<th>RECROSS</th>
<th>VOIR DIRE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JOSEPH TUROW</td>
<td>887</td>
<td>917</td>
<td>957</td>
<td>958</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORA LEWIS</td>
<td>967</td>
<td>976</td>
<td>991</td>
<td>992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer's:</th>
<th>EXHIBITS</th>
<th>IDENTIFIED</th>
<th>RECEIVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E-27</td>
<td></td>
<td>898</td>
<td>898</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-28</td>
<td></td>
<td>917</td>
<td>917</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Union's:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EXHIBITS</th>
<th>IDENTIFIED</th>
<th>RECEIVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P-37</td>
<td></td>
<td>927</td>
<td>927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-38</td>
<td></td>
<td>937</td>
<td>937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-39</td>
<td></td>
<td>987</td>
<td>987</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE REPORTER: Back on the record.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The employer can call its next witness.

MS. DANTE: Thank you. The employer calls Joe Turow.

MR. TUROW: Hello.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Hi.

MR. TUROW: Do I sit over there?

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yep.

Good morning.

MR. TUROW: Good morning.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your first and last name?

MR. TUROW: Yes, J-o-s-e-p-h, that's Joseph, not Joe, but anyway, and then T-u-r-o-w, T as in Tom.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you raise your right hand?

MR. TUROW: Yes.

JOSEPH TUROW, WITNESS, SWORN

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Ready.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. DANTE:

Q Morning, Dr. Turow.

A Morning.
Where are you currently employed?

At the University of Pennsylvania, the Annenberg School for Communication.

Okay. What's your current position in the Annenberg School of Communication?

I'm the Associate Dean for Graduate Studies, I'm also a chair professor at the Robert Lou Sham (ph), Professor of Communication.

How long have you been associate dean of graduate studies?

I think it comes out to about eight or nine years, I forget exactly, but most recently the last three years.

Okay. What are your responsibilities as the associate dean of graduate studies?

My responsibilities are to bring in the best possible group of graduate students that we can have, doctoral students to help move them through the program, and encourage them to do the best work they can do, and hopefully get them the best jobs they want.

Do you sit on any university governance committees?

I'm presently among the grad dean's council.

What's the grad dean's council?

It's a meeting that's chaired by Vess Winklestein (ph) who's the vice provost for education and various deans and graduate programs get together to talk about issues across the campus relating to graduate study.
Q Who else sits on that committee?
A All the associate deans for graduate studies running the doctoral programs at the university.
Q So are there representatives from Wharton on that committee?
A The Wharton Doctoral Program.
Q And what about engineering?
A Yes.
Q Can you tell me a little bit about your graduate education?
A Yes. My personal -- oh, mine personally or the --
Q Your education, undergraduate and graduate.
A Oh, my education, okay. I got a BA in English at the University of Pennsylvania, a master's in communication the University of Pennsylvania, and a Ph.D. from Penn. So I've been at Penn a long time.
Then I taught at Purdue and -- for about ten years and now I'm back here at Penn.
Q So how long have you been at Penn?
A As a professor since 1986.
Q Okay. And as a professor, do you currently teach and interact with graduate students?
A All the time.
Q Can you give us a little bit of background about Annenberg?
A Yes. The Annenberg is the smallest school I believe at Penn. We're only a doctoral program. We have an undergraduate program of arts and sciences, but our goal is to create doctoral students who specialize in communication. The school goes back to the late 1950s.

Q What type of graduate degrees does Annenberg offer?

A We only offer a doctoral degree in communication now.

Q Would you consider Annenberg to be interdisciplinary?

A That's what we are, the core of what we are, interdisciplinary. We have people who are faculty from -- who have Ph.D.'s and a variety, there is anthropology, sociology, as well as communication.

Q Do students at Annenberg collaborate with students and faculty outside of the school?

A Yes.

Q Can you give any examples of that?

A Well, we have faculty, for example, who are working with people in engineering now, doing work in -- working with engineering professors. We have students all the time who are taking courses across the university, because we encourage that as part of our interdisciplinary.

You can take six classes, at least six classes which Annenberg will pay for anywhere in the university. We have students taking law classes, anthropology classes, Africano studies classes, cinema studies classes. We have -- and if
students need to take statistics or other methods classes, we will pay for that over and above often times the six classes.

So in the sociology department, a lot of our students take statistics. In Wharton, they take statistics, biomedical statistics, every now and again.

Q  Okay. Do you know whether Annenberg is grouped with SAS, SP2, design, BGF, education and nursing for any educational purpose?

A  Not that I know of.

Q  Let's talk a little bit about the Ph.D. students in Annenberg. Do they receive funding packages?

A  Yes.

Q  Is the funding package typically laid out in an admission letter?

A  Yes, we have an admissions letter.

Q  Okay.

A  Thank you.

Q  Do you recognize this document?

A  Yes.

Q  Can you tell me what it is?

A  Yeah, this is the admissions letter that is sent to any student we admitted was sent in February.

Q  Okay. When does the funding for a student typically start?

A  With the beginning of the fall semester.
Q And I see a list of components in this financial aid sort of package. Can you walk us through what each of these are starting with the full tuition scholarship?
A Sure. We offer as part of the package that we give to students if they come, a full tuition scholarship, meaning they don't have to pay for any of the classes that they take as part of the program. We offer individual student health insurance, the school pays for that.
Q So is that -- sorry to interrupt.
A Yeah.
Q But so does Annenberg provide a subsidy for its Ph.D. students --
A Yes.
Q -- health insurance subsidy?
A Yes.
Q Okay.
A Yeah, the subsidy is the tuition scholarship and the student health insurance plus shared office space, which is a great thing, including as it says a computer, cook-work station and access to the university library. People don't realize that Penn has an incredible library. The ability to have access to the University of Pennsylvania library is unbelievable.
And then we do have yearly research and travel funds.
$1,200 are just the beginning. These are funds for students
who travel to conferences to present papers, and if they travel
temporarily they get more money, I believe up to $500 more
now. So you can get up to $1,700 for travel to conferences.
Q You mentioned that they travel to present papers. Are
these their own papers?
A Typically, yes.
Q And why do you offer these travel funds?
A The goal of the school is to help our students get the
best jobs that they can get and want to get. And often times,
the way of building of a reputation, getting to know people in
the area of academia, all of that takes place through
conferences, knowing what programs are like, and other places
around the world as well as in the U.S. and so many of our
students take advantage of that.
Q Okay. So next I see stipends. Can you explain what the
stipend is?
A Yeah, stipend is the amount of money a student will get on
a monthly basis. We offer $31,000 a year. That includes
$4,000 in summer funding.
Q Okay. And putting aside the summer stipend for a moment,
and focusing on the academic year stipend --
A Uh-huh.
Q -- is the amount of academic year funding tied to
activities in which a student is engaged?
A No, not in any specific way. In other words, you get the
funding no matter what you do as long as you're a student in good standing.

Q Is that the only condition on which they receive this stipend funding?
A Yes. We have a certain idea of what it means to be a student in good standing at Annenberg, and if you fulfill that educational trajectory, you will continue to get your funding.

Q So does the amount change depending on whether the student is engaged in teaching activities or performing research?
A No.

Q Is the stipend essentially uniform throughout the four years?
A It may go up.

Q Okay. When would it go up?
A If the dean figures he has the money to do it.

Q Okay.
A Yeah.

Q And moving on to summer funding, can you explain what the summer funding is for?
A Yeah, the summer funding was a way that the faculty and the dean decided would help our students to create the kind of dossier they needed to get jobs. So essentially what it is, the student has ability to take a paper that he or she wrote during the regular school year, turn it into a publishable document, a conference paper, work on a proposal towards a
dissertation, anything that will help the student to work
toward their end goals.

Q So students can receive this $4,000 simply to pursue their
academicals?
A Yes, virtually everybody gets it.

Q Is there any service requirement for that funding?
A No.

Q Are you aware, speaking of the summer, are you aware of
any Ph.D. students spending time outside of Philadelphia this
summer?
A Many.

Q Can you give me some examples?
A Sure. I'm going to a conference tomorrow and at least two
of my students are going there as well, totally separate from
me, they're presenting individual papers. It's going to be in
Ottawa, Canada.

We have a number of students going on what we call summer
culture, which is part of the cultural studies program. And a
group of like seven to ten students, I forget how many, are
going with two professors. This year it's to Vancouver, and
the students are doing research into various aspects of culture
that they are interested in.

They come back, they write a paper. Oftentimes they'll
present the paper, some of them get them published, and they
often have a long day conference at Annenberg to present what
they've learned.

Q  Okay. Does Annenberg require its Ph.D. students to provide the school with summer mail addresses?

A  No.

Q  How do you typically communicate with your students?

A  E-mail.

Q  Okay. And looking back at the admission letter, Employer 27 --

A  Uh-huh.

Q  -- I see there's another bullet point that is a dissertation research fellowship. Can you explain what that is?

A  Yes. That is a 12-month money for a student who will simply do her dissertation over the course of 12 months.

Q  Is the funding conditioned on anything?

A  Just having a proposal ready for dissertation.

Q  So there's no service requirement associated with this stipend?

A  No.

Q  Do your students typically engage in teaching activities at Penn during this dissertation research year?

A  They're not allowed to. If they do teaching, they have to stop doing the dissertation in order to be able to teach.

Q  What's the purpose of the four year stipends and the dissertation research fellowship?
A The purpose is to help the students get jobs frankly. I mean, the -- you cannot get a good job at a university or even a college today without having training in teaching and/or research. It is simply -- it would be irresponsible of us not to have these kinds of activities to help our students.

Q And what's the purpose of providing them with the funding while they pursue their degree?

A So that they will not have to do other things in order to be able to survive.

Q What if a student comes in with his or her own funding, what happens then?

A With our school, we actually encourage them -- we allow them to keep the funding. So the feeling was that we want our students to try to get as many awards and fellowships as possible, it's good for them, it helps them get jobs down the line.

So, for example, we have students coming from Canada who have Canadian fellowships. They get that money and they keep that money above and beyond the stipends that Annenberg gives them.

Q So you don't use that additional external funding to offset the stipends you provide?

A No.

Q Okay. The next paragraph in Employer 27 describes teaching and research fellowships. Is that -- are those
fellowships an academic requirement of the Ph.D. degree in Annenberg?

A Yes, they are.

Q Okay.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union object to Employer 27?

MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Employer 27 is received.

(Employer's Exhibit No. 27 received)

(Pause)

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

BY MS. DANTE:

Q Mr. Turow, do you recognize what I've marked as Employer 28?

A Yes, ma'am.

Q Can you tell us what this is?

A Yeah, this is the graduate curriculum on our website, the Annenberg School's website.

Q Okay. Focusing on the Ph.D. program, can you explain the general degree requirements for your students at Annenberg?

A Yes. As it says, the students are required to have 20 classes, you can transfer up to five of them. And as it also says, we have a pro-seminar which is now non-credit, as well as introductory classes in methods and statistics.

Beyond that, students are not required to take any
particular courses. The courses are -- the selection of courses are made with the help of the student's advisor over time, and really we want our students to create a curriculum that fits the needs that each person has.

Q When do Annenberg Ph.D. students actually take courses?
A Through the period they -- from the time they come into the school until the time they pretty well start their dissertation.

Q Okay. So if we turn to the next page, you talked a little bit about coursework, let's move on to some of the other requirements.
A Uh-huh.

Q I see a qualifications evaluation. Can you explain what that is?
A Yeah. That's a university mandated activity, typically at the end of the second year. It's simply an activity for which the graduate studies committee together with the faculty who have worked with the student make a determination as to whether the student can continue in the program, whether she or he can do doctoral level dissertation research.

Q Okay. And then the next thing I see is a dissertation. Can you explain what a dissertation is?
A A dissertation is a research project that is typically written up as a major research activity, hopefully with contributions to the field.
Q Okay. And then moving down to beyond the classroom section, I see a reference to research and teaching fellowships.

A Yes.

Q Are those fellowships the same fellowships referenced in the admission letter?

A Yes.

Q And are these fellowships part of the graduate curriculum?

A Yes, they are.

Q Do you know what the average time to degree is for a Ph.D. student in Annenberg?

A It varies. We want to bring it down a bit, but right now it's about I believe 5.8, 5.7 years.

Q Okay. Let's talk a little bit about research. Are Annenberg Ph.D. students required to engage in their own independent research?

A Yes, they are.

Q So going back to this beyond the classroom, let's start with research fellowships first. Why is the research fellowship part of the academic curriculum?

