

BEFORE THE  
NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

THE TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY  
OF PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

and

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER,  
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA  
(GET-UP) A/W AMERICAN  
FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

Case No. 04-RC-199609

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice, before THE HONORABLE MARY LEACH, Hearing Officer, at the National Labor Relations Board, Region 4, 615 Chestnut Street, 7th Floor, Courtroom 3, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, on Tuesday, June 20, 2017 at 10:31 a.m.

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC  
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206  
Wayne, New Jersey 07470  
(973) 692-0660

A P P E A R A N C E S

1 On Behalf of the Employer:  
2

3 DANIEL V. JOHNS, ESQ.  
4 MEREDITH SWARTZ DANTE, ESQ.  
5 BALLARD SPAHR LLP  
6 1735 Market Street  
7 51st Floor  
8 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
9

10

11 On Behalf of the Petitioner:  
12

13 AMY ROSENBERGER, ESQ.  
14 WILLIS, WILLIAMS & DAVIDSON  
15 1845 Walnut Street  
16 24th Floor  
17 Philadelphia, PA 19103  
18

19

	<u>I N D E X</u>				
	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RECROSS</u>	<u>VOIR DIRE</u>
1					
2					
3	<u>WITNESS</u>				
4					
5	JOSEPH TUROW	887	917	957	958
6					
7	NORA LEWIS	967	976	991	992
8					

<u>EXHIBITS</u>	<u>IDENTIFIED</u>	<u>RECEIVED</u>
Employer's:		
E-27	898	898
E-28	917	917
Union's:		
P-37	927	927
P-38	937	937
P-39	987	987

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Time Noted: 10:31 a.m.)

THE REPORTER: Back on the record.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The employer can call its  
next witness.

MS. DANTE: Thank you. The employer calls Joe Turow.

MR. TUROW: Hello.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Hi.

MR. TUROW: Do I sit over there?

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yep.

Good morning.

MR. TUROW: Good morning.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your first  
and last name?

MR. TUROW: Yes, J-o-s-e-p-h, that's Joseph, not Joe, but  
anyway, and then T-u-r-o-w, T as in Tom.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you raise your right  
hand?

MR. TUROW: Yes.

JOSEPH TUROW, WITNESS, SWORN

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Ready.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. DANTE:

Q Morning, Dr. Turow.

A Morning.

1 Q Where are you currently employed?

2 A At the University of Pennsylvania, the Annenberg School  
3 for Communication.

4 Q Okay. What's your current position in the Annenberg  
5 School of Communication?

6 A I'm the Associate Dean for Graduate Studies, I'm also a  
7 chair professor at the Robert Lou Sham (ph), Professor of  
8 Communication.

9 Q How long have you been associate dean of graduate studies?

10 A I think it comes out to about eight or nine years, I  
11 forget exactly, but most recently the last three years.

12 Q Okay. What are your responsibilities as the associate  
13 dean of graduate studies?

14 A My responsibilities are to bring in the best possible  
15 group of graduate students that we can have, doctoral students  
16 to help move them through the program, and encourage them to do  
17 the best work they can do, and hopefully get them the best jobs  
18 they want.

19 Q Do you sit on any university governance committees?

20 A I'm presently among the grad dean's council.

21 Q What's the grad dean's council?

22 A It's a meeting that's chaired by Vess Winklestein (ph)  
23 who's the vice provost for education and various deans and  
24 graduate programs get together to talk about issues across the  
25 campus relating to graduate study.

1 Q Who else sits on that committee?

2 A All the associate deans for graduate studies running the  
3 doctoral programs at the university.

4 Q So are there representatives from Wharton on that  
5 committee?

6 A The Wharton Doctoral Program.

7 Q And what about engineering?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Can you tell me a little bit about your graduate  
10 education?

11 A Yes. My personal -- oh, mine personally or the --

12 Q Your education, undergraduate and graduate.

13 A Oh, my education, okay. I got a BA in English at the  
14 University of Pennsylvania, a master's in communication the  
15 University of Pennsylvania, and a Ph.D. from Penn. So I've  
16 been at Penn a long time.

17 Then I taught at Purdue and -- for about ten years and now  
18 I'm back here at Penn.

19 Q So how long have you been at Penn?

20 A As a professor since 1986.

21 Q Okay. And as a professor, do you currently teach and  
22 interact with graduate students?

23 A All the time.

24 Q Can you give us a little bit of background about  
25 Annenberg?

1 A Yes. The Annenberg is the smallest school I believe at  
2 Penn. We're only a doctoral program. We have an undergraduate  
3 program of arts and sciences, but our goal is to create  
4 doctoral students who specialize in communication. The school  
5 goes back to the late 1950s.

6 Q What type of graduate degrees does Annenberg offer?

7 A We only offer a doctoral degree in communication now.

8 Q Would you consider Annenberg to be interdisciplinary?

9 A That's what we are, the core of what we are,  
10 interdisciplinary. We have people who are faculty from -- who  
11 have Ph.D.'s and a variety, there is anthropology, sociology,  
12 as well as communication.

13 Q Do students at Annenberg collaborate with students and  
14 faculty outside of the school?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Can you give any examples of that?

17 A Well, we have faculty, for example, who are working with  
18 people in engineering now, doing work in -- working with  
19 engineering professors. We have students all the time who are  
20 taking courses across the university, because we encourage that  
21 as part of our interdisciplinary.

22 You can take six classes, at least six classes which  
23 Annenberg will pay for anywhere in the university. We have  
24 students taking law classes, anthropology classes, Africano  
25 studies classes, cinema studies classes. We have -- and if



1 students need to take statistics or other methods classes, we  
2 will pay for that over and above often times the six classes.

3 So in the sociology department, a lot of our students take  
4 statistics. In Wharton, they take statistics, biomedical  
5 statistics, every now and again.

6 Q Okay. Do you know whether Annenberg is grouped with SAS,  
7 SP2, design, BGF, education and nursing for any educational  
8 purpose?

9 A Not that I know of.

10 Q Let's talk a little bit about the Ph.D. students in  
11 Annenberg. Do they receive funding packages?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Is the funding package typically laid out in an admission  
14 letter?

15 A Yes, we have an admissions letter.

16 Q Okay.

17 A Thank you.

18 Q Do you recognize this document?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Can you tell me what it is?

21 A Yeah, this is the admissions letter that is sent to any  
22 student we admitted was sent in February.

23 Q Okay. When does the funding for a student typically  
24 start?

25 A With the beginning of the fall semester.

1 Q And I see a list of components in this financial aid sort  
2 of package. Can you walk us through what each of these are  
3 starting with the full tuition scholarship?

4 A Sure. We offer as part of the package that we give to  
5 students if they come, a full tuition scholarship, meaning they  
6 don't have to pay for any of the classes that they take as part  
7 of the program. We offer individual student health insurance,  
8 the school pays for that.

9 Q So is that -- sorry to interrupt.

10 A Yeah.

11 Q But so does Annenberg provide a subsidy for its Ph.D.  
12 students --

13 A Yes.

14 Q -- health insurance subsidy?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Okay.

17 A Yeah, the subsidy is the tuition scholarship and the  
18 student health insurance plus shared office space, which is a  
19 great thing, including as it says a computer, cook-work station  
20 and access to the university library. People don't realize  
21 that Penn has an incredible library. The ability to have  
22 access to the University of Pennsylvania library is  
23 unbelievable.

24 And then we do have yearly research and travel funds.  
25 \$1,200 are just the beginning. These are funds for students

1 who travel to conferences to present papers, and if they travel  
2 internationally they get more money, I believe up to \$500 more  
3 now. So you can get up to \$1,700 for travel to conferences.

4 Q You mentioned that they travel to present papers. Are  
5 these their own papers?

6 A Typically, yes.

7 Q And why do you offer these travel funds?

8 A The goal of the school is to help our students get the  
9 best jobs that they can get and want to get. And often times,  
10 the way of building of a reputation, getting to know people in  
11 the area of academia, all of that takes place through  
12 conferences, knowing what programs are like, and other places  
13 around the world as well as in the U.S. and so many of our  
14 students take advantage of that.

15 Q Okay. So next I see stipends. Can you explain what the  
16 stipend is?

17 A Yeah, stipend is the amount of money a student will get on  
18 a monthly basis. We offer \$31,000 a year. That includes  
19 \$4,000 in summer funding.

20 Q Okay. And putting aside the summer stipend for a moment,  
21 and focusing on the academic year stipend --

22 A Uh-huh.

23 Q -- is the amount of academic year funding tied to  
24 activities in which a student is engaged?

25 A No, not in any specific way. In other words, you get the

1 funding no matter what you do as long as you're a student in  
2 good standing.

3 Q Is that the only condition on which they receive this  
4 stipend funding?

5 A Yes. We have a certain idea of what it means to be a  
6 student in good standing at Annenberg, and if you fulfill that  
7 educational trajectory, you will continue to get your funding.

8 Q So does the amount change depending on whether the student  
9 is engaged in teaching activities or performing research?

10 A No.

11 Q Is the stipend essentially uniform throughout the four  
12 years?

13 A It may go up.

14 Q Okay. When would it go up?

15 A If the dean figures he has the money to do it.

16 Q Okay.

17 A Yeah.

18 Q And moving on to summer funding, can you explain what the  
19 summer funding is for?

20 A Yeah, the summer funding was a way that the faculty and  
21 the dean decided would help our students to create the kind of  
22 dossier they needed to get jobs. So essentially what it is,  
23 the student has ability to take a paper that he or she wrote  
24 during the regular school year, turn it into a publishable  
25 document, a conference paper, work on a proposal towards a

1 dissertation, anything that will help the student to work  
2 toward their end goals.

3 Q So students can receive this \$4,000 simply to pursue their  
4 academics?

5 A Yes, virtually everybody gets it.

6 Q Is there any service requirement for that funding?

7 A No.

8 Q Are you aware, speaking of the summer, are you aware of  
9 any Ph.D. students spending time outside of Philadelphia this  
10 summer?

11 A Many.

12 Q Can you give me some examples?

13 A Sure. I'm going to a conference tomorrow and at least two  
14 of my students are going there as well, totally separate from  
15 me, they're presenting individual papers. It's going to be in  
16 Ottawa, Canada.

17 We have a number of students going on what we call summer  
18 culture, which is part of the cultural studies program. And a  
19 group of like seven to ten students, I forget how many, are  
20 going with two professors. This year it's to Vancouver, and  
21 the students are doing research into various aspects of culture  
22 that they are interested in.

23 They come back, they write a paper. Oftentimes they'll  
24 present the paper, some of them get them published, and they  
25 often have a long day conference at Annenberg to present what

1 they've learned.

2 Q Okay. Does Annenberg require its Ph.D. students to  
3 provide the school with summer mail addresses?

4 A No.

5 Q How do you typically communicate with your students?

6 A E-mail.

7 Q Okay. And looking back at the admission letter, Employer  
8 27 --

9 A Uh-huh.

10 Q -- I see there's another bullet point that is a  
11 dissertation research fellowship. Can you explain what that  
12 is?

13 A Yes. That is a 12-month money for a student who will  
14 simply do her dissertation over the course of 12 months.

15 Q Is the funding conditioned on anything?

16 A Just having a proposal ready for dissertation.

17 Q So there's no service requirement associated with this  
18 stipend?

19 A No.

20 Q Do your students typically engage in teaching activities  
21 at Penn during this dissertation research year?

22 A They're not allowed to. If they do teaching, they have to  
23 stop doing the dissertation in order to be able to teach.

24 Q What's the purpose of the four year stipends and the  
25 dissertation research fellowship?

1 A The purpose is to help the students get jobs frankly. I  
2 mean, the -- you cannot get a good job at a university or even  
3 a college today without having training in teaching and/or  
4 research. It is simply -- it would be irresponsible of us not  
5 to have these kinds of activities to help our students.

6 Q And what's the purpose of providing them with the funding  
7 while they pursue their degree?

8 A So that they will not have to do other things in order to  
9 be able to survive.

10 Q What if a student comes in with his or her own funding,  
11 what happens then?

12 A With our school, we actually encourage them -- we allow  
13 them to keep the funding. So the feeling was that we want our  
14 students to try to get as many awards and fellowships as  
15 possible, it's good for them, it helps them get jobs down the  
16 line.

17 So, for example, we have students coming from Canada who  
18 have Canadian fellowships. They get that money and they keep  
19 that money above and beyond the stipends that Annenberg gives  
20 them.

21 Q So you don't use that additional external funding to  
22 offset the stipends you provide?

23 A No.

24 Q Okay. The next paragraph in Employer 27 describes  
25 teaching and research fellowships. Is that -- are those

1 fellowships an academic requirement of the Ph.D. degree in  
2 Annenberg?

3 A Yes, they are.

4 Q Okay.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union object to Employer  
6 27?

7 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Employer 27 is received.

9 (Employer's Exhibit No. 27 received)

10 (Pause)

11 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

12 BY MS. DANTE:

13 Q Mr. Turow, do you recognize what I've marked as Employer  
14 28?

15 A Yes, ma'am.

16 Q Can you tell us what this is?

17 A Yeah, this is the graduate curriculum on our website, the  
18 Annenberg School's website.

19 Q Okay. Focusing on the Ph.D. program, can you explain the  
20 general degree requirements for your students at Annenberg?

21 A Yes. As it says, the students are required to have 20  
22 classes, you can transfer up to five of them. And as it also  
23 says, we have a pro-seminar which is now non-credit, as well as  
24 introductory classes in methods and statistics.

25 Beyond that, students are not required to take any



1 particular courses. The courses are -- the selection of  
2 courses are made with the help of the student's advisor over  
3 time, and really we want our students to create a curriculum  
4 that fits the needs that each person has.

5 Q When do Annenberg Ph.D. students actually take courses?

6 A Through the period they -- from the time they come into  
7 the school until the time they pretty well start their  
8 dissertation.

9 Q Okay. So if we turn to the next page, you talked a little  
10 bit about coursework, let's move on to some of the other  
11 requirements.

12 A Uh-huh.

13 Q I see a qualifications evaluation. Can you explain what  
14 that is?

15 A Yeah. That's a university mandated activity, typically at  
16 the end of the second year. It's simply an activity for which  
17 the graduate studies committee together with the faculty who  
18 have worked with the student make a determination as to whether  
19 the student can continue in the program, whether she or he can  
20 do doctoral level dissertation research.

21 Q Okay. And then the next thing I see is a dissertation.  
22 Can you explain what a dissertation is?

23 A A dissertation is a research project that is typically  
24 written up as a major research activity, hopefully with  
25 contributions to the field.

1 Q Okay. And then moving down to beyond the classroom  
2 section, I see a reference to research and teaching  
3 fellowships.

