

BEFORE THE
NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF
PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

Case No. 04-RC-199609

And

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER-
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA
(GET-UP), a/w AMERICAN
FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice before MARY R. LEACH, Hearing Officer, at the National Labor Relations Board, Region 4, 615 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, 19106, in Hearing Room 3, on Thursday, June 29, 2017, at 10:00 a.m.

A P P E A R A N C E S

On Behalf of the Employer:

DAVID S. FRYMAN, ESQ.
DANIEL V. JOHNS, ESQ.
KATHERINE J. ATKINSON, ESQ.
MEREDITH SWARTZ DANTE, ESQ.
Ballard Spahr, LLP
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-7199
(215) 665-8500
fryman@ballardspahr.com

On Behalf of the Petitioner:

AMY L. ROSENBERGER, ESQ.
LAUREN HOYE, ESQ.
Law Offices of Willig, Williams & Davidson
1845 Walnut Street, 24th Floor
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
(215) 656-3622
arosenberger@wwdlaw.com

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660

I N D E X

<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RECROSS</u>	<u>VOIR DIRE</u>
Rosemary Clark	2020	2077	2116	--	--
Allison Russell	2133	2162	2175	--	--
Ozan Kiratli	2183	2221	2246	--	--

<u>EXHIBITS</u>	<u>E X H I B I T S</u> <u>IDENTIFIED</u>	<u>RECEIVED</u>
EMPLOYER'S		
E-76	2086	2113
E-77	2109	2113
E-78	2113	2114
E-79	2114	2115
E-80	2166	2183
E-81	2226	2246
PETITIONER'S		
P-72	2023	2025
P-73	2029	2032
P-74	2035	2037
P-75	2037	2045
P-76	2046	2052
P-77	2053	2054
P-78	2055	2056
P-79	2059	2060
P-80	2068	2072
P-81	2072	2074
P-82	2136	2139
P-83	2139	2146
P-84	2158	2161
P-85	2188	2190
P-86	2194	2195

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Time Noted: 11:07 a.m.)

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

Okay, the Union can call their next witness.

MS. ROSENBERGER: Our next witness is Rosemary Clark.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Good morning.

MS. CLARK: Good morning.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your name for the record, please?

Ms. CLARK: My name is Rosemary Clark. It's R-O-S-E-M-A-R-Y C-L-A-R-K.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you -- is it all -- is the "R" the only capital?

MS. CLARK: Yes.

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. All right, can you raise your right hand, please?

(Whereupon,

ROSEMARY CLARK,

was called as a witness by and on behalf of the Petitioner and, after having been duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:)

HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, thank you.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

Q Ms. Clark, before we start into your testimony, I want to

1 make sure you understand the procedure that we've been
2 operating under here. So, I'll ask you questions on direct
3 examination. And when your direct examination is done, the
4 lawyers for the University will take a break, determine whether
5 there's any records that might be in your -- in their files
6 about you that they might want to use. They'll come -- on
7 cross-examination.

8 A Um-hum.

9 Q They'll come back, they'll explain to us the general
10 categories of records, if there are any, that they want to use,
11 and at that point, you'll have an opportunity, if you wish, to
12 look at the records in private, with no one else in the room
13 with you, next door here. And you can do that or not, as you
14 wish, and then state whether you agree to have those records be
15 part of the record in this case.

16 A Okay.

17 Q Okay. Do you understand that? Do you agree to that?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. You're a graduate student at University of
20 Pennsylvania?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. And what degree are you pursuing?

23 A I'm pursuing my Ph.D. in communications.

24 Q And how many years have you been in the Ph.D. program?

25 A I just finished my fourth year.

1 Q And what was your educational background before you came
2 to the University of Pennsylvania?

3 A I started at Penn immediately after finishing my
4 undergraduate degree. I got my bachelor's in communications in
5 English from Ursinus College.

6 Q And what school is your program in at Penn?

7 A The Annenberg School for Communication.

8 Q And are there departments within that school? Or
9 divisions within the doctoral program?

10 A There are not. No.

11 Q So, you're just in the doctoral program for Annenberg?

12 A Right. Yeah.

13 Q And do you have a specific dissertation topic that you're
14 focusing on?

15 A Yes. So, my dissertation, in short, looks at feminist
16 social movements in the United States and their media prefaces.
17 The kinds of media that they make in their media topics.

18 Q Okay. And do you have a plan for what you would like to
19 do once you get your degree?

20 A Ideally, I would like to stay in academia. Find a tenure
21 track job or a post-doc somewhere.

22 Q Okay. So, you said you're in your fourth year.

23 A Um-hum.

24 Q So, you would have started at Penn in 2013-14 academic
25 year?

1 A Yes, that's right.

2 Q Okay. And when you applied to Penn, did you get some
3 written confirmation of your acceptance into the program?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Did you provide me a copy of that written acceptance?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And do you agree to have that be made an exhibit in this
8 case?

9 A Yes.

10 (Petitioner's P-72 marked.)

11 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

12 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 72. Do
13 you recognize that?

14 A Yes.

15 Q What is it?

16 A It's my acceptance letter to Annenberg.

17 Q Okay. And it -- in that first paragraph, it informs you
18 that you're accepted. And it, in the last sentence it says,
19 "We had a record number of applicants this year and have
20 selected a fascinating and diverse group of students for Fall
21 of 2013."

22 Did you begin the program in the fall of 2013?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And then the second paragraph talks about the offer of
25 admission carries with it full tuition scholarship, an academic

1 year stipend of 25 -- I'm sorry, \$24,000, and individual
2 student health insurance for four years. So, did you get all
3 of those things for your first four years?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And are they -- are you getting them anymore?

6 A So, I'm -- I'm getting what comes in the next sentence, in
7 the summer. And then next year I'll be on the Dissertation
8 Research Fund, which --

9 Q Okay.

10 A -- I believe is discussed in the one-, two-, three-,
11 fourth paragraph of this letter.

12 Q Okay. So, let's take that one at a time.

13 A Sure.

14 Q You -- you said then -- the next sentence after the one I
15 read says, "Students are eligible to apply for \$4,000 of summer
16 funding." So, you have that this summer?

17 A Yes, that's right.

18 Q And did you apply for and receive that each summer of your
19 time in the program so far?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And then the sentence after that says, "Your funding is
22 contingent upon your date of enrollment, satisfactory academic
23 progress, and performance as a teaching or research fellow."

24 Have you performed as a teaching or research fellow?

25 A Yes.

1 Q One or both?

2 A Both.

3 Q Okay.

4 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union 72.

5 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 72 is received.

7 (Petitioner's P-72 received.)

8 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

9 Q How many semesters of teaching or research fellowships
10 have you done?

11 A So, I've completed eight semesters as a fellow. Three
12 times as a teaching fellow, and five times as a research
13 fellow.

14 Q So, let's talk about each of those, and I'll -- will take
15 you chronological order.

16 A Sure.

17 Q So, did you have a teaching or research fellowship in the
18 first semester in fall of 2013?

19 A I had a research fellowship.

20 Q Okay. And what did you do for that research fellowship?

21 A I worked for Dr. Barbie Zelizer, who at the time was
22 going preliminary research for a book that she's still writing
23 on cold war journalism in the United States.

24 My job was to collect primary source material for her.

25 So, copies of news articles printed during the period she was

1 interested from the types of newspapers she was interested in
2 from online archives. So, essentially, I -- we had a set of
3 key word we were using to find them. I would find them, print
4 them, and organize them for her research.

5 Q Okay. So, you said this was for a book she was working
6 on?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Do you know if the book's been published yet?

9 A I do not believe it has been yet, no.

10 Q Do you know whether you're going to get any, sort of,
11 co-authorship credit?

12 A I won't get co-authorship credit, no.

13 Q And does that research have any connection to your
14 dissertation?

15 A No. Not at all.

16 Q So, you did that for one semester?

17 A That's right. Yes.

18 Q And your -- the letter that is Union Exhibit 72, in that
19 second paragraph that I was reading from, talks about your --
20 in the one-, two -- fourth sentence it says, "As a doctoral
21 student, you will perform fellowship duties 20 hours per week
22 under the supervision of a faculty member."

23 A Um-hum.

24 Q Is that about what -- the amount of time you spent on your
25 fellowship with Dr. Zelizer?

1 A Yes. Some weeks, yes and you know, some weeks a few hours
2 less, depending on what we were looking at that particular
3 week, which set of archives.

4 Q So, sort of, an average of 20?

5 A Yes. Basically, an average of 20, yeah.

6 Q Then, the second semester of your first year, Spring 2014,
7 did you have a research or teaching fellowship?

8 A I had a research fellowship.

9 Q And what was that one?

10 A I -- I was working for Professor Monroe Price. But more
11 specifically I was working for the staff of the Center for
12 Global and Communication -- sorry; the Center for Global
13 Communication Studies, which is now known under a different
14 name. Now, it's the Center for Advanced Research in Global
15 Communication.

16 At the time, the center had been hired a non-government
17 organization called Half The Sky.

18 Q Half The Sky.

19 A Half The Sky, yes.

20 Q Okay.

21 A This is an organization that develops and launches media
22 based interventions toward targeting women and girls in
23 developing countries and communities. By media based
24 intervention in this case, I mean, mobile based phone -- phone
25 games and applications where in the process of playing or using

1 these apps you would learn about things like prenatal care or
2 how to avoid sexually transmitted infections. Things like
3 that.

4 So, CTCS has been hired to evaluate a set of interventions
5 that had been launched in India and Kenya. They were going to
6 evaluate these by doing large scale quantitative survey based
7 research in those areas. My role was to -- that semester, was
8 to write up some background on women's rights and girl's rights
9 and issues related to gender based rights in India and Kenya
10 that semester.

11 Q So, you were -- to write up that background, you initially
12 had to do some research about it?

13 A Yes. Yeah.

14 Q Was that -- the product, the write-up that you did, was
15 that something that got published?

16 A I'm not 100 percent sure. My understanding is that the
17 evaluation ultimately wasn't launched successfully, so I'm not
18 sure where this piece of writing is now. I'm not sure.

19 Q But it -- but it's not something on your CV?

20 A Right. Right.

21 Q When you were -- when you learned that you were going to
22 do that for your research fellowship, did you get any, sort of,
23 written confirmation of that?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And did you provide me a copy of that?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And are you -- do you consent to have that written
3 confirmation made an exhibit in this case?

4 A Yes.

5 (Petitioner's P-73 marked.)

6 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

7 Q Ms. Clark, I have handed you a document marked Union
8 Exhibit 73. Do you recognize that?

9 A Yes, I do.

10 Q What is that?

11 A This is a letter we receive on a semesterly basis
12 confirming my fellowship assignment and how much pay I'll
13 receive.

14 Q Okay. And again, that one in the second paragraph refers
15 to your fellowship requiring an average of 20 hours per week,
16 right?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And was it -- was -- similarly, did you work about an
19 average of 20 hours per week?

20 A I would say on average, but often more for this particular
21 fellowship.

22 Q Okay. You know, I didn't ask you with regard to your fall
23 fellowship, who -- who oversaw your work as a research fellow?

24 A Dr. Zelizer.

25 Q And in the spring -- well, let me step back a second. And

1 what -- what form of oversight was that? Did you have regular
2 meetings with her? Or I mean, what happened?

3 A I -- if I remember correctly, I believe we met once a
4 week, as much as possible, but following her schedule, to
5 discuss what I had been finding in the archives and to discuss
6 her project.

7 Q Okay. Do you have an advisor?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Who's your advisor?

10 A Dr. Guobin Yang.

11 Q Okay. So, was Dr. Zelizer ever your advisor?

12 A No. Never.

13 Q Now, getting back to the spring of 2014 when you were
14 working with Professor Price, did he oversee the work that you
15 did, like Dr. Zelizer had in the fall?

16 A Not directly. The woman who was directing the center at
17 the time did. Or not directing, but I -- I believe her title
18 was something like associate director. Basically, his second
19 in command at the Center was directly overseeing what I did.

20 Q And was there any connection between Professor Price and
21 the Center?

22 A Yes. Yes, he -- he was the director.

23 Q Okay.

24 A Yeah.

25 Q Did he assign you to work with the Center?

1 A Can you clarify?

2 Q How did you -- so -- so, this letter says, in the first
3 paragraph, "You will be working as a research fellow with Dr.
4 Price."

5 A Um-hum.

6 Q And in the second paragraph it says, in the second
7 sentence, "Although classes begin on January 2015, 2014" -- I'm
8 sorry, "January 15, 2014, you should be in contact with your
9 assigned faculty member well in advance of this date in order
10 to make whatever preparations are necessary for the
11 assignment."

12 A Um-hum.

13 Q So, how -- how did you -- I guess my question is, how did
14 you come to learn that you would specifically working with the
15 Center?