A A research fellowship is a training situation where a graduate student works with a faculty member to learn how to do research. What I tell students, when they come into Annenberg, that it may look like your undergraduate situation, there are chairs, there are -- there's a classroom, there's a
What you're learning to do now is to create knowledge. Whereas, an undergraduate typically what you do is you synthesize knowledge, you may regurgitate knowledge. And so what's happening here is a very different experience and students have to learn how to do that. And as a part of the way they learn it is through these research fellowships.

Q When students first come to Annenberg, do they necessarily know what their dissertation may be?
A No.

Q So can you walk us through the process of research at Annenberg starting at the beginning?
A Sure. A student comes in, they typically have ideas of what they care about, they have to write a goal statement, they take pro-seminar, they learn about the various faculty interests. They then take both classes and fellowships and through both of them they learn techniques, they learn ways to think about research, they learn how to actually actualize research, write up papers, even create grants, and hopefully by the end of their third year, they're pretty well ready to start thinking about a dissertation proposal, which will bring together a lot of the ideas that they've gotten through those activities.

Q And you mentioned research techniques. When they're learning these techniques, are they learning these through
their research fellowships?

A Yes. So, for example, Emily Faulk is a professor at Annenberg who does work on FMRI machines, the ways in which you can use brain scanners to look at how people are persuaded and what parts of the brains light up. And it's a new and fascinating area of research.

She brings students in to learn this stuff really from scratch. And it's a technique that's quite sophisticated. They work with people in engineering, they work with people elsewhere in the university. In fact, the machines they work in some of their offices are over at the Richards Building not even in the Annenberg School. That takes a lot of learning.

Q What's the Richards Building?

A It's a building in the biomedical complex of the university.

Q Okay.

A And they've converted that building, as I understand it, into a multi-disciplinary area for FMRI research. It's quite amazing. And so to learn this kind of stuff you have to do it together with a team, and that's what Emily has -- helps her students do, learn this stuff.

Q Okay. And along those same lines when you talk about teams, do students pick an advisor?

A Yes, they do.

Q How do they go about picking an advisor?
We encourage them to think about this and choose an advisor by the end of the first year. Typically they do it in a couple of ways. They learn obviously about the faculty even before they come here.

Secondly, they learn through pro-seminar, they take classes with faculty in the first year. And then they decide which people are of interest to them and choose one.

Now, we do not require them to stick that person at all. One of the themes that I constantly tell them and other faculty do as well is, you can switch advisors. You know, it is no shame, in fact, if you change your area of study, if you don't like the person you're working with, and we have students who will ask to have different fellowships just for that reason. They want to try out a different advisor.

Q Does anything happen to a student's funding if they choose to switch advisors?

A Not at all.

Q You also mentioned research papers. Do students pursue researchers or research fellow to publish?

A Yes. Many of them do publish based on the work they do with the professor. And sometimes they'll have streams of research as part of the fellowships where they'll be doing one stream and another person will do another stream in the same core group and they'll publish that as well.

Q How does this -- maybe I'll ask it this way, does that
1 help students professionally?
2 A Absolutely.
3 Q Can you explain why?
4 A Now a days you really can't get a good job without having
5 publications. No school is going to look at you unless you
6 have frankly two, three or four publications. The better the
7 university the more they expect.
8 Q So is the research conducted as a research fellow often
9 used in helping a student figure out what their dissertation
10 topic may be?
11 A That happens a lot as well.
12 Q And what about actually using some of that research toward
13 their dissertation?
14 A Yes, that happens. People will do pilot studies, they'll
15 even take chunks of what they've done in their research
16 fellowship and apply them to the dissertation.
17 Q Do students in Annenberg receive their funding while
18 they're learning how to perform the research as you just
19 described it?
20 A Yes.
21 Q And that funding is through the research fellowship that
22 we saw in Employer 28, 7 and 28; is that right?
23 A Yes, uh-huh.
24 Q Is -- you mentioned grants, is funding conditioned upon a
25 student performing research on a particular grant?
1 A  No.
2 Q  Is it conditioned on anything?
3 A  No, just being a good student.
4 Q  Does Annenberg track the hours that its students perform this type of research?
5 A  No.
6 Q  Are Ph.D. students ever disciplined for insufficient progress as a researcher?
7 A  No.
8 Q  Do you know of any Ph.D. students who were dismissed because they weren't performing as a research fellow?
9 A  No.
10 Q  What would you -- how would you characterize the overall purpose of doctoral research?
11 A  The purpose of doctoral research is to help a student learn how to be a first class researcher and get a great job.
12 Q  Does engaging in this type of research as a research fellow prepare the students for their future roles?
13 A  That's the point, exactly.
14 Q  Do -- what do you graduate students do after graduation? What type of roles do they typically --
15 A  A great percentage of our students I believe is 65 to 70 percent end up getting college or university positions, tenured track positions. Some of them start off as post-docs and then go into that.
Some students go into some aspect of business, typically doing research in business working for Centers for Disease Control, that kind of thing as well, government-type work as well. But the great percentage goes into academia in some sort or another.

Q And so some of the techniques that they learn throughout the course of their fellowships will help them in obtaining these types of jobs?

A Of course, even the non-academic jobs.

Q How so?

A If you worked for the Centers for Disease Control you have to know how to do research. They do research at the CDC that reflects the kind of work that they've done at Annenberg. Annenberg has a world-class health communication division area. And we have work -- faculty at Annenberg work on T-CORE now for example, which is tobacco cessation group, which works with people at the medical school.

So there's a lot of interconnection with the medical school and our students work with those faculty. They learn the kind of techniques that would set them up for terrific positions at the CDC and other types of organizations like that.

Q Okay. Now, let's shift gears a little bit and talk about teaching. Are Ph.D. students in Annenberg required to teach in order to obtain their degrees?
A Yes.

Q Will we see that teaching requirement noted as a teaching fellowship in Employer 28?

A Yes.

Q And is that the same teaching fellowship that's referenced in Employer 27?

A Yes.

Q Why is engaging in teaching activities part of the academic curriculum at Annenberg?

A You can't get a job today in a university or a college without having teaching skills, it's as simple as that. You have to be a teaching fellow in order to be able to have the experience that will require, that will allow you to get a job.

Q When students are engaging in these teaching activities, are they referred to as a teaching fellow?

A Yes.

Q And when they are a teaching fellow, are they a teaching fellow within their overarching field of study?

A Yes.

Q Before we get into what a teaching fellow actually does, does Annenberg provide any sort of training before its students engage and embark on these teaching activities?

A Well, faculty members who work with the students provide them with training coming into the classes, I do for example. We also have at Penn Center for Teaching and Learning, and a
number of our students, probably many of our students take that into account. We have had students who are fellows at the Center for Teaching and Learning, and they come back and they talk to our students about it. So there's a fair amount of -- plus we have people, alumni who come in and talk to our students about these topics.

Q: Okay. Let's talk a little about what the teaching fellows actually do. Can you explain what they do in Annenberg?

A: Sure. A teaching fellow is a person who helps a professor to work on a course throughout the semester.

Q: Okay. Can you give me some examples of some of the activities they might do?

A: Sure. I'll give you directly my situation, which I don't think is highly unusual. I teach large lecture classes, and my students help to -- we give three exams, they help me write the exams. They help to learn how to write a paper topic, they help to grade the papers. They help to decide what the grades of the students are. They meet with the students on a regular basis to help them prepare for exams and to help them with any issues that come up. Essentially what they're doing is they're learning how to be a teacher in a course of this sort.

Q: So let's unpack some of the things that you mentioned. You mentioned writing exams.

A: Yeah.

Q: Can you explain how you go about teaching your Ph.D.
students how to write an exam?

A Sure. Writing an exam may sound easy but it's really hard. And what -- you know, in a large class, and I teach people say from 70 to 150 people now a days, and what we do is I will ask students to write the questions, they'll send me a battery of questions. Typically a certain number of multiple choice questions, open-ended questions, and then I will look at the questions. I will change them, fix them, go back to them and say, this is what I've done with them. I want you to grade me and so they will give me a grade for each question, depending on how hard it is, whether it's a good question or a bad question, we talk about it. This is typically by e-mail. And then I will canonize the test as it were, send it back to them. They look it over again from a stage to problems. We then get together in person. We will discuss the exam and the answers. If we find that some of the answers are not really good, in other words, like the question is kind of messy we'll change the question again. And only then will we prepare it for the students to take the test the next day.

Q So this -- is there a pedagogical value to --

A Yeah, I wish someone had done with me when I learned how to -- I mean, this is really important stuff. It's hard to write a good exam, and it's hard to figure out what the arc of questioning should be, how to -- even simply how do you make a question that was worth four points. Do you make one question
that if you get everything wrong, you throw the question out, or should there be two parts, so it's two points and two points, I tend to favor the two and two. So we talk about that. And we want to help the students get through the test and do as well as they can.

Q So when your students are helping you write these exams, would you say it's an interactive process?

A Very much so, yeah.

Q You also mentioned grading.

A Yeah.

Q Can you explain how you teach your Ph.D. students to grade?

A Well, what we do is we go over all the questions, all the answers essentially. I go over it with them. The students -- say I have two students. Some of them with the multiple choice pretty well one student will take a certain number of multiple choice, and another student will grade the other multiple choice.

But when it comes to the open-ended questions I want one student to grade everybody so the students won't -- the undergraduates won't say, hey, Sally did better than John, she was easier than the other person on the same question. So we have that.

But I go over all the questions with them, give them the possibility of what a person might say, what would work, what
would not work, so it's a fair amount of time. And I think they get better at it over time in terms of grading. These are -- our grad students are terrific, they're smart and they pick this stuff up well. But anybody needs to have guidance with respect to something like this, particularly if you've never done it before.

Q And why is that important for Ph.D. students?

A Well, if you want a good job, a lot of times now a days the college or university hiring you asks you to talk about your philosophy of teaching. I've seen them when they actually even write it down. They'll ask you to write an essay on your philosophy of teaching.

If you haven't had any experience with that, forget about it. Okay. So this part of how they learn what their philosophy of teaching. They not like my philosophy and they end up saying, you know, maybe somebody else I worked with is better. But this is a perspective that I'm presenting them.

Q Okay. You also mentioned finals and grades.

A Yeah.

Q Can you explain your interactions with your Ph.D. students when it comes to --

A So our final, I don't do a cumulative exam. So the third exam is like the other exams from that standpoint. But then what we do is we get together in my office and we literally every go through every student. And I have a TV screen on the
wall where I can move my stuff that's on my computer onto the wall, it's a monitor. And we look at each student, a picture of each student, because I don't know the names so much, I'll know the faces, and they know the names obviously and we talk about every student, and whether that student should have a bit of a higher bump or not, you know, based on how she's doing or how he's doing, and we do that for every one of the students. And I think that also helps them understand that this is a very individualized process, it's not a mass production activity.

Q And when you were say we, is that you and your teaching fellows?
A Yes.

Q Okay. Is there a pedagogical value to engaging in those activities?
A I think so. Again, I think that -- it's really important to see the students, and I see the students a semester, students have individual problems, how do you deal with them, how do you deal with Weingarten which is the disability center. All of these issues come up when things that students have never had directly problems -- issues with before. All of a sudden students realize, the graduate students that this is a whole -- another world they haven't had.

Q Do you provide any sort of mentoring to your teaching fellows?
A: Well, this is a kind of mentoring. You know, and my philosophy, I have different perspectives on things, and I'll pontificate about it every now and again.

Q: What about feedback, do your teaching fellows receive feedback from faculty while they're teaching fellows?

A: Yeah. Yes, I do that and sometimes I write it down, sometimes I just talk to them.

Q: Is it ongoing throughout the time of their fellowship?

A: Yeah.

Q: Do TAs, your teaching fellows typically serve as the primary instructor of records for courses?

A: No, no.

Q: Does Annenberg admit Ph.D. students based on undergraduate enrollment in communications majors?

A: No.

Q: Why do you -- why does Annenberg create these teaching opportunities for its Ph.D. students?

A: There is no way that a doctoral student can get a good job without having teaching experience, period. A good teaching -- a good university or college, there's just no way. And we have to -- it would be irresponsible of us not to have an experience that allows students to claim rightly that they have the kind of teaching experience that a college would want.

Q: In your experience, are there students who want to teach multiple semesters beyond the one that's required?
A: Yes. Some of our students are more interested in research, some of our students have more of an interest in teaching, and we accommodate that.

Q: So if someone wants to be a teaching fellow multiple times how do you handle that?

A: What we do every year, every semester, before every semester is the students will -- we ask the students to have first, second and third choices with respect to what they want to do. And the great, great proportion of time the person gets a first choice, and there are some students who more than once want to have teaching as their first choice.