4 A Yes.

5 Q Are those fellowships the same fellowships referenced in  
6 the admission letter?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And are these fellowships part of the graduate curriculum?

9 A Yes, they are.

10 Q Do you know what the average time to degree is for a Ph.D.  
11 student in Annenberg?

12 A It varies. We want to bring it down a bit, but right now  
13 it's about I believe 5.8, 5.7 years.

14 Q Okay. Let's talk a little bit about research. Are  
15 Annenberg Ph.D. students required to engage in their own  
16 independent research?

17 A Yes, they are.

18 Q So going back to this beyond the classroom, let's start  
19 with research fellowships first. Why is the research  
20 fellowship part of the academic curriculum?

21 A A research fellowship is a training situation where a  
22 graduate student works with a faculty member to learn how to  
23 do research. What I tell students, when they come into  
24 Annenberg, that it may look like your undergraduate situation,  
25 there are chairs, there are -- there's a classroom, there's a

1 desk, but it's a totally different experience.

2 What you're learning to do now is to create knowledge.

3 Whereas, an undergraduate typically what you do is you

4 synthesize knowledge, you may regurgitate knowledge. And so

5 what's happening here is a very different experience and

6 students have to learn how to do that. And as a part of the

7 way they learn it is through these research fellowships.

8 Q When students first come to Annenberg, do they necessarily

9 know what their dissertation may be?

10 A No.

11 Q So can you walk us through the process of research at

12 Annenberg starting at the beginning?

13 A Sure. A student comes in, they typically have ideas of

14 what they care about, they have to write a goal statement, they

15 take pro-seminar, they learn about the various faculty

16 interests. They then take both classes and fellowships and

17 through both of them they learn techniques, they learn ways to

18 think about research, they learn how to actually actualize

19 research, write up papers, even create grants, and hopefully by

20 the end of their third year, they're pretty well ready to start

21 thinking about a dissertation proposal, which will bring

22 together a lot of the ideas that they've gotten through those

23 activities.

24 Q And you mentioned research techniques. When they're

25 learning these techniques, are they learning these through

1 their research fellowships?

2 A Yes. So, for example, Emily Faulk is a professor at  
3 Annenberg who does work on FMRI machines, the ways in which you  
4 can use brain scanners to look at how people are persuaded and  
5 what parts of the brains light up. And it's a new and  
6 fascinating area of research.

7 She brings students in to learn this stuff really from  
8 scratch. And it's a technique that's quite sophisticated.  
9 They work with people in engineering, they work with people  
10 elsewhere in the university. In fact, the machines they work  
11 in some of their offices are over at the Richards Building not  
12 even in the Annenberg School. That takes a lot of learning.

13 Q What's the Richards Building?

14 A It's a building in the biomedical complex of the  
15 university.

16 Q Okay.

17 A And they've converted that building, as I understand it,  
18 into a multi-disciplinary area for FMRI research. It's quite  
19 amazing. And so to learn this kind of stuff you have to do it  
20 together with a team, and that's what Emily has -- helps her  
21 students do, learn this stuff.

22 Q Okay. And along those same lines when you talk about  
23 teams, do students pick an advisor?

24 A Yes, they do.

25 Q How do they go about picking an advisor?

1 A We encourage them to think about this and choose an  
2 advisor by the end of the first year. Typically they do it in  
3 a couple of ways. They learn obviously about the faculty even  
4 before they come here.

5 Secondly, they learn through pro-seminar, they take  
6 classes with faculty in the first year. And then they decide  
7 which people are of interest to them and choose one.

8 Now, we do not require them to stick that person at all.  
9 One of the themes that I constantly tell them and other faculty  
10 do as well is, you can switch advisors. You know, it is no  
11 shame, in fact, if you change your area of study, if you don't  
12 like the person you're working with, and we have students who  
13 will ask to have different fellowships just for that reason.  
14 They want to try out a different advisor.

15 Q Does anything happen to a student's funding if they choose  
16 to switch advisors?

17 A Not at all.

18 Q You also mentioned research papers. Do students pursue  
19 researchers or research fellow to publish?

20 A Yes. Many of them do publish based on the work they do  
21 with the professor. And sometimes they'll have streams of  
22 research as part of the fellowships where they'll be doing one  
23 stream and another person will do another stream in the same  
24 core group and they'll publish that as well.

25 Q How does this -- maybe I'll ask it this way, does that

1 help students professionally?

2 A Absolutely.

3 Q Can you explain why?

4 A Now a days you really can't get a good job without having  
5 publications. No school is going to look at you unless you  
6 have frankly two, three or four publications. The better the  
7 university the more they expect.

8 Q So is the research conducted as a research fellow often  
9 used in helping a student figure out what their dissertation  
10 topic may be?

11 A That happens a lot as well.

12 Q And what about actually using some of that research toward  
13 their dissertation?

14 A Yes, that happens. People will do pilot studies, they'll  
15 even take chunks of what they've done in their research  
16 fellowship and apply them to the dissertation.

17 Q Do students in Annenberg receive their funding while  
18 they're learning how to perform the research as you just  
19 described it?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And that funding is through the research fellowship that  
22 we saw in Employer 28, 7 and 28; is that right?

23 A Yes, uh-huh.

24 Q Is -- you mentioned grants, is funding conditioned upon a  
25 student performing research on a particular grant?

1 A No.

2 Q Is it conditioned on anything?

3 A No, just being a good student.

4 Q Does Annenberg track the hours that its students perform  
5 this type of research?

6 A No.

7 Q Are Ph.D. students ever disciplined for insufficient  
8 progress as a researcher?

9 A No.

10 Q Do you know of any Ph.D. students who were dismissed  
11 because they weren't performing as a research fellow?

12 A No.

13 Q What would you -- how would you characterize the overall  
14 purpose of doctoral research?

15 A The purpose of doctoral research is to help a student  
16 learn how to be a first class researcher and get a great job.

17 Q Does engaging in this type of research as a research  
18 fellow prepare the students for their future roles?

19 A That's the point, exactly.

20 Q Do -- what do you graduate students do after graduation?  
21 What type of roles do they typically --

22 A A great percentage of our students I believe is 65 to 70  
23 percent end up getting college or university positions, tenured  
24 track positions. Some of them start off as post-docs and then  
25 go into that.

1           Some students go into some aspect of business, typically  
2 doing research in business working for Centers for Disease  
3 Control, that kind of thing as well, government-type work as  
4 well. But the great percentage goes into academia in some sort  
5 or another.

6   Q     And so some of the techniques that they learn throughout  
7 the course of their fellowships will help them in obtaining  
8 these types of jobs?

9   A     Of course, even the non-academic jobs.

10  Q     How so?

11  A     If you worked for the Centers for Disease Control you have  
12 to know how to do research. They do research at the CDC that  
13 reflects the kind of work that they've done at Annenberg.  
14 Annenberg has a world-class health communication division area.  
15 And we have work -- faculty at Annenberg work on T-CORE now for  
16 example, which is tobacco cessation group, which works with  
17 people at the medical school.

18           So there's a lot of interconnection with the medical  
19 school and our students work with those faculty. They learn  
20 the kind of techniques that would set them up for terrific  
21 positions at the CDC and other types of organizations like  
22 that.

23  Q     Okay. Now, let's shift gears a little bit and talk about  
24 teaching. Are Ph.D. students in Annenberg required to teach in  
25 order to obtain their degrees?



1 A Yes.

2 Q Will we see that teaching requirement noted as a teaching  
3 fellowship in Employer 28?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And is that the same teaching fellowship that's referenced  
6 in Employer 27?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Why is engaging in teaching activities part of the  
9 academic curriculum at Annenberg?

10 A You can't get a job today in a university or a college  
11 without having teaching skills, it's as simple as that. You  
12 have to be a teaching fellow in order to be able to have the  
13 experience that will require, that will allow you to get a job.

14 Q When students are engaging in these teaching activities,  
15 are they referred to as a teaching fellow?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And when they are a teaching fellow, are they a teaching  
18 fellow within their overarching field of study?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Before we get into what a teaching fellow actually does,  
21 does Annenberg provide any sort of training before its students  
22 engage and embark on these teaching activities?

23 A Well, faculty members who work with the students provide  
24 them with training coming into the classes, I do for example.  
25 We also have at Penn Center for Teaching and Learning, and a

1 number of our students, probably many of our students take that  
2 into account. We have had students who are fellows at the  
3 Center for Teaching and Learning, and they come back and they  
4 talk to our students about it. So there's a fair amount of --  
5 plus we have people, alumni who come in and talk to our  
6 students about these topics.

7 Q Okay. Let's talk a little about what the teaching fellows  
8 actually do. Can you explain what they do in Annenberg?

9 A Sure. A teaching fellow is a person who helps a professor  
10 to work on a course throughout the semester.

11 Q Okay. Can you give me some examples of some of the  
12 activities they might do?

13 A Sure. I'll give you directly my situation, which I don't  
14 think is highly unusual. I teach large lecture classes, and my  
15 students help to -- we give three exams, they help me write the  
16 exams. They help to learn how to write a paper topic, they  
17 help to grade the papers. They help to decide what the grades  
18 of the students are. They meet with the students on a regular  
19 basis to help them prepare for exams and to help them with any  
20 issues that come up. Essentially what they're doing is they're  
21 learning how to be a teacher in a course of this sort.

22 Q So let's unpack some of the things that you mentioned.  
23 You mentioned writing exams.

24 A Yeah.

25 Q Can you explain how you go about teaching your Ph.D.

1 students how to write an exam?

2 A Sure. Writing an exam may sound easy but it's really  
3 hard. And what -- you know, in a large class, and I teach  
4 people say from 70 to 150 people now a days, and what we do is  
5 I will ask students to write the questions, they'll send me a  
6 battery of questions. Typically a certain number of multiple  
7 choice questions, open-ended questions, and then I will look at  
8 the questions. I will change them, fix them, go back to them  
9 and say, this is what I've done with them. I want you to grade  
10 me and so they will give me a grade for each question,  
11 depending on how hard it is, whether it's a good question or a  
12 bad question, we talk about it. This is typically by e-mail.

13 And then I will canonize the test as it were, send it back  
14 to them. They look it over again from a stage to problems. We  
15 then get together in person. We will discuss the exam and the  
16 answers. If we find that some of the answers are not really  
17 good, in other words, like the question is kind of messy we'll  
18 change the question again. And only then will we prepare it  
19 for the students to take the test the next day.

20 Q So this -- is there a pedagogical value to --

21 A Yeah, I wish someone had done with me when I learned how  
22 to -- I mean, this is really important stuff. It's hard to  
23 write a good exam, and it's hard to figure out what the arc of  
24 questioning should be, how to -- even simply how do you make a  
25 question that was worth four points. Do you make one question

1 that if you get everything wrong, you throw the question out,  
2 or should there be two parts, so it's two points and two  
3 points, I tend to favor the two and two. So we talk about  
4 that. And we want to help the students get through the test  
5 and do as well as they can.

6 Q So when your students are helping you write these exams,  
7 would you say it's an interactive process?

8 A Very much so, yeah.

9 Q You also mentioned grading.

10 A Yeah.

11 Q Can you explain how you teach your Ph.D. students to  
12 grade?

13 A Well, what we do is we go over all the questions, all the  
14 answers essentially. I go over it with them. The students --  
15 say I have two students. Some of them with the multiple choice  
16 pretty well one student will take a certain number of multiple  
17 choice, and another student will grade the other multiple  
18 choice.

19 But when it comes to the open-ended questions I want one  
20 student to grade everybody so the students won't -- the  
21 undergraduates won't say, hey, Sally did better than John, she  
22 was easier than the other person on the same question. So we  
23 have that.

24 But I go over all the questions with them, give them the  
25 possibility of what a person might say, what would work, what

1 would not work, so it's a fair amount of time. And I think  
2 they get better at it over time in terms of grading. These are  
3 -- our grad students are terrific, they're smart and they pick  
4 this stuff up well. But anybody needs to have guidance with  
5 respect to something like this, particularly if you've never  
6 done it before.

7 Q And why is that important for Ph.D. students?

8 A Well, if you want a good job, a lot of times now a days  
9 the college or university hiring you asks you to talk about  
10 your philosophy of teaching. I've seen them when they actually  
11 even write it down. They'll ask you to write an essay on your  
12 philosophy of teaching.

13 If you haven't had any experience with that, forget about  
14 it. Okay. So this part of how they learn what their  
15 philosophy of teaching. They not like my philosophy and they  
16 end up saying, you know, maybe somebody else I worked with is  
17 better. But this is a perspective that I'm presenting them.

18 Q Okay. You also mentioned finals and grades.

19 A Yeah.

20 Q Can you explain your interactions with your Ph.D. students  
21 when it comes to --

22 A So our final, I don't do a cumulative exam. So the third  
23 exam is like the other exams from that standpoint. But then  
24 what we do is we get together in my office and we literally  
25 every go through every student. And I have a TV screen on the

1 wall where I can move my stuff that's on my computer onto the  
2 wall, it's a monitor. And we look at each student, a picture  
3 of each student, because I don't know the names so much, I'll  
4 know the faces, and they know the names obviously and we talk  
5 about every student, and whether that student should have a bit  
6 of a higher bump or not, you know, based on how she's doing or  
7 how he's doing, and we do that for every one of the students.

8 And I think that also helps them understand that this is a  
9 very individualized process, it's not a mass production  
10 activity.

11 Q And when you were say we, is that you and your teaching  
12 fellows?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. Is there a pedagogical value to engaging in those  
15 activities?

16 A I think so. Again, I think that -- it's really important  
17 to see the students, and I see the students a semester,  
18 students have individual problems, how do you deal with them,  
19 how do you deal with Weingarten which is the disability center.  
20 All of these issues come up when things that students have  
21 never had directly problems -- issues with before. All of a  
22 sudden students realize, the graduate students that this is a  
23 whole -- another world they haven't had.

24 Q Do you provide any sort of mentoring to your teaching  
25 fellows?

1 A Well, this is a kind of mentoring. You know, and my  
2 philosophy, I have different perspectives on things, and I'll  
3 pontificate about it every now and again.

4 Q What about feedback, do your teaching fellows receive  
5 feedback from faculty while they're teaching fellows?

6 A Yeah. Yes, I do that and sometimes I write it down,  
7 sometimes I just talk to them.

8 Q Is it ongoing throughout the time of their fellowship?

9 A Yeah.

10 Q Do TAs, your teaching fellows typically serve as the  
11 primary instructor of records for courses?

12 A No, no.

13 Q Does Annenberg admit Ph.D. students based on undergraduate  
14 enrollment in communications majors?

15 A No.

16 Q Why do you -- why does Annenberg create these teaching  
17 opportunities for its Ph.D. students?

18 A There is no way that a doctoral student can get a good job  
19 without having teaching experience, period. A good teaching --  
20 a good university or college, there's just no way. And we have  
21 to -- it would be irresponsible of us not to have an experience  
22 that allows students to claim rightly that they have the kind  
23 of teaching experience that a college would want.