16 A Um-hum. So, I can explain the process through which we're
17 assigned to our fellowships.

18 Q Sure.

19 A As best as I can from my perspective as a student. My
20 understanding is that our fellowship assignments work through
21 this process: we give Joanne Murray, who is an assistant dean
22 at Annenberg, our top three to five choices for what to do for
23 our fellowship. Then the faculty are supposed to give Joanne
24 their three or five choices of students that they would like to
25 work with. And Joanne is supposed to essentially match us, as

1 best as she can.

2 I had spoken with Monroe Price about work happening at the
3 Center that might have been related to gender, which broadly is
4 what my work fits into, and this is how I wound up at this
5 project. Then I found out that they were working on this, and
6 I requested it through Joanne. And that's how we were
7 assigned.

8 Q Okay. So, part of that initial discussion with Professor
9 Price was about working with the Center?

10 A Yes. Yes.

11 Q Okay. So that --

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for Exhibit -- for admission of
13 Union Exhibit 73.

14 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 73 is received.

16 (Petitioner's P-73 received.)

17 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

18 Q So, that takes us through your -- the first fall and
19 spring --

20 A Yes.

21 Q -- of your first year. Did you -- you said you got summer
22 funding in all of your summers, right?

23 A Right.

24 Q So, you had summer funding in the summer then?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And was that a fellowship with an assignment? Or was it
2 just funding to do research?

3 A It was just funding to do research.

4 Q Did -- did you have any assignment that was outside of
5 your -- that fellowship? The summer funding.

6 A Yes. I got a, sort of, side job with the CGCS, with the
7 center that I had worked with the previous semester.

8 Q Okay. And did -- were you compensated for doing that?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And what were you doing during the summer for the Center?

11 A For an unrelated project, they needed students to conduct
12 phone interviews with people who were experts in the world of
13 media based interventions.

14 So, my job, they -- they gave me a script of the
15 interview, and had to either call or Skype whoever I was
16 assigned to call or Skype, ask them if it was okay to record
17 the conversation, record it, walk through the interview
18 according to the script. Clarify anything for the
19 interviewees. And while I wasn't transcribing the interviews,
20 I was asked to make note of, sort of, recurring themes as they
21 came up or when an interviewee would say something that no one
22 else had mentioned before. Basically.

23 Q So, you had some level of analysis of the interviews to be
24 passed on to -- whoever was going to work on it?

25 A Yeah, summary preliminary analysis, yeah.

1 Q And this was on a different project, not the project
2 relating to women in India and Kenya?

3 A Right. Yeah.

4 Q Was this work at all related to your dissertation work?

5 A No. No.

6 Q Okay. And why did you take on this extra work?

7 A In part because our summer funding works out to less per
8 month than what we get during the school year, so having an
9 extra source of income is helpful. Yeah, I would say that was
10 the primary reason.

11 Q Okay. And who -- when you say they created a script for
12 you, that was the Center staff?

13 A Yes. Um-hum.

14 Q Is the -- this center within Annenberg? Separate from
15 Annenberg? What is it?

16 A It's within Annenberg, yes.

17 Q Okay. Then in fall of your second year, did you do a
18 teaching fellowship or a research fellowship?

19 A A research fellowship.

20 Q And who was that with?

21 A That was again with Professor Monroe Price and the Center.

22 Q Okay. And did you get -- did you get a written
23 confirmation of your research fellowship for that one, as well?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And did you give me a copy of it?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And do you consent to you having that being made an
3 exhibit here?

4 A Yes.

5 (Petitioner's P-74 marked.)

6 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

7 Q I've handed you a copy of a document marked Union Exhibit
8 74. Do you recognize that?

9 A Yes.

10 Q What is that?

11 A This is a letter confirming my assignment to Monroe Price
12 for my research fellowship.

13 Q Okay. Now, just -- just so that the record is clear, you
14 and I have been calling Professor Price either Professor Price
15 or Monroe Price. The letters -- these two letters say "Dr.
16 Price."

17 A Right.

18 Q Is he a doctor?

19 A He's a lawyer, so he doesn't have a Ph.D., so we typically
20 call him Professor or just Monroe.

21 Q Okay. Again, I think you said with regard to Union
22 Exhibit 73, that this was the -- an example of the kind of
23 letter you would get every time you got an assignment --

24 A Yeah.

25 Q -- for one of your semesters of fellowship, right?

1 A Yeah. That's right.

2 Q So, this looks very similar to Union 73, right?

3 A Um-hum.

4 Q Again, refers to -- in the second paragraph to an average
5 of 20 hours per week. And again, did you work around that
6 much? Or more?

7 A I would say with this particular semester I worked more.

8 Q Okay. And this was -- this semester you were working with
9 the Center?

10 A Yes.

11 Q What did you do for the Center in this semester?

12 A So, it was the same project, broadly, the Half The Sky
13 evaluation, but this time I was writing up a literature review.
14 So, I was looking at research that had already been published,
15 either through similar evaluations of similar media based
16 interventions, or research that would be related to these
17 interventions. So, literature on questions like how does
18 access to mobile phones empower women and girls in different
19 types of communities? So, my job was to, sort of, collect
20 these published articles, reports, chapters, and organize and
21 summarize, and I was actually writing up the literature review.

22 Q And was that ultimate -- the document, the literature
23 review something that you had published?

24 A So, it's similar situation to what I was talking about
25 with the other semester; I'm not sure where that document is

1 now. I know that ultimately it was meant to be -- provide
2 background on the evaluation in a written-up report, but I'm
3 not sure what happened to it essentially.

4 Q And it's certainly not something you had published?

5 A No. No.

6 Q Okay.

7 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union 74.

8 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 74 is received.

10 (Petitioner's P-74 received.)

11 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

12 Q So, that's fall of your second year. Then, did you have
13 an assignment in the spring of your second year?

14 A Yes, I was a research fellow.

15 Q And with whom did you work that semester?

16 A That semester I worked with Dr. Guobin Yang.

17 Q Okay. And again, did you receive written confirmation of
18 your assignment to work with Dr. Yang?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And did you give me a copy of that?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And do you consent to that being an exhibit here?

23 A Yes.

24 (Petitioner's P-75 marked.)

25 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

1 Q I've handed you a copy of a document marked Union Exhibit
2 75. Do you recognize that?

3 A Yes.

4 Q What is it?

5 A This is a letter confirming my assignment to Dr. Yang
6 as -- the supervisor for my research fellowship.

7 Q And again, it looks like it's basically the same format as
8 the other two, right?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And it refers to an average, in the second paragraph
11 there, working an average of 20 hours per week. Would that
12 reflect what you did in the spring semester of your second year
13 in 2015?

14 A Yes.

15 Q So, what were you -- what specifically were doing as a
16 research fellow that spring?

17 A So, that spring I worked on two different projects which
18 are not connected, so I can walk you through one at a time.

19 Q Yeah.

20 A The first -- Professor Yang, he's -- he's my advisor. We
21 had decided that -- or noticed that on campus there was this,
22 sort of, critical mass of students studying questions related
23 to social movements and activism, and we decided that Penn
24 needed some sort of student group in which these people could
25 come together to discuss their research. Because often, these

1 students would be scattered across different departments, not
2 really crossing paths otherwise, so we petitioned our own dean,
3 Michael Delli Carpini, as well as the dean of the Sociology
4 Department for funding to start a group that we called the
5 Media Activism Research Collective or MARC. This is a, sort
6 of, extracurricular informal student driven group. It's a
7 space, sort of, like an incubating space for ideas,
8 workshopping ideas.

9 My job in -- as a research fellow for Professor Yang
10 involved helping to get this collective off the ground. So, I
11 would help to coordinate our usually once or twice per month
12 meetings, which were often student workshops. I coordinated
13 with students who would sign up to present their work. I would
14 make sure we had food for this meeting. Get the word out about
15 the event.

16 That semester, I also helped grow in different ways the
17 collective, reaching out to people across campus, to other
18 universities in the Philadelphia area, including Temple and
19 Drexel. Creating a ListServe, creating a blog and managing a
20 blog.

21 We also had, as opportunities arised [sic], different
22 speaking events. So, lecturers would come in and -- who were
23 not otherwise working at Penn, and talk about their work.
24 Things like that.

25 Q So, the students who would participate in the programs

1 that you were coordinating, were -- included Penn students?

2 A Yeah.

3 Q And did they also students from other universities?

4 A Yes.

5 Q So, from Drexel and Temple that you mentioned?

6 A We had Drexel, Temple, and Rutgers that I know of.

7 Q Okay. And they were students from different disciplines
8 across the university?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And was -- you were doing this as a research fellow,
11 right?

12 A Um-hum. Yes.

13 Q Were these students do -- you called it an extracurricular
14 thing.

15 A Um-hum.

16 Q Were these students doing it as research fellows or
17 research assistants? Were --

18 A No. The thing about qualitative communications research
19 is that it's often completed individually. We don't -- we
20 don't work in labs in the traditional sense, so this was
21 supposed to just be a space where people could come together
22 and get a sounding board for their ideas.

23 Q And I think you said the funding came from the Annenberg
24 School and the Sociology Department?

25 A That's right.

1 Q And that's the Sociology Department in the School of Arts
2 & Sciences?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Do you remember what other programs the -- were these --
5 let me step back a second.

6 The students who attended, were they all graduate students
7 or a mix of graduate and undergrad? Or what was the makeup?

8 A The majority were graduate students. Every once in a
9 while, we -- one undergrad was curious, would trickle in, but
10 almost always graduate students.

11 Q Okay. And they were from different programs across the
12 university?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Do you remember what programs were represented among the
15 folks when you were working in this program?

16 A Yes. So, Annenberg and sociology. We had people from the
17 English Department. From political science. Philosophy. The
18 Education School. And that's probably about it, I think.
19 Yeah.

20 Q And these were the student attendees?

21 A Yes.

22 Q So, you said you had two things that you were working
23 on --

24 A Yes.

25 Q -- that spring. What was the other thing?

1 A The other thing involved Dr. Yang, his new journal that he
2 had just started that year. It's called Communication in the
3 Public, and I worked as an editorial assistant for his journal.

4 Q And is that refereed journal?

5 A It's a refereed journal, yes.

6 Q And what did you do as an editorial assistant?

7 A It's easy stuff I can walk you through from when an
8 article is submitted to --

9 Q Sure.

10 A -- go to anything that I do. So, my role as an editorial
11 assistant involves coordinating the logistics that go into the
12 viewing an article.

13 So, when an article is submitted, I don't copy edit, but I
14 skim through to see -- make sure it adheres to our stylistic
15 standards. If it doesn't, I have to send it back. If it does,
16 I coordinated with the editors in chief, who are Dr. Yang and
17 his colleague at the University of Wisconsin, whose name is
18 Zhang Dang Pan. I work with them on figuring out who would be
19 an appropriate reviewer. I send it out to those potential
20 reviewers, and keeping sending out until we get two. Then I
21 have to be making sure those reviews I conducted in a timely
22 fashion. We have a deadline, a production schedule to follow.

23 Once the reviews come in, I send them out to the editors
24 in chief, ask how they would like to proceed, whether they want
25 to reject or accept with minor revisions. So, once a decision

1 has been arrived at, I send out the decision letter, and then
2 the process essentially starts over in a way. They have to
3 resubmit, it goes out again. Once we arrive at the final
4 version of an article, I'm responsible for putting it into
5 production, which means I have to make sure we have an author
6 bio, and they have to sign a copyright form.

7 Then once we're past that stage, it goes on to copy
8 editing, which I'm not involved with. But -- yeah.

9 Q Okay. And this was all work that you were doing as part
10 of your research fellowship that spring of 2015?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And were you -- you know, I neglected to ask you something
13 in the earlier research fellowships. So, in your research
14 fellowship.

15 So, in your research fellowship with Professor Zelizer,
16 were you the only research fellow working with Professor
17 Zelizer that semester?

18 A I believe so, yes.

19 Q Okay. And in your first -- we already talked about your
20 work with the Center in your -- those two semesters. And then
21 in this work with Professor Yang on -- let me just step back a
22 second.

23 No, on your work with Professor Price, on the Center --
24 was thinking of the collective -- your work with Professor
25 Price on the Center, were you -- were there other research

1 fellows working alongside you in that?

2 A Not on the same paths. There are other -- I believe in
3 the second semester that I worked for Dr. Price there was
4 another graduate student who was working on -- directly on the
5 evaluation itself. I don't know if it was as a fellow or what
6 the deal was, but there were other graduate students. Yeah.

7 Q Were they from Annenberg or another school?

8 A From Annenberg, yes.

9 Q And then in your work with Professor Yang at the
10 collective, we talked about that.

11 In your work in connection with his new journal,
12 Communication in the Public, were you -- were there other
13 graduate students working with you on that?

14 A No.

15 Q So, that's -- takes us through your second year.

16 A Yes.

17 Q The summer after your second year you also had summer
18 funding. I think you said it had -- you had it every year,
19 right?