The -- there's -- and so what we do is we accommodate that. Some students simply want to have that experience because they want to teach in a teaching college or teaching university.

Q: Do you know whether the students typically put this type of experience on their dossiers?

A: Yes.

Q: And maybe I should back up. What's a dossier?

A: Well, a dossier is the accumulated activities that they have done that's reflected in their CV, their resume. So when they send the -- if a school is interested in them, they'll probably send a packet to the school that has all the materials that they want the school to see. And teaching is part of that. And as I said, some schools even require a philosophy of
teaching.

Q Okay. And if someone is more research focused, do you allow them to be research fellows instead of teaching fellows after they're hired?

A You have to have one semester of teaching.

Q Okay.

A Otherwise, you can be a research fellow throughout.

Q Okay. Do you try to accommodate the students' preferences based on their academicals?

A Well, they're the ones that ask us to and we do. And as I said, the great percentage of time we can do that.

Q So is the fact that a student was a teaching fellow in the past predictive of whether they'll be a teaching fellow in the future?

A No.

Q Do graduate students ever move between a teaching fellow and a research fellow on a semester-by-semester basis?

A Yeah, not -- the ones who care more about teaching will do that, but there's no predictability that way. A person may decide that she wants to be a teaching fellow one semester and a research fellow the next semester and that works for them.

Q Does the students' stipend change depending on whether or not they're a researching fellow, or a teaching fellow, or switching back and forth?

A Not at all.
Q Is a student's funding contingent on how well he or she performs engaging in their teaching activities?
A No, no.

Q Are the teaching fellows removed from their courses for poor performance?
A No.

Q Does poor performance jeopardize a teaching fellow's funding?
A No.

Q What would you do if someone was struggling teaching?
A It doesn't happen very much. We have had, as I remember vaguely, maybe one or two times in all my time here. Mainly we try to help them. I mean, it's an educational activity so the professor tries to help. Maybe I would speak to the student. But typically it's worked out with the professor, you know, it's considered an important part of the educational process, and professors are in tune. We have some really good teachers. And typically the ones who are teaching with graduate students are particularly good.

Q So you mentioned that there is more of an educational experience. Can you summarize generally how you view teaching and research fellowships?
A Yeah. I see them as an inextricable part of the doctoral program. If we are going to help graduate students get good jobs, we have to have them doing exemplary research and
teaching fellowships.

MS. DANTE: I have no further questions.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Oh, did we move 27 in?

MS. DANTE: 28, sorry.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union object to Employer 28?

MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Employer 28 is received.

(Employer's Exhibit No. 28 received)

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q Good morning, Doctor.

A Hello.

Q My name is Amy Rosenberger and I'm one of the lawyers representing the union in this case. I have some questions for you.

A Okay.

Q Probably not a surprise.

A No.

Q So Annenberg is one of the 12 schools within the University of Pennsylvania, right?

A Uh-huh.

Q And does it have departments? You mentioned it was small.

A No, we don't.

Q It's basically one department, right?
Q And does it have multiple graduate groups or just one?
A We're our own graduate group.
Q So we've heard some about the reporting structure in schools that have departments as you might imagine. What would be the -- in your school where there's not department for graduate groups, what is -- let's start with just faculty generally. What's the reporting structure for faculty, the hierarchy of reporting for faculty in the Annenberg School?
A I think I understand what you mean. Do you mean who -- where -- what's the power structure?
Q Yes.
A Okay. The dean is at the top, and beyond that we have associate deans. There's an associate dean for graduate studies and an associate dean for undergraduate studies who relates to the undergraduate program to the School of Arts and Sciences. And then we have faculty. That's it.
Q Okay. So --
A Pretty flat.
Q So faculty directly report -- so on the graduates -- well, let me withdraw for a second.
If the undergraduate program is run through the School of Arts and Sciences --
A Yes.
Q -- are the faculty in Annenberg teaching in the School of
Arts and Sciences in those programs?

A No, we don't consider it that way. The way I understand it works and that is that the school gets reimbursed by the university for teaching the undergraduate courses.

Q The School of Arts and Sciences does?

A No, the Annenberg School. The School of Arts and Sciences will pay the Annenberg School for teaching in the classes.

Q I see, okay. So if you --

A And I don't know the particulars of this.

Q Okay. That's fine. And with regard to the graduate programs, faculty, all of the faculty in the Annenberg School work with the graduate programs?

A Yes. There's one graduate program.

Q It's one graduate.

A Right.

Q And they all report to you with regard to those programs, right?

A Yes, they do, in a manner of speaking. The Annenberg School is very collegial, and the whole idea of hierarchy, the idea of reporting to me just doesn't sound right, it's not like that.

Q Okay. You report to the dean.

A If there's a problem he'll ask me a question.

Q Yeah, okay. And --

A It's still like work.
Q Yeah, okay, okay, understood.

How many faculty are there in the Annenberg School?

A I believe now there's 20, but I think we can go up to 21 right now, but I think we have 20.

Q And you talked about there being -- the interdisciplinary nature of the programs, are there faculty in the Annenberg School who have -- also have an appointment in a different school?

A Yes. We -- well, Diana Mutz has an appointment in the political science department. And let's see, John Jackson is the dean of the SP-2, he doesn't really teach much anymore, you know, but he still is considered as a faculty member of the Annenberg School. So is Amy Guttman (ph) for that matter, but she doesn't do any teaching. And Vince Price, Vince used to be a faculty.

Q He's the provost, right?

A Yes.

Q Does he teach anymore?

A No.

Q But he's not -- so he's a provost but does he have an appointment in another school?

A He was a full professor at Annenberg and the provost, that's it.

Q Okay. Not in some other school.

A No.
Q And Amy Guttman, does she have an appointment at another school?
A I don't know.
Q Okay.
A I have no idea.
Q Okay. But you listed her because she has another role at the university.
A Right.
Q Okay. And same thing with -- well, I guess does John Jackson have an appointment in SP-2?
A I assume he must.
Q Yeah. So -- and you mentioned Diana Mutz, is that the name?
A Yeah.
Q How do you spell her name?
A M-u-t-z.
Q And so she's got an appointment in political science in the School of Arts and Sciences?
A Yes.
Q So Professor Mutz --
A And Guobin Yang. Guobin Yang has an appointment in sociology.

THE REPORTER: Spell, please.
THE WITNESS: Y-a -- G-u-o-b-i-n, Guobin, and Yang is Y-a-n-g.
1 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:
2 Q And Guobin is one word?
3 A Yes.
4 Q Okay. Professor Yang has an appointment where?
5 A Sociology.
6 Q In the School of Arts?
7 A In SAS.
8 Q In SAS, okay. And are those -- so Professor Yang, Professor Mutz, Professor Jackson are there primary appointments in Annenberg School?
9 A I don't know.
10 Q Okay. Anyone else you can think of?
11 A No.
12 Q Okay. If you would, put Employer Exhibit 27 in front of you, that's the offer letter that you talked about.
13 A Yeah, uh-huh.
14 Q You talked about the travel -- the research and travel funds, that's generally used for students to attend conferences?
15 A Typically, yes.
16 Q And those conferences may occur in any term of the academic year?
17 A Yeah. I would say most of them -- a lot of people go in the summer because the -- it doesn't affect their going to classes and stuff like that. People go in the winter as well.
and in the fall, but I just get the feeling that summer is the time when there's a lot more of that kind of activity. But it happens year round.

Q Okay.

A They certainly go longer in the summer too.

Q Okay. You don't offer graduate classes in the summer?

A No.

Q In the paragraph that you talked about on direct examination that follows the bullet points, the --

A Yes.

Q -- paragraph that discusses the teaching fellowships and the research fellowships, the -- let's see, four lines from the bottom of that paragraph a sentence starts with "students who do not transfer," do you see that sentence?

A Yes, uh-huh.

Q It says, "Students who do not transfer graduate level courses from another institution are eligible for up to eight semesters (four years) of TF and RF support."

A Right.

Q What is TF and RF support?

A Teaching fellowship and research fellowship.

Q What's the support?

A Meaning the support that they get, the stipends. It's the same thing as stipend.

Q So -- and then students who enter with -- the next
sentence says "students entering with a relevant master's degree may transfer up to five courses from another institution." The next sentence, "Those students --"

A Uh-huh.

Q "-- will receive fewer semesters of financial support based on the number of courses needed to complete the graduation requirement." So that's again referring to the --

A Stipend.

Q -- TF and RF support, the stipend?

A Exactly.

Q I've handed you a document that I've marked Union 37.

A Uh-huh.

Q Do you recognize that?

A Yes.

Q Do you want to take a minute to look at it?

A Yeah. Right, okay.

Q What is that?

A This is the letter that the dean sends the -- about the full fellowship that the student gets.

Q And it looks like it's indicating to the student --

A It's the terms of the fellowship.

Q And what they'll be assigned to do --

A Yes.

Q -- for that particular semester.

A Well, not quite. In other words, it doesn't say whether a
person's going to be a teaching or a research fellow. It just
says the general terms.

Q Okay. But this is like a form letter, right?
A Exactly.

Q And in the first paragraph it says, "I'm writing about
your fellowship experience during the fall 2007, you will be
working as an --" and then it says "(insert research and
teaching fellowship name)."
A Yes.

Q So presumably in the actual letter that goes to, you know,
a doctoral student, Amy Rosenberger, I would get -- it would
say what I'm doing, right?
A Yes, it would.

Q And then in the second paragraph it says that "the
fellowship experience should require an average of 20 hours per
week." Do you see that?
A Yes.

Q That's university -- that's the university max for a
teaching/research fellowship.
A That's a number that we put. It shouldn't be higher than
that.

Q Right.
A Yeah.

Q But I gather from your direct testimony that the school
doesn't do anything to make sure that it's not higher than
that?

A Never. Well, it's never higher than that, and it -- we --
by talking to faculty and we talk about this stuff all the time
in faculty meetings. The general sense is that the number of
hours varies with the research that people do, and the notion
that it's going to be -- it just -- we constantly remind people
that they cannot make it higher than 19 hours a week actually.

Q Okay. You remind faculty --

A Right.

Q -- not to have their teaching fellows or research fellows
doing more than that amount.

A Yeah.

Q So it's basically monitored by the individual faculty
members and then --

A Monitored --

Q -- reports by the rest of you collegially?

A Yeah, it's just -- right. But nobody keeps a record.

Q Okay. The next paragraph -- well, before I leave that
paragraph.

So it then goes on to say, "Although classes begin on
August 29, you should be in contact with your assigned faculty
member well in advance of this date in order to make whatever
preparations are necessary for the assignment."

A Uh-huh.

Q So do I read that correctly to understand that the
individual teaching fellowship or research fellowship, the individual students' duties, the role that they will play as determined by the faculty member who is working with them.

Q Then in the next paragraph, it talks about the amount of the stipend, and you've talked about that. And it says, "In addition and unrelated to your fellowship stipend, you will receive a scholarship covering tuition and general fees for the same period." What does that mean that it's unrelated to your fellowship stipend, if you know?

A I think there's -- no, I don't know why that clause is in there.

Q And then it says "the fellowship stipend is currently subject to local and federal taxes." Is it your understanding that students pay payroll taxes on their fellowship stipends?

A I don't know.

Q Okay.

MS. ROSENBERGER: I move for the admission of Union Exhibit 37.

MS. DANTE: No objection.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: 37 is received.

(Union's Exhibit No. 37 received)

(Pause)

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Uh-huh.
BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q I've handed you a document that's marked Union 38, it's a sort of thick packet, so go ahead and take a look at it and let me know when you've had a chance to look at it.

A It's something I'm familiar with.

Q Okay. What is it?

A It's the handbook, graduate student handbook for the Annenberg School.

Q And it lays out in more detail what the graduate program is at Annenberg and the expectations, right?

A Exactly.

Q Right. In -- if you turn to page 8.

A Okay.

Q Toward the top there, it talks about the research fellowships and the teaching fellowships, right?

A Yes.

Q And describes sort of what their purpose is, and it's not inconsistent with what you talked about, right?

A Uh-huh. Even the 19 hours.

Q Yeah, yeah. And then down toward the -- two-thirds of the way down there's a section entitled summer fellowships.

A Yes.

Q In the eligibility section of that it talks about, "to be eligible for a summer fellowship, you have to have held a research fellowship or teaching fellowship in the previous
semester."

A Yes, I don't know if that still applies to be honest, because I believe the dean has allowed some students to engage in that right after they were accepted to the school. But in general the idea there was, you should have gone through a year of the school in order to get a summer fellowship for the next summer.