24 Q In your experience, are there students who want to teach  
25 multiple semesters beyond the one that's required?

1 A Yes. Some of our students are more interested in  
2 research, some of our students have more of an interest in  
3 teaching, and we accommodate that.

4 Q So if someone wants to be a teaching fellow multiple times  
5 how do you handle that?

6 A What we do every year, every semester, before every  
7 semester is the students will -- we ask the students to have  
8 first, second and third choices with respect to what they want  
9 to do. And the great, great proportion of time the person gets  
10 a first choice, and there are some students who more than once  
11 want to have teaching as their first choice.

12 The -- there's -- and so what we do is we accommodate  
13 that. Some students simply want to have that experience  
14 because they want to teach in a teaching college or teaching  
15 university.

16 Q Do you know whether the students typically put this type  
17 of experience on their dossiers?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And maybe I should back up. What's a dossier?

20 A Well, a dossier is the accumulated activities that they  
21 have done that's reflected in their CV, their resume. So when  
22 they send the -- if a school is interested in them, they'll  
23 probably send a packet to the school that has all the materials  
24 that they want the school to see. And teaching is part of  
25 that. And as I said, some schools even require a philosophy of



1 teaching.

2 Q Okay. And if someone is more research focused, do you  
3 allow them to be research fellows instead of teaching fellows  
4 after they're hired?

5 A You have to have one semester of teaching.

6 Q Okay.

7 A Otherwise, you can be a research fellow throughout.

8 Q Okay. Do you try to accommodate the students' preferences  
9 based on their academics?

10 A Well, they're the ones that ask us to and we do. And as I  
11 said, the great percentage of time we can do that.

12 Q So is the fact that a student was a teaching fellow in the  
13 past predictive of whether they'll be a teaching fellow in the  
14 future?

15 A No.

16 Q Do graduate students ever move between a teaching fellow  
17 and a research fellow on a semester-by-semester basis?

18 A Yeah, not -- the ones who care more about teaching will do  
19 that, but there's no predictability that way. A person may  
20 decide that she wants to be a teaching fellow one semester and  
21 a research fellow the next semester and that works for them.

22 Q Does the students' stipend change depending on whether or  
23 not they're a researching fellow, or a teaching fellow, or  
24 switching back and forth?

25 A Not at all.

1 Q Is a student's funding contingent on how well he or she  
2 performs engaging in their teaching activities?

3 A No, no.

4 Q Are the teaching fellows removed from their courses for  
5 poor performance?

6 A No.

7 Q Does poor performance jeopardize a teaching fellow's  
8 funding?

9 A No.

10 Q What would you do if someone was struggling teaching?

11 A It doesn't happen very much. We have had, as I remember  
12 vaguely, maybe one or two times in all my time here. Mainly we  
13 try to help them. I mean, it's an educational activity so the  
14 professor tries to help. Maybe I would speak to the student.  
15 But typically it's worked out with the professor, you know,  
16 it's considered an important part of the educational process,  
17 and professors are in tune. We have some really good teachers.  
18 And typically the ones who are teaching with graduate students  
19 are particularly good.

20 Q So you mentioned that there is more of an educational  
21 experience. Can you summarize generally how you view teaching  
22 and research fellowships?

23 A Yeah. I see them as an inextricable part of the doctoral  
24 program. If we are going to help graduate students get good  
25 jobs, we have to have them doing exemplary research and

1 teaching fellowships.

2 MS. DANTE: I have no further questions.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Oh, did we move 27 in?

4 MS. DANTE: 28, sorry.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union object to Employer  
6 28?

7 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Employer 28 is received.

9 (Employer's Exhibit No. 28 received)

10 CROSS-EXAMINATION

11 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

12 Q Good morning, Doctor.

13 A Hello.

14 Q My name is Amy Rosenberger and I'm one of the lawyers  
15 representing the union in this case. I have some questions for  
16 you.

17 A Okay.

18 Q Probably not a surprise.

19 A No.

20 Q So Annenberg is one of the 12 schools within the  
21 University of Pennsylvania, right?

22 A Uh-huh.

23 Q And does it have departments? You mentioned it was small.

24 A No, we don't.

25 Q It's basically one department, right?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And does it have multiple graduate groups or just one?

3 A We're our own graduate group.

4 Q So we've heard some about the reporting structure in  
5 schools that have departments as you might imagine. What would  
6 be the -- in your school where there's not department for  
7 graduate groups, what is -- let's start with just faculty  
8 generally. What's the reporting structure for faculty, the  
9 hierarchy of reporting for faculty in the Annenberg School?

10 A I think I understand what you mean. Do you mean who --  
11 where -- what's the power structure?

12 Q Yes.

13 A Okay. The dean is at the top, and beyond that we have  
14 associate deans. There's an associate dean for graduate  
15 studies and an associate dean for undergraduate studies who  
16 relates to the undergraduate program to the School of Arts and  
17 Sciences. And then we have faculty. That's it.

18 Q Okay. So --

19 A Pretty flat.

20 Q So faculty directly report -- so on the graduates -- well,  
21 let me withdraw for a second.

22 If the undergraduate program is run through the School of  
23 Arts and Sciences --

24 A Yes.

25 Q -- are the faculty in Annenberg teaching in the School of

1 Arts and Sciences in those programs?

2 A No, we don't consider it that way. The way I understand  
3 it works and that is that the school gets reimbursed by the  
4 university for teaching the undergraduate courses.

5 Q The School of Arts and Sciences does?

6 A No, the Annenberg School. The School of Arts and Sciences  
7 will pay the Annenberg School for teaching in the classes.

8 Q I see, okay. So if you --

9 A And I don't know the particulars of this.

10 Q Okay. That's fine. And with regard to the graduate  
11 programs, faculty, all of the faculty in the Annenberg School  
12 work with the graduate programs?

13 A Yes. There's one graduate program.

14 Q It's one graduate.

15 A Right.

16 Q And they all report to you with regard to those programs,  
17 right?

18 A Yes, they do, in a manner of speaking. The Annenberg  
19 School is very collegial, and the whole idea of hierarchy, the  
20 idea of reporting to me just doesn't sound right, it's not like  
21 that.

22 Q Okay. You report to the dean.

23 A If there's a problem he'll ask me a question.

24 Q Yeah, okay. And --

25 A It's still like work.

1 Q Yeah, okay, okay, understood.

2 How many faculty are there in the Annenberg School?

3 A I believe now there's 20, but I think we can go up to 21  
4 right now, but I think we have 20.

5 Q And you talked about there being -- the interdisciplinary  
6 nature of the programs, are there faculty in the Annenberg  
7 School who have -- also have an appointment in a different  
8 school?

9 A Yes. We -- well, Diana Mutz has an appointment in the  
10 political science department. And let's see, John Jackson is  
11 the dean of the SP-2, he doesn't really teach much anymore, you  
12 know, but he still is considered as a faculty member of the  
13 Annenberg School. So is Amy Guttman (ph) for that matter, but  
14 she doesn't do any teaching. And Vince Price, Vince used to be  
15 a faculty.

16 Q He's the provost, right?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Does he teach anymore?

19 A No.

20 Q But he's not -- so he's a provost but does he have an  
21 appointment in another school?

22 A He was a full professor at Annenberg and the provost,  
23 that's it.

24 Q Okay. Not in some other school.

25 A No.

1 Q And Amy Guttman, does she have an appointment at another  
2 school?

3 A I don't know.

4 Q Okay.

5 A I have no idea.

6 Q Okay. But you listed her because she has another role at  
7 the university.

8 A Right.

9 Q Okay. And same thing with -- well, I guess does John  
10 Jackson have an appointment in SP-2?

11 A I assume he must.

12 Q Yeah. So -- and you mentioned Diana Mutz, is that the  
13 name?

14 A Yeah.

15 Q How do you spell her name?

16 A M-u-t-z.

17 Q And so she's got an appointment in political science in  
18 the School of Arts and Sciences?

19 A Yes.

20 Q So Professor Mutz --

21 A And Guobin Yang. Guobin Yang has an appointment in  
22 sociology.

23 THE REPORTER: Spell, please.

24 THE WITNESS: Y-a -- G-u-o-b-i-n, Guobin, and Yang is Y-a-  
25 n-g.

1 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

2 Q And Guobin is one word?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Okay. Professor Yang has an appointment where?

5 A Sociology.

6 Q In the School of Arts?

7 A In SAS.

8 Q In SAS, okay. And are those -- so Professor Yang,  
9 Professor Mutz, Professor Jackson are there primary  
10 appointments in Annenberg School?

11 A I don't know.

12 Q Okay. Anyone else you can think of?

13 A No.

14 Q Okay. If you would, put Employer Exhibit 27 in front of  
15 you, that's the offer letter that you talked about.

16 A Yeah, uh-huh.

17 Q You talked about the travel -- the research and travel  
18 funds, that's generally used for students to attend  
19 conferences?

20 A Typically, yes.

21 Q And those conferences may occur in any term of the  
22 academic year?

23 A Yeah. I would say most of them -- a lot of people go in  
24 the summer because the -- it doesn't affect their going to  
25 classes and stuff like that. People go in the winter as well



1 and in the fall, but I just get the feeling that summer is the  
2 time when there's a lot more of that kind of activity. But it  
3 happens year round.

4 Q Okay.

5 A They certainly go longer in the summer too.

6 Q Okay. You don't offer graduate classes in the summer?

7 A No.

8 Q In the paragraph that you talked about on direct  
9 examination that follows the bullet points, the --

10 A Yes.

11 Q -- paragraph that discusses the teaching fellowships and  
12 the research fellowships, the -- let's see, four lines from the  
13 bottom of that paragraph a sentence starts with "students who  
14 do not transfer," do you see that sentence?

15 A Yes, uh-huh.

16 Q It says, "Students who do not transfer graduate level  
17 courses from another institution are eligible for up to eight  
18 semesters (four years) of TF and RF support."

19 A Right.

20 Q What is TF and RF support?

21 A Teaching fellowship and research fellowship.

22 Q What's the support?

23 A Meaning the support that they get, the stipends. It's the  
24 same thing as stipend.

25 Q So -- and then students who enter with -- the next

1 sentence says "students entering with a relevant master's  
2 degree may transfer up to five courses from another  
3 institution." The next sentence, "Those students --"

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q "-- will receive fewer semesters of financial support  
6 based on the number of courses needed to complete the  
7 graduation requirement." So that's again referring to the --

8 A Stipend.

9 Q -- TF and RF support, the stipend?

10 A Exactly.

11 Q I've handed you a document that I've marked Union 37.

12 A Uh-huh.

13 Q Do you recognize that?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Do you want to take a minute to look at it?

16 A Yeah. Right, okay.

17 Q What is that?

18 A This is the letter that the dean sends the -- about the  
19 full fellowship that the student gets.

20 Q And it looks like it's indicating to the student --

21 A It's the terms of the fellowship.

22 Q And what they'll be assigned to do --

23 A Yes.

24 Q -- for that particular semester.

25 A Well, not quite. In other words, it doesn't say whether a

1 person's going to be a teaching or a research fellow. It just  
2 says the general terms.

3 Q Okay. But this is like a form letter, right?

4 A Exactly.

5 Q And in the first paragraph it says, "I'm writing about  
6 your fellowship experience during the fall 2007, you will be  
7 working as an --" and then it says "(insert research and  
8 teaching fellowship name)."

9 A Yes.

10 Q So presumably in the actual letter that goes to, you know,  
11 a doctoral student, Amy Rosenberger, I would get -- it would  
12 say what I'm doing, right?

13 A Yes, it would.

14 Q And then in the second paragraph it says that "the  
15 fellowship experience should require an average of 20 hours per  
16 week." Do you see that?

17 A Yes.

18 Q That's university -- that's the university max for a  
19 teaching/research fellowship.

20 A That's a number that we put. It shouldn't be higher than  
21 that.

22 Q Right.

23 A Yeah.

24 Q But I gather from your direct testimony that the school  
25 doesn't do anything to make sure that it's not higher than

1 that?

2 A Never. Well, it's never higher than that, and it -- we --  
3 by talking to faculty and we talk about this stuff all the time  
4 in faculty meetings. The general sense is that the number of  
5 hours varies with the research that people do, and the notion  
6 that it's going to be -- it just -- we constantly remind people  
7 that they cannot make it higher than 19 hours a week actually.

8 Q Okay. You remind faculty --

9 A Right.

10 Q -- not to have their teaching fellows or research fellows  
11 doing more than that amount.

12 A Yeah.

13 Q So it's basically monitored by the individual faculty  
14 members and then --

15 A Monitored --

16 Q -- reports by the rest of you collegially?

17 A Yeah, it's just -- right. But nobody keeps a record.

18 Q Okay. The next paragraph -- well, before I leave that  
19 paragraph.

20 So it then goes on to say, "Although classes begin on  
21 August 29, you should be in contact with your assigned faculty  
22 member well in advance of this date in order to make whatever  
23 preparations are necessary for the assignment."

24 A Uh-huh.

25 Q So do I read that correctly to understand that the

1 individual teaching fellowship or research fellowship, the  
2 individual students' duties, the role that they will play as  
3 determined by the faculty member who is working with them.

4 A Yes.

5 Q Then in the next paragraph, it talks about the amount of  
6 the stipend, and you've talked about that. And it says, "In  
7 addition and unrelated to your fellowship stipend, you will  
8 receive a scholarship covering tuition and general fees for the  
9 same period." What does that mean that it's unrelated to your  
10 fellowship stipend, if you know?

11 A I think there's -- no, I don't know why that clause is in  
12 there.

13 Q And then it says "the fellowship stipend is currently  
14 subject to local and federal taxes." Is it your understanding  
15 that students pay payroll taxes on their fellowship stipends?

16 A I don't know.

17 Q Okay.

18 MS. ROSENBERGER: I move for the admission of Union  
19 Exhibit 37.

20 MS. DANTE: No objection.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: 37 is received.

22 (Union's Exhibit No. 37 received)

23 (Pause)

24 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

25 MS. ROSENBERGER: Uh-huh.

1 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

2 Q I've handed you a document that's marked Union 38, it's a  
3 sort of thick packet, so go ahead and take a look at it and let  
4 me know when you've had a chance to look at it.

5 A It's something I'm familiar with.

6 Q Okay. What is it?

7 A It's the handbook, graduate student handbook for the  
8 Annenberg School.

9 Q And it lays out in more detail what the graduate program  
10 is at Annenberg and the expectations, right?

11 A Exactly.

12 Q Right. In -- if you turn to page 8.

13 A Okay.

14 Q Toward the top there, it talks about the research  
15 fellowships and the teaching fellowships, right?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And describes sort of what their purpose is, and it's not  
18 inconsistent with what you talked about, right?