20 A Yes, that's right.

21 Q And then did you also have any additional work for which
22 you were paid above and beyond your summer funding?

23 A I don't think so. Yeah.

24 Q Then, fall -- and did -- and let me step back.

25 And for your summer funding, that package, did you do any

1 work that was for that package?

2 A Just for my own research.

3 Q Okay. Then, in the fall of 2015, so that's the fall of
4 your third year, did you have a research fellowship?

5 A Yes. I was a research fellow.

6 Q And who were you assigned to -- I'm sorry, let me --
7 before I go there.

8 MS. ROSENBERGER: Can -- did I move for admission of Union
9 75 yet? Then I would move for admission of Union 75.

10 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 75 is received.

12 (Petitioner's P-75 received.)

13 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

14 Q In the fall of your third year, did you have a research
15 fellowship?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And who were you assigned to work with?

18 A With Professor Yang again.

19 Q And did you get, again, another similar letter confirming
20 that, as you had in the past?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. And then what did you do with Professor Yang that
23 semester?

24 A It was the continuation of the same work. So, I was also
25 coordinating with the collective, all of those things again.

1 And also working as the editorial assistant for the journal.

2 Q So all the same as what you had done in the spring of
3 2015?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Okay. And then in the spring of your third year, did you
6 have a research fellowship or a teaching fellow?

7 A That was my first semester as a teaching fellow.

8 Q Okay. And so, you talked about the process for getting,
9 sort of, matched up with someone to work with as a research
10 fellow. Was there a similar process for teaching fellowship?

11 A Yes.

12 Q So, who did you end up working with as a teaching fellow
13 in the spring of your third year?

14 A I worked with Dr. Felicity Paxton.

15 Q Okay. And how did you get matched up to work with Dr.
16 Felicity Paxton?

17 A I introduced myself to Dr. Paxton. Told her why I was
18 interested in her class. And then submitted my request to
19 Joanne and my top three choices. And then I assume that Dr.
20 Paxton submitted my name to Joanne and we were matched.

21 Q Okay. And did you get written confirmation of that again?

22 A Yes.

23 (Petitioner's P-76 marked.)

24 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

25 Q I'm sorry, did you give me a copy of your written

1 confirmation?

2 A I did, yes.

3 Q And do you have any objection to that being used as an
4 exhibit in this case?

5 A No.

6 Q Okay. I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 76.

7 Do you recognize that?

8 A Yes, I do.

9 Q What is it?

10 A This is a letter confirming my assignment to Dr. Paxton as
11 her teaching fellow.

12 Q Okay. And it looks like it's very much the same format as
13 the research fellowship letters that you received, right?

14 A That's right. Yes.

15 Q And only this time, in the first paragraph it says, "You
16 will be working as a teaching fellow with Professor Felicity
17 Paxton." Right?

18 A Correct. Yes.

19 Q And again, in the second paragraph it says it should
20 require an average of 20 hours per week. Is that about what
21 your teaching fellow required?

22 A On average, yes.

23 Q Okay. So, what was the -- what did you do as a teaching
24 fellow?

25 A So, the class was a higher level classed called Ritual in

1 Communication, with about 30 students. My job as a teaching
2 fellow involved attending every class. Taking notes in class.
3 Taking attendance in class. I lectured twice. I held office
4 hours. I graded -- I had a weekly assignment -- writing
5 assignment they had to turn in; I graded that. And I graded
6 their, I believe it was two paper assignments.

7 Q And was there -- so this class had 30 students, so were
8 there recitation sections in this class?

9 A No.

10 Q So, when you were in the class, the -- Professor Paxton
11 was also in the class?

12 A Yeah.

13 Q And what -- when you graded the -- what were the weekly
14 assignments? What kind of assignment was it?

15 A They had to submit a brief reflection on the readings,
16 usually prompted by questions that Dr. Paxton had developed.

17 Q Okay. And what as the grading process? Were you
18 coordinating that with Dr. Paxton? Or were you doing that
19 independently?

20 A Because it was my first teaching fellowship, in the
21 beginning of the semester we would coordinated a lot to make
22 subscriber I was, sort of, calibrating my grading to her
23 expectations. But then once we got past the first month, I
24 think, of class I was grading on my own.

25 Q Did you have any training -- other than what you've just

1 described as, you know, meeting and coordinating with Dr.
2 Paxton, did you have any training before you became a teaching
3 fellow?

4 A No.

5 Q You also said you graded, was it exams at the end?

6 A Final papers.

7 Q Final papers.

8 A Yeah.

9 Q Is that what the final -- were there also exams? Or just
10 these assignments and the final paper?

11 A It was -- so two papers. One was, sort of, stood in as a
12 midterm, and the other was a final -- would be a substitute for
13 a final exam.

14 Q And did you grade both sets?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Did you grade them for all the students?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And did you coordinate with Dr. Paxton similarly on what
19 her expectations were?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And once you graded the exams, what -- did she review them
22 and then, sort of, see whether she agreed with your grade? Or
23 was your grade the grade? Or how did that work?

24 A So, we -- if my memory serves me correctly, we both graded
25 a sample of papers, that was meant to be somewhat

1 representative of the class, you know, who we thought were A's,
2 B's and C's, et cetera. We grade them -- we graded them
3 blindly and separately, and then came together and looked at
4 where we landed with our grades and discussed any
5 discrepancies, so we could, again, calibrate grading by her
6 expectations.

7 Q And then -- and then did you -- once that was calibrated,
8 to use your term, did you grade all of the exams then based on
9 what you had -- what the two of you had developed through that
10 interchange?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And was the grade you gave the grade that the student got
13 for that paper?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Okay. Did you -- did the students evaluate you as a
16 teaching fellow in that class?

17 A Yes. But the process was different than what happens with
18 professors.

19 Q So, what's the process?

20 A So, with the professor, at least at Annenberg, I don't
21 know if this was the case for all faculty at Penn, you have to
22 complete a -- if you're an undergraduate, you have to complete
23 an evaluation of the professor before you can see your grades.
24 It's not the same requirement for teaching fellows, so we tend
25 to get a much lower response rate.

1 Q Okay.

2 A We send them a survey, but like I said, there were 30 kids
3 in that class and I think I got four or seven reviews, so,
4 that's just the way it is.

5 Q And was this an undergraduate class or a graduate level
6 class?

7 A An undergraduate class.

8 Q Okay. And is Professor Paxton a professor in the
9 Annenberg School?

10 A She's a lecturer there, yes. Um-hum.

11 Q Was this course related to your dissertation?

12 A The unit I lectured on was, but I don't -- I wouldn't say
13 the rest of the course was, the literature that we looked at
14 was relevant to my dissertation.

15 Q Did you receive -- other than the student, you know, the
16 sampling of student evaluations that you got, did you receive
17 any feedback about your performance as a TA?

18 A When I lectured, Dr. Paxton wrote up notes and gave me
19 some feedback, but otherwise, no.

20 Q And I -- I don't think I asked you, the work that you had
21 done on the journal, Communication in the Public, for Dr. Yang,
22 was that related to your dissertation?

23 A No. I'm not -- I'm not studying journals. I don't know
24 if that makes sense. I published things, but not really
25 related to my dissertation.

1 MR. FRYMAN: I'm sorry, I'm having trouble hearing.

2 THE WITNESS: It's not related to my dissertation.

3 MS. ROSENBERGER: Yeah, sorry. You're going to have to
4 keep your voice up, especially --

5 THE WITNESS: Oh, sure.

6 MS. ROSENBERGER: -- when this air conditioning system is
7 running. It's hard on this side to hear witnesses.

8 THE WITNESS: Sure. Yes.

9 MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay. And that does not amplify your
10 voice.

11 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's for the court reporter.

13 THE WITNESS: Okay.

14 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

15 Q So, you're still -- so, your dissertation is about media
16 practices, but not in the scholarly journal form of media?

17 A Right. Yeah.

18 Q Okay. So, that was --

19 MS. ROSENBERGER: Oh, I'm sorry; I move for the admission
20 of Union 76.

21 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 76 is received.

23 (Petitioner's P-76 received.)

24 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

25 Q So, that was spring of your third year, right?

1 A That's right.

2 Q And then last summer, the summer after your third year,
3 did you -- you again received the summer funding?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And that was for you research?

6 A Yes. Yes.

7 Q And did you do any additional -- any -- any work that
8 involved additional compensation last summer?

9 A Yes. I continued, and I have been working for the journal
10 since that initial semester. So that summer, Professor Yang
11 compensated me separately for working on the journal, but also
12 for copy editing his references in his recent book.

13 Q Okay. And did he send you some -- did you receive a copy
14 of some written communication confirmation that you were going
15 to do that position?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And did you give me a copy of that?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And do you consent to it being an exhibit here?

20 A Yes.

21 (Petitioner's P-77 marked.)

22 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

23 Q I've handed you a copy of a document marked Union Exhibit
24 77. Do you recognize that?

25 A Yes.

1 Q What is it?

2 A This is an email that Professor Yang sent to Kelly
3 Anderson. She runs our business office. And Guobin is asking
4 Kelly to -- he's letting her know that I'm working for him as a
5 research assistant on a summer project and asking her to
6 process pay for me over the summer, 100 hours of pay, and
7 instructing me to turn in time sheets.

8 Q Okay. And this research assistant position is the one you
9 just described?

10 A Yes.

11 Q So, this was again, on top of your summer funding, right?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Why did you take on an additional position on top of your
14 summer funding?

15 A Again, it comes down to wanting extra income in the summer
16 months when I -- stipends are less or lower than they are
17 during the school year. So, yeah.

18 Q Okay. And did you --

19 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union 77.

20 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 77 is received.

22 (Petitioner's P-77 received.)

23 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

24 Q Are you familiar with something called your Penn profile?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And did you send me a copy of yours?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And do you consent to that being used as an exhibit in
4 this case?

5 A Yes.

6 (Petitioner's P-78 marked.)

7 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

8 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 78. Do
9 you recognize that?

10 A Yes.

11 Q What is it?

12 A This is my Penn profile.

13 Q And where -- what is this printed out from?

14 A So, my understanding of the Penn profile is it's partly
15 where you go to access direct information. It includes
16 information about your employment status. And I basically -- I
17 clicked on my profile on that page, which is what you see here,
18 and I quick print and made a pdf.

19 Q Okay. Now, this shows, if you look down at the -- toward
20 the bottom of the first page --

21 A Yes.

22 Q Well, on the bottom half of the first page, there's a
23 series of entries that have, under the title "Job Information,"
24 do you see that?

25 A Yeah.

1 Q And the one-, two-, three-, fourth entry there, has a job
2 title "Student Worker B," right?

3 A Correct.

4 Q And two lines lower, "Job Class Entry Date 6/13/2016." Is
5 that around the time that you did summer work?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. And I note that Dr. Yang's email that's Union 77 is
8 dated August 1st, right?

9 A Right.

10 Q But it says, "Rosemary Clark is working as a research
11 assistant for me on a summer project." Were you already in
12 process when he sent this?

13 A Yes. Yeah.

14 Q Were you holding any other position that summer for pay
15 outside of your summer funding?

16 A Not for pay, no.

17 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union 78.

18 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 78 is received.

20 (Petitioner's P-78 received.)

21 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

22 Q Then your fourth year, that would be last year, right?

23 A Yeah.

24 Q So, what did you do in the fall of your fourth year?

25 A I was a teaching fellow again.

1 Q And who were you a teaching fellow for this time?

2 A For Dr. Amy Jordan.

3 Q And how did you come to be -- and for what class?

4 A The class was called Communication Behavior.

5 Q Okay. And how did you come to be a teaching fellow
6 assigned to Dr. Jordan's class?

7 A So, this assignment was a little more complicated how I
8 arrived at this particular assignment. I was supposed to be
9 assigned to another professor, Dr. Jessa Lingel for a different
10 class, how -- a class called Gender and Technology. But what
11 had happened in the time between when I was assigned and when
12 the semester started, is that expected enrollment for Dr.
13 Lingel's class was not as high -- didn't turn out to be as high
14 as they had expected, basically. They were expecting about 60
15 students to enroll, I think 30-some did. Meanwhile, in Dr.
16 Jordan's class, enrollment was higher than they expected. So,
17 the school needed another teaching assistant/teaching fellow.

18 I received an email from Joanne Murray and Joe Turow
19 ask -- telling me that I was being reassigned to Dr. Jordan's
20 class because of the situation. So, that's how I wound up
21 there.

22 Q And you just mentioned someone we haven't heard about yet,
23 Joe Turow. He's the associate dean for graduate studies at
24 Annenberg? Or do you know w--

25 A I think his title is Dean of Graduate Students -- or

1 Studies.

2 Q Okay. Very good. And did you -- so -- so, you had
3 originally been assigned to another professor. Who did you say
4 that was?

5 A Jessa Lingel.

6 Q Jessa?

7 A Lingel.

8 Q Lingel. And Professor Lingel was -- was that something
9 where you had gone through this process and you described
10 before of matching up with her?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And was -- did -- did you have a preference as between the
13 two classes as to which one you would be a teaching fellow for?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Which one?