Q So your under -- I want to make sure I understand what you're saying. Your understanding is that a student who was notified say this spring of their admission to the program, you had testified on direct that they normally start in the fall's term, right?

A Yes.

Q Might on some occasions be permitted to start in the summer with summer funding.

A The dean will -- I know I think of one or two perhaps situations where a student was particularly interested in the research project that was going on in the summer, that involved summer funding and the dean helped to pay for travel to that place.

So it wasn't -- maybe it really wasn't summer funding the way they're describing, so I may be incorrect in saying.

Q Okay. So a research project that wasn't going on at the school.

A It was related to something that was happening at the
school.

Q  It was something that a professor at the Annenberg School was --

A  I don't remember the particulars to be honest.

Q  Okay.  Fair enough.

And then at the bottom of the page and continuing on to page 9, there's a list of bullet points. Those are the kinds of things that students are -- may do while receiving summer funding.

A  Providing research assistance, working for a faculty member of a joint project, revising a paper, writing grant proposal, conducting new research, working on paid internship, yes, working dissertation, yeah, that's -- it says "taking one or more summer courses relevant to one's research interest."

Uh-huh.

Q  So sometimes students in the Annenberg School -- Ph.D. students in the Annenberg School may take courses over the summer that are related to their research interests?

A  I -- that has happened. It's even the school will -- has even paid for places like the University of Michigan, if a student is interested in a particular statistics class, we've had people take statistics at the University of Michigan, which the school will pay for.

Q  Okay. And that's -- if I -- I'm not exactly clear. So do you know if that last parenthetical then about tuition being
covered up to a maximum of 4,000 indicates that if -- in that
t Situation that you described, the student --
A  Uh-huh.
Q  -- taking a course in Michigan, the $4,000 summer funding
was used to pay for that tuition?
A  That would be the idea.
Q  Okay.
A  I mean you have to realize how incredible that is to be
able to do that. It's unbelievable, you know, very few
programs in the world can do stuff like that.
Q  Can send students to other schools you mean?
A  Pay for this kind of funding in the way that I'm talking
about.
Q  Oh, you mean the amount of funding --
A  The ability to send the student to the University of
Michigan, take a class where the school will pay for it is --
Q  Unusual.
A  Yeah and good.
Q  Yeah. It's one of the selling points in trying to recruit
the best students that you talked about, isn't it?
A  And a way that we can help to create the best students as
it were.
Q  The funding package that you provide is in part designed
to attract the best students; isn't that right?
A  Yes.
Q  And why do you want the best students?
A  We're the best School of Communication in the country, maybe the world, and we're very fortunate. And so our -- we want to keep up a reputation. Our reputation is a combination of our faculty and our students. Students are incredibly important for the school.
Q  Incredibly important for the?
A  For the school.
Q  Why?
A  Because that's what we do, we educate people, and we try to create a future for our field. And we're producing, helping to create some of the best professors coming out into the field, that's what we do. Create a legacy for ourselves to some extent and for the field. And in many ways, to help the country because a lot of the stuff that Annenberg puts out, the kind of work we do helps to encourage social conversation, to get people thinking about things.
Q  That's part of what the work of the faculty and the students does, doesn't it?
A  Together, yes.
Q  That's part of why publishing whether by faculty or students is important, because that gets that out into the larger field; isn't that right?
A  Yes. And it also -- from the student's standpoint it's probably the educational experience, it helps them learn how to
write for publications, so they can get a good job afterwards.

Q  And it's something that when they go for that job interview, they have listed as part of what their experience already is; is that right?

A  Yes, uh-huh.

Q  You talked about the dissertation research fellowship and I see that's the next thing on page 9.

A  Uh-huh.

Q  I mean, I'm not going to ask you specifically about the content on page 9, but the dissertation research, the funding package with the teaching fellowship and the research fellowship support is a four year package, right?

A  Yes.

Q  For someone coming in without a master's already.

A  Right.

Q  And then the dissertation research fellowship is usually for the fifth year?

A  Yes.

Q  With the goal that someone would hopefully have their dissertation completed by the end of the fifth year.

A  Yes.

Q  But you said that your average time to completion is about 5.8 years?

A  It's gone up a little bit, yes.

Q  So what does a student do for funding in the sixth year,
you know, the partial sixth year?
A  We have buffer semesters. So what we do is we help a
student out by -- the school will pay for the tuition, so a
student won't have to pay tuition for two semesters. Sometimes
a student will take a little more time working on the proposal
beyond the time that they -- covered by the research
fellowships, so we have a buffer semester, which we'll -- the
school will pay for the tuition of that student.
If a student doesn't finish her dissertation within the
fifth year, we have a buffer semester after that to cushion it
so that they won't have to pay for tuition then.
Q  And do students -- so in that buffer, I want to make sure
I'm not mixing up what you're saying. Are you saying the
buffer semester comes always after the fifth year after the
dissertation research fellowship?
A  It can come before or after. There are two of them,
possibilities for two of them.
Q  Okay. And during the buffer semester or semesters --
A  Right.
Q  -- the student does not receive a stipend.
A  No.
Q  Do students in those buffer semesters from time to time,
presumably in order to put food on their table, take on other
-- a teaching assistantship, or other positions at the
university to enable them to have some income?
1 A I'd have to look into that. I don't know how -- I haven't
done any systematic thinking or looking at how people support
themselves through those semesters.
2 Q Okay. But in any event, it's not from a stipend.
3 A No.
4 Q If you would turn to page 26 of Union Exhibit 38 please.
5 A 26, okay. Okay.
6 Q So page -- both page 26 and page 27 have charts that look
like just sort of an example of what someone's plan of study
could be, right?
7 A Right.
8 Q But let's use the one on page 26 just for purposes of
discussion. So it looks like that first -- the first eight
semesters that are listed there are essentially the first four
years during which they have the teaching fellowship or
research fellowship funding, right?
9 A Yes.
10 Q And then in semesters 9 and 10 -- well, let's start with
semester 9. That would be the first semester of the fifth
year.
11 A Right.
12 Q It says "Either DRF", that's dissertation research
fellowship, right?
13 A Yeah.
14 Q "Or bridge semester," is that the buffer that you --
A: Yeah, that's what I refer to as the buffer.
Q: Okay. And that's where it says the tuition and health insurance gets paid, but no stipend.
A: Yes.
Q: Okay. And then semester ten -- and that's only one semester and that's why it doesn't show up on this sample in semester ten, right?
A: Right.
Q: And then in -- so the person could, if they took a bridge semester in semester nine, they could start their dissertation research fellowship in semester ten and it would continue through semester 11, right?
A: Yes.
Q: That's the spring and fall.
A: Uh-huh.
Q: And if they did that, would they get summer funding as well, the $4,000?
A: No. If you're on DRF, you don't get summer funding.
Q: Okay.
A: You get the year's funding for doing your dissertation.
Q: Okay. And then in semester 11 and semester 12, it has a much lower tuition and health insurance -- or sorry, a much lower tuition rate than in semesters 9 and 10. Is that because the school has a lowered tuition rate for folks beyond their fifth year?
A: I believe that's the university funding.
Q: Okay.
A: That's how that works. That's why we have those bridge semesters, because otherwise the costs would be much higher.
Q: A student would have to pay $16,000.
A: It's just a lot of money, right.
Q: Okay. It sure is.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union Exhibit 38.
MS. DANTE: No objection.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 38 admitted.
(Union's Exhibit No. 38 received)

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:
Q: So the Ph.D. students in Annenberg when they are working -- let's start first with teaching fellows, okay.
A: Uh-huh.
Q: When they are doing their teaching fellowship, are they doing that in undergraduate courses?
A: Teaching fellowship is an undergraduate course.
Q: So are they doing that in the School of Arts and Sciences?
A: The courses are related to the School of Arts and Sciences, yes.
Q: And are the faculty that they are working with, in the way you describe it, I mean, I know you do that, you do the -- that supervision of the teaching fellowship, so obviously the
faculty from Annenberg do that in the School of Arts and Sciences, right?

A  Yeah. I don't consider myself a member of the School of Arts and Sciences, it's just simply an administrative funding --

Q  Right.

A  -- activity.

Q  And I didn't mean to suggest that.

A  Yeah.

Q  But you teach a course that is administered by the School of Arts and Sciences.

A  Yes.

Q  And are there also faculty who are affiliated with the school, who are appointed in the School of Arts and Sciences, who are the sort of the faculty member that a teaching fellow would be working with on one of these fellowships?

A  No. No.

Q  It's always Annenberg faculty?

A  It's only Annenberg and the student.

Q  Okay.

A  May I correct something you said before just to be --

Q  Sure.

A  -- absolutely sure. When a student gets a dissertation research fellowship, they're getting the entire year funding of $31,000 that includes what they would have gotten for the
summer stipend. You seem to think that it was --

Q Oh, I see.

A Right. I just glossed over that quickly, but the point is they're getting all of it. They're not taking away the summer stipend.

Q So it's a 12-month fellowship.

A Yes, it is.

Q Okay. Thank you for that clarification.

And when you have a teaching fellow, sorry, we've used many terms in different schools, when you have a teaching fellow on a course that you are teaching --

A Yes.

Q -- do you have one teaching fellow for the course or do you sometimes have two for the course?

A It -- I sometimes have two, sometimes three, if it's a lot of students.

Q It depends on the size of the class?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And do you have the same fellow or fellows throughout the semester, throughout the class?

A Yes.

Q And these fellowships happen only during the spring and fall?

A Yes, that's when I teach.

Q Okay. Do Annenberg doctoral students sometimes take on
1 teaching assistantships in the summer?
2 A Not assistantships. They teach in the summer.
3 Q They teach where?
4 A Through the college of -- I believe it's called the
5 College of Liberal Arts or something, it's just summer classes.
6 Q Liberal and professional studies?
7 A No, it's the -- it's what we call summer school. So
8 students take classes from -- in the summer.
9 Q And is it in the School of Arts and Sciences?
10 A I believe it's run by another part of the university, but
11 I -- you know, the name has changed in recent years and I
12 forget what it is.
13 Q Okay.
14 A But it is a -- it's the part of the university that runs
15 the summer school.
16 Q And when doctoral students from the School of -- from the
17 Annenberg School teach in the summer, if you know, I mean, I
18 know you don't teach in the summer, so if you know, are they
19 listed as teaching assistants or are they listed as the
20 instructor of the course?
21 A They're listed as the instructor of the class.
22 Q Okay. Do doctoral students in Annenberg sometimes also
23 take on roles as, for example, a role at the university as a
24 tutor or as a grader, separate from their fellowship?
25 A They're not allowed to do that as part of the -- the
fellowship says, and I think the Dean's letter says that, you're not allowed to work outside of the fellowship while you're getting a fellowship.

Q But you're allowed to teach in the summer when you're getting --

A That has nothing -- you're getting a summer funding that's part of a time, but you're allowed to teach in the summer, yes. And the reason for that is, is that again, in order to get a good job, it's really terrific to have individual teaching experience. The typical student will teach a summer class that's related to the class that they were a teaching fellow for.

So I will essentially just as part of what I do with students, help the student to prepare for the summer class.

Q When the student is acting as a teaching fellow --

A Yes.

Q -- do they -- you talked about that they will meet with students in the class.

A Uh-huh.

Q Do they do office hours?

A Oh, yeah.

Q And would that be the office hours for the class or --

A Well, we divide the students into groups typically alphabetically. So you might have students A to F and another student might have G to something, T, whatever, and they
typically get the same number. And those students then will go and if they need to speak to one of the -- to a research fellow, a teaching fellow, they'll go to that person's office hours.

Q Okay. And just so that the record is clear, because we have a lot of students involved here, you're saying the undergraduate students are divided alphabetically --

A Yes.

Q -- and assigned to the graduate students --

A To the graduate students.

Q -- for purposes of office hours.

A To the research/teaching fellows.

Q Okay. Do the teaching fellows actually -- I know you said they're not the instructor of record for the course, but do they actually teach the lecture from time to time?

A We consider it important for them to teach at least one class or a half a class, if it's an hour and 20 minutes, because it's good experience. So I will encourage one of my -- each of my research -- teaching -- each of my teaching fellows to teach at least a half a class. I teach, my classes are an hour and 20 minutes, it's really tough for a student to teach that long. So sometimes we'll cut it in half, so the student who wants to will take part of the class, the other may do the other part, but I help them prepare for the class. We -- I look at their slides, and so it's really an educational
experience.

Q And for the -- you said that teaching fellows can choose to -- sorry, that doctoral students can choose to do more than one teaching fellowship.