19 A Uh-huh. Even the 19 hours.

20 Q Yeah, yeah. And then down toward the -- two-thirds of the  
21 way down there's a section entitled summer fellowships.

22 A Yes.

23 Q In the eligibility section of that it talks about, "to be  
24 eligible for a summer fellowship, you have to have held a  
25 research fellowship or teaching fellowship in the previous

1 semester."

2 A Yes, I don't know if that still applies to be honest,  
3 because I believe the dean has allowed some students to engage  
4 in that right after they were accepted to the school. But in  
5 general the idea there was, you should have gone through a year  
6 of the school in order to get a summer fellowship for the next  
7 summer.

8 Q So your under -- I want to make sure I understand what  
9 you're saying. Your understanding is that a student who was  
10 notified say this spring of their admission to the program, you  
11 had testified on direct that they normally start in the fall's  
12 term, right?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Might on some occasions be permitted to start in the  
15 summer with summer funding.

16 A The dean will -- I know I think of one or two perhaps  
17 situations where a student was particularly interested in the  
18 research project that was going on in the summer, that involved  
19 summer funding and the dean helped to pay for travel to that  
20 place.

21 So it wasn't -- maybe it really wasn't summer funding the  
22 way they're describing, so I may be incorrect in saying.

23 Q Okay. So a research project that wasn't going on at the  
24 school.

25 A It was related to something that was happening at the

1 school.

2 Q It was something that a professor at the Annenberg School  
3 was --

4 A I don't remember the particulars to be honest.

5 Q Okay. Fair enough.

6 And then at the bottom of the page and continuing on to  
7 page 9, there's a list of bullet points. Those are the kinds  
8 of things that students are -- may do while receiving summer  
9 funding.

10 A Providing research assistance, working for a faculty  
11 member of a joint project, revising a paper, writing grant  
12 proposal, conducting new research, working on paid internship,  
13 yes, working dissertation, yeah, that's -- it says "taking one  
14 or more summer courses relevant to one's research interest."  
15 Uh-huh.

16 Q So sometimes students in the Annenberg School -- Ph.D.  
17 students in the Annenberg School may take courses over the  
18 summer that are related to their research interests?

19 A I -- that has happened. It's even the school will -- has  
20 even paid for places like the University of Michigan, if a  
21 student is interested in a particular statistics class, we've  
22 had people take statistics at the University of Michigan, which  
23 the school will pay for.

24 Q Okay. And that's -- if I -- I'm not exactly clear. So do  
25 you know if that last parenthetical then about tuition being



1 covered up to a maximum of 4,000 indicates that if -- in that  
2 situation that you described, the student --

3 A Uh-huh.

4 Q -- taking a course in Michigan, the \$4,000 summer funding  
5 was used to pay for that tuition?

6 A That would be the idea.

7 Q Okay.

8 A I mean you have to realize how incredible that is to be  
9 able to do that. It's unbelievable, you know, very few  
10 programs in the world can do stuff like that.

11 Q Can send students to other schools you mean?

12 A Pay for this kind of funding in the way that I'm talking  
13 about.

14 Q Oh, you mean the amount of funding --

15 A The ability to send the student to the University of  
16 Michigan, take a class where the school will pay for it is --

17 Q Unusual.

18 A Yeah and good.

19 Q Yeah. It's one of the selling points in trying to recruit  
20 the best students that you talked about, isn't it?

21 A And a way that we can help to create the best students as  
22 it were.

23 Q The funding package that you provide is in part designed  
24 to attract the best students; isn't that right?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And why do you want the best students?

2 A We're the best School of Communication in the country,  
3 maybe the world, and we're very fortunate. And so our -- we  
4 want to keep up a reputation. Our reputation is a combination  
5 of our faculty and our students. Students are incredibly  
6 important for the school.

7 Q Incredibly important for the?

8 A For the school.

9 Q Why?

10 A Because that's what we do, we educate people, and we try  
11 to create a future for our field. And we're producing, helping  
12 to create some of the best professors coming out into the  
13 field, that's what we do. Create a legacy for ourselves to  
14 some extent and for the field. And in many ways, to help the  
15 country because a lot of the stuff that Annenberg puts out, the  
16 kind of work we do helps to encourage social conversation, to  
17 get people thinking about things.

18 Q That's part of what the work of the faculty and the  
19 students does, doesn't it?

20 A Together, yes.

21 Q That's part of why publishing whether by faculty or  
22 students is important, because that gets that out into the  
23 larger field; isn't that right?

24 A Yes. And it also -- from the student's standpoint it's  
25 probably the educational experience, it helps them learn how to

1 write for publications, so they can get a good job afterwards.

2 Q And it's something that when they go for that job  
3 interview, they have listed as part of what their experience  
4 already is; is that right?

5 A Yes, uh-huh.

6 Q You talked about the dissertation research fellowship and  
7 I see that's the next thing on page 9.

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q I mean, I'm not going to ask you specifically about the  
10 content on page 9, but the dissertation research, the funding  
11 package with the teaching fellowship and the research  
12 fellowship support is a four year package, right?

13 A Yes.

14 Q For someone coming in without a master's already.

15 A Right.

16 Q And then the dissertation research fellowship is usually  
17 for the fifth year?

18 A Yes.

19 Q With the goal that someone would hopefully have their  
20 dissertation completed by the end of the fifth year.

21 A Yes.

22 Q But you said that your average time to completion is about  
23 5.8 years?

24 A It's gone up a little bit, yes.

25 Q So what does a student do for funding in the sixth year,

1 you know, the partial sixth year?

2 A We have buffer semesters. So what we do is we help a  
3 student out by -- the school will pay for the tuition, so a  
4 student won't have to pay tuition for two semesters. Sometimes  
5 a student will take a little more time working on the proposal  
6 beyond the time that they -- covered by the research  
7 fellowships, so we have a buffer semester, which we'll -- the  
8 school will pay for the tuition of that student.

9 If a student doesn't finish her dissertation within the  
10 fifth year, we have a buffer semester after that to cushion it  
11 so that they won't have to pay for tuition then.

12 Q And do students -- so in that buffer, I want to make sure  
13 I'm not mixing up what you're saying. Are you saying the  
14 buffer semester comes always after the fifth year after the  
15 dissertation research fellowship?

16 A It can come before or after. There are two of them,  
17 possibilities for two of them.

18 Q Okay. And during the buffer semester or semesters --

19 A Right.

20 Q -- the student does not receive a stipend.

21 A No.

22 Q Do students in those buffer semesters from time to time,  
23 presumably in order to put food on their table, take on other  
24 -- a teaching assistantship, or other positions at the  
25 university to enable them to have some income?

1 A I'd have to look into that. I don't know how -- I haven't  
2 done any systematic thinking or looking at how people support  
3 themselves through those semesters.

4 Q Okay. But in any event, it's not from a stipend.

5 A No.

6 Q If you would turn to page 26 of Union Exhibit 38 please.

7 A 26, okay. Okay.

8 Q So page -- both page 26 and page 27 have charts that look  
9 like just sort of an example of what someone's plan of study  
10 could be, right?

11 A Right.

12 Q But let's use the one on page 26 just for purposes of  
13 discussion. So it looks like that first -- the first eight  
14 semesters that are listed there are essentially the first four  
15 years during which they have the teaching fellowship or  
16 research fellowship funding, right?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And then in semesters 9 and 10 -- well, let's start with  
19 semester 9. That would be the first semester of the fifth  
20 year.

21 A Right.

22 Q It says "Either DRF", that's dissertation research  
23 fellowship, right?

24 A Yeah.

25 Q "Or bridge semester," is that the buffer that you --

1 A Yeah, that's what I refer to as the buffer.

2 Q Okay. And that's where it says the tuition and health  
3 insurance gets paid, but no stipend.

4 A Yes.

5 Q Okay. And then semester ten -- and that's only one  
6 semester and that's why it doesn't show up on this sample in  
7 semester ten, right?

8 A Right.

9 Q And then in -- so the person could, if they took a bridge  
10 semester in semester nine, they could start their dissertation  
11 research fellowship in semester ten and it would continue  
12 through semester 11, right?

13 A Yes.

14 Q That's the spring and fall.

15 A Uh-huh.

16 Q And if they did that, would they get summer funding as  
17 well, the \$4,000?

18 A No. If you're on DRF, you don't get summer funding.

19 Q Okay.

20 A You get the year's funding for doing your dissertation.

21 Q Okay. And then in semester 11 and semester 12, it has a  
22 much lower tuition and health insurance -- or sorry, a much  
23 lower tuition rate than in semesters 9 and 10. Is that because  
24 the school has a lowered tuition rate for folks beyond their  
25 fifth year?

1 A I believe that's the university funding.

2 Q Okay.

3 A That's how that works. That's why we have those bridge  
4 semesters, because otherwise the costs would be much higher.

5 Q A student would have to pay \$16,000.

6 A It's just a lot of money, right.

7 Q Okay. It sure is.

8 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union Exhibit  
9 38.

10 MS. DANTE: No objection.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 38 admitted.

12 (Union's Exhibit No. 38 received)

13 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

14 Q So the Ph.D. students in Annenberg when they are working  
15 -- let's start first with teaching fellows, okay.

16 A Uh-huh.

17 Q When they are doing their teaching fellowship, are they  
18 doing that in undergraduate courses?

19 A Teaching fellowship is an undergraduate course.

20 Q So are they doing that in the School of Arts and Sciences?

21 A The courses are related to the School of Arts and  
22 Sciences, yes.

23 Q And are the faculty that they are working with, in the way  
24 you describe it, I mean, I know you do that, you do the -- that  
25 supervision of the teaching fellowship, so obviously the

1 faculty from Annenberg do that in the School of Arts and  
2 Sciences, right?

3 A Yeah. I don't consider myself a member of the School of  
4 Arts and Sciences, it's just simply an administrative  
5 funding --

6 Q Right.

7 A -- activity.

8 Q And I didn't mean to suggest that.

9 A Yeah.

10 Q But you teach a course that is administered by the School  
11 of Arts and Sciences.

12 A Yes.

13 Q And are there also faculty who are affiliated with the  
14 school, who are appointed in the School of Arts and Sciences,  
15 who are the sort of the faculty member that a teaching fellow  
16 would be working with on one of these fellowships?

17 A No. No.

18 Q It's always Annenberg faculty?

19 A It's only Annenberg and the student.

20 Q Okay.

21 A May I correct something you said before just to be --

22 Q Sure.

23 A -- absolutely sure. When a student gets a dissertation  
24 research fellowship, they're getting the entire year funding of  
25 \$31,000 that includes what they would have gotten for the



1 summer stipend. You seem to think that it was --

2 Q Oh, I see.

3 A Right. I just glossed over that quickly, but the point is  
4 they're getting all of it. They're not taking away the summer  
5 stipend.

6 Q So it's a 12-month fellowship.

7 A Yes, it is.

8 Q Okay. Thank you for that clarification.

9 And when you have a teaching fellow, sorry, we've used  
10 many terms in different schools, when you have a teaching  
11 fellow on a course that you are teaching --

12 A Yes.

13 Q -- do you have one teaching fellow for the course or do  
14 you sometimes have two for the course?

15 A It -- I sometimes have two, sometimes three, if it's a lot  
16 of students.

17 Q It depends on the size of the class?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. And do you have the same fellow or fellows  
20 throughout the semester, throughout the class?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And these fellowships happen only during the spring and  
23 fall?

24 A Yes, that's when I teach.

25 Q Okay. Do Annenberg doctoral students sometimes take on

1 teaching assistantships in the summer?

2 A Not assistantships. They teach in the summer.

3 Q They teach where?

4 A Through the college of -- I believe it's called the  
5 College of Liberal Arts or something, it's just summer classes.

6 Q Liberal and professional studies?

7 A No, it's the -- it's what we call summer school. So  
8 students take classes from -- in the summer.

9 Q And is it in the School of Arts and Sciences?

10 A I believe it's run by another part of the university, but  
11 I -- you know, the name has changed in recent years and I  
12 forget what it is.

13 Q Okay.

14 A But it is a -- it's the part of the university that runs  
15 the summer school.

16 Q And when doctoral students from the School of -- from the  
17 Annenberg School teach in the summer, if you know, I mean, I  
18 know you don't teach in the summer, so if you know, are they  
19 listed as teaching assistants or are they listed as the  
20 instructor of the course?

21 A They're listed as the instructor of the class.

22 Q Okay. Do doctoral students in Annenberg sometimes also  
23 take on roles as, for example, a role at the university as a  
24 tutor or as a grader, separate from their fellowship?

25 A They're not allowed to do that as part of the -- the

1 fellowship says, and I think the Dean's letter says that,  
2 you're not allowed to work outside of the fellowship while  
3 you're getting a fellowship.

4 Q But you're allowed to teach in the summer when you're  
5 getting --

6 A That has nothing -- you're getting a summer funding that's  
7 part of a time, but you're allowed to teach in the summer, yes.  
8 And the reason for that is, is that again, in order to get a  
9 good job, it's really terrific to have individual teaching  
10 experience. The typical student will teach a summer class  
11 that's related to the class that they were a teaching fellow  
12 for.

13 So I will essentially just as part of what I do with  
14 students, help the student to prepare for the summer class.

15 Q When the student is acting as a teaching fellow --

16 A Yes.

17 Q -- do they -- you talked about that they will meet with  
18 students in the class.

19 A Uh-huh.

20 Q Do they do office hours?

21 A Oh, yeah.

22 Q And would that be the office hours for the class or --

23 A Well, we divide the students into groups typically  
24 alphabetically. So you might have students A to F and another  
25 student might have G to something, T, whatever, and they

1 typically get the same number. And those students then will go  
2 and if they need to speak to one of the -- to a research  
3 fellow, a teaching fellow, they'll go to that person's office  
4 hours.

5 Q Okay. And just so that the record is clear, because we  
6 have a lot of students involved here, you're saying the  
7 undergraduate students are divided alphabetically --

8 A Yes.

9 Q -- and assigned to the graduate students --

10 A To the graduate students.

11 Q -- for purposes of office hours.

12 A To the research/teaching fellows.

13 Q Okay. Do the teaching fellows actually -- I know you said  
14 they're not the instructor of record for the course, but do  
15 they actually teach the lecture from time to time?

16 A We consider it important for them to teach at least one  
17 class or a half a class, if it's an hour and 20 minutes,  
18 because it's good experience. So I will encourage one of my --  
19 each of my research -- teaching -- each of my teaching fellows  
20 to teach at least a half a class. I teach, my classes are an  
21 hour and 20 minutes, it's really tough for a student to teach  
22 that long. So sometimes we'll cut it in half, so the student  
23 who wants to will take part of the class, the other may do the  
24 other part, but I help them prepare for the class. We -- I  
25 look at their slides, and so it's really an educational

1 experience.