16 A I preferred Jessa's class.

17 Q Why?

18 A That class is perhaps the only Annenberg undergraduate
19 class -- it was a new one for that semester, but it in my time
20 was the only undergraduate class that's pretty much squarely
21 within my dissertation research. So, yeah.

22 Q And you -- and when you got reassigned, did you attempt to
23 have that reconsidered?

24 A Yes. So, I wrote back to the deans. Jessa and I had
25 actually already been working on the course, because it's a new

1 class so she was developing the syllabus. We were going back
2 and forth on what the syllabus should look like, what the
3 assessment should be. So, I wrote back to the deans, explained
4 that situation and explained the relevance to my dissertation,
5 but I was told ultimately that it didn't matter, and that there
6 was a need and I needed to fill it.

7 Q When you were originally assigned to Professor Lingel's
8 class, did you get written documentation of that assignment?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And did you provide a copy of that to me?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And do you consent to that being an exhibit here?

13 A Yes.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Did we move 78? It's in? Okay.

15 (Petitioner's P-79 marked.)

16 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

17 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 79. Do
18 you -- do you have that in front of you?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Do you recognize that?

21 A Yes.

22 Q What is it?

23 A This is a letter confirming that I was assigned to Jessa
24 Lingel for the fall of 2016.

25 Q Okay. And this was dated April -- well, this copy is

1 dated April 27, 2016. Is that around the time you received it?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And when abouts was it that you learned that you were
4 being reassigned to Dr. Jordan's class?

5 A I believe it was -- it was, trying to think. I believe it
6 was in August. It was pretty close to the semester actually
7 starting.

8 Q Okay. It was a -- but it was -- in any event at a time
9 when folks knew what the enrollment was looking like?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Okay.

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union 79.

13 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 79 is received.

15 (Petitioner's P-79 received.)

16 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

17 Q So, what did you do as a teaching fellow in Dr. Jordan's
18 class on communication behavior?

19 A So, this is class is very different from the other classes
20 because it has a recitation. So, I led two recitations a week
21 as the instructor of record for those recitation sessions. I
22 had to attend the regular lecture that Dr. Jordan led twice a
23 week. I held office hours twice a week. I developed exam
24 questions on week's where I was assigned, too; so, we sort of
25 divvied up who had which weeks of material to write exam

1 question for.

2 Q When you say you divvied up who had -- who would do the
3 exam questions, you and who divided that up?

4 A There were three other TAs or TFs, so there were four of
5 us all together, so we divided that work over the course of the
6 semester.

7 Q Okay.

8 A Alongside that, also writing study guide questions that
9 paired up with the exam questions. We also graded assignments
10 and exams for the semester.

11 Q And was it a -- was this a class -- when you say
12 "assignments," would these be similar to or different from the
13 assignments in the class you had been a teaching fellow for the
14 previous year?

15 A So, these were slightly different because this class had
16 exams, like multiple choice exams. I believe there were two.
17 And it also had a semester long writing project where students
18 were submitting what we were calling benchmark assignments.
19 So, submitted pieces of it as they went along.

20 Q And is that the assignments that you were referring to
21 that you graded?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And was there any coordination, let's talk first about
24 those assignments. Was there any coordination -- well, let me
25 step back a second.

1 Did you grade them for all students or some of the
2 students?

3 A Just the students I had recitations.

4 Q Okay. And did you -- was there any coordination on the
5 grading of those benchmark assignments?

6 A Yes. We had weekly meetings, all five of us; the four TAs
7 and Dr. Jordan, to discuss what our expectations were for each
8 submission.

9 Q Okay. And then the exams you talked about, they were all
10 multiple choice?

11 A Yes. Yes.

12 Q Okay. On the assignments, was -- once you coordinated on
13 the expectations, was your grade the grade? Or was that, sort
14 of, double-checked by Dr. Jordan or someone else?

15 A My grade was the grade, um-hum.

16 Q And same with regard to the test -- the exams?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. Although, that's more objective?

19 A Right. Right.

20 Q Right. Okay, did you -- were you evaluated by students in
21 that class?

22 A Yes. But on -- in separate ways. So, they -- because I
23 was the instructor of record for the recitation, they had to
24 review me before receiving their recitation grade.

25 Q Um-hum.

1 A But they also reviewed us in -- give a similar survey that
2 was sent out other whole class, because we had guest
3 lecturer -- which I forgot to mention -- that we each
4 guest-lectured in the main lecture room, and so Dr. Jordan
5 wanted students to have the opportunity to give us feedback on
6 that, so she sent out surveys related to that.

7 Q Okay. But those weren't mandatory?

8 A Not mandatory, yeah.

9 Q And did you have a similar response rate on those?

10 A I believe, yes. Yeah.

11 Q Any other feedback from Dr. Jordan or anyone else in
12 regard to your service as a TA?

13 A She -- Dr. Jordan gave us feedback after lecturing. And
14 because of my work in this class, Dr. Jordan nominated me for a
15 teaching award, so I guess that was feedback as well. But --

16 Q Did you get the teaching award?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. Is that an award that's given out by the school?

19 A By Annenberg.

20 Q By Annenberg?

21 A Yeah.

22 Q And so in that fall semester of last year, you were a
23 teaching fellow. And I think you had said before that the last
24 time you were a teaching fellow, you continued working on the
25 journal with Dr. Yang?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And did you also continue working on the journal with Dr.
3 Yang this semester? Or were you done with that?

4 A I have continued, and I'm still working for the journal.

5 Q Okay. Then, what did you -- what did you do last spring?

6 A Last spring, I was a teaching fellow, again -- again for
7 Dr. Paxton, but for a different class.

8 Q What was this class?

9 A This class is called Communication -- or sorry, Critical
10 Approaches to Popular Culture.

11 Q And was this a big class with recitations or a smaller
12 class?

13 A It's about 60 people and there are recitations.

14 Q Were you the only teaching fellow?

15 A There were two of us.

16 Q And what did you as a teaching fellow for that class?

17 A I again attended all classes. Had office hours. We
18 didn't develop exam questions because Dr. Paxton's been
19 teaching for about 20 years, so we essentially went through her
20 archive of questions helped her organize them, so that she
21 could pull from her bank of questions. We graded all the
22 assignments and helped as necessary with things in class -- in
23 class activities. And we both guest lectured once.

24 Q And on the grading -- so the assignments that you were
25 grading, were they multiple choice type quizzes? Or were they

1 written assignments? Or what form did they take?

2 A There were two multiple choice exams and two written
3 papers.

4 Q And the papers you graded?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And did you -- did you divide up the class to grade the
7 papers? Or --

8 A Yes. So, each of the TAs had 30-some to grade.

9 Q And was there any coordination with Dr. Paxton on the
10 expectations?

11 A We did something similar as we did in Ritual
12 Communication; we took a sample. Both the TFs, sort of, chose
13 which subset of students they wanted to look at with Dr.
14 Paxton. And then we met with Dr. Paxton to go over our --
15 both -- both of our reviews of those papers.

16 Q Okay. And then you got, I think your term earlier was you
17 calibrated --

18 A Right.

19 Q -- your expectations, right?

20 And then you used that understanding about what the
21 expectations were to grade your whole set and your fellow
22 teaching fellow to grade that person's whole set?

23 A Right.

24 Q And then once you did that, did Dr. Paxton review that and
25 make changes? Or was that -- that was the grade? Your grade

1 was the grade?

2 A We would review papers -- if there's another paper that
3 would come up after we did the sample that we were, sort of, on
4 the fence about, we would discuss -- of it was a student who
5 hadn't being doing well and again, continued not to do well and
6 was in danger of failing we would discuss. But generally, our
7 grades stood.

8 Q And was this also an undergraduate class?

9 A Yes.

10 Q All the classes that you were a teaching fellow for were
11 undergraduate?

12 A Yes, that's right.

13 Q And was the other teaching fellow in this class from
14 Annenberg?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And were the other three teaching fellows in the fall of
17 2016 from Annenberg?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Were you evaluated by the students in this class?

20 A But I -- with a similar situation. You know, more
21 informal survey and low response rate.

22 Q And did you get feedback from Dr. Paxton in this class?

23 A After we lectured, yes, we would have received feedback.

24 Q So, that brings us to this summer.

25 A Um-hum.

1 Q You said that you have the summer funding this summer,
2 right?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And are you doing any additional work this summer for
5 compensation?

6 A Yes. So, I'm teaching two different classes this summer.

7 Q Where are you teaching?

8 A Both at Penn. One class was LPS. This is a class called
9 Communication in Popular Culture, which I'm co-teaching with
10 another graduate student at Annenberg.

11 Q And what's the other one?

12 A The other class is for this new program that Penn just
13 launched called Penn Summer Prep. It's a four-week program in
14 which, I think, mostly sophomores and juniors in high school
15 get to, sort of, come to Penn and see what college is like.
16 I'm teaching one module, they're calling it, in that program,
17 twice. So, I teach it -- it's two-week sessions, two sets of
18 modules, but I'm teaching the same class twice, if that makes
19 sense, to different groups.

20 Q Okay. And are you being paid for each of these -- for the
21 -- for the class in LPS and for the -- this prep class that
22 you're doing?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Separate from your summer funding?

25 A Yes.

1 Q So, let's talk first about the one for LPS. Did you get
2 written confirmation of your appointment to teach that class?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And did you provide me a copy of that?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And are you -- do you consent to that being used as an
7 exhibit here?

8 A Yes.

9 (Petitioner's P-80 marked.)

10 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

11 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 80. Do
12 you recognize that?

13 A Yes.

14 Q What is it?

15 A This is a letter -- my appointment letter for LPS for the
16 Communication in Popular Culture class.

17 A Okay.

18 Q And it says -- in the second paragraph it says, "Your
19 duties will include teaching one course or courses. In 11-week
20 summer session you will teach Com 1, 2, 3 and 900." Is that
21 the class that you're referring to?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And are you teaching it over the 11-week summer section?
24 Or is it in one of the Summer 1, Summer 2?

25 A It's in the 11-week session.

1 Q So, you've been doing it all -- all summer so far?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Why did you take this on?

4 A This summer in particular I really needed extra income.

5 My -- so my partner who is a graduate student doesn't receive
6 income in the summer, so we really needed the extra income this
7 summer.

8 Q Okay. And your fellowship funding, did that run out as of
9 this summer? Or when does that run out?

10 A By which you mean the --

11 Q Your -- I'm sorry, your -- the four-year funding that was
12 mentioned in your offer letter.

13 A So, the -- I believe it's sort of different pots of
14 money --

15 Q Yes.

16 A -- funding, if you will. So, my research fellow and
17 teaching fellowship funding ends after four years. But then in
18 my fifth year, starting in August -- well, starting in
19 September, I'll be on what's called Dissertation Research Fund,
20 which is slightly different.

21 Q Okay. And that -- you'll get -- is that the same
22 elements; a stipend, health insurance, tuition?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And is there a service requirement for that?

25 A No.

1 Q And is that -- we've heard reference in these hearings to
2 something called a Dissertation Completion Fellowships; is that
3 what you're on? Or is it just something separate?

4 A I'm not sure. I -- I've heard of types of outside funding
5 called Dissertation Completion Fellowships. Annenberg doesn't
6 offer something by that name. This would be something you
7 might apply for from an outside party if you're going into a
8 sixth year --

9 Q Okay.

10 A -- at Annenberg.

11 Q Are you -- is there an expectation connected to your
12 dissertation research fellowship that you will complete your
13 dissertation next year?

14 A Yes, I believe. Yeah.

15 Q Is that your hope?

16 A That's my hope, yes.

17 Q Is there any requirement that, in connection with
18 acceptance of your dissertation research fellowship, that you
19 not take on any of these other, sort of, side employment?

20 A In the summer I can, so this summer, as with every other
21 summer I'm allowed to take on extra employment. But during
22 my -- during the semesters when I'm on Dissertation Research
23 Fund I cannot have outside employment.

24 Q Okay. And if you don't complete your dissertation by the
25 end of spring semester of 2018, does that restriction go away

1 again? That restriction on that other employment?

2 A Yes. Yeah.

3 Q And your -- and that Dissertation Research Fellowship is
4 for two semesters? If you know?

5 A It's for two semesters. What I can't remember is what
6 happens when you get to the summer of next year.

7 Q When it gets to summer?

8 A When it gets to summer, yeah, I'm not sure.

9 Q Okay. Back to Union Exhibit 80, how did you come to get
10 this appoint to teach in the College of Liberal and
11 Professional Studies?

12 A This is a complicated process of applying to teach for
13 LPS, particularly at Annenberg, it's not completely clear how
14 assignments are made. But there's an application process
15 through LPS, and you apply with your course preference. It --
16 there might be something about why this course would work well
17 for a summer session, if this is a course that you can take as
18 a requirement for the major, so it works well for summer
19 session.

20 And then I think LPS coordinates with Joanne Murray, with
21 the dean's office, about which courses Annenberg wants to run
22 and why, and who should teach them.