A Yes.

Q Is there a maximum number of teaching fellowships they can do?

A We don't have one.

Q Except that they have to at least do one research fellowship or --

A Yes.

Q Okay. So they could do up to seven teaching fellowships, right?

A Yes.

Q And presumably by the time someone gets to -- I mean, even the fourth or, you know, after they've done it several times, they have developed some level of skill, yes?

A Yes.

Q And so does the faculty member, do you as a faculty member, take into consideration the amount of experience that a person has as a teaching fellow in determining what roles you're going to assign to them?

A First of all there are very few students who even take three, let alone four. I don't know that we had anybody who took four.
Secondly, they will work with a number of different faculty because they want the level, different kinds of experiences. I know that students think about what they might bring to a program when they're looking for a job. So I teach a course called Mass Meet and Society, it's great for a student to have that under her belt, to say I can teach a class like that.

But then there might be another class that a student also wants to be able to teach, so she might work with that professor as well.

I -- if a student has experience having taken -- taught -- helped me teach the class in the past, they will often help to guide the other students who are working with them. So that's a terrific value, and that's how we use experience.

Q Okay. And the -- do -- you talked about having on occasion large lecture classes.

A Yes.

Q Do they -- I just don't know how it works in communications classes.

A Uh-huh.

Q Do they have recitation sections or discussion sections?

A Some of them do, I don't.

Q Okay.

A But some professors have that.

Q Do you know whether the professors that have those
recitation sections, whether they have teaching fellows lead those sections?

A I know they do, I don't know the dynamics of it.

Q Okay. As far as the summer teaching that you described --

A Uh-huh.

Q -- that doctoral students at Annenberg can take on in --

A Yes.

Q -- summer school, do they do that sometimes in the summer that's adjacent to the bridge semester when they have less support?

A I don't know.

Q There's nothing that would prohibit them from doing that?

A No.

Q Do you know whether they do it -- well, withdrawn.

With regard to the research fellows then, similar to the teaching -- the letter that you described or that you identified earlier that is Union Exhibit 37 --

A Uh-huh.

Q -- would assign a person to either their research fellowship or their teaching fellowship, right?

A Yes.

Q So they would find out their assignment and similarly before the semester starts, be in touch with the faculty member that they're assigned to about any sort of preparatory activities, right?
1 A  Exactly.
2 Q  And then are they -- in that research fellowship, if
3 they're working with a faculty member, might they be working
4 with the faculty member on research that the faculty member is
5 doing?
6 A  Sure.
7 Q  Okay. And they are -- I think you testified they're
8 learning sort of the, this is my term, but the nuts and bolts
9 of how to conduct research.
10 A  Exactly.
11 Q  And is research in communications similar to -- is it a --
12 let me -- is it a form of social science research or --
13 A  Yeah, there are -- we have faculty doing different kinds
14 of work. So I would say that generally speaking it would fit
15 social science, but we have people who have humanistic
16 approaches to research, people who do cultural studies research
17 would be closer to the humanities, that would be in the
18 humanities. The work I do I consider it close to sociology.
19 Q  Uh-huh.
20 A  People who do social psychology, it runs the gamete.
21 Q  And you mentioned Dr. Faulk's research --
22 A  Yeah.
23 Q  -- which would be FMRI that sounds --
24 A  Neuro psychology basically.
25 Q  Okay. So is some of that work grant funded research?
1 A Yes.
2 Q And you talked about it -- I'm sorry, when it's grant funded research, is the student paid out of the grant?
3 A Yes, but the same amount. The student never knows it's -- there's nothing about being paid out of the grant that's specific to that. The school gets the money and pays the student.
4 Q Okay. And you talked about that research sometimes resulting in publication, right?
5 A Yes.
6 Q Which adds to the knowledge in the field that you've already talked about, right?
7 A Uh-huh.
8 THE REPORTER: You should say yes.
9 THE WITNESS: Yes.
10 Q Yeah, thank you, sorry.
11 A We're close.
12 Q He needs you to hear -- he needs you to say a word. Very funny.
13 A I'm from Brooklyn.
14 Q I'm sorry?
15 A I'm from Brooklyn, it's hard.
16 Q Smart-aleckness comes with the territory.
17 A Or language.
18 Q Yeah. So if a student is working on a research project
that the faculty's research project, and a publication comes of it, the student may be an author on it, right?

A Yes.

Q And the faculty may be an author on it, right?

A Yes.

Q And maybe multiple faculty members or multiple students, right?

A Exactly.

Q If they're working as a team.

A Right.

Q And so you talked about that having value to the student, it's something that they can show to a perspective employer that they've been involved in publishing research, right?

A Yes, yes.

Q It also has value to the faculty member, doesn't it?

A Yeah, more or less, depending on the faculty person. In other words, I don't need it anymore, I do it because that's my job, I like it, it's part of my work, I care about it. But you know, it's much more valuable to the student at this point than it is to me.

Q Right. But at a lower level -- with fewer years of experience, I mean, you've been a faculty member for a very long time --

A Yes.

Q -- and you obviously have a very high profile at this
stage of your career, right?

A Yes.

Q And that's --

A I'm trying to be modest about it.

Q You've already said it in a much more modest way, I'm saying in the crass way.

But a more junior faculty member it would have value to them, right?

A Could be.

Q That's the kind of thing that gets listed on your curriculum vitae, isn't it?

A Yes.

Q And your curriculum vitae is -- or any faculty member's curriculum vitae is the kind of thing that gets posted on Penn's website; isn't that right?

A Yes.

Q It adds to -- I've seen your vitae, it's very long. And I can understand why you're saying you don't necessarily need another publication on there. But for an individual faculty member it shows their experience in the field and it shows Penn's experience through the faculty; is that right?

A Yes.

Q And through the students who are listed on those publications, right?

A What do you mean by through the students?
Q Well, just as it's on your vitae for you, it's on -- but it also lists the student, right?
A Uh-huh. Yes.
Q You don't just list yourself as the author if you had students as the co-authors?
A All the people who are co-authors typically in the line of -- particularly in psychology, there's a hierarchy of how people are presented as authors. And they're meaningful. In an interesting way, in some places, the final author can be the most important author, interestingly.
Q Why is that?
A I've heard that in some disciplines the final author is considered to be the person who sort of helped to conceptualize things and bring it up that way.
Q Okay. I might be close to being done, let me just see if I missed anything.
You testified on direct examination that you generally are in communication with students through e-mail, right?
A Yes.
Q And that's through Penn's e-mail system?
A Uh-huh.
Q The students -- each student has a Penn e-mail, right?
A Some of them use Gmail.
Q Okay. And you said there's no requirement of students to update their address during the summer. How -- at any time of
year, do you know how a student would update their address?
A  My understanding is that they would tell the assistant
dean for graduate studies, Joann Murray where they live and
that's how they would update it.
Q  You spoke a couple of times about something called pro-
    seminar. What is that?
A  It's the introductory class to the doctoral program where
    faculty come in and talk about the research they're doing.
Q  And it's a semester long course?
A  Yes. It's a non-credit course.
Q  What happened if a teaching fellow or a research fellow,
    not so much if they were struggling, but they just sort of
didn't show up or didn't do the work of the fellowship?
A  We have not had a situation like that.
Q  Fortunately.
A  Yeah.
Q  Would they continue to be in academic good standing?
A  My guess is that it would relate to other things that were
going on with their work, so we would see the whole situation.
It's unlikely that a person would be doing that and not having
problems in their classes, in other aspect of their work.
Q  You mentioned in connection with training of teaching
fellows, you referred to the Center for Teaching and Learning,
and you referred to -- you said something about, if I
understood you correctly, that the Annenberg School has fellows
at the Center for Teaching and Learning.

A  In addition to their fellowships, in addition to the stipends, they have -- they are chosen by the -- they're chosen by the Center for Teaching and Learning. It's quite an honor and we had one last year, Elana Marris who becomes kind of liaison to other students. She takes classes, she gets certain kinds of training of how to teach well, and then she is expected to bring some of her knowledge back to other schools, but particularly the Annenberg School.

Q  So -- and when you said it's separate from the fellowship, is she paid for the Center -- was she paid by the Center of Teaching and Learning?

A  Yes, she is, and I'm trying -- I suspect -- I don't know absolutely sure, but I think as in the past, we add that to her stipend.

Q  Okay. So she gets -- it's also a way that she earned additional funds.

A  We add that to her stipend. I wouldn't put it the way you put it because as I said, the purpose of the -- of getting -- we encourage students to go after awards so they can enhance their CVs, that's the idea as I said with the Canadian fellowships. It's not a matter of making more money from our standpoint, it's a matter of aggrandizing your reputation so that Elana is going to have a really -- you know, she's learned a lot about teaching, she knows that's her strong interest
area, and when she applies for a position she'll be able to say that she was a fellow in the Center for Teaching and Learning. She's also learned a heck of a lot about teaching and learning. So that, you know, we want to encourage students to be thinking about that kind of fellowship.

Q So when you say she, you know, learns what she learns there and brings it back to the school, does she have a role in the training that you provide for teaching fellows?
A Yes. She will actually set up lunch seminars, where she will bring topics to the students and they'll discuss them, things of that sort.

Q And if you -- and that's -- you have that, you have the ability for a Center of Teaching and Learning -- teaching and learning fellow come and do that, only if you have someone in the Annenberg School who has received this honor from the Center of Teaching and Learning.
A But other times, we've had people from CTL who are not Annenberg people come to do similar things, and our students will go to other departments to learn. But there is a sense that I've heard students say that when it's our own student or student, then they bring direct communication related issues, it's much more relevant to their research and their teaching.

Q If you didn't have a teaching fellow -- you described in your large lecture class you had, you divide up the office hours for example.
A Yeah.

Q If you didn't have a teaching fellow or two or three teaching fellows to do that work, who would be doing the office hours?

A I wouldn't be teaching that class. We wouldn't have a class that large. Okay. It just wouldn't work. So we wouldn't do it.

Q You might have it, but it would have to be a smaller class.

A Yes.

Q And if it were a smaller class, who'd be doing that?

A I would.

Q And the same is true with all of the functions that get served by the teaching fellows, right?

A What do you mean by that?

Q So if you were developing an exam --

A Yes.

Q -- and you didn't have a teaching fellow to draft some of the questions, have the back and forth with, you'd be doing all the developing --

A Except it takes me longer to write an exam with a teaching fellow than it does to do it myself. The amount of work that it takes for me to write an exam in cooperation with the teaching fellows is part of the educational process. I could write that exam in a half a day, with the teaching fellows it
takes far longer because there's an educational component involved. They haven't done it before.

Q  Would it take you longer to grade that exam without the teaching fellows?
A  I -- again, if it were my class with a small number of people I would do it myself, yes. But you have to understand that's still part of the educational component.

Q  I understand that, and I'm not -- well, I understand that. You talked about the sort of not exam grading, but the course grading for the undergraduate --
A  Yes, uh-huh.
Q  -- students being essentially a discussion with your teaching fellows, right?
A  Not only that, but yes.
Q  Yes. But -- and you said they know the students' names, you may know the face but not the names, that's because they're doing the office hours and meeting with the undergraduates, right?
A  Yeah, I will meet students myself sometimes if they want to come to my office, but the great majority of work like that is theirs.

Q  Okay. Is there any exception -- well, let me step back a second. Have you ever had a graduate student come in who had higher ed teaching experience say as an adjunct professor or something along those lines?
A: I can't think of anyone like that.
Q: Okay. You said that before the assignment process that is reflected in the letter that we saw, that the graduate student gives their first, second and third choice of what they would like to do.
A: Uh-huh.
Q: You need to say yes.
A: Yes.
Q: So they could say, I'd like to be a teaching fellow, right?
A: Yes.
Q: They could say I'd like to be a research fellow or do they get more specific than that?
A: They can get more specific.
Q: Okay. So they could say I want to be a research fellow with Dr. Turow.
A: Exactly.
Q: Or I want to be a --
A: And much of this is done in collaboration with the professors themselves. So the professors actually also do the same kind of nominations. So this is a -- very much of a collaborative activity. The professors nominate students as well.
Q: Meaning Professor Turow could say --
A: I would like to work with Nora.
Q. Yes, okay.
A. And inevitably we bring them together, but that helps understand how to link people up.
Q. Okay. When you were testifying on direct examination you talked about the kind of assistance that a professor would try to give to a teaching fellow say who was struggling. Is one of the things that might be suggested that the student, if they're really struggling, that they move into a research fellowship instead?
A. That has never happened, it really hasn't.
Q. Okay.
MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have on -- for right now, thank you.
MS. DANTE: I just have a few questions on redirect.
REDIRECT EXAMINATION
BY MS. DANTE:
Q. Dr. Turow, do you know how many Annenberg Ph.D. students teach over the summer?
A. Yes, I believe there are eight this summer.
Q. Do you know how that compares to teaching fellows in the fall and spring?
A. Much smaller.
Q. Okay. You also testified on cross-examination that students will teach a class. Do you mean one session of a class over the course of a semester?
A: Typically, yes. They -- it depends on the professor. In my case, they might even teach as I said about a half a class because if it's an hour and 20 minutes, they may teach part of it and another student may teach the other half.