2 Q And for the -- you said that teaching fellows can choose  
3 to -- sorry, that doctoral students can choose to do more than  
4 one teaching fellowship.

5 A Yes.

6 Q Is there a maximum number of teaching fellowships they can  
7 do?

8 A We don't have one.

9 Q Except that they have to at least do one research  
10 fellowship or --

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay. So they could do up to seven teaching fellowships,  
13 right?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And presumably by the time someone gets to -- I mean, even  
16 the fourth or, you know, after they've done it several times,  
17 they have developed some level of skill, yes?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And so does the faculty member, do you as a faculty  
20 member, take into consideration the amount of experience that a  
21 person has as a teaching fellow in determining what roles  
22 you're going to assign to them?

23 A First of all there are very few students who even take  
24 three, let alone four. I don't know that we had anybody who  
25 took four.

1           Secondly, they will work with a number of different  
2 faculty because they want the level, different kinds of  
3 experiences. I know that students think about what they might  
4 bring to a program when they're looking for a job. So I teach  
5 a course called Mass Meet and Society, it's great for a student  
6 to have that under her belt, to say I can teach a class like  
7 that.

8           But then there might be another class that a student also  
9 wants to be able to teach, so she might work with that  
10 professor as well.

11           I -- if a student has experience having taken -- taught --  
12 helped me teach the class in the past, they will often help to  
13 guide the other students who are working with them. So that's  
14 a terrific value, and that's how we use experience.

15 Q       Okay. And the -- do -- you talked about having on  
16 occasion large lecture classes.

17 A       Yes.

18 Q       Do they -- I just don't know how it works in  
19 communications classes.

20 A       Uh-huh.

21 Q       Do they have recitation sections or discussion sections?

22 A       Some of them do, I don't.

23 Q       Okay.

24 A       But some professors have that.

25 Q       Do you know whether the professors that have those

1 recitation sections, whether they have teaching fellows lead  
2 those sections?

3 A I know they do, I don't know the dynamics of it.

4 Q Okay. As far as the summer teaching that you described --

5 A Uh-huh.

6 Q -- that doctoral students at Annenberg can take on in --

7 A Yes.

8 Q -- summer school, do they do that sometimes in the summer  
9 that's adjacent to the bridge semester when they have less  
10 support?

11 A I don't know.

12 Q There's nothing that would prohibit them from doing that?

13 A No.

14 Q Do you know whether they do it -- well, withdrawn.

15 With regard to the research fellows then, similar to the  
16 teaching -- the letter that you described or that you  
17 identified earlier that is Union Exhibit 37 --

18 A Uh-huh.

19 Q -- would assign a person to either their research  
20 fellowship or their teaching fellowship, right?

21 A Yes.

22 Q So they would find out their assignment and similarly  
23 before the semester starts, be in touch with the faculty member  
24 that they're assigned to about any sort of preparatory  
25 activities, right?

1 A Exactly.

2 Q And then are they -- in that research fellowship, if  
3 they're working with a faculty member, might they be working  
4 with the faculty member on research that the faculty member is  
5 doing?

6 A Sure.

7 Q Okay. And they are -- I think you testified they're  
8 learning sort of the, this is my term, but the nuts and bolts  
9 of how to conduct research.

10 A Exactly.

11 Q And is research in communications similar to -- is it a --  
12 let me -- is it a form of social science research or --

13 A Yeah, there are -- we have faculty doing different kinds  
14 of work. So I would say that generally speaking it would fit  
15 social science, but we have people who have humanistic  
16 approaches to research, people who do cultural studies research  
17 would be closer to the humanities, that would be in the  
18 humanities. The work I do I consider it close to sociology.

19 Q Uh-huh.

20 A People who do social psychology, it runs the gamete.

21 Q And you mentioned Dr. Faulk's research --

22 A Yeah.

23 Q -- which would be FMRI that sounds --

24 A Neuro psychology basically.

25 Q Okay. So is some of that work grant funded research?



1 A Yes.

2 Q And you talked about it -- I'm sorry, when it's grant  
3 funded research, is the student paid out of the grant?

4 A Yes, but the same amount. The student never knows it's --  
5 there's nothing about being paid out of the grant that's  
6 specific to that. The school gets the money and pays the  
7 student.

8 Q Okay. And you talked about that research sometimes  
9 resulting in publication, right?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Which adds to the knowledge in the field that you've  
12 already talked about, right?

13 A Uh-huh.

14 THE REPORTER: You should say yes.

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 Q Yeah, thank you, sorry.

17 A We're close.

18 Q He needs you to hear -- he needs you to say a word. Very  
19 funny.

20 A I'm from Brooklyn.

21 Q I'm sorry?

22 A I'm from Brooklyn, it's hard.

23 Q Smart-aleckness comes with the territory.

24 A Or language.

25 Q Yeah. So if a student is working on a research project

1 that the faculty's research project, and a publication comes of  
2 it, the student may be an author on it, right?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And the faculty may be an author on it, right?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And maybe multiple faculty members or multiple students,  
7 right?

8 A Exactly.

9 Q If they're working as a team.

10 A Right.

11 Q And so you talked about that having value to the student,  
12 it's something that they can show to a perspective employer  
13 that they've been involved in publishing research, right?

14 A Yes, yes.

15 Q It also has value to the faculty member, doesn't it?

16 A Yeah, more or less, depending on the faculty person. In  
17 other words, I don't need it anymore, I do it because that's my  
18 job, I like it, it's part of my work, I care about it. But you  
19 know, it's much more valuable to the student at this point than  
20 it is to me.

21 Q Right. But at a lower level -- with fewer years of  
22 experience, I mean, you've been a faculty member for a very  
23 long time --

24 A Yes.

25 Q -- and you obviously have a very high profile at this

1 stage of your career, right?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And that's --

4 A I'm trying to be modest about it.

5 Q You've already said it in a much more modest way, I'm  
6 saying in the crass way.

7 But a more junior faculty member it would have value to  
8 them, right?

9 A Could be.

10 Q That's the kind of thing that gets listed on your  
11 curriculum vitae, isn't it?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And your curriculum vitae is -- or any faculty member's  
14 curriculum vitae is the kind of thing that gets posted on  
15 Penn's website; isn't that right?

16 A Yes.

17 Q It adds to -- I've seen your vitae, it's very long. And I  
18 can understand why you're saying you don't necessarily need  
19 another publication on there. But for an individual faculty  
20 member it shows their experience in the field and it shows  
21 Penn's experience through the faculty; is that right?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And through the students who are listed on those  
24 publications, right?

25 A What do you mean by through the students?

1 Q Well, just as it's on your vitae for you, it's on -- but  
2 it also lists the student, right?

3 A Uh-huh. Yes.

4 Q You don't just list yourself as the author if you had  
5 students as the co-authors?

6 A All the people who are co-authors typically in the line of  
7 -- particularly in psychology, there's a hierarchy of how  
8 people are presented as authors. And they're meaningful. In  
9 an interesting way, in some places, the final author can be the  
10 most important author, interestingly.

11 Q Why is that?

12 A I've heard that in some disciplines the final author is  
13 considered to be the person who sort of helped to conceptualize  
14 things and bring it up that way.

15 Q Okay. I might be close to being done, let me just see if  
16 I missed anything.

17 You testified on direct examination that you generally are  
18 in communication with students through e-mail, right?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And that's through Penn's e-mail system?

21 A Uh-huh.

22 Q The students -- each student has a Penn e-mail, right?

23 A Some of them use Gmail.

24 Q Okay. And you said there's no requirement of students to  
25 update their address during the summer. How -- at any time of

1 year, do you know how a student would update their address?

2 A My understanding is that they would tell the assistant  
3 dean for graduate studies, Joann Murray where they live and  
4 that's how they would update it.

5 Q You spoke a couple of times about something called pro-  
6 seminar. What is that?

7 A It's the introductory class to the doctoral program where  
8 faculty come in and talk about the research they're doing.

9 Q And it's a semester long course?

10 A Yes. It's a non-credit course.

11 Q What happened if a teaching fellow or a research fellow,  
12 not so much if they were struggling, but they just sort of  
13 didn't show up or didn't do the work of the fellowship?

14 A We have not had a situation like that.

15 Q Fortunately.

16 A Yeah.

17 Q Would they continue to be in academic good standing?

18 A My guess is that it would relate to other things that were  
19 going on with their work, so we would see the whole situation.  
20 It's unlikely that a person would be doing that and not having  
21 problems in their classes, in other aspect of their work.

22 Q You mentioned in connection with training of teaching  
23 fellows, you referred to the Center for Teaching and Learning,  
24 and you referred to -- you said something about, if I  
25 understood you correctly, that the Annenberg School has fellows

1 at the Center for Teaching and Learning.

2 A In addition to their fellowships, in addition to the  
3 stipends, they have -- they are chosen by the -- they're chosen  
4 by the Center for Teaching and Learning. It's quite an honor  
5 and we had one last year, Elana Marris who becomes kind of  
6 liaison to other students. She takes classes, she gets certain  
7 kinds of training of how to teach well, and then she is  
8 expected to bring some of her knowledge back to other schools,  
9 but particularly the Annenberg School.

10 Q So -- and when you said it's separate from the fellowship,  
11 is she paid for the Center -- was she paid by the Center of  
12 Teaching and Learning?

13 A Yes, she is, and I'm trying -- I suspect -- I don't know  
14 absolutely sure, but I think as in the past, we add that to her  
15 stipend.

16 Q Okay. So she gets -- it's also a way that she earned  
17 additional funds.

18 A We add that to her stipend. I wouldn't put it the way you  
19 put it because as I said, the purpose of the -- of getting --  
20 we encourage students to go after awards so they can enhance  
21 their CVs, that's the idea as I said with the Canadian  
22 fellowships. It's not a matter of making more money from our  
23 standpoint, it's a matter of aggrandizing your reputation so  
24 that Elana is going to have a really -- you know, she's learned  
25 a lot about teaching, she knows that's her strong interest

1 area, and when she applies for a position she'll be able to say  
2 that she was a fellow in the Center for Teaching and Learning.  
3 She's also learned a heck of a lot about teaching and learning.

4 So that, you know, we want to encourage students to be  
5 thinking about that kind of fellowship.

6 Q So when you say she, you know, learns what she learns  
7 there and brings it back to the school, does she have a role in  
8 the training that you provide for teaching fellows?

9 A Yes. She will actually set up lunch seminars, where she  
10 will bring topics to the students and they'll discuss them,  
11 things of that sort.

12 Q And if you -- and that's -- you have that, you have the  
13 ability for a Center of Teaching and Learning -- teaching and  
14 learning fellow come and do that, only if you have someone in  
15 the Annenberg School who has received this honor from the  
16 Center of Teaching and Learning.

17 A But other times, we've had people from CTL who are not  
18 Annenberg people come to do similar things, and our students  
19 will go to other departments to learn. But there is a sense  
20 that I've heard students say that when it's our own student or  
21 student, then they bring direct communication related issues,  
22 it's much more relevant to their research and their teaching.

23 Q If you didn't have a teaching fellow -- you described in  
24 your large lecture class you had, you divide up the office  
25 hours for example.

1 A Yeah.

2 Q If you didn't have a teaching fellow or two or three  
3 teaching fellows to do that work, who would be doing the office  
4 hours?

5 A I wouldn't be teaching that class. We wouldn't have a  
6 class that large. Okay. It just wouldn't work. So we  
7 wouldn't do it.

8 Q You might have it, but it would have to be a smaller  
9 class.

10 A Yes.

11 Q And if it were a smaller class, who'd be doing that?

12 A I would.

13 Q And the same is true with all of the functions that get  
14 served by the teaching fellows, right?

15 A What do you mean by that?

16 Q So if you were developing an exam --

17 A Yes.

18 Q -- and you didn't have a teaching fellow to draft some of  
19 the questions, have the back and forth with, you'd be doing all  
20 the developing --

21 A Except it takes me longer to write an exam with a teaching  
22 fellow than it does to do it myself. The amount of work that  
23 it takes for me to write an exam in cooperation with the  
24 teaching fellows is part of the educational process. I could  
25 write that exam in a half a day, with the teaching fellows it



1 takes far longer because there's an educational component  
2 involved. They haven't done it before.

3 Q Would it take you longer to grade that exam without the  
4 teaching fellows?

5 A I -- again, if it were my class with a small number of  
6 people I would do it myself, yes. But you have to understand  
7 that's still part of the educational component.

8 Q I understand that, and I'm not -- well, I understand that.  
9 You talked about the sort of not exam grading, but the  
10 course grading for the undergraduate --

11 A Yes, uh-huh.

12 Q -- students being essentially a discussion with your  
13 teaching fellows, right?

14 A Not only that, but yes.

15 Q Yes. But -- and you said they know the students' names,  
16 you may know the face but not the names, that's because they're  
17 doing the office hours and meeting with the undergraduates,  
18 right?

19 A Yeah, I will meet students myself sometimes if they want  
20 to come to my office, but the great majority of work like that  
21 is theirs.

22 Q Okay. Is there any exception -- well, let me step back a  
23 second. Have you ever had a graduate student come in who had  
24 higher ed teaching experience say as an adjunct professor or  
25 something along those lines?

1 A I can't think of anyone like that.

2 Q Okay. You said that before the assignment process that is  
3 reflected in the letter that we saw, that the graduate student  
4 gives their first, second and third choice of what they would  
5 like to do.

6 A Uh-huh.

7 Q You need to say yes.

8 A Yes.

9 Q So they could say, I'd like to be a teaching fellow,  
10 right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q They could say I'd like to be a research fellow or do they  
13 get more specific than that?

14 A They can get more specific.

15 Q Okay. So they could say I want to be a research fellow  
16 with Dr. Turow.

17 A Exactly.

18 Q Or I want to be a --

19 A And much of this is done in collaboration with the  
20 professors themselves. So the professors actually also do the  
21 same kind of nominations. So this is a -- very much of a  
22 collaborative activity. The professors nominate students as  
23 well.

24 Q Meaning Professor Turow could say --

25 A I would like to work with Nora.

1 Q Yes, okay.

2 A And inevitably we bring them together, but that helps  
3 understand how to link people up.

4 Q Okay. When you were testifying on direct examination you  
5 talked about the kind of assistance that a professor would try  
6 to give to a teaching fellow say who was struggling.

7 Is one of the things that might be suggested that the  
8 student, if they're really struggling, that they move into a  
9 research fellowship instead?

10 A That has never happened, it really hasn't.

11 Q Okay.

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have on -- for right now,  
13 thank you.