23 Q Okay, that makes sense. And are you teaching this class
24 on your own?

25 A No, I'm co-teaching.

1 Q Okay. And the person you're co-teaching with, is that a
2 faculty member or a graduate student?

3 A It's another graduate student, yes.

4 Q A graduate student from Annenberg?

5 A Yes.

6 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for admission of Union 80.

7 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 80 is received.

9 (Petitioner's P-80 received.)

10 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

11 Q Now, with regard to the -- I think you called it Penn
12 Summer Prep --

13 A Yes.

14 Q -- is that right?

15 Did you also get written confirmation of your appointment
16 to work with that program?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. And did you provide me a copy of that?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And are you okay with that being an exhibit here?

21 A Yes.

22 (Petitioner's P-81 marked.)

23 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

24 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 81. Do
25 you recognize that?

1 A Yes.

2 Q What is that?

3 A This is my appointment letter for the Penn Summer Prep
4 program.

5 Q Okay. It looks like from the letterhead that that's
6 something that's run through the College of Liberal and
7 Professional Studies, as well?

8 A Yes, that's right.

9 Q How did you get this assignment?

10 A LPS sent out a call for applications essentially, so you
11 apply. You, sort of, pitch a class that you think would work
12 well for high schoolers in this situation. So, I had to apply,
13 give me timing preferences, and also describe the class that I
14 wanted to teach.

15 Q And so you developed this -- the title of the class is at
16 the bottom of the page, there right, Media Activism and Social
17 Movements?

18 A That's right, yeah.

19 Q You developed that topic?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And they accepted that?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And you're being paid, according to the one-, two-,
24 three-, four -- your -- the fourth paragraph indicates that
25 you're getting paid compensation for doing those two modules,

1 yes?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And that's above and beyond your summer funding?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And why did you take this on?

6 A For the extra income, and also teaching experience is
7 crucial, as well.

8 MS. ROSENBERGER: Move for the admission of Union Exhibit
9 81.

10 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 81 is received.

12 (Petitioner's P-81 received.)

13 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

14 Q Have you, yourself, published any articles during your
15 time at Annenberg so far?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Are they articles that are published -- co-authored with
18 anyone?

19 A I have one short essay that's co-authored and one -- it's
20 a bibliography, which is -- sort of like an annotated
21 bibliography that was co-authored.

22 Q And were they co-authored with a faculty member?

23 A The short essay was co-authored with Professor Yang. And
24 this bibliography was co-authored with two other graduate
25 students, and also Professor Yang.

1 Q Any -- so, there's two pieces, right?

2 A Right. Yeah.

3 Q Are either of them going to be part of your dissertation?

4 A So, the bibliography is about activist media. Essentially
5 is a list of resources if this is a topic you're interested in
6 but don't know how to navigate the literature; that's what it's
7 for. So, that's relevant to my dissertation.

8 The other piece, the short essay, is about social media
9 and how it affects our sense of time, which is --

10 Q I can relate to that.

11 A Sort of related to my dissertation, in that I studied
12 social media as part of my case study, so there's relevance
13 there. Yeah.

14 Q And are either of these things -- were they part of what
15 you did as a research fellow or a teaching fellow?

16 A No.

17 Q Have you, yourself, done any traveling as part of your
18 program at Penn?

19 A Yes.

20 Q What kind of things do you travel for?

21 A I've traveled for conferences. And also, what's more like
22 a seminar, not quite a conference.

23 Q And at what time of the year have you done that traveling?

24 A There's a big conference for communication that's every
25 May, towards the end of May, but I -- and I have traveled for

1 conferences not related to that one during the spring and the
2 fall. So.

3 Q And have you, based on your -- what you see in the
4 Annenberg School who are graduate students, do you know whether
5 your experience is unique or do other students travel for those
6 kinds of events, as well?

7 A Other students travel, as well.

8 Q And both in the summer session and in the spring and fall?

9 A Yes.

10 Q So, you are heading into your fifth year and hoping to
11 complete in your fifth year?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Is that the norm in Annenberg?

14 A I -- last I heard from our dean, the average was five and
15 a half years. I -- from my personal perspective and with that
16 number in mind, it seems like finishing in five is not exactly
17 the norm; it's the ideal one. Does that make sense?

18 A Okay.

19 MS. ROSENBERGER: Did I move for the admission of Union 81
20 already? I move for the admission of Union 81.

21 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 81 is received.

23 MS. ROSENBERGER: And that's all I have on direct, but Mr.
24 Fryman -- we're going to take a break, and then Mr. Fryman may
25 have some questions for you. And eventually, the hearing

1 officer may ask questions.

2 THE WITNESS: Okay.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, can we go off the record?

4 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

6 MR. FRYMAN: So, we would like to introduce with Ms. Clark
7 a copy of her transcript and a copy of her CV.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is the redact -- the grades are
9 redacted?

10 MR. FRYMAN: The grades are redacted.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Does the Union have any
12 objection?

13 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So, for the Witness, either
15 you can add -- you can have an opportunity to go in the room
16 next door and review those documents to see what they are
17 before they're presented. Or you can just say you have no
18 objection to them being presented.

19 THE WITNESS: I have no objection.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

21 MR. FRYMAN: Give me a moment.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

23 (Pause.)

24 MR. FRYMAN: Okay.

25 CROSS-EXAMINATION

1 BY MR. FRYMAN:

2 Q Good afternoon --

3 A Good afternoon.

4 Q -- Ms. Clark. I just have a handful of questions for you
5 about your program at Penn.

6 So, I want to start with going back to U-72, if you can
7 get that back in front of you? It's the first -- one of the
8 first documents Ms. Rosenberger provided to you.

9 So, this was the letter dated in February 2013 advising
10 you that you had been accepted to the doctoral program?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And as I recall, you -- you had still been in your senior
13 year at college at this point; correct?

14 A Yes.

15 Q You went straight through from college to the doctoral
16 program?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And so before entering the doctoral program you did not
19 have any prior teaching experience?

20 A Right.

21 Q And looking at U-72, up at the top, it's got an email
22 header, for lack of a better term; is that right?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And so, in fact, this was emailed to you?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And in fact, doesn't -- it doesn't reflect any type of
2 mailing address. So, you -- you only received this via email?

3 A I believe so.

4 Q And is that consistent with how the University or
5 Annenberg has communicated with you throughout your studies, by
6 email or electronically?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And while we have U-72 in front of us, I want to go down
9 to the one-, two-, three-, fourth paragraph; that's the one
10 that talks about the Dissertation Research Fellowship. Do you
11 see that?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And I think when Ms. Rosenberger was asking you questions,
14 you testified that the funding for this upcoming year when
15 you'll have this -- this Dissertation -- I'm going to call it
16 "DRF."

17 A That's fine. That's what we call it.

18 Q When you have this DRF, that the funding will be for the
19 two academic semesters. Did I hear that right?

20 A Yes.

21 Q But in fact, if you look at the fourth paragraph here, it
22 talks about that being a 12-month fellowship; correct?

23 A Right. I said I wasn't sure about the summer months, but
24 that would cover that.

25 Q So, according to this, it appears that you will receive it

1 for an entire 12-month period?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Now, before either applying or commencing your studies in
4 the fall of 2013, did you review any materials with respect to
5 the doctoral program at Annenberg?

6 A Yes.

7 Q What was it that you reviewed?

8 A Do you mean in my process of choosing to apply about the
9 program? Or --

10 Q Sure.

11 A Yeah. I reviewed Annenberg's website. I looked through
12 the student handbook. I -- my undergraduate department
13 includes two alumni, so I talked with them about their
14 experiences. Things like that.

15 Q Okay. And I'm not going to make you dig through that huge
16 pile. So, let's start with E-28.

17 MS. ROSENBERGER: She can get mine, that's okay.

18 MR. FRYMAN: You got it? Great.

19 MS. ROSENBERGER: Yeah.

20 BY MR. FRYMAN:

21 Q Show you what we've marked before as E-28. Do you
22 recognize that?

23 A Yes.

24 Q So, is this part of the website that you reviewed?

25 A So, it's hard to say with 100 percent confidence because

1 our website has undergone a major facelift.

2 Q Sure.

3 A But I believe this is generally what I reviewed.

4 Q And I -- I certainly appreciate that. That's fair. And I
5 certainly did not pull this in 2013.

6 A Right. Right.

7 Q In fact, it's dated up at the top June of this year. But
8 it provides an overview of the curriculum. And looking at that
9 overview of the curriculum, does that generally look familiar
10 to you at -- in terms of your understanding of what is required
11 to obtain the Ph.D. in the Annenberg School?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And that talks about initially the classroom experience
14 and the courses that you're required to take?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And then it has a section called "Beyond the Classroom."
17 Is that right?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And it mentions there are research and teaching
20 fellowships; correct?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And those would be the research and teaching fellowships
23 about which you testified when Ms. Rosenberger was asking you
24 questions; correct?

25 A That's right.

1 Q And then it goes on to talk about the qualifying --
2 qualifications evaluation?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And have you undertaken that qualifications evaluation?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And have you completed your coursework?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And you've satisfied the teaching and research fellowship
9 requirement?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And what about comprehensive exams?

12 A Yes. Taken them.

13 Q I'm sorry; you?

14 A I took them, yes.

15 Q And then hopefully sometime next year you will be
16 defending your dissertation?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And that's sometimes called an oral defense?

19 A Yes.

20 Q So you essentially have to -- to a roomful of hopefully
21 encouraging people get up and essentially give a talk on your
22 dissertation?

23 A That's right.

24 Q Not unlike a lecture?

25 A Not unlike a lecture, yes.

26 Q And now I want to take a look at -- and I'll give you a

1 copy, you can give that back to me -- U-38. And do you
2 recognize what was previously marked as U-38?

3 A Yes. This is the Annenberg School's Graduate Student
4 handbook for the years 2016 and 2017.

5 Q Okay. And so, then the handbook that you would have used
6 when you were contemplating enrolling at Penn would have been
7 an earlier version of this?

8 A That's right.

9 Q And like the much-abbreviated Employer 28 from the
10 website, Union 38 runs through the requirements of the doctoral
11 program at Annenberg; is that right?

12 A Yes, that's right.

13 Q It also talks about the funding that's available to
14 students?

15 A That's right.

16 Q And so you -- you reviewed some earlier version of this?

17 A Right.

18 Q And it also talks about the degree requirements; correct?

19 A Correct.

20 Q Including the coursework?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And the teaching and research fellowships?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Exams?

25 A Yes.

1 Q The dissertation --

2 A Yes.

3 Q -- completion and defense?

4 A Yes. That's right.

5 Q And that Annenberg provides bicycle racks, among other
6 things.

7 MS. ROSENBERGER: Is that a degree requirement?

8 MR. FRYMAN: Just gotten lighten up the mood every now and
9 again.

10 BY MR. FRYMAN:

11 Q Okay, and going for a moment to U-72, that's the initial
12 acceptance letter. You had reviewed those materials and the
13 letter, that is U-38, E-28, and this U-72 before you signed
14 this letter of -- reflecting your acceptance and desire to
15 enter the program?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Now, the first -- the first year you had to take courses,
18 right?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And those were graduate level courses in the Annenberg
21 School?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And is it fair for me to -- to assume they were not unlike
24 courses with which I would be familiar, where you had assigned
25 readings?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Where you had to conduct some research?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Where you had to produce some papers?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Take some exams?
- 7 A Not as much in this program, no.
- 8 Q More papers?
- 9 A More papers.
- 10 Q Okay. And is that consistent through the courses that you
- 11 took your first and second year?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q Now, when did you finish your coursework?
- 14 A I took three and a half years of coursework, so last fall
- 15 was my last semester of coursework. The first semester of my
- 16 fourth year.
- 17 Q Okay. And you took a variety of courses across the
- 18 Annenberg School?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q And I take it now those courses would have related
- 21 ultimately to what you selected as your dissertation topic?
- 22 A That's right.
- 23 Q Okay. And those courses that you took, those were in the
- 24 fall and the spring academic semesters?
- 25 A Yes.

1 Q And they were held during the week?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And you generally attended?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Occasionally, you went on -- you went -- you left campus
6 to attend a conference or a seminar?

7 A Um-hum. Yes.

8 Q And that would be for a weekend or perhaps a week?

9 A In one instance it was a week, and most other instances a
10 long weekend. Yeah.

11 Q Okay. And I think one of the conferences or seminars you
12 mentioned was at the end of May; is that right?

13 A Yes.

14 Q So, that would have been after the conclusion of the
15 spring semester?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Okay.

18 (Employer's E-76 marked.)

19 BY MR. FRYMAN:

20 Q I'm showing you what we've marked as Employer's 76. This
21 is a copy of your unofficial transcript at Penn?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And starting at the -- at the top, it gives some
24 identifying information about you: where you were admitted
25 from, the school, Annenberg, and then the divisional -- what it

1 calls the division, which is the Annenberg Ph.D. Program;
2 correct?