Q: So that's on one occasion during the semester?

A: Yes, in my class. Some professors may do it differently.

Q: Okay. How often do your classes meet?

A: I meet twice a week.

Q: Okay.

MS. DANTE: I have no further questions.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Can I just ask one redirect -- recross rather?

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Uh-huh.

RECROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q: What's the total number of doctoral students per class typically at Annenberg?

A: In a doctoral class?

Q: Yeah.

A: I would say it's about seven to ten. Sometimes there's more, but if it's a class like social psychology communication we may have 20.

Q: Oh, I'm sorry, I meant in a year. I didn't mean a classroom --
A: Oh, you mean the number --
Q: -- I mean the --
A: -- of entering students.
Q: Yes.
A: Okay.
Q: A cohort.
A: We accept 12 to 15 a year doctoral students.
Q: Okay. Thank you.
A: I should say 12 to 15 enter a year.
MS. ROSENBERGER: Thanks.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything?
Okay. I have a couple of questions.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I do. But it's not a lot, it's not a lot I promise.
THE WITNESS: You've been paying attention.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I've been trying. I'm a good listener.
Okay. So you mentioned that you're a professor. How did you say you had been a professor since 1986 or '96?
THE WITNESS: '86.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I just want to be sure.
THE WITNESS: Well, that's at Penn.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.
THE WITNESS: But then I was a professor at Purdue before
that, P-u-r-d-u-e, not like the chickens.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I'm from Chicago.

THE WITNESS: Okay. So you know that. That's great, because I spelled to P-e-r for a long time.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: No, I'm familiar. How many Ph.D. students does Annenberg have?

THE WITNESS: At any one time about 75, in different stages of the completion.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The employer asked you some questions about Employer 27 which is the admission letter.


HEARING OFFICER LEACH: They asked you questions about I believe it was, you know, how/why students get funding, you mentioned the funding is tied to activities, but the students do -- you said they must be a student in good standing. What does that mean?

THE WITNESS: There are requirements by the school and the university in terms of the grade point average that they should have, which basically that's what we're talking about. The student has to retain a certain kind of -- I believe it's a 3.5 average, anything below of 3.5 they're in danger of not continuing in the program.

And as we also said, a student has to pass the qualification evaluation, which is at the end of the second year, which is both related to grades, but it's also related to
a general sense of whether the student can continue in the
program because of an ability to do independent research or
other issues like that.

And then there's the comprehensive examinations which the
student has to take typically toward the end of their stay at
Annenberg. Again a university mandated requirement, which is a
set of exams, three days of examinations, they have to pass
that.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Thank you.
Okay. As far as the teaching requirement, and your
school, you call that a teaching fellow?


HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And they are -- students are
required to do that at least one semester.

THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And when they're doing the
teaching fellow, is that always something they're doing in
conjunction with the professor?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: By definition, yeah.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is there a time where they are
teaching alone?

THE WITNESS: Not as part of a teaching fellowship.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do teaching fellows get
evaluated?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How?

THE WITNESS: Well, the students can evaluate them through rating systems that are typically now on line, and the professor has an opportunity to evaluate them both as we said orally, talking to them, or even writing a memo that might go into their file if the student wants that.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And what's the purpose of the evaluation?

THE WITNESS: It can be multiple. Often it's simply feedback for the graduate student to help them understand what they can do better next time or in the future. Sometimes if the evaluations are really good, it can help them in their dossier that we discussed when they're looking for a job.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is there ever a time when maybe your department someone's evaluation has been bad?

THE WITNESS: I can't -- I don't know the particulars of every student who -- I don't see them to be honest, so I haven't looked. I could look at them, but I haven't looked at them. And so I assume that some students haven't done as good a job as the professor would have wanted, and that gets fed back to them as a way to improve, like in any other part of the educational program.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. What would happen if a
student is required to -- that a student is required to do the
teaching fellow but they don't do it, or has that ever
happened?

THE WITNESS: Never happened, they have to, at least one
semester. No one ever says no.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I didn't know if maybe
there was a time someone got ill or was having some sort of
problems, something like that?

THE WITNESS: Oh, yeah, no. I mean, there have been
sicknesses, but that's worked out, they still have to do the
teaching portion.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So when they do the teaching
fellowship, that's part of their -- that's related to the
stipend that they receive?

THE WITNESS: It is part of the process through which they
move through the school and they get a stipend when they are in
the school as a student. I -- the two are linked, but not
directly. We consider the stipend a way to help them move
through the program.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. When a student is acting as
a research fellow, this is a situation where they are doing
research with a professor?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And does that mean they're working
on the professor's research?
THE WITNESS: It depends on the professor. Some professors will allow the students to do their own research with the help of the professor. Other students will be working with research that the professor is doing. Sometimes students will carve out part of the professor's work to do for themselves. It just -- it really depends.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How many research fellowships are required in this department?

THE WITNESS: Just one semester of a research fellowship.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: You have to have each semester year as a continuing student, you have to have a fellowship but technically you can have -- all teaching fellowships except for one semester of research fellowship, or you can have all research fellowships except for one semester of teaching fellowship.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. There was a term used I think from Union 38, DRF, that's dissertation research funding?

THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: Dissertation research fellowship.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Fellowship, okay.

Now, I believe you also testified that at some point a student can do additional teaching that's not a teaching fellow.
THE WITNESS: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: When they teach in the summer.

THE WITNESS: If they get the opportunity to teach in the summer, yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. When they do that, do they get paid?

THE WITNESS: By the university, not by us.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And is this a time where they would be teaching a class alone or with another --

THE WITNESS: Yes, they teach the class alone, and it's typically they have had in one way or another experience through their doctoral program. So a student may teach mass meet and society in the summer, having been a teaching fellow for me on that class previously, see. So they get the experience teaching it through -- with the professor, and then if they're fortune enough, they can teach it in the summer.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And one last question.

When a graduate student is working as a teaching fellow or research fellow, who oversees their work?

THE WITNESS: The professor to whom they're assigned.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I don't have any other questions, does the union -- I mean, the employer, I'm sorry, it's your witness.

MS. DANTE: I do not.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union have other
questions?

MS. ROSENBERGER: One.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

FURTHER RECOMEXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q Do students get a grade for the teaching fellowship or the research fellowship?

A No. There's no course credit, it's just part of the activity.

MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything else for the employer?

MS. DANTE: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Thank you. I appreciate it.

THE WITNESS: Sure.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: We can go off the record.

(Recessed at 12:16 p.m.)
AFTERNOON SESSION
(Time Noted: 1:34 p.m.)

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: The employer can call their next witness.

MS. DANTE: Yes, thanks. Penn calls Nora Lewis.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Good afternoon.

MS. LEWIS: Good afternoon.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your first and last name for the record, please.

MS. LEWIS: Yes, Nora, N-o-r-a, Lewis, L-e-w-i-s.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you raise your right hand?

NORA LEWIS, WITNESS, SWORN

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

MS. DANTE: Thank you.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. DANTE:

Q Good afternoon, Ms. Lewis. Where are you currently employed?

A I am the Vice Dean for Professional and Liberal Education in the School of Arts and Sciences at the University of Pennsylvania.

Q How long have you held that position?

A I have been in this role since 2010 and I was interim for about nine months before that.
Q. How long have you been at Penn?

A. Actually I came to Penn in 1985 as a graduate student, and I've been employed there since about 1990.

Q. Okay. Can you tell me a little bit about your responsibilities as the Vice Dean for Professional and Liberal Education?

A. Sure. So our division, the College of Liberal and Professional Studies is the lifelong learning and professional education division of arts and sciences. So we have quite a large and diverse portfolio. We truly work with learners across the lifespan, from high school students to retirees. We have undergraduate and professional master's degree programs, we have a part-time adult bachelor of arts program, and several professional master degrees. We run the summer sessions for arts and sciences. We run some high school programs and we also have a series of non-credit programming including the university's English as a second language program, and some sort of non-credit programs that are tailored for organizations, partner university fraud and companies.

Q. Okay. Can you tell us a little bit about LPS and what that stands for?

A. Oh, I'm sorry, very acronym heavy. So LPS stands for the College of Liberal and Professional Studies, and that's actually the name of the division that I'm in charge of.

Q. Okay. And is that division within SAS?
A Yes. It's part of Arts and Sciences, it's one of the three educational divisions in Arts and Sciences. We have the College of Arts and Sciences, which is the residential undergrad program, the graduate division which is all the research masters and Ph.D.'s and then LPS does everything else pretty much.

Q Okay. And you mentioned the summer program. How does the summer program work when it comes to SAS?

A Okay. So in the summer time, the College of Liberal and Professional Studies runs all of the summer sessions credit courses for arts and sciences at the undergraduate level and at the professional master's level.

So we roster just over 200 or so courses a summer. Most of them are undergraduate courses for -- that serve primarily our residential traditional undergraduates at Penn. Our part-time adult VA students in LPS, and some visiting students from universities around the world.

Q Okay. And you mentioned master's courses as well.

A Yes.

Q Do you know approximately how many master's courses you would have?

A So we generally run between 30 and 35 master's courses in the summer. There are eight professional master's programs in the school. Some of them really only offer master's thesis registration in the summer, but about five of them offer a
handful of courses, because most of our students are working professionals, and so they study -- sometimes they're studying year round in a part-time basis while they're working.

Q  Are any Ph.D. courses offered through LPS in the summer?
A  No, we never work with Ph.D. courses.

Q  Okay. Are there different summer sessions?
A  Yeah, so the summer semester, one big term is 11 weeks in length, but within that summer term there are three sub-terms, we call them, and of course, this can be rostered in one of those three terms. So there's an evening 11-week session that runs the entire summer semester. That serves primarily, again our working adult population students, either undergraduate or master's.

And then there are much bigger sessions with many more courses are the two, five and a half week summer one term. So summer begins May 22nd, this summer began May 22nd. Summer one term this year ran May 22nd to next Wednesday, June 28th.

Immediately after that ends, the second five and a half week summer terms begins, the summer two session. So that will run from Thursday, June 29th until -- let me see, Friday, August 4th.

Q  Okay.
A  The 11-week term runs that whole period, May 22nd to August 4th.

Q  And you mentioned that most of the courses are taught
during either of those five and a half week sessions?
A  Yes, the summer one or the summer two session, uh-huh.
Q  Okay. How many -- approximately how many undergraduate courses are offered across all three of the sessions?
A  So I believe the summer undergraduate courses about 185 across all three terms.
Q  Okay. And do you have an estimate of how many graduate students are engaged in teaching activities in the summer courses?
A  Yes. So in the summer, the last couple of summers, including this summer, I would say there's somewhere between 90 and 95 graduate students who are either instructor of record, grader, or teaching assistant.
Q  And you mentioned that these courses are courses within the School of Arts and Sciences; is that right?
A  Yes, uh-huh.
Q  Have there been Wharton students who have taught as TA -- as TA's in some of these courses within SAS during summer?
A  Yes. So we always offer statistics courses in summer, they're very popular and those are usually staffed by Wharton and frequently graduate students are almost always graduate students are TAs or instructor of record for those courses.
Q  Graduate students within Wharton?
A  Yes, for the statistics, uh-huh.
Q  And if a graduate student teaches in summer one, is that
predictive of whether they will also teach in summer session two?

A  No. Only three to four students typically teach in both summer one and summer two.

Q  If a graduate student is let's say a poor TA, is their funding impacted?

A  Poor, do you mean poverty or poor quality?

Q  Poor quality.

A  Poor quality, okay. So -- no. No.

Q  Are you aware of any Ph.D. student who was removed for poor performance as a TA?

A  No.

Q  What about, are you aware of any Ph.D. student who was issued corrective discipline for poor performance as a TA over the summer?

A  No, I am not.

Q  And what would you do if someone was struggling in the performance of their teaching activities over the summer?

A  That's a -- yes. So we have had situations where graduate students were struggling in their teaching, and we work very closely with the University Center for Teaching and Learning, also with their academic department and their advisor, undergraduate and graduate chair of their department.