14 MS. DANTE: I just have a few questions on redirect.

15 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

16 BY MS. DANTE:

17 Q Dr. Turow, do you know how many Annenberg Ph.D. students  
18 teach over the summer?

19 A Yes, I believe there are eight this summer.

20 Q Do you know how that compares to teaching fellows in the  
21 fall and spring?

22 A Much smaller.

23 Q Okay. You also testified on cross-examination that  
24 students will teach a class. Do you mean one session of a  
25 class over the course of a semester?

1 A Typically, yes. They -- it depends on the professor. In  
2 my case, they might even teach as I said about a half a class  
3 because if it's an hour and 20 minutes, they may teach part of  
4 it and another student may teach the other half.

5 Q So that's on one occasion during the semester?

6 A Yes, in my class. Some professors may do it differently.

7 Q Okay. How often do your classes meet?

8 A I meet twice a week.

9 Q Okay.

10 MS. DANTE: I have no further questions.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: Can I just ask one redirect -- recross  
13 rather?

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Uh-huh.

15 RECCROSS-EXAMINATION

16 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

17 Q What's the total number of doctoral students per class  
18 typically at Annenberg?

19 A In a doctoral class?

20 Q Yeah.

21 A I would say it's about seven to ten. Sometimes there's  
22 more, but if it's a class like social psychology communication  
23 we may have 20.

24 Q Oh, I'm sorry, I meant in a year. I didn't mean a  
25 classroom --

1 A Oh, you mean the number --

2 Q -- I mean the --

3 A -- of entering students.

4 Q Yes.

5 A Okay.

6 Q A cohort.

7 A We accept 12 to 15 a year doctoral students.

8 Q Okay. Thank you.

9 A I should say 12 to 15 enter a year.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: Thanks.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything?

12 Okay. I have a couple of questions.

13 THE WITNESS: Oh, you do? Okay.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I do. But it's not a lot, it's

15 not a lot I promise.

16 THE WITNESS: You've been paying attention.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I've been trying. I'm a good

18 listener.

19 Okay. So you mentioned that you're a professor. How --

20 did you say you had been a professor since 1986 or '96?

21 THE WITNESS: '86.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I just want to be sure.

23 THE WITNESS: Well, that's at Penn.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

25 THE WITNESS: But then I was a professor at Purdue before

1 that, P-u-r-d-u-e, not like the chickens.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I'm from Chicago.

3 THE WITNESS: Okay. So you know that. That's great,  
4 because I spelled to P-e-r for a long time.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: No, I'm familiar. How many Ph.D.  
6 students does Annenberg have?

7 THE WITNESS: At any one time about 75, in different  
8 stages of the completion.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The employer asked you some  
10 questions about Employer 27 which is the admission letter.

11 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh. Yes.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: They asked you questions about I  
13 believe it was, you know, how/why students get funding, you  
14 mentioned the funding is tied to activities, but the students  
15 do -- you said they must be a student in good standing. What  
16 does that mean?

17 THE WITNESS: There are requirements by the school and the  
18 university in terms of the grade point average that they should  
19 have, which basically that's what we're talking about. The  
20 student has to retain a certain kind of -- I believe it's a 3.5  
21 average, anything below of 3.5 they're in danger of not  
22 continuing in the program.

23 And as we also said, a student has to pass the  
24 qualification evaluation, which is at the end of the second  
25 year, which is both related to grades, but it's also related to

1 a general sense of whether the student can continue in the  
2 program because of an ability to do independent research or  
3 other issues like that.

4 And then there's the comprehensive examinations which the  
5 student has to take typically toward the end of their stay at  
6 Annenberg. Again a university mandated requirement, which is a  
7 set of exams, three days of examinations, they have to pass  
8 that.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Thank you.

10 Okay. As far as the teaching requirement, and your  
11 school, you call that a teaching fellow?

12 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh. Yes.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And they are -- students are  
14 required to do that at least one semester.

15 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And when they're doing the  
17 teaching fellow, is that always something they're doing in  
18 conjunction with the professor?

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

21 THE WITNESS: By definition, yeah.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is there a time where they are  
23 teaching alone?

24 THE WITNESS: Not as part of a teaching fellowship.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do teaching fellows get

1 evaluated?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How?

4 THE WITNESS: Well, the students can evaluate them through  
5 rating systems that are typically now on line, and the  
6 professor has an opportunity to evaluate them both as we said  
7 orally, talking to them, or even writing a memo that might go  
8 into their file if the student wants that.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And what's the purpose of the  
10 evaluation?

11 THE WITNESS: It can be multiple. Often it's simply  
12 feedback for the graduate student to help them understand what  
13 they can do better next time or in the future. Sometimes if  
14 the evaluations are really good, it can help them in their  
15 dossier that we discussed when they're looking for a job.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is there ever a time when maybe  
17 your department someone's evaluation has been bad?

18 THE WITNESS: I can't -- I don't know the particulars of  
19 every student who -- I don't see them to be honest, so I  
20 haven't looked. I could look at them, but I haven't looked at  
21 them. And so I assume that some students haven't done as good  
22 a job as the professor would have wanted, and that gets fed  
23 back to them as a way to improve, like in any other part of the  
24 educational program.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. What would happen if a



1 student is required to -- that a student is required to do the  
2 teaching fellow but they don't do it, or has that ever  
3 happened?

4 THE WITNESS: Never happened, they have to, at least one  
5 semester. No one ever says no.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I didn't know if maybe  
7 there was a time someone got ill or was having some sort of  
8 problems, something like that?

9 THE WITNESS: Oh, yeah, no. I mean, there have been  
10 sicknesses, but that's worked out, they still have to do the  
11 teaching portion.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So when they do the teaching  
13 fellowship, that's part of their -- that's related to the  
14 stipend that they receive?

15 THE WITNESS: It is part of the process through which they  
16 move through the school and they get a stipend when they are in  
17 the school as a student. I -- the two are linked, but not  
18 directly. We consider the stipend a way to help them move  
19 through the program.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. When a student is acting as  
21 a research fellow, this is a situation where they are doing  
22 research with a professor?

23 THE WITNESS: Yes.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And does that mean they're working  
25 on the professor's research?

1 THE WITNESS: It depends on the professor. Some  
2 professors will allow the students to do their own research  
3 with the help of the professor. Other students will be working  
4 with research that the professor is doing. Sometimes students  
5 will carve out part of the professor's work to do for  
6 themselves. It just -- it really depends.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How many research fellowships are  
8 required in this department?

9 THE WITNESS: Just one semester of a research fellowship.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

11 THE WITNESS: You have to have each semester year as a  
12 continuing student, you have to have a fellowship but  
13 technically you can have -- all teaching fellowships except for  
14 one semester of research fellowship, or you can have all  
15 research fellowships except for one semester of teaching  
16 fellowship.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. There was a term used I  
18 think from Union 38, DRF, that's dissertation research funding?

19 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

21 THE WITNESS: Dissertation research fellowship.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Fellowship, okay.

23 Now, I believe you also testified that at some point a  
24 student can do additional teaching that's not a teaching  
25 fellow.

1 THE WITNESS: No.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: When they teach in the summer.

3 THE WITNESS: If they get the opportunity to teach in the  
4 summer, yes.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. When they do that, do they  
6 get paid?

7 THE WITNESS: By the university, not by us.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And is this a time where they  
9 would be teaching a class alone or with another --

10 THE WITNESS: Yes, they teach the class alone, and it's  
11 typically they have had in one way or another experience  
12 through their doctoral program. So a student may teach mass  
13 meet and society in the summer, having been a teaching fellow  
14 for me on that class previously, see. So they get the  
15 experience teaching it through -- with the professor, and then  
16 if they're fortunate enough, they can teach it in the summer.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And one last question.  
18 When a graduate student is working as a teaching fellow or  
19 research fellow, who oversees their work?

20 THE WITNESS: The professor to whom they're assigned.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I don't have any other  
22 questions, does the union -- I mean, the employer, I'm sorry,  
23 it's your witness.

24 MS. DANTE: I do not.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union have other

1 questions?

2 MS. ROSENBERGER: One.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

4 FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION

5 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

6 Q Do students get a grade for the teaching fellowship or the  
7 research fellowship?

8 A No. There's no course credit, it's just part of the  
9 activity.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything else for the employer?

12 MS. DANTE: No.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Thank you. I appreciate  
14 it.

15 THE WITNESS: Sure.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: We can go off the record.

17 (Recessed at 12:16 p.m.)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A F T E R N O O N   S E S S I O N

(Time Noted: 1:34 p.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: The employer can call their next witness.

MS. DANTE: Yes, thanks. Penn calls Nora Lewis.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Good afternoon.

MS. LEWIS: Good afternoon.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your first and last name for the record, please.

MS. LEWIS: Yes, Nora, N-o-r-a, Lewis, L-e-w-i-s.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you raise your right hand?

NORA LEWIS, WITNESS, SWORN

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

MS. DANTE: Thank you.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. DANTE:

Q Good afternoon, Ms. Lewis. Where are you currently employed?

A I am the Vice Dean for Professional and Liberal Education in the School of Arts and Sciences at the University of Pennsylvania.

Q How long have you held that position?

A I have been in this role since 2010 and I was interim for about nine months before that.

1 Q How long have you been at Penn?

2 A Actually I came to Penn in 1985 as a graduate student, and  
3 I've been employed there since about 1990.

4 Q Okay. Can you tell me a little bit about your  
5 responsibilities as the Vice Dean for Professional and Liberal  
6 Education?

7 A Sure. So our division, the College of Liberal and  
8 Professional Studies is the lifelong learning and professional  
9 education division of arts and sciences. So we have quite a  
10 large and diverse portfolio. We truly work with learners  
11 across the lifespan, from high school students to retirees.

12 We have undergraduate and professional master's degree  
13 programs, we have a part-time adult bachelor of arts program,  
14 and several professional master degrees. We run the summer  
15 sessions for arts and sciences. We run some high school  
16 programs and we also have a series of non-credit programming  
17 including the university's English as a second language  
18 program, and some sort of non-credit programs that are tailored  
19 for organizations, partner university fraud and companies.

20 Q Okay. Can you tell us a little bit about LPS and what  
21 that stands for?

22 A Oh, I'm sorry, very acronym heavy. So LPS stands for the  
23 College of Liberal and Professional Studies, and that's  
24 actually the name of the division that I'm in charge of.

25 Q Okay. And is that division within SAS?

1 A Yes. It's part of Arts and Sciences, it's one of the  
2 three educational divisions in Arts and Sciences. We have the  
3 College of Arts and Sciences, which is the residential  
4 undergrad program, the graduate division which is all the  
5 research masters and Ph.D.'s and then LPS does everything else  
6 pretty much.

7 Q Okay. And you mentioned the summer program. How does the  
8 summer program work when it comes to SAS?

9 A Okay. So in the summer time, the College of Liberal and  
10 Professional Studies runs all of the summer sessions credit  
11 courses for arts and sciences at the undergraduate level and at  
12 the professional master's level.

13 So we roster just over 200 or so courses a summer. Most  
14 of them are undergraduate courses for -- that serve primarily  
15 our residential traditional undergraduates at Penn. Our part-  
16 time adult VA students in LPS, and some visiting students from  
17 universities around the world.

18 Q Okay. And you mentioned master's courses as well.

19 A Yes.

20 Q Do you know approximately how many master's courses you  
21 would have?

22 A So we generally run between 30 and 35 master's courses in  
23 the summer. There are eight professional master's programs in  
24 the school. Some of them really only offer master's thesis  
25 registration in the summer, but about five of them offer a

1 handful of courses, because most of our students are working  
2 professionals, and so they study -- sometimes they're studying  
3 year round in a part-time basis while they're working.

4 Q Are any Ph.D. courses offered through LPS in the summer?

5 A No, we never work with Ph.D. courses.

6 Q Okay. Are there different summer sessions?

7 A Yeah, so the summer semester, one big term is 11 weeks in  
8 length, but within that summer term there are three sub-terms,  
9 we call them, and of course, this can be rostered in one of  
10 those three terms. So there's an evening 11-week session that  
11 runs the entire summer semester. That serves primarily, again  
12 our working adult population students, either undergraduate or  
13 master's.

14 And then there are much bigger sessions with many more  
15 courses are the two, five and a half week summer one term. So  
16 summer begins May 22nd, this summer began May 22nd. Summer one  
17 term this year ran May 22nd to next Wednesday, June 28th.

18 Immediately after that ends, the second five and a half  
19 week summer terms begins, the summer two session. So that will  
20 run from Thursday, June 29th until -- let me see, Friday,  
21 August 4th.

22 Q Okay.

23 A The 11-week term runs that whole period, May 22nd to  
24 August 4th.

25 Q And you mentioned that most of the courses are taught



1 during either of those five and a half week sessions?

2 A Yes, the summer one or the summer two session, uh-huh.

3 Q Okay. How many -- approximately how many undergraduate  
4 courses are offered across all three of the sessions?

5 A So I believe the summer undergraduate courses about 185  
6 across all three terms.

7 Q Okay. And do you have an estimate of how many graduate  
8 students are engaged in teaching activities in the summer  
9 courses?

10 A Yes. So in the summer, the last couple of summers,  
11 including this summer, I would say there's somewhere between 90  
12 and 95 graduate students who are either instructor of record,  
13 grader, or teaching assistant.

14 Q And you mentioned that these courses are courses within  
15 the School of Arts and Sciences; is that right?

16 A Yes, uh-huh.

17 Q Have there been Wharton students who have taught as TA --  
18 as TA's in some of these courses within SAS during summer?

19 A Yes. So we always offer statistics courses in summer,  
20 they're very popular and those are usually staffed by Wharton  
21 and frequently graduate students are almost always graduate  
22 students are TAs or instructor of record for those courses.

23 Q Graduate students within Wharton?

24 A Yes, for the statistics, uh-huh.

25 Q And if a graduate student teaches in summer one, is that

1 predictive of whether they will also teach in summer session  
2 two?

3 A No. Only three to four students typically teach in both  
4 summer one and summer two.

5 Q If a graduate student is let's say a poor TA, is their  
6 funding impacted?

7 A Poor, do you mean poverty or poor quality?

8 Q Poor quality.

9 A Poor quality, okay. So -- no. No.

10 Q Are you aware of any Ph.D. student who was removed for  
11 poor performance as a TA?

12 A No.

13 Q What about, are you aware of any Ph.D. student who was  
14 issued corrective discipline for poor performance as a TA over  
15 the summer?

16 A No, I am not.

17 Q And what would you do if someone was struggling in the  
18 performance of their teaching activities over the summer?

19 A That's a -- yes. So we have had situations where graduate  
20 students were struggling in their teaching, and we work very  
21 closely with the University Center for Teaching and Learning,  
22 also with their academic department and their advisor,  
23 undergraduate and graduate chair of their department.