3 A Correct.

4 Q And then identifies something called the Graduate Group,
5 which it says is the Communication Graduate Group.

6 A That's right.

7 Q Now, it mentions that in May of 2015 you were awarded a
8 master's degree?

9 A That's right.

10 Q So, that was by virtue of your having completed certain
11 milestones on the way to the Ph.D.?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And then the -- your transcript goes on to detail all your
14 coursework; correct?

15 A Correct.

16 Q And then reflects that starting in the spring of this past
17 year -- or this year, you're on dissertation status; is that
18 right?

19 A That's right.

20 Q And then you will be again in the fall of 2017?

21 A Right.

22 Q And then finally, your academic transcript reflects that
23 you passed your comprehensive exams?

24 A Correct.

25 Q And your master's file and your qualifications evaluation?

1 A That's right.

2 Q And your doctoral preliminary exam?

3 A Right.

4 Q And then you're scheduled to defend your dissertation on
5 May 9, 2017?

6 A Yes. Well, that's my proposal, actually. It's the
7 proposal for the dissertation.

8 Q Okay. And then it -- finally, it mentions that, you know,
9 satisfied the teaching requirement?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And that would be the teaching fellowships about which you
12 testified?

13 A We are required to be a teaching fellow once, so that's
14 the requirement.

15 Q All right. So, doing that for one of those three
16 semesters satisfied that requirement?

17 A Yes.

18 Q The other two times you did it, you received your
19 fellowship funding; correct?

20 A Yes.

21 Q You didn't receive any additional compensation or pay?

22 A No. That's right.

23 Q Then, let's just go back a minute to your initial funding
24 package. So, in U-72, that initial letter you received
25 advising of -- you of your acceptance into your program, that

1 advised you that you would be provided four years of this
2 fellowship funding; correct?

3 A Correct.

4 Q And that would include this annual stipend?

5 A Correct.

6 Q For the academic year of 24,000, or perhaps as it may
7 increase over time, right?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Health insurance?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Payment of the -- any university fees and costs?

12 A Right.

13 Q And then also four years of summer funding?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And there was no service required with respect to the
16 summer funding; correct?

17 A Correct.

18 Q And with respect to the -- the four years of stipend, the
19 requirements there were essentially the requirements of the
20 degree program? That as long you satisfied the requirements of
21 the degree program and made satisfactory academic progress you
22 would receive that annual stipend; correct?

23 A And as long as you were a teaching or research fellow.
24 Doing that work.

25 Q I'm sorry?

1 A As long as you were doing the work of being a TF or an RF.

2 Q And as we discussed earlier, those were laid out
3 requirements of the degree program; correct?

4 A Not exactly. I'm not sure if I understand the question
5 then.

6 Q Well, in E-28 and U-38, it laid out that in order to
7 obtain the Ph.D. you had to serve as a teaching fellow and a
8 research fellow; correct?

9 A Right. But I believe in -- in most of the written
10 versions of those policies, it talks about having to be an RF
11 or a TF once. And your fellowship work beyond that is in
12 exchange for the stipend was my understanding.

13 Q Okay. And that stipend was the same, whether you were
14 serving in a "required semester" or "non-required semester"?

15 A Right.

16 Q And just finishing up with E-76, the transcript, we talked
17 about that it reflects that the teaching requirement was
18 satisfied. It also reflects that you satisfied the research
19 requirement; correct?

20 A That's right.

21 Q It mentions -- the last phrase there, "Master's research
22 requirement satisfied by research project." What was that?

23 A I believe that's referring to the qualifying exam, the QE.

24 Q Okay. So, let's talk about -- your first semester, that
25 was the fall of 2013, right?

1 A Right.

2 Q And that's when you worked as a research fellow alongside,
3 I'll hopefully pronounce this correctly, Dr. Zelziner?

4 A Zelizer, that's right.

5 Q Zelizer. And you would meet with Dr. Zelizer once a week?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And discuss the -- the collection of materials, the
8 organization of materials that you were doing?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Had you developed a dissertation topic at this point?

11 A No.

12 Q And moving on to the second semester of your first year,
13 that's the spring of 2014, you submitted some -- your top three
14 to five choices --

15 A Right.

16 Q -- for that assign, right?

17 A That's right.

18 Q And you had actually spoken to Professor Price before
19 submitting those choices?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And his work -- yeah, I think you testified it related
22 involving to what ultimately -- your utility research
23 direction?

24 A Not his work, per se. He works on diplomacy,
25 international diplomacy. But the Center, at the time, had a

1 project related to gender and media.

2 Q And that center -- okay, strike that.

3 I'm sorry, what -- what did you tell us your dissertation
4 topic is?

5 A It's feminist social movements in the United States and
6 their media practices.

7 Q Right. And would I be wrong to say that that relates in
8 some way to the work that you were doing with the Staff Center
9 for Global Communication Studies?

10 A In the broadest possible terms there's connection that
11 both sets of projects fall under the categories of gender and
12 media. But the -- that type of media base and media for
13 development intervention is not the kind of media practices
14 that I was studying. And I'm studying the U.S. context. This
15 was about India and Kenya. And the types of methods of both
16 the articles I was looking at -- behind the articles I was
17 looking at, the research methods, and the methods that the
18 evaluation was carrying out are not methods that I use in my
19 own research.

20 Q And you hope someday to obtain a tenure track position or
21 initially a post-doc position, right?

22 A That's right.

23 Q And in that position, you would expect to be doing
24 research?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And you would deploy the research skills that you
2 developed in the doctoral program in Annenberg in conducting
3 future research, I assume?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Now, I want to stick with this -- the work you did with
6 Professor Price in the Center. I think you told us that come
7 the fall of 2014, while you were working on the same project,
8 now you were -- you had moved on to writing something you
9 described as a literature review?

10 A That's right.

11 Q That is unlike writing a paper for a class?

12 A A literature review is usually a component of a class
13 paper, yeah.

14 Q Okay. And in the spring of 2014 you -- you then moved on
15 to working with your -- as a research fellow with your advisor
16 Dr. Yang.

17 A Isn't that 2015?

18 Q My notes reflect the spring of 2014. So, that would be --
19 or did I get that wrong? You're right, the spring of '15 --

20 A Yes.

21 Q -- because that comes after the fall of '14. So, I wrote
22 that down wrong. My apologies.

23 So, then it was in the spring of '15 that you worked with
24 Dr. Yang; correct?

25 A Correct.

1 Q And this is where you took the laboring oar in pulling
2 together this collective?

3 A That's right.

4 Q And you wanted to create this critical mass of students
5 studying social movements across the university; correct?

6 A We had noticed that this -- there was a critical mass, so
7 we wanted to bring them together basically.

8 Q And would it be fair to characterize this as a -- an
9 interdisciplinary group of students?

10 A Yes.

11 Q In fact, I think you identified that in addition to
12 Annenberg, you had participants from sociology, right?

13 A Correct.

14 Q Some other departments or programs in the School of Arts &
15 Sciences, political science, philosophy, right?

16 A Yes.

17 Q A student from an English [sic]?

18 A Yes.

19 Q But also from another school, School of Education?

20 A Yes, at Penn.

21 Q Okay. Did you have any student participants from the
22 School of Design?

23 A Not that I know of off the top of my head.

24 Q Did you have any students from the School of Nursing
25 participate?

1 A I don't think so.

2 Q Did you have any students participate from what's referred
3 to BGS, or Biomedical Graduate Studies?

4 A No.

5 Q And I think you had mentioned that this was funded, not
6 just by Annenberg, but also Sociology?

7 A That's right.

8 Q Which is part of the School of Arts & Sciences or SAS?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And part of your responsibilities were to create programs,
11 programming conferences, events, that sort of thing?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Now, getting back to for a moment that you hope to one day
14 be a faculty member.

15 A Um-hum.

16 Q Do you understand that most colleges and universities,
17 there is what's called a tripartite composition of
18 responsibilities of the faculty member?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Research being one of them?

21 A Um-hum. Right.

22 Q Teaching?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Service?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And by "service" that you either would have to do or might
2 want to do as a faculty member would involve creating
3 interdisciplinary programming?

4 A Yes. Sure.

5 Q Now, that was the semester, the spring 2015 that we're
6 talking about, where you also embarked on this project on the
7 journal, right?

8 A Right.

9 Q And that's a journal where scholarly articles or papers
10 are published?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Peer reviewed?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And you hope to someday public peer reviewed papers or
15 articles?

16 A Yes. I have done that.

17 Q And in fact, you have done that. And this research fellow
18 gave you an opportunity to see kind of the other side, right,
19 where from the journal side of reviewing papers that were
20 submitted and how those are viewed and processed, right?

21 A Right.

22 Q And I want to talk about the second summer, so think we're
23 now in the summer of 2015, if I have my dates right?

24 A Right.

25 Q And I think you testified that -- well, each summer you

1 received this summer funding?

2 A Um-hum, that's right.

3 Q That was identified in U-72, the initial acceptance
4 letter -- or --

5 A Right.

6 Q -- acceptance letter, right?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And there was no service attached -- service requirement
9 attached to that summer funding; correct?

10 A Right. You have to submit an application that includes a
11 description of plan you to do. One option for that is to say
12 you're going to do work that would -- you would call service,
13 but you can also write that you're going to do your own
14 research. So, there's options with what you do.

15 Q And that -- and that -- just going back for a moment, that
16 first summer, that would be the summer of '14, that was where
17 you did some work with the Center?

18 A That's right.

19 Q Doing the interviews?

20 A Right.

21 Q What you described as, I think, qualitative research?
22 Well, would you describe that as qualitative research?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And then the second summer, you did not do anything beyond
25 your own research and did not receive any compensation beyond

1 the summer funding?

2 A Right.

3 Q So, what was it you did that -- that summer?

4 A That summer -- I can tell by looking at my -- that summer
5 I believe I worked on turning course papers into journal
6 submissions. Does that make sense? So, there's differences
7 between what a course -- a term paper would look like versus
8 what you would submit as a finished product to a journal, and I
9 worked on that for my own research.

10 Q So, these were papers that you had written in one or more
11 of your courses?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And then trying to enhance or do whatever you would do so
14 that I might be accepted in a journal?

15 A Correct. Yeah.

16 Q And this may be obvious, but why is it that you want to be
17 published in a journal?

18 A Because most universities prioritize your research, and
19 they want to see publications as evidence of excellence in
20 research.

21 Q Okay. And would this enhance, in your mind, your ability
22 to obtain one of those post-doc or tenure track faculty
23 positions?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And where did you conduct that research that summer?

1 A Where did I conduct it?

2 Q Did you stay here in Philadelphia?

3 A Yes.

4 Q So, let's move on then to the spring of 2016, if we could.

5 A Sure.

6 Q And that's when you did your first teaching fellowship;
7 correct?

8 A That's right.

9 Q And before commencing that position, you had actually
10 approached Professor Paxton; is that right?

11 A Right.

12 Q And you were -- I believe you said you were interested in
13 her class?

14 A That's right.

15 Q And why were you interested in her class?

16 A Dr. Paxton has a reputation as an excellent teacher. And
17 this course was a higher-level course within the area of
18 qualitative communications. So, that was a good experience to
19 have.

20 Q And did it relate in any way to your particular research
21 interests?

22 A The theories that are taught in that class generally do
23 not. It's an area called Ritual Theory, but the -- the unit
24 that I -- the class I taught was related to my research
25 interests. I connected it to my dissertation.

1 Q Okay. With respect to the class where you guest lectured?

2 A Yes.

3 Q But going back to the other place -- the class, generally,
4 it did not relate to your particular research interests, but
5 nonetheless you wanted to have experience with Professor Paxton
6 because of the teaching experience?

7 A Right.

8 Q And the -- what you could pick up and learn from her?

9 A That's right.

10 Q In terms of developing your own teaching skills for future
11 employment?

12 A That's right.

13 Q And this was a class that had 30 students in it?

14 A About that, yes.

15 Q So, there was no recitation?

16 A Right.

17 Q And they were undergraduate students; correct?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Now, these were undergraduate students not in Annenberg;
20 correct?

21 A No, they were in Annenberg. Not all of them were
22 communication majors, if that's what you're asking. But.

23 Q Well, aren't the communication major's undergrad in the
24 School of Arts & Sciences?

25 A Yes. Yes. Yeah. Okay.

1 Q So -- so, in fact, these are undergraduate students who
2 are enrolled in the School of Arts & Sciences, not the
3 Annenberg School of Communications?

4 A Right. That's right.

5 Q And some of them happened to be communication majors?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Which is a major in the School of Arts & Sciences --

8 A Yes.

9 Q -- degree?

10 A That's right.

11 Q Or to really be precise, for undergrads it's called the
12 College of Arts & Sciences; is that right?

13 A I think so, yes.

14 Q All right. And I think you talked about in your -- this
15 was your -- really your first teaching experience; correct?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And in fact, because it was your first experience, the
18 first time you were going to have to grade, you had a good bit
19 of discussion with Professor Paxton?