In the case of a couple of departments that -- where we have worked closely with their graduate students, the economics
department, the psychology department and the math department, those are all departments in arts and sciences, we created a mentor program in partnership with the departments, we, being LPS, created a mentor program with their department and the Center for Teaching and Learning. And we hired a more advanced graduate student from that department who had experience teaching and was a strong teacher to be a mentor for new graduate students in the department who are coming into their first teaching assignment.

So we have actually kind of proactively tried to work with departments where there are a lot of graduate students teaching, and where sometimes the courses are quite difficult and challenging and undergraduates need kind of more support and really strong pedagogy.

Q Why did you institute some of these mentoring programs, what's the purpose of that?

A There are two purposes really. One purpose is to make sure that our undergraduates in the courses are receiving the best possible education and they're able to master the material in the course, so we want the course experience to be good for the undergraduates in the course.

But the teaching assignments are also really important in terms of graduate student training, because our Ph.D. students are being prepared to go in the academic job market. And so learning how to teach undergraduate courses particularly intra-
level foundational courses, which can be some of the more challenging courses to teach, it's really important for us to help them develop strong skills and how you design and teach an undergraduate course and work with undergraduate students from a variety of backgrounds.

And in the summer, you get a wide variety of background, because we've got residential undergrads, LPS, part-time adult students who are returning to school maybe after many years, you have visiting students from other countries and other universities. So it's a particularly diverse mix of students, and that can be challenging and quantitatively oriented courses in particular and language courses.

Q Okay. You mentioned in your role as Vice Dean for Professional and Liberal Education that you also oversee professional masters; is that right?

A Yes, uh-huh.

Q So when it comes to professional masters in the School of Arts and Sciences, what are your responsibilities?

A So we manage and oversee those programs. Each master's program has a committee of standing or tenured faculty in the university who provide the academic governance, but we do all of the administration for those programs. So we recruit and admit students, we provide student services and support, we manage the budget and finances, and we work with the faculty governance committee to set academic policy, admission
standards, and to identify and hire instructors for the courses.

Q Do you sit on any sort of governance body when it comes to the administrative -- administration of professional master's at the university?

A Yes. So there are two levels of oversight, I would say at the level of the School of Arts and Sciences. The school bylaws mandate that there's a committee called the Committee on Graduate Continuing Education.

I co-chair that along with the graduate dean of Arts and Sciences. And it's a faculty made -- comprised of standing faculty, practitioner faculty because there are professional masters and we oversee the Arts and Sciences masters.

At the university level, I sit on the Council of Professional Masters Deans, which is an advisory body to the provost. It's chaired by the vice provost for education, and there is a representative from each of the 12 schools of the university who is engaged with their masters programs.

Q So that would include representatives from Wharton?

A Yes.

Q And representatives from engineering as well?

A Yes.

Q Do master students pay tuition?

A In Arts and Sciences, all master students pay tuition.

They're expected to be self-funded.
Q Is there a service requirement as part of their academic program?

A No, not in any of our programs.

Q I wanted to just go back to one thing you mentioned about some of the courses particularly the statistics and the quantitative courses that are taught in LPS over the summer. You mentioned that Wharton students have taught as TAs of those SAS courses, and you gave the example of statistics. Are there any other examples that you can think of where Wharton students have taught courses in SAS?

A I believe in the past there is a required quantitative course in our master public administration degree and the Fellows Institute of Government, and I believe in years past, we have had Ph.D. students from Wharton who were TAs on that course.

Q And the Fellows Institute falls within the umbrella of the School of Arts and Sciences?

A Yes, I'm sorry, it's one of the professional masters that reports in through my division, yeah.

Q Okay.

MS. DANTE: I have no further questions of this witness.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q Good afternoon.

A Hi.
Q  My name is Amy Rosenberger and I'm one of the lawyers for
the union in this case and I have some questions for you too.
Let's start where you were leaving off there. You were
asked by Ms. Dante if you -- if Wharton students teach in SAS
courses and you gave an example, in additional besides
statistics, and you gave this Fellows Institute of
Government --
A  Uh-huh.
Q  -- course.
A  Is that in SAS generally that the Wharton students teach
or in LPS in your professional masters programs?
A  I can't speak to generally where they teach. I was
speaking just to my division of Arts and Sciences.
Q  Which is the College of Liberal --
A  Continuing and professional education, right, College of
Liberal and Professional Studies.
Q  Okay. And just so I'm -- everybody else may be clear, but
I'm not.
A  It's very confusing.
Q  So within the School of Arts and Sciences, big umbrella is
the School of Arts and Sciences, right?
A  Yeah, correct.
Q  Smaller -- the three divisions under that, one that is the
College of Liberal and Professional Studies --
A  Correct.
Q -- where you are. One that is the College of Arts and Sciences that is undergraduate residential.
A Correct.
Q And one that is the graduate programs that we've already heard about --
A Correct.
Q -- to a large degree.
Okay. Are -- with regard to the graduate students who teach, whether as a TA or an instructor of record in the College of Liberal and Professional Studies, do they teach -- is teaching in the College of Liberal and Professional Studies a degree requirement?
A For Ph.D. students?
Q Yes.
A I don't know. I don't think so.
Q Okay. If you have people doing that as a TA and others doing it as instructor of record, what's the difference in what those two people are doing? How do we distinguish who's going to be designated as a TA and who's going to be an instructor of record?
A So the College of Liberal and Professional Studies does not make those decisions. I should explain that the way we roster or put courses together, we work with academic departments, for example, sociology or economics or English. And the academic department and the faculty in that department
we tell them the types of courses we need for the populations we're going to be serving, whether it's in the academic year or in the summer. We give them a wish list of the types of courses, or the specific courses we want.

They come back, the department will come back to LPS with a proposal for these ten courses that we want to offer, and they determine who will staff them. Whether the courses run or not is enrollment dependent. So my division is really a completely tuition driven unit. And we require a minimum enrollment in order to run a course.

So the department, let's say for example, English or TAs are more common in the sciences and some of the social sciences, so let's take chemistry. Chemistry would come back to us to say, we're going to offer chemistry 201 and here's the person who's going to be the instructor of record. You have 50 students expected in this course, there will be two TAs, here are the names of the teaching assistants.

Q And the number of TAs depends on how many students there are in the course.

A The type of course and how many students.

Q Okay. So is it possible to have a course where the instructor of record is a Ph.D. student and they have a TA in addition?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And in that case, the instructor of record is the
person who is responsible for the course, right?

Q And the TA -- what function, if you have an instructor of record and a TA in a course in your program, what does the TA do?

A So again, it will depend on what the subject matter is in the courses, but for example, they may be running a lab and handling the -- so in a basic chemistry course, there's a lecture portion that the instructor of record would handle, and there would be lab assignments that the students every week in the chemistry lab.

The instructor of record would determine what the lab assignments and activities are, but the TA would actually run and supervise the labs with the students in it. It's also common to have recitation, what we call recitation sections, which are like discussion sessions that are often required with certain types of courses, like a big political science lecture where maybe there are 80 or 100 students but in order to make sure all the students are really having a good opportunity to engage with the material and understanding and ask questions, they will be required to register, in addition to the lecture that meets three times a week, they may have to -- they will have to register for a non-credit recitation or discussion section tied to the big course. There may be 25 students, 20 students in that recitation section. And often a TA may --
teaching assistant would lead those discussion recitation sections, sometimes with the instructor of record, sometimes by themselves.

Teaching assistants in other courses often help with grading, that's very common proctoring exams and grading under the supervision of the instructor of record. Those are the most common kinds of assignments.

Q And if I understand you correctly, so you are not deciding who teaches any of the classes that get -- that run through your program, it's the department faculty within the School of Arts and Sciences who determine that.

A At the undergraduate level that is correct.

Q The graduate level?

A In the professional masters programs, there aren't necessarily departments that are making those decisions, but there's these faculty oversight committees and LPS staff who are credentialed in that area, but they're professional staff running the programs, they have a voice along with the faculty on the oversight committee as to who teaches -- what courses are offered and who can teach them.

So it's a similar process. I would say we have more voice with professional masters level, it's a collaboration between practitioners and that professional domain and academics.

A At the undergraduate level, those decisions are being made by the academic departments.
Q: Okay. And so do you know whether -- let me step back a second. Is that process the same, whether it's a course that's offered in LPS undergraduate courses offered in LPS in the summer or during spring or fall terms?

A: The process of who assigns?

Q: Yes.

A: Yes. So for the College of Liberal and Professional Studies for undergraduate courses in our division, the process is the same fall, spring and summer.

Q: You mentioned at one point, you talked about your students being -- see where this is -- largely people who are working professional -- working professions we reobtaining a degree; is that true? I wasn't sure whether you were talking specifically about undergraduate students, graduate -- masters -- professional masters students or both.

A: Both.

Q: So do the students -- do the masters students in liberal and professional studies take on teaching assistant positions or research assistant positions at the university?

A: Not to my knowledge, it'd be very rare.

Q: They're working somewhere else?

A: They're working full time in consulting or geoscience or --

Q: Whatever the case may be.

A: -- government.
Q Yeah.
A Yeah.

Q Okay. You testified that you've never known of someone -- a graduate student working -- teaching a course or TA'ing a course in LPS who faced some sort of impact for poor quality performance.

Are you aware of anyone who performed poorly in teaching one of the courses through your program?

A I'm aware that there have been those cases and they were the genesis of us developing the mentoring program in connection with the departments and the Center for Teaching and Learning. I cannot think of any specific individual because I'm going back probably 11 or 12 years.

Q Okay. Are you -- do regular faculty also teach in the Fellowship Liberal and Professional Studies?

A Yes. Five to ten percent of our undergraduate courses in a semester are taught by tenure track or standard track.

Q Five to ten percent.
A Uh-huh.

Q And the other 90 to 95 percent are taught by who?

A A combination of full time professional staff, lecturers, both full time and part-time lecturers who are not in the tenure track. Many times those are practitioners and graduate students.

Q What proportion of your courses are taught by graduate
students?

A As instructor of record?

Q Let's start with that.

A So in the summer of the 185 courses this summer, about 40 percent, I think around 70 courses have a graduate student as the instructor of record. That is much lower in the fall and spring. It ranges between 20 and 25 percent of courses, and we offer, on the order of 150 undergraduate courses in the fall and in the spring, and about 20 to 25 percent each semester are taught by graduate students.

Q And the rest are taught by?

A Lecturers, either full time, fully affiliated lecturers or part-time lecturers.

Q Graduate students who are instructors of record in LPS get a stipend from LPS; is that right?

A Yes.

Q And that's whether it's fall, spring or summer?

A Yes.

Q And it's not teaching in LPS is not part of the -- whatever funding package, whether it's a Ben Franklin Fellowship or whatever funding package of their doctoral program, is it?

A So if I could amend what I just said. In the fall and spring there are some departments and some students who teach in LPS as part of their funding package and assignment. I
don't know the specific numbers.

Q  Okay. Because you're not making those assignments.

A  Right.

Q  It's coming from the department.

A  Right.

Q  Okay.

A  In the summer, everyone is paid a stipend.

Q  The stipend that's set at LPS.

A  Yes.

Q  So I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 39, and I recognize this is from a couple of years ago, but do you recognize what that is?

A  Yes.

Q  What is it?

A  This is our stipend schedule for the College of Liberal and Professional Studies.

Q  And do you put something like this out every year, letting folks know what the stipend schedule will be for the year?

A  Yes.

Q  So it looks like you have a particular level of stipend for anyone who teaches in the College of Liberal and Professional Studies, just depending on whether they're full professor, associate professor, what their status is.

A  Correct.

Q  And there's one that is particularly for a Penn graduate
student.

A  Correct.

Q  And it's the same for this -- this was for the '14/'15 academic year, right?

A  Yes.

Q  And --

A  Well, according to what you gave me.

Q  Yeah, well, it reports to be from you. Right, was it from you?

A  Yes, yes.

Q  Okay. And it's -- the stipends that are listed on this chart are for -- are the same at any point, if the person teaches in fall, spring or summer, right?

A  Correct.

Q  With the exception being if someone -- you had -- I don't mean to misrepresent the record. So you had just given an example that in some cases, a graduate student might be teaching in LPS as part of their funding package, right?

A  Correct.

Q  So that -- they wouldn't get this stipend on top of that if they were teaching as part of their --

A  Correct.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union Exhibit 39.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection from the employer?
MS. DANTE: No objection.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Union 39 is received.

(Union's Exhibit No. 39 received)

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q  Do -- so Ph.D. students teach in LPS, right?
A  Yes.