24 In the case of a couple of departments that -- where we  
25 have worked closely with their graduate students, the economics

1 department, the psychology department and the math department,  
2 those are all departments in arts and sciences, we created a  
3 mentor program in partnership with the departments, we, being  
4 LPS, created a mentor program with their department and the  
5 Center for Teaching and Learning. And we hired a more advanced  
6 graduate student from that department who had experience  
7 teaching and was a strong teacher to be a mentor for new  
8 graduate students in the department who are coming into their  
9 first teaching assignment.

10 So we have actually kind of proactively tried to work with  
11 departments where there are a lot of graduate students  
12 teaching, and where sometimes the courses are quite difficult  
13 and challenging and undergraduates need kind of more support  
14 and really strong pedagogy.

15 Q Why did you institute some of these mentoring programs,  
16 what's the purpose of that?

17 A There are two purposes really. One purpose is to make  
18 sure that our undergraduates in the courses are receiving the  
19 best possible education and they're able to master the material  
20 in the course, so we want the course experience to be good for  
21 the undergraduates in the course.

22 But the teaching assignments are also really important in  
23 terms of graduate student training, because our Ph.D. students  
24 are being prepared to go in the academic job market. And so  
25 learning how to teach undergraduate courses particularly intra-

1 level foundational courses, which can be some of the more  
2 challenging courses to teach, it's really important for us to  
3 help them develop strong skills and how you design and teach an  
4 undergraduate course and work with undergraduate students from  
5 a variety of backgrounds.

6 And in the summer, you get a wide variety of background,  
7 because we've got residential undergrads, LPS, part-time adult  
8 students who are returning to school maybe after many years,  
9 you have visiting students from other countries and other  
10 universities. So it's a particularly diverse mix of students,  
11 and that can be challenging and quantitatively oriented courses  
12 in particular and language courses.

13 Q Okay. You mentioned in your role as Vice Dean for  
14 Professional and Liberal Education that you also oversee  
15 professional masters; is that right?

16 A Yes, uh-huh.

17 Q So when it comes to professional masters in the School of  
18 Arts and Sciences, what are your responsibilities?

19 A So we manage and oversee those programs. Each master's  
20 program has a committee of standing or tenured faculty in the  
21 university who provide the academic governance, but we do all  
22 of the administration for those programs. So we recruit and  
23 admit students, we provide student services and support, we  
24 manage the budget and finances, and we work with the faculty  
25 governance committee to set academic policy, admission

1 standards, and to identify and hire instructors for the  
2 courses.

3 Q Do you sit on any sort of governance body when it comes to  
4 the administrative -- administration of professional master's  
5 at the university?

6 A Yes. So there are two levels of oversight, I would say at  
7 the level of the School of Arts and Sciences. The school  
8 bylaws mandate that there's a committee called the Committee on  
9 Graduate Continuing Education.

10 I co-chair that along with the graduate dean of Arts and  
11 Sciences. And it's a faculty made -- comprised of standing  
12 faculty, practitioner faculty because there are professional  
13 masters and we oversee the Arts and Sciences masters.

14 At the university level, I sit on the Council of  
15 Professional Masters Deans, which is an advisory body to the  
16 provost. It's chaired by the vice provost for education, and  
17 there is a representative from each of the 12 schools of the  
18 university who is engaged with their masters programs.

19 Q So that would include representatives from Wharton?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And representatives from engineering as well?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Do master students pay tuition?

24 A In Arts and Sciences, all master students pay tuition.  
25 They're expected to be self-funded.

1 Q Is there a service requirement as part of their academic  
2 program?

3 A No, not in any of our programs.

4 Q I wanted to just go back to one thing you mentioned about  
5 some of the courses particularly the statistics and the  
6 quantitative courses that are taught in LPS over the summer.

7 You mentioned that Wharton students have taught as TAs of  
8 those SAS courses, and you gave the example of statistics. Are  
9 there any other examples that you can think of where Wharton  
10 students have taught courses in SAS?

11 A I believe in the past there is a required quantitative  
12 course in our master public administration degree and the  
13 Fellows Institute of Government, and I believe in years past,  
14 we have had Ph.D. students from Wharton who were TAs on that  
15 course.

16 Q And the Fellows Institute falls within the umbrella of the  
17 School of Arts and Sciences?

18 A Yes, I'm sorry, it's one of the professional masters that  
19 reports in through my division, yeah.

20 Q Okay.

21 MS. DANTE: I have no further questions of this witness.

22 CROSS-EXAMINATION

23 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

24 Q Good afternoon.

25 A Hi.

1 Q My name is Amy Rosenberger and I'm one of the lawyers for  
2 the union in this case and I have some questions for you too.

3 Let's start where you were leaving off there. You were  
4 asked by Ms. Dante if you -- if Wharton students teach in SAS  
5 courses and you gave an example, in addition besides  
6 statistics, and you gave this Fellows Institute of  
7 Government --

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q -- course.

10 Is that in SAS generally that the Wharton students teach  
11 or in LPS in your professional masters programs?

12 A I can't speak to generally where they teach. I was  
13 speaking just to my division of Arts and Sciences.

14 Q Which is the College of Liberal --

15 A Continuing and professional education, right, College of  
16 Liberal and Professional Studies.

17 Q Okay. And just so I'm -- everybody else may be clear, but  
18 I'm not.

19 A It's very confusing.

20 Q So within the School of Arts and Sciences, big umbrella is  
21 the School of Arts and Sciences, right?

22 A Yeah, correct.

23 Q Smaller -- the three divisions under that, one that is the  
24 College of Liberal and Professional Studies --

25 A Correct.

1 Q -- where you are. One that is the College of Arts and  
2 Sciences that is undergraduate residential.

3 A Correct.

4 Q And one that is the graduate programs that we've already  
5 heard about --

6 A Correct.

7 Q -- to a large degree.

8 Okay. Are -- with regard to the graduate students who  
9 teach, whether as a TA or an instructor of record in the  
10 College of Liberal and Professional Studies, do they teach --  
11 is teaching in the College of Liberal and Professional Studies  
12 a degree requirement?

13 A For Ph.D. students?

14 Q Yes.

15 A I don't know. I don't think so.

16 Q Okay. If you have people doing that as a TA and others  
17 doing it as instructor of record, what's the difference in what  
18 those two people are doing? How do we distinguish who's going  
19 to be designated as a TA and who's going to be an instructor of  
20 record?

21 A So the College of Liberal and Professional Studies does  
22 not make those decisions. I should explain that the way we  
23 roster or put courses together, we work with academic  
24 departments, for example, sociology or economics or English.  
25 And the academic department and the faculty in that department



1 we tell them the types of courses we need for the populations  
2 we're going to be serving, whether it's in the academic year or  
3 in the summer. We give them a wish list of the types of  
4 courses, or the specific courses we want.

5 They come back, the department will come back to LPS with  
6 a proposal for these ten courses that we want to offer, and  
7 they determine who will staff them. Whether the courses run or  
8 not is enrollment dependent. So my division is really a  
9 completely tuition driven unit. And we require a minimum  
10 enrollment in order to run a course.

11 So the department, let's say for example, English or TAs  
12 are more common in the sciences and some of the social  
13 sciences, so let's take chemistry. Chemistry would come back  
14 to us to say, we're going to offer chemistry 201 and here's the  
15 person who's going to be the instructor of record. You have 50  
16 students expected in this course, there will be two TAs, here  
17 are the names of the teaching assistants.

18 Q And the number of TAs depends on how many students there  
19 are in the course.

20 A The type of course and how many students.

21 Q Okay. So is it possible to have a course where the  
22 instructor of record is a Ph.D. student and they have a TA in  
23 addition?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Okay. And in that case, the instructor of record is the

1 person who is responsible for the course, right?

2 A Correct.

3 Q And the TA -- what function, if you have an instructor of  
4 record and a TA in a course in your program, what does the TA  
5 do?

6 A So again, it will depend on what the subject matter is in  
7 the courses, but for example, they may be running a lab and  
8 handling the -- so in a basic chemistry course, there's a  
9 lecture portion that the instructor of record would handle, and  
10 there would be lab assignments that the students every week in  
11 the chemistry lab.

12 The instructor of record would determine what the lab  
13 assignments and activities are, but the TA would actually run  
14 and supervise the labs with the students in it. It's also  
15 common to have recitation, what we call recitation sections,  
16 which are like discussion sessions that are often required with  
17 certain types of courses, like a big political science lecture  
18 where maybe there are 80 or 100 students but in order to make  
19 sure all the students are really having a good opportunity to  
20 engage with the material and understanding and ask questions,  
21 they will be required to register, in addition to the lecture  
22 that meets three times a week, they may have to -- they will  
23 have to register for a non-credit recitation or discussion  
24 section tied to the big course. There may be 25 students, 20  
25 students in that recitation section. And often a TA may -- a

1 teaching assistant would lead those discussion recitation  
2 sections, sometimes with the instructor of record, sometimes by  
3 themselves.

4 Teaching assistants in other courses often help with  
5 grading, that's very common proctoring exams and grading under  
6 the supervision of the instructor of record. Those are the  
7 most common kinds of assignments.

8 Q And if I understand you correctly, so you are not deciding  
9 who teaches any of the classes that get -- that run through  
10 your program, it's the department faculty within the School of  
11 Arts and Sciences who determine that.

12 A At the undergraduate level that is correct.

13 Q The graduate level?

14 A In the professional masters programs, there aren't  
15 necessarily departments that are making those decisions, but  
16 there's these faculty oversight committees and LPS staff who  
17 are credentialed in that area, but they're professional staff  
18 running the programs, they have a voice along with the faculty  
19 on the oversight committee as to who teaches -- what courses  
20 are offered and who can teach them.

21 So it's a similar process. I would say we have more voice  
22 with professional masters level, it's a collaboration between  
23 practitioners and that professional domain and academics.

24 At the undergraduate level, those decisions are being made  
25 by the academic departments.

1 Q Okay. And so do you know whether -- let me step back a  
2 second. Is that process the same, whether it's a course that's  
3 offered in LPS undergraduate courses offered in LPS in the  
4 summer or during spring or fall terms?

5 A The process of who assigns?

6 Q Yes.

7 A Yes. So for the College of Liberal and Professional  
8 Studies for undergraduate courses in our division, the process  
9 is the same fall, spring and summer.

10 Q You mentioned at one point, you talked about your students  
11 being -- see where this is -- largely people who are working  
12 professional -- working professions we reobtaining a degree; is  
13 that true? I wasn't sure whether you were talking specifically  
14 about undergraduate students, graduate -- masters --  
15 professional masters students or both.

16 A Both.

17 Q So do the students -- do the masters students in liberal  
18 and professional studies take on teaching assistant positions  
19 or research assistant positions at the university?

20 A Not to my knowledge, it'd be very rare.

21 Q They're working somewhere else?

22 A They're working full time in consulting or geoscience  
23 or --

24 Q Whatever the case may be.

25 A -- government.

1 Q Yeah.

2 A Yeah.

3 Q Okay. You testified that you've never known of someone --  
4 a graduate student working -- teaching a course or TA'ing a  
5 course in LPS who faced some sort of impact for poor quality  
6 performance.

7 Are you aware of anyone who performed poorly in teaching  
8 one of the courses through your program?

9 A I'm aware that there have been those cases and they were  
10 the genesis of us developing the mentoring program in  
11 connection with the departments and the Center for Teaching and  
12 Learning. I cannot think of any specific individual because  
13 I'm going back probably 11 or 12 years.

14 Q Okay. Are you -- do regular faculty also teach in the  
15 Fellowship Liberal and Professional Studies?

16 A Yes. Five to ten percent of our undergraduate courses in  
17 a semester are taught by tenure track or standard track.

18 Q Five to ten percent.

19 A Uh-huh.

20 Q And the other 90 to 95 percent are taught by who?

21 A A combination of full time professional staff, lecturers,  
22 both full time and part-time lecturers who are not in the  
23 tenure track. Many times those are practitioners and graduate  
24 students.

25 Q What proportion of your courses are taught by graduate

1 students?

2 A As instructor of record?

3 Q Let's start with that.

4 A So in the summer of the 185 courses this summer, about 40  
5 percent, I think around 70 courses have a graduate student as  
6 the instructor of record. That is much lower in the fall and  
7 spring. It ranges between 20 and 25 percent of courses, and we  
8 offer, on the order of 150 undergraduate courses in the fall  
9 and in the spring, and about 20 to 25 percent each semester are  
10 taught by graduate students.

11 Q And the rest are taught by?

12 A Lecturers, either full time, fully affiliated lecturers or  
13 part-time lecturers.

14 Q Graduate students who are instructors of record in LPS get  
15 a stipend from LPS; is that right?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And that's whether it's fall, spring or summer?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And it's not teaching in LPS is not part of the --  
20 whatever funding package, whether it's a Ben Franklin  
21 Fellowship or whatever funding package of their doctoral  
22 program, is it?

23 A So if I could amend what I just said. In the fall and  
24 spring there are some departments and some students who teach  
25 in LPS as part of their funding package and assignment. I

1 don't know the specific numbers.

2 Q Okay. Because you're not making those assignments.

3 A Right.

4 Q It's coming from the department.

5 A Right.

6 Q Okay.

7 A In the summer, everyone is paid a stipend.

8 Q The stipend that's set at LPS.

9 A Yes.

10 Q So I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 39, and  
11 I recognize this is from a couple of years ago, but do you  
12 recognize what that is?

13 A Yes.

14 Q What is it?

15 A This is our stipend schedule for the College of Liberal  
16 and Professional Studies.

17 Q And do you put something like this out every year, letting  
18 folks know what the stipend schedule will be for the year?

19 A Yes.

20 Q So it looks like you have a particular level of stipend  
21 for anyone who teaches in the College of Liberal and  
22 Professional Studies, just depending on whether they're full  
23 professor, associate professor, what their status is.

24 A Correct.

25 Q And there's one that is particularly for a Penn graduate

1 student.

2 A Correct.

3 Q And it's the same for this -- this was for the '14/'15  
4 academic year, right?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And --

7 A Well, according to what you gave me.

8 Q Yeah, well, it reports to be from you. Right, was it from  
9 you?

10 A Yes, yes.

11 Q Okay. And it's -- the stipends that are listed on this  
12 chart are for -- are the same at any point, if the person  
13 teaches in fall, spring or summer, right?

14 A Correct.

15 Q With the exception being if someone -- you had -- I don't  
16 mean to misrepresent the record. So you had just given an  
17 example that in some cases, a graduate student might be  
18 teaching in LPS as part of their funding package, right?

19 A Correct.

20 Q So that -- they wouldn't get this stipend on top of that  
21 if they were teaching as part of their --

22 A Correct.

23 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union Exhibit  
24 39.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection from the employer?