20 A That's right.

21 Q And you had an opportunity to guest lecture in this
22 course?

23 A That's right.

24 Q And that's where you attempted to develop a lecture
25 related to your particular research interests?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Okay. And Professor Paxton observed?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And provided you feedback afterwards?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Now, I think you told Ms. Rosenberger that you did not --
7 you did not receive any training before serving as a teaching
8 fellow; is that right?

9 A That's right.

10 Q Okay. So, you were not -- you did not attend any workshop
11 or seminar put on by the Center for Teaching and Learning?

12 A I don't think so prior to that teaching fellow. But I
13 would have to look at my calendar to confirm that. But I don't
14 remember -- I don't recall attending any CTL workshops prior to
15 that semester.

16 Q Okay. Did you attend some CTL workshops at some
17 subsequent point?

18 A Yes.

19 Q What was it that you attended in CTL?

20 A I would have to think pretty hard about it. I think I
21 attended one CTL workshop on syllabus development. I have
22 attended a CTL workshop on semester long assignments, as in an
23 assign that has parts that grow over the course of the
24 semester. I attended a workshop that was -- that involved the
25 retiring faculty member, sort of, giving a lookback on her

1 teaching experience and the major lessons that she has learned.
2 And then probably a couple others that I'm forgetting at the
3 moment.

4 Q Okay. And going back to this teaching fellow experience
5 with Professor Paxton and the grading. You talked about how
6 with respect to papers that you would engage in this process
7 initially where you would take a subset, small number of papers
8 where you perhaps would identify what you thought were some of
9 the best, some of the worst, do some grading, have the
10 professor grade those, as well, so that you could then compare
11 notes, for lack of a better term.

12 A Sure. Yes.

13 Q And that was a process that -- in which you engaged in
14 subsequent teaching fellow experiences?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And when you compared notes, that was in an in-person
17 meeting where you discussed why it was that you assessed a
18 particular stud's paper in a particular way? And Professor
19 Paxton offered her observations as to where she agreed,
20 disagreed, and why?

21 A Typically, yes.

22 Q Okay. So, let's talk about the -- what my notes say is
23 the third summer, which I think we're now talking about the
24 summer of 2016? Would that be last summer?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay.

2 A Yeah.

3 Q And this is where you, in addition to your summer funding,
4 you worked on the journal?

5 A That's right.

6 Q And if my notes are correct, doing some copy-editing work
7 with respect to the references for, was it, Professor Yang's
8 book?

9 A That's right.

10 Q So what did that entail specifically?

11 A The copy editing?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Professor Yang was in the process of submitting the final
14 proofs for his book. His publisher has a very specific
15 citation style that we don't use otherwise, so rather than
16 going through it himself or hiring some outside source to make
17 sure all the references were within the proper style
18 requirements, he asked me to go through what amounted a couple
19 dozen pages of references to make sure they all followed the
20 appropriate style.

21 Q Okay. And do you recall what period of time over the
22 summer you did this work?

23 A Yes. I think -- I want to say it was within June and July
24 and August, but I'm not really for sure.

25 Q And going back to the union exhibits, go -- in Union 77,

1 that's the email that Dr. Yang sent to Kelly Anderson about
2 your work. Is this the work we're talking about?

3 A That was meant to be compensation for both the copy
4 editing and the journal.

5 Q Okay.

6 A Yeah.

7 Q And that -- all of that work took place between -- or over
8 June, July and August of 2016?

9 A Well, the journal I had been working on already, to --

10 Q Right.

11 A -- prior to that summer. But yes, with respect to the
12 copy editing.

13 Q Okay. And with respect to -- let's start looking at the
14 copy-editing work, that was not required -- work that was
15 required in order for you to obtain your degree; correct?

16 A That's right.

17 Q Nor was the -- the other journal work; correct?

18 A That's right.

19 Q And not required as a condition of your -- your funding
20 package?

21 A That's right. Yeah.

22 Q In fact, over the summer you're still getting the \$4,000
23 summer funding as part of your four-year fellowship package,
24 right?

25 A That's right.

1 Q And is that work that you were doing on the journal and
2 copy editing, were you paid hourly for that work?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And did you track your hours?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay. So, now the fall of 2016 you serve as a teaching
7 fellow that semester, right?

8 A That's right.

9 Q And this is with -- was with Dr. Jordan?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And this is where you essentially didn't get the -- the
12 assignment you wanted?

13 A That's right.

14 Q And that was due to Dr. Lingel's class not having the
15 anticipated enrollment?

16 A And Dr. Jordan's class having higher than anticipated.

17 Q And higher than expected.

18 A Right.

19 Q Okay. Now, was Dr. Jordan's class nonetheless on your
20 list of preferences?

21 A I don't remember if it was. It's possible.

22 Q And Dr. Jordan's class, that had recitations?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And your prior experience with Dr. Paxton, you did not
25 have the opportunity to lead a recitation section?

1 A Right. That's right.

2 Q And in your subsequent experience in the spring of 2016,
3 the last time you had served as teaching fellow, there was no
4 recitation?

5 A That's right.

6 Q So, this teaching fellow with Dr. Jordan, that was the --
7 the one time you had the opportunity to lead a recitation
8 section; correct?

9 A Right.

10 Q And I think you told us you did so well in Dr. Jordan's
11 mind that she nominated you for and you received an award for
12 your teaching in that class?

13 A That's right.

14 Q And you also had regular meetings with Dr. Jordan?

15 A Yes.

16 Q To discuss how things were going in the class and
17 recitation?

18 A yes.

19 Q Did Dr. Jordan ever attend your recitation?

20 A I don't think so. No.

21 Q But she also gave you the opportunity to guest lecture?

22 A Within the bigger lecture hall, yeah.

23 Q And she observed?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And she provided feedback?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And this summer, you're teaching in this new Penn summer
3 prep program, along with one help -- the LPS course?

4 A That's right.

5 Q And with the Penn summer prep, you had the opportunity to
6 develop the topic?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And the course content?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And this will be something to build upon your teaching
11 experience and résumé?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And starting in September, that's when you'll start on
14 this dissertation -- the DRF?

15 A That's right.

16 Q And you won't be performing any service in the way of
17 research fellow or research assistant or teaching fellow or
18 teaching assistant?

19 A That's right.

20 Q And you know now that you -- that's what's going to happen
21 next year?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And you have no -- well, and the expectation or the hope
24 is that you will complete and defend your dissertation and not
25 need an additional year of funding?

1 A That's the goal.

2 Q And if you don't, currently there's no promise or
3 guarantee of any funding beyond the fifth year?

4 A Not from Annenberg, that's right.

5 Q Right.

6 (Employer's E-77 marked.)

7 BY MR. FRYMAN:

8 Q Do you recognize what we've marked as E-77?

9 A Yes. It's my CV.

10 Q And is this current?

11 A It's a little out of date, yeah.

12 Q What would -- what would need updating?

13 A The bibliography I mentioned earlier was just published
14 this week. I have another solo authored article in press or
15 forthcoming, as I've marked here. Oh, sorry; the bibliography
16 is on here, my apologies. But the other solo authored
17 forthcoming piece is not on here.

18 Q And that's something that you would put under the section
19 titled "Publications?"

20 A Yes.

21 Q And would -- if you wouldn't mind, where is the
22 bibliography?

23 A So, that's under "Chapters." The second entry.

24 Q The -- that in part says "Oxford Bibliographies in
25 Communication"?

1 A That's right.

2 Q And you're listed as the first -- your name appears first?

3 A That's right.

4 Q Is there a significance in or a protocol in communication
5 as to the listing of authors?

6 A Usually it indicates someone who invested the most work in
7 the piece. Or in more quantitative communication research it
8 would be the PI or the primary investigator.

9 Q And so, it appears that there's a mix, although on most of
10 these that you list here you're listed first, right?

11 A That's right.

12 Q And then there's one where Dr. Yang is listed, and you're
13 listed as a co-author, the one on Social Media and Time, and
14 Social Media and Society?

15 A That's right.

16 Q And you also list your teaching experience on here;
17 correct?

18 A Correct.

19 Q Looks like you already have your summer teaching for this
20 summer on that. That's right on the bottom of the page;
21 correct?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And then you list your experience as a teaching fellow,
24 including the guest lectures that you conducted?

25 A Yes.

1 Q So, looking down, there's a guest lecture that appears at
2 Ursinus, so, were you invited to -- to go back to your alma
3 mater and deliver a guest lecture there?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And it looks like even though you didn't get -- get to be
6 a teaching fellow with Professor Lingel, that you did get to
7 guest lecture in one of her courses?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And did she observe?

10 A She was not at -- in class at the time. She had to travel
11 to a conference.

12 Q And then you -- you also list something here, "Instructor,
13 Introduction to Communication Behavior Recitation." What does
14 that mean?

15 A That's the recitation sessions that I led for Amy Jordan's
16 class. I was the instructor of record.

17 Q Okay. So, that -- where she's the primary instructor for
18 the course, that reflects that you were leading her recitation
19 session?

20 A Right.

21 Q And were you required to do all these guest lectures for
22 these other professors?

23 A Professors I wasn't a TF for, no.

24 Q And that was something you wanted to do?

25 A Yes.

1 Q To gain the additional teaching experience?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And then you, on the third page, you go on to detail your
4 experience as a research fellow?

5 A That's right.

6 Q Now, I see in the summer of 2014 it appears you traveled
7 to Spain?

8 A That's right.

9 Q How long were you in Spain in the summer of 2014?

10 A Two weeks.

11 MR. FRYMAN: For the benefit of the court reporter right
12 now, I see Dr. Zelizer's name on here, so it is Z-E-L-I-Z-E-R.

13 BY MR. FRYMAN:

14 Q And then turning to the last page, where it says "Founding
15 member of Media Activism Research Collective, University of
16 Pennsylvania," that's the collective that you helped establish
17 the interdisciplinary, bringing together this critical mass of
18 students that we talked about?

19 A That's right.

20 Q And the "Editorial assistant, Communication in the
21 Public," is that the journal?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And then under "Awards," you list the James D. Woods Award
24 for Outstanding Graduate Student Teaching. Is that the award
25 that Dr. Jordan nominated you for and you received?

1 A Yes.

2 Q For your teaching?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And then you list "Doctoral Fellowship, Annenberg School
5 for Communication, University of Pennsylvania." That's your
6 Ph.D. program?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And you view that as, quite rightly, as an award?
9 Something that you earned?

10 A It's traditionally listed that way on CV, yes.

11 Q Okay.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I don't think we moved 76, did we?

13 MR. FRYMAN: Oh.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

15 MR. FRYMAN: I would move 76 and 77.

16 MS. ROSENBERGER: No objection.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, 76 and --

18 MR. FRYMAN: Thank you, Mary.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- Employer 76 and 77 are
20 received. You're welcome.

21 (Employer's E-76 and E-77 received.)

22 (Employer's E-78 marked.)

23 BY MR. FRYMAN:

24 Q Do you recognize what we've marked as Employer 78?

25 A Yes, it's my profile on Annenberg's website.

1 Q And that, you know, describes some of your activities that
2 we've talked about today?

3 A That's right.

4 Q The collective we've talked about?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And then your publications?

7 A Yes, though it's a little off. I don't update it enough.
8 It's a little outdated.

9 Q Okay. And just going back for a moment to E-77, the CV,
10 that's something that you'll use in order to -- when you're
11 seeking a faculty position?

12 A Yes. It's usually required application material.

13 MR. FRYMAN: Can I -- did I move for 78?

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: No.

15 MR. FRYMAN: Move for 78.

16 MS. ROSENBERGER: No objection.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Employer's 78 is received.

18 (Employer's E-78 received.)

19 (Employer's E-79 marked.)

20 BY MR. FRYMAN:

21 Q Employer's 79, this is an announcement on the Penn website
22 of your receipt of the James D. Woods Award?

23 A That's right.

24 Q And that, again, was for Dr. Jordan's class?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And she's quoted in there talking about you?

2 A That's right.

3 MR. FRYMAN: Move 79.

4 MS. ROSENBERGER: No objection.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Employer's 79 is received.

6 (Employer's E-79 received.)

7 BY MR. FRYMAN:

8 Q You talked about pursuing a position in academia. In
9 addition to your CV, is it your expectation that colleges or
10 universities would expect some form a teaching dossier?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And that would be a collection of your teaching
13 experiences?

14 A It varies, yeah. So, but usually more than what's on your
15 CV. It might include metrics from your evaluations if you have
16 any. The qualitative open-ended comments from student
17 evaluations. Reference letters regarding your teaching from
18 someone who can speak to them. And often even proposals for
19 courses at the university you're applying to; what courses,
20 like, you could teach that could contribute to their
21 curriculum.