Q  Do Penn masters students teach in LPS?
A  Not to my knowledge.

Q  Do graduate students in the -- from the law school teach at LPS?
A  Not to my knowledge.

Q  Med school?
A  Yes, sometimes.

Q  And I guess I should be careful about that. So doctoral students from the medical school or MD students from the medical school?
A  I don't know.

Q  What about dental school students?
A  Not to my knowledge.

Q  And veterinary school students?
A  I don't know.

Q  Okay. Do you -- I don't know whether you know this or not, so if you don't just tell me you don't know and we'll ask someone else. But do you know when a graduate student is -- let's pick the summer in particular. When a graduate student
is teaching a course in LPS, do you know how they are listed in
payroll system, what their classification is that's listed in
the payroll system?
A I don't want to speculate because I don't do payroll.
Q That's okay, if you don't know, you don't know, that's
fair enough.
Who supervises the work of a graduate student who is the
instructor of record in LPS?
A Their academic department. The subject -- the department
that owns the subject they're teaching.
Q Okay.
A Graduate groups in arts and sciences are not necessarily
mapped one-to-one with academic departments. So a course comes
out of an academic department or an academic program, so it
might be an interdisciplinary international relations course.
You could -- and I'm giving a hypothetical example.
Q Sure.
A The graduate student could be from political science or
the graduate student could be from anthropology or sociology or
history. So -- but it would be the faculty who run the
international relations, the undergraduate program could be
responsible for overseeing quality in the instruction.
Q Okay.
A LPS does monitor as well, we look at all the course
evaluations, student complaints come to us if there are any
usually. Sometimes they'll go to the department, sometimes
they will come to us, but we always work with the academic
department to resolve any issues.

Q  Okay. And is the same true with regard to the supervisory
structure for graduate students working as teaching assistants
in an LPS course?

A  Yes. The first line of supervision would be the
instructor of record for the course that they're TA'ing for.
And then the next line would be the faculty leadership of the
department that the course is from.

Q  Okay. Did I understand you correctly from your direct
examination that graduate students, in addition to function as
instructors of record, were teaching assistants in LPS courses
they also sometimes serve as graders.

A  Yes.

Q  It's a separate role or separate classification than the
teaching assistant might also do grading, right?

A  That's correct.

Q  A grader's sole function is to grade exams --

A  Correct.

Q  -- or papers or --

A  There are very few courses that do not have a teaching
assistant role, but who may have a greater role, which is
strictly grading, nothing else.

Q  Are there courses that have both a teaching assistant and
a grader?
A  I don't know.

Q  Okay. And for your purposes when you have someone who is brought on just to serve as a grader, do they get paid the graduate student stipend or do they get paid some other rate?
A  No, they get paid another rate.

Q  As an hourly rate or just a different stipend?
A  No, it's a different stipend, it's lower. I believe the standing grading stipend this summer is $2,000.

Q  The College of Liberal and Professional Studies has the same academic calendar as the university as a whole; isn't that right?
A  Yes.

Q  Do you know whether payroll taxes are paid out of the stipend that is paid to graduate students working either as a teaching assistant or an instructor of record in LPS?
A  I'm sorry, I have no idea.

Q  I know, you don't do --
A  I look at finances at big level. I don't do payroll.

Q  Let me just double-check, I think I might be done. When you -- you talked about the university level committee that you sit on that is the Committee of Professional Masters Deans, that committee has representatives from all 12 schools or just certain schools?
A  No. The Council of Professional Masters Deans has
representation from all 12 schools.

Q  Are there other schools -- if you know, are there other
schools besides SAS that have summer courses?

A  Yes. There are undergraduate courses from Wharton
Engineering, I don't know about nursing.

MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have for you at this time,
thank you.

THE WITNESS: Okay.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the employer have any
additional questions?

MS. DANTE: Just a few.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. DANTE:

Q  Ms. Lewis, are there more courses offered during the
spring and fall semesters than there are during the summer at
the university?

MS. ROSENBERGER: I'm sorry, just so the record is clear,
are you talking about the university or in LPS?

MS. DANTE: At the university.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay.

THE WITNESS: In the whole university, a huge number more
in the fall and spring than in the summer. In the summer, we
run all the courses for arts and sciences, and it's only about
180, 185. There are ten times that many just in arts and
BY MS. DANTE:

Q  Okay. And if you could take a quick look at Union 39. I see that graduate students receive a stipend of $5,380. Would you say that it's less expensive to have graduate students teach than it is lecturers in LPS?

A  In terms of the stipend alone, they're at the lower scale of the stipend, but they're much more expensive for the school, and in certain aspects for LPS. Our lecturer B, the next category as well as our standing faculty tend to teach for us in an ongoing way over many years. Graduate students teach for us once and usually it's very rare for graduate students -- there's a handful who teach more than once. And the school investment in them, the cost of graduate students is much more than a lecturer B.

MS. DANTE: I don't have any further questions.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union?

MS. ROSENBERGER: I have -- yeah, just one follow-up to that.

RECROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q  So if you're -- so when you're talking about that, you're talking about the total compensation to a graduate student which would include their funding package, right?

A  Correct.
Q And if we compared them to say the total compensation for an assistant professor, that's going to be more than the total compensation for a Penn graduate student, right?
A I don't know what the total compensation for a Penn graduate student is, and assistant professor salaries vary a lot as well.
Q Okay.
A So I don't have data to really --
Q But you have data on what lecturers make.
A Yes.
Q What lecturers make in LPS, what do they make elsewhere in the university?
A The LPS -- in the whole university I don't know. In arts and sciences, this scale is the scale for lecturers.
MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay. That's all I have.
MS. DANTE: Nothing further.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I have a few questions just to follow-up.
THE WITNESS: Yeah.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: In the beginning you said, when we were going through I guess the time you've been at Penn, did you say you have been at Penn since 1995 as a graduate student?
THE WITNESS: '85.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I want to be sure that I'm clear on the definition of the different terms. You used the
term instructor and then grader and then TA. So what's the
difference between an instructor and a TA?

THE WITNESS: So the instructor of record is the person
leading the course, they're standing in front of the classroom,
they're responsible for the syllabus, the teaching, designing
the assessments, grading, ultimately the grades the students
receive.

A teaching assistant supports the instructor of record
whether that's a professor or a lecturer. And the teaching
assistant could do a variety of things to assist the lecturer.
They might help with grading. They might run discussion
sections or a lab, run laboratories in science classes, meet
with students for extra help.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is an instructor ever a graduate
student?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I believe the employer
asked you whether or not Wharton students had TA'd in LPS. Has
-- do engineering students TA in LPS?

THE WITNESS: I don't know.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And I believe the employer
asked about TAs and whether or not if they're poor quality is
their stipend affected, you said no.

What about if an instructor is of poor quality, is that
the same answer?
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Whether they're a lecturer or a graduate student?

THE WITNESS: Correct.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I believe you testified that a TA had not been removed for poor performance. Has an instructor been removed for poor performance?

THE WITNESS: Not to my knowledge.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you know whether an instructor has been issued discipline?

THE WITNESS: I don't know.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I guess for instructor issues.

THE WITNESS: For academic issues you mean?

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Uh-huh. As far as in their role as an instructor.

THE WITNESS: Not issued discipline, if it is a lecturer, not a graduate student a lecturer, they might not be hired in the future to teach if the quality of their teaching was unsatisfactory and they did not remediate it with our help and support. But they have not been removed or disciplined in the middle of a course.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. What about if it's an instructor or a TA that's a graduate student, if there was an issue with their teaching, would that affect whether or not they would be rehired?
THE WITNESS: That would be the call of the academic department, and a lot of effort is put into working with graduate students on their teaching to help and support them. So that would be up to the department.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: That they come from.

THE WITNESS: Right. And most graduate students who teach in LPS don't teach over the long haul, they teach once, maybe twice.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I've heard a lot of testimony about masters programs and now you said a new term today. What is a professional masters?

THE WITNESS: So it's a terminal masters that prepares students for a profession or a professional domain, so for instance, applying geoscience. We are preparing students in that masters of science, and applied geoscience to sit for an engineering geology licensure or master of medical and physics, prepares students to sit for the American Board of Radiology licensure as a medical physicist.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How many professional masters does LPS offer?

THE WITNESS: Eight right now. There's a ninth that begins in the fall.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh, okay. Can you name them?

THE WITNESS: Yes. Are you ready?

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yes.
THE WITNESS: And I won't use the acronym.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: The master of science in organizational dynamics. The master of public administration; the master of liberal arts, the master of environmental studies, the master of science in applied geoscience, the master of medical physics, the master of chemical sciences, the master of applied positive psychology, and the master of behavioral and decision sciences. I think that was nine.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: Now you see why we use acronyms all the time.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I do.

THE WITNESS: It's a mouthful.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Just a few more. Just give me a moment, please.

You gave the example of that when the union asked you some questions of a chemistry class where the instructor or you talked about the difference between the instructor of record versus the TA. I just want to clarify. The instructor of record in that situation could be a graduate student or would that have to be a faculty member?

THE WITNESS: I'm not sure. I am trying to think of a -- in theory, it could be a graduate student, I can't think of any examples where it has been.
HEARING OFFICER LEACH:  Okay. As far as the grader role, I think you said if someone is a grader, that's their sole function but very few courses just have someone who's only categorized as a grader.

THE WITNESS: Correct.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is that person a graduate student or would that person be a non-graduate student?

THE WITNESS: Yes, a grader could be a graduate student or a non-graduate student.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know how many graders you have in LPS?

THE WITNESS: I do not.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you have any?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

THE WITNESS: There are at least a couple on the summer sessions list. They're course specific, so we don't -- not positions that exist in LPS, they're tied to a particular type of course.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Who are they paid by?

THE WITNESS: LPS.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you ever call a grader a student worker?

THE WITNESS: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: You just call them a grader?
1 THE WITNESS: Correct.
2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know what a -- are you
3 familiar with the term student worker?
4 THE WITNESS: We -- the term that we use is a work study
5 student, meaning usually an undergraduate student who has
6 federal work study money as part of their financial aid package
7 and they're usually doing administrative tasks in our office.
8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.
9 In your department, are the LPS instructors evaluated?
10 THE WITNESS: Yes.
11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How?
12 THE WITNESS: All LPS instructors are evaluated with the
13 same means that any instructor in arts and sciences evaluated.
14 There is a -- there are standard course evaluations that are
15 administered at the end of every course, every term. They're
16 anonymous and the results are aggregated and available through
17 a secure web system. But there's not a -- and then full time
18 faculty and full time lecturers have a kind of annual
19 performance evaluation, but part-time lecturers and graduate
20 students to my knowledge do not.
21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So the graduate students
22 would just be subject to the end of the year or end of the
23 course.
24 THE WITNESS: The course evaluations at the end of the
25 term.

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660
HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And what does your department do with those course evaluations that you receive for graduate students?

THE WITNESS: That's a very good question. So the course evaluations are web based, and so the data is in secure data suppository. Honesty, for graduate students, we always look at the course evaluations just to determine, you know, how things went, is the course working for the types of students that we're serving, but we don't use them for any purpose other than really looking to serve our students.

If it were a full time lecturer who teaches for us regularly, we would be using it as part of their professional development. So I imagine the departments might be doing something similar for the graduate students. We're not the only ones with access to it, so access to the course evaluation system is available to department chairs, undergraduate chairs, deans.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Would you use a course evaluation for a graduate student to determine whether or not they could come back and teach again in LPS?

THE WITNESS: We would not make that determination, that would be their advisor and their graduate chair and their undergraduate chair in the department, academic department.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I don't have any other questions. Does the employer?
MS. DANTE: No.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union?

MS. ROSENBERGER: Just one.

FURTHER RE CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q Who -- when you mentioned that poor performance by a lecturer might mean they wouldn't get rehired, is that a decision that would be made by the department or by LPS?

A Both. We -- LPS would not make it in isolation from the department. The department with the dean's office, have at times, approached us to say that we're concerned. And it usually would not happen without I've heard it, you know, working with that lecturer.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Thank you.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything else from the employer?

MS. DANTE: Nothing further.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. We're finished. Thank you. I appreciate it. You could just leave it there.

Can we go off the record for a moment?

(Whereupon, the proceedings were recessed at 2:27 p.m., this date.)

* * * * *

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660
CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION 4

In the Matter of:

THE TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

and

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER, UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA (GET-UP) A/W AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 04-RC-199609
Date: June 20, 2017
Place: Philadelphia, PA

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original transcript thereof for the files of the Board.

__________________________
Official Reporter

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660