1 MS. DANTE: No objection.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Union 39 is received.

3 (Union's Exhibit No. 39 received)

4 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

5 Q Do -- so Ph.D. students teach in LPS, right?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Do Penn masters students teach in LPS?

8 A Not to my knowledge.

9 Q Do graduate students in the -- from the law school teach  
10 at LPS?

11 A Not to my knowledge.

12 Q Med school?

13 A Yes, sometimes.

14 Q And I guess I should be careful about that. So doctoral  
15 students from the medical school or MD students from the  
16 medical school?

17 A I don't know.

18 Q What about dental school students?

19 A Not to my knowledge.

20 Q And veterinary school students?

21 A I don't know.

22 Q Okay. Do you -- I don't know whether you know this or  
23 not, so if you don't just tell me you don't know and we'll ask  
24 someone else. But do you know when a graduate student is --  
25 let's pick the summer in particular. When a graduate student

1 is teaching a course in LPS, do you know how they are listed in  
2 payroll system, what their classification is that's listed in  
3 the payroll system?

4 A I don't want to speculate because I don't do payroll.

5 Q That's okay, if you don't know, you don't know, that's  
6 fair enough.

7 Who supervises the work of a graduate student who is the  
8 instructor of record in LPS?

9 A Their academic department. The subject -- the department  
10 that owns the subject they're teaching.

11 Q Okay.

12 A Graduate groups in arts and sciences are not necessarily  
13 mapped one-to-one with academic departments. So a course comes  
14 out of an academic department or an academic program, so it  
15 might be an interdisciplinary international relations course.

16 You could -- and I'm giving a hypothetical example.

17 Q Sure.

18 A The graduate student could be from political science or  
19 the graduate student could be from anthropology or sociology or  
20 history. So -- but it would be the faculty who run the  
21 international relations, the undergraduate program could be  
22 responsible for overseeing quality in the instruction.

23 Q Okay.

24 A LPS does monitor as well, we look at all the course  
25 evaluations, student complaints come to us if there are any

1 usually. Sometimes they'll go to the department, sometimes  
2 they will come to us, but we always work with the academic  
3 department to resolve any issues.

4 Q Okay. And is the same true with regard to the supervisory  
5 structure for graduate students working as teaching assistants  
6 in an LPS course?

7 A Yes. The first line of supervision would be the  
8 instructor of record for the course that they're TA'ing for.  
9 And then the next line would be the faculty leadership of the  
10 department that the course is from.

11 Q Okay. Did I understand you correctly from your direct  
12 examination that graduate students, in addition to function as  
13 instructors of record, were teaching assistants in LPS courses  
14 they also sometimes serve as graders.

15 A Yes.

16 Q It's a separate role or separate classification than the  
17 teaching assistant might also do grading, right?

18 A That's correct.

19 Q A grader's sole function is to grade exams --

20 A Correct.

21 Q -- or papers or --

22 A There are very few courses that do not have a teaching  
23 assistant role, but who may have a greater role, which is  
24 strictly grading, nothing else.

25 Q Are there courses that have both a teaching assistant and

1 a grader?

2 A I don't know.

3 Q Okay. And for your purposes when you have someone who is  
4 brought on just to serve as a grader, do they get paid the  
5 graduate student stipend or do they get paid some other rate?

6 A No, they get paid another rate.

7 Q As an hourly rate or just a different stipend?

8 A No, it's a different stipend, it's lower. I believe the  
9 standing grading stipend this summer is \$2,000.

10 Q The College of Liberal and Professional Studies has the  
11 same academic calendar as the university as a whole; isn't that  
12 right?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Do you know whether payroll taxes are paid out of the  
15 stipend that is paid to graduate students working either as a  
16 teaching assistant or an instructor of record in LPS?

17 A I'm sorry, I have no idea.

18 Q I know, you don't do --

19 A I look at finances at big level. I don't do payroll.

20 Q Let me just double-check, I think I might be done.

21 When you -- you talked about the university level  
22 committee that you sit on that is the Committee of Professional  
23 Masters Deans, that committee has representatives from all 12  
24 schools or just certain schools?

25 A No. The Council of Professional Masters Deans has

1 representation from all 12 schools.

2 Q Are there other schools -- if you know, are there other  
3 schools besides SAS that have summer courses?

4 A Yes. There are undergraduate courses from Wharton  
5 Engineering, I don't know about nursing.

6 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have for you at this time,  
7 thank you.

8 THE WITNESS: Okay.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the employer have any  
10 additional questions?

11 MS. DANTE: Just a few.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

14 BY MS. DANTE:

15 Q Ms. Lewis, are there more courses offered during the  
16 spring and fall semesters than there are during the summer at  
17 the university?

18 MS. ROSENBERGER: I'm sorry, just so the record is clear,  
19 are you talking about the university or in LPS?

20 MS. DANTE: At the university.

21 MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay.

22 THE WITNESS: In the whole university, a huge number more  
23 in the fall and spring than in the summer. In the summer, we  
24 run all the courses for arts and sciences, and it's only about  
25 180, 185. There are ten times that many just in arts and

1 sciences undergraduate in the academic year.

2 BY MS. DANTE:

3 Q Okay. And if you could take a quick look at Union 39. I  
4 see that graduate students receive a stipend of \$5,380. Would  
5 you say that it's less expensive to have graduate students  
6 teach than it is lecturers in LPS?

7 A In terms of the stipend alone, they're at the lower scale  
8 of the stipend, but they're much more expensive for the school,  
9 and in certain aspects for LPS. Our lecturer B, the next  
10 category as well as our standing faculty tend to teach for us  
11 in an ongoing way over many years. Graduate students teach for  
12 us once and usually it's very rare for graduate students --  
13 there's a handful who teach more than once. And the school  
14 investment in them, the cost of graduate students is much more  
15 than a lecturer B.

16 MS. DANTE: I don't have any further questions.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the union?

18 MS. ROSENBERGER: I have -- yeah, just one follow-up to  
19 that.

20 RE CROSS-EXAMINATION

21 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

22 Q So if you're -- so when you're talking about that, you're  
23 talking about the total compensation to a graduate student  
24 which would include their funding package, right?

25 A Correct.

1 Q And if we compared them to say the total compensation for  
2 an assistant professor, that's going to be more than the total  
3 compensation for a Penn graduate student, right?

4 A I don't know what the total compensation for a Penn  
5 graduate student is, and assistant professor salaries vary a  
6 lot as well.

7 Q Okay.

8 A So I don't have data to really --

9 Q But you have data on what lecturers make.

10 A Yes.

11 Q What lecturers make in LPS, what do they make elsewhere in  
12 the university?

13 A The LPS -- in the whole university I don't know. In arts  
14 and sciences, this scale is the scale for lecturers.

15 MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay. That's all I have.

16 MS. DANTE: Nothing further.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I have a few questions just to  
18 follow-up.

19 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: In the beginning you said, when we  
21 were going through I guess the time you've been at Penn, did  
22 you say you have been at Penn since 1995 as a graduate student?

23 THE WITNESS: '85.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I want to be sure that I'm  
25 clear on the definition of the different terms. You used the

1 term instructor and then grader and then TA. So what's the  
2 difference between an instructor and a TA?

3 THE WITNESS: So the instructor of record is the person  
4 leading the course, they're standing in front of the classroom,  
5 they're responsible for the syllabus, the teaching, designing  
6 the assessments, grading, ultimately the grades the students  
7 receive.

8 A teaching assistant supports the instructor of record  
9 whether that's a professor or a lecturer. And the teaching  
10 assistant could do a variety of things to assist the lecturer.  
11 They might help with grading. They might run discussion  
12 sections or a lab, run laboratories in science classes, meet  
13 with students for extra help.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is an instructor ever a graduate  
15 student?

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I believe the employer  
18 asked you whether or not Wharton students had TA'd in LPS. Has  
19 -- do engineering students TA in LPS?

20 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And I believe the employer  
22 asked about TAs and whether or not if they're poor quality is  
23 their stipend affected, you said no.

24 What about if an instructor is of poor quality, is that  
25 the same answer?



1 THE WITNESS: Same answer.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Whether they're a lecturer  
3 or a graduate student?

4 THE WITNESS: Correct.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I believe you testified that a TA  
6 had not been removed for poor performance. Has an instructor  
7 been removed for poor performance?

8 THE WITNESS: Not to my knowledge.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you know whether an  
10 instructor has been issued discipline?

11 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I guess for instructor issues.

13 THE WITNESS: For academic issues you mean?

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Uh-huh. As far as in their role  
15 as an instructor.

16 THE WITNESS: Not issued discipline, if it is a lecturer,  
17 not a graduate student a lecturer, they might not be hired in  
18 the future to teach if the quality of their teaching was  
19 unsatisfactory and they did not remediate it with our help and  
20 support. But they have not been removed or disciplined in the  
21 middle of a course.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. What about if it's an  
23 instructor or a TA that's a graduate student, if there was an  
24 issue with their teaching, would that affect whether or not  
25 they would be rehired?

1 THE WITNESS: That would be the call of the academic  
2 department, and a lot of effort is put into working with  
3 graduate students on their teaching to help and support them.  
4 So that would be up to the department.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: That they come from.

6 THE WITNESS: Right. And most graduate students who teach  
7 in LPS don't teach over the long haul, they teach once, maybe  
8 twice.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I've heard a lot of  
10 testimony about masters programs and now you said a new term  
11 today. What is a professional masters?

12 THE WITNESS: So it's a terminal masters that prepares  
13 students for a profession or a professional domain, so for  
14 instance, applying geoscience. We are preparing students in  
15 that masters of science, and applied geoscience to sit for an  
16 engineering geology licensure or master of medical and physics,  
17 prepares students to sit for the American Board of Radiology  
18 licensure as a medical physicist.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How many professional masters does  
20 LPS offer?

21 THE WITNESS: Eight right now. There's a ninth that  
22 begins in the fall.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh, okay. Can you name them?

24 THE WITNESS: Yes. Are you ready?

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yes.

1 THE WITNESS: And I won't use the acronym.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

3 THE WITNESS: The master of science in organizational  
4 dynamics. The master of public administration; the master of  
5 liberal arts, the master of environmental studies, the master  
6 of science in applied geoscience, the master of medical  
7 physics, the master of chemical sciences, the master of applied  
8 positive psychology, and the master of behavioral and decision  
9 sciences. I think that was nine.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

11 THE WITNESS: Now you see why we use acronyms all the  
12 time.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I do.

14 THE WITNESS: It's a mouthful.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Just a few more. Just give me a  
16 moment, please.

17 You gave the example of that when the union asked you some  
18 questions of a chemistry class where the instructor or you  
19 talked about the difference between the instructor of record  
20 versus the TA. I just want to clarify. The instructor of  
21 record in that situation could be a graduate student or would  
22 that have to be a faculty member?

23 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure. I am trying to think of a --  
24 in theory, it could be a graduate student, I can't think of any  
25 examples where it has been.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. As far as the grader role,  
2 I think you said if someone is a grader, that's their sole  
3 function but very few courses just have someone who's only  
4 categorized as a grader.

5 THE WITNESS: Correct.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is that person a graduate student  
7 or would that person be a non-graduate student?

8 THE WITNESS: Yes, a grader could be a graduate student or  
9 a non-graduate student.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know how many graders you  
11 have in LPS?

12 THE WITNESS: I do not.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you have any?

14 THE WITNESS: Yes.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

16 THE WITNESS: There are at least a couple on the summer  
17 sessions list. They're course specific, so we don't -- not  
18 positions that exist in LPS, they're tied to a particular type  
19 of course.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Who are they paid by?

21 THE WITNESS: LPS.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you ever call a grader a  
23 student worker?

24 THE WITNESS: No.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: You just call them a grader?

1 THE WITNESS: Correct.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know what a -- are you  
3 familiar with the term student worker?

4 THE WITNESS: We -- the term that we use is a work study  
5 student, meaning usually an undergraduate student who has  
6 federal work study money as part of their financial aid package  
7 and they're usually doing administrative tasks in our office.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

9 In your department, are the LPS instructors evaluated?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How?

12 THE WITNESS: All LPS instructors are evaluated with the  
13 same means that any instructor in arts and sciences evaluated.  
14 There is a -- there are standard course evaluations that are  
15 administered at the end of every course, every term. They're  
16 anonymous and the results are aggregated and available through  
17 a secure web system. But there's not a -- and then full time  
18 faculty and full time lecturers have a kind of annual  
19 performance evaluation, but part-time lecturers and graduate  
20 students to my knowledge do not.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So the graduate students  
22 would just be subject to the end of the year or end of the  
23 course.

24 THE WITNESS: The course evaluations at the end of the  
25 term.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And what does your department do  
2 with those course evaluations that you receive for graduate  
3 students?

4 THE WITNESS: That's a very good question. So the course  
5 evaluations are web based, and so the data is in secure data  
6 suppository. Honesty, for graduate students, we always look at  
7 the course evaluations just to determine, you know, how things  
8 went, is the course working for the types of students that  
9 we're serving, but we don't use them for any purpose other than  
10 really looking to serve our students.

11 If it were a full time lecturer who teaches for us  
12 regularly, we would be using it as part of their professional  
13 development. So I imagine the departments might be doing  
14 something similar for the graduate students. We're not the  
15 only ones with access to it, so access to the course evaluation  
16 system is available to department chairs, undergraduate chairs,  
17 deans.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Would you use a course evaluation  
19 for a graduate student to determine whether or not they could  
20 come back and teach again in LPS?

21 THE WITNESS: We would not make that determination, that  
22 would be their advisor and their graduate chair and their  
23 undergraduate chair in the department, academic department.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I don't have any other  
25 questions. Does the employer?

1 MS. DANTE: No.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union?

3 MS. ROSENBERGER: Just one.

4 FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION

5 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

6 Q Who -- when you mentioned that poor performance by a  
7 lecturer might mean they wouldn't get rehired, is that a  
8 decision that would be made by the department or by LPS?

9 A Both. We -- LPS would not make it in isolation from the  
10 department. The department with the dean's office, have at  
11 times, approached us to say that we're concerned. And it  
12 usually would not happen without I've heard it, you know,  
13 working with that lecturer.

14 MS. ROSENBERGER: Thank you.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything else from the employer?

16 MS. DANTE: Nothing further.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. We're finished. Thank you.  
18 I appreciate it. You could just leave it there.

19 Can we go off the record for a moment?

20 (Whereupon, the proceedings were recessed at 2:27 p.m.,  
21 this date.)

22 \* \* \* \* \*

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before  
the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION 4

In the Matter of:

THE TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

and

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER, UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA  
(GET-UP) A/W AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 04-RC-199609

Date: June 20, 2017

Place: Philadelphia, PA

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original  
transcript thereof for the files of the Board.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Official Reporter

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC  
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206  
Wayne, New Jersey 07470  
(973) 692-0660