22 MR. FRYMAN: Thank you very much, Ms. Clark. That's all
23 the questions that I have.

24 THE WITNESS: Okay.

25 MS. ROSENBERGER: I have just a little bit of follow-up.

1 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

3 Q Do you still have Employer 79 in front of you?

4 MR. FRYMAN: And I did move 79?

5 COURT REPORTER: Yes.

6 MR. FRYMAN: Thank you.

7 THE WITNESS: Which one is that?

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: It's this one.

9 THE WITNESS: Okay. Yes. Mine's not marked.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: Oh.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: It's not stickered. There you go.

12 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

13 Q So, Mr. Fryman asked you -- had you note that Dr. Jordan
14 is quoted there. She's quoted here on the side -- the left of
15 the middle picture on the first page; isn't that right?

16 A That's right.

17 Q And she said -- one of things she says in reference to you
18 is, "She has been a gift to the undergraduate program at
19 Annenberg, and one day she will be a gift to her own students."

20 Is it your understanding that this award relates to the
21 contribution that you, when you were a recipient or whoever the
22 recipient is, makes to the undergraduate program?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Is there a monetary component to this award?

25 A No.

1 Q It's just a recognition?

2 A Yes.

3 Q On Employer 76, which is your redacted transcript, on the
4 second page, I just want to make sure that the record is clear
5 on one thing. Do you have that in front of you, the second
6 page?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Under "Comments," the first paragraph, the second to last
9 entry says, "Defensive proposal date 5/9/17."

10 A Yes.

11 Q What -- what is it that happened on May 9th of 2017?

12 A So, we have to submit a written proposal for the
13 dissertation, and then complete an oral defense of it. So, the
14 oral defense is what happens on that date.

15 Q Okay. It's not the defense of your dissertation, it's the
16 defense of the proposal about what you want to do your
17 dissertation on?

18 A Right. That's right.

19 Q When did you settle on your dissertation topic?

20 Approximately.

21 A It's hard to say. My movement toward my dissertation
22 project began in the fall of my second year, I believe. Yeah,
23 in the fall of my second year, and has grown through coursework
24 and through conversations with my advisor. I would say it
25 wasn't until the end of my third year that I had a pretty

1 definitive idea of what it was going to be like.

2 Q Okay. Do you still have a copy of Union Exhibit 38 that
3 Mr. Fryman handed you; it's the student handbook. Do you still
4 have that in front of you?

5 A Yes, I have that.

6 Q Could you turn to Page 26?

7 A Yes.

8 Q There's a chart on the bottom there with a heading that
9 says "Sample Plan of Study."

10 A Yes.

11 Q Do you see that?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Was there -- when you reviewed the student handbook for --
14 before you -- when you were applying to graduate schools, do
15 you remember if there was a sample plan of study in the version
16 that you reviewed?

17 A I don't recall. That version is still accessible on the
18 website, though. It --

19 Q But you don't recall specifically?

20 A But I don't recall specifically.

21 Q So, in this sample plan of study, in the current version,
22 or at least as current as we have here in the record, it has a
23 reference in the first eight semesters to something called
24 "TF/RF Funding."

25 A Um-hum.

1 Q Do you know what that refers to?

2 A I believe it's just the stipend. That's my understanding,
3 the 24,000 or 25 -- stipend.

4 Q And the terms "TF" and "RF" have a common meaning in
5 Annenberg?

6 A Yes.

7 Q What do they mean?

8 A Teaching fellow or research fellow.

9 Q Okay. Mr. Fryman asked you about when you -- some
10 questions about what you do when you are in classes in terms of
11 your research.

12 A That's right.

13 Q Do you remember that questioning?

14 A Yes.

15 Q When you are doing research for classes, are you asked to
16 do research for the professor's book?

17 A No.

18 Q When you're doing research for classes, are you do --
19 asked -- being asked to do research that's part of a project
20 run by, say, the Center that you testified about?

21 A No.

22 Q Is it research for the class?

23 A Yes.

24 Q With regard to the collective --

25 MR. FRYMAN: There's a lot noise there.

1 MS. ROSENBERGER: I'm sorry?

2 MR. FRYMAN: He's making a lot noise tapping out on his
3 computer.

4 MS. ROSENBERGER: Oh. Well, it's better than the doors
5 that were slamming a while ago.

6 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

7 Q With regard --

8 COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry. I'll will attempt to type
9 quietly.

10 MR. FRYMAN: Thank you.

11 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

12 Q With regard to the collective that you talked about
13 starting up, you said that the funding for that came from
14 sociology and Annenberg, right?

15 A That's right.

16 Q Was that funding to pay for your position?

17 A No.

18 Q What was it for?

19 A We drew up a proposal to prepare for the deans, what we
20 wanted to do and why need funding for it. This included being
21 able to have -- just have food at events. It included being
22 able to pay honorariums to speakers. It included things like
23 being able to print out programs when we had a conference.
24 Just the cost of running the group.

25 Q And when you say "we put together the proposal," you and

1 who?

2 A Me and Dr. Yang.

3 Q Okay. And Mr. Fryman also asked you about the tripartite
4 responsibility of a faculty member; teaching, research, and
5 service. Do you remember that testimony?

6 A Yes.

7 Q The service component of that, based on your
8 understanding, is that service to the university --

9 A Yes.

10 Q -- or the institution?

11 A Yes.

12 Q With regard to the Center for Teaching and Learning
13 workshops that you talked about, there were other attendees
14 that attended them?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And were they all graduate students?

17 A I believe so, yes.

18 Q Did you ever -- do you know whether faculty also attend
19 workshops at the Center for Teaching and Learning?

20 A I know that post-doc's do. I've never been at a workshop
21 where there's someone there who I recognize as a faculty
22 member. Sometimes these are open to the entire campus, so you
23 know, I'm not going to know everyone whose there. But.

24 Q Okay.

25 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have on redirect, thank

1 you.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I have some questions. Are
3 you okay? Do you need to --

4 THE WITNESS: Oh, yeah.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- take a break? Okay.

6 All right, okay, if I have the time wrong -- the timing
7 wrong, just let me know. But Fall 2013, when you -- I have in
8 my notes that you did research with the professor, collected
9 primary source material. Were you evaluated on that work?

10 THE WITNESS: No.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Spring 2014, you were doing
12 more -- I guess -- a research fellow again. Is that where you
13 were working for the Center for Global Communication Studies?

14 THE WITNESS: That's right.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Were you evaluated on that
16 work?

17 THE WITNESS: Just in person.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And how?

19 THE WITNESS: The staff that I was working under at the
20 Center told me that they thought I was doing a good job.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Any other evaluation?

22 THE WITNESS: No.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know whether or not that
24 goes back to your -- to the Communications Department?

25 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: All right. In the summer -- so,
2 just so I'm clear, whenever you receive summer funding, that
3 funding did not require you to do any service?

4 THE WITNESS: That's right.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So, when you worked in the summer,
6 those were additional jobs that you chose to do because you
7 said you needed money?

8 THE WITNESS: That's right.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. When you worked after -- I
10 think for your -- the first summer, you were conducting --
11 conducting phone interviews?

12 THE WITNESS: Right.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How much were you paid for that,
14 if you remember?

15 THE WITNESS: I don't remember.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you remember that it was
17 hourly?

18 THE WITNESS: It was hourly.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Year 2, you were a research
20 fellow and you were writing a literature review. Did you
21 receive an evaluation for that work?

22 THE WITNESS: Just in person.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Who did it?

24 THE WITNESS: The same staff members at the Center.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you remember what --

1 well, do you whether or not that review was shared with your
2 department?

3 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Spring 2015, still the
5 research fellow working with the MARC program?

6 THE WITNESS: That's right.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Were you evaluated on that work?

8 THE WITNESS: No.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: What about -- you also worked with
10 the professor who started the new journal. You were the
11 editorial assistant?

12 THE WITNESS: That's right.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any evaluation of that work?

14 THE WITNESS: Just in person.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: From who?

16 THE WITNESS: From Professor Yang. The professor.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Well, do you remember
18 what -- that's a woman, right?

19 THE WITNESS: No.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: A man, sorry.

21 THE WITNESS: That's okay.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you remember what he mentioned?
23 What he told you about your work?

24 THE WITNESS: We were still figuring out how to run the
25 journal, so he would give me feedback on when I needed to loop

1 the editors into the conversation, when I didn't. When I could
2 work more independently, you know, without asking if I could
3 take this next step.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I was a little bit
5 confused. Summer -- the summer after your second year you
6 received funding, but I think there was some talk about you --
7 you submitted -- I think the Employer asked you something about
8 whether or not you did service and you said something about you
9 could submit an application to do something. What -- what did
10 you mean by that?

11 THE WITNESS: So, I think it's in the handbook. But when
12 you're applying your summer fellowship, you have to -- there's
13 a form you have to fill out for the dean's office. And part of
14 that form involves a proposal of the activities you'll carry
15 out for, I guess, summer funding. And the handbook spells out,
16 like, different categories of what this type -- what types of
17 activities could fall under this category and be eligible for
18 summer funding. One of those categories does include service.
19 So, that's an option to include in your application, but not
20 required.

21 When I have applied for my summer fellowship funding, I
22 have applied to complete my own research, not to do service to
23 other -- for other faculty.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The first time you taught,
25 you mentioned the collaboration concerning grades.

1 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How was the final grade decided?

3 THE WITNESS: When we were looking at the same paper you
4 mean? Or are --

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I just -- I just mean the over --
6 the final grade the student receives. Like, their overall
7 grade.

8 THE WITNESS: Oh. If I remember correctly, for the final
9 grades for that class, for that student's overall grade for the
10 course, we met in --

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Who's "we"?

12 THE WITNESS: Dr. Paxton and myself. She was the
13 professor of the course.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

15 THE WITNESS: And we discussed what the curve was going to
16 look like for the class. Most classes at Penn are curved, so
17 you have to decide who is going to be the "A" of the class or
18 what set of students is going to have the A's, the B's, and the
19 C's, until you have somewhat of a normal distribution.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

21 THE WITNESS: But ultimately, Dr. Paxton had the final
22 say. But we met to just discuss how that was going to work
23 out. Does that make sense?

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yes. Because you before -- you
25 talked about how you would do the other grades, and you would

1 talk to her, and then you would calibrate how you would do that
2 and, you know, then you would do the grades, right?

3 THE WITNESS: That's right.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The evaluations that you
5 received from the students, what happened with those? Do you
6 know whether or not the professor looked at them?

7 THE WITNESS: I don't know whether Dr. Paxton looked at
8 that first set. I know in my other teaching fellowship
9 experiences the professor has looked at the evaluations. But
10 ultimately, they go to the dean's office.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So, for this particular class, the
12 first time you taught, did you -- once the evaluations are
13 submitted by the students, did anyone talk to you about it,
14 whether it be the professor or someone from the dean's office?

15 THE WITNESS: That first time I was a TF, no.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Then your -- you received
17 summer funding for that -- the next summer. And this is the
18 summer you said you got paid for working on the book with the
19 professor?

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Was that your -- the only work you
22 did that summer? Or did you have two jobs that summer?

23 THE WITNESS: I --

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Or additional work?

25 THE WITNESS: I was also compensated for working on the

1 journal that summer.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Were you paid hourly?

3 THE WITNESS: Yes.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: In addition to your summer
5 funding?

6 THE WITNESS: That's right.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you remember how much?

8 THE WITNESS: I don't.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The Union presented you
10 with your -- you had -- your profile.

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 78.

13 THE WITNESS: Right.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I see you use different titles,
15 "Student Worker," "Teaching Fellow," "Teaching Assistant." Do
16 you know how those titles are assigned?

17 THE WITNESS: I do not.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I'm going to move on to the
19 summer funding that you, I guess that you're doing right now.

20 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Again, you're getting summer
22 funding that does not require service, but you're teaching two
23 classes, right?

24 THE WITNESS: That's right.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And how much -- oh, the

1 letters -- I think the letters were referenced how much you're
2 getting paid for that, right?

3 THE WITNESS: Yes, that's right.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Oh, okay, Union 80, I guess
5 that's a -- the award letter for your summer work. It's this
6 one.

7 THE WITNESS: Oh.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: It says March 17, 2017 on top.

9 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: March 17th, right?

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: That's the date on top. Okay,
13 this is work that you're already -- you're currently doing?

14 THE WITNESS: Yes.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Page 2 -- can you turn to
16 Page 2? There's a section that says -- the third section down,
17 it says, "Teaching assistants and graders. If you need a TA or
18 grader see Ellie Lesser." Do you know what a grader is?

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: What is it?

21 THE WITNESS: A grader is someone who is essentially hired
22 to do all of the grading for a course. There are different
23 requirements, as far as my understanding goes. Some graders
24 are required to attend all classes, in the same way you would
25 if you were a teaching fellow or assistant. But their primary

1 responsibility is to grade. And I believe they're typically
2 paid to do so.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Have you ever been a grader?

4 THE WITNESS: No.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: How do you know what a grader
6 does?

7 THE WITNESS: I've seen calls for graders put out by
8 lecturers at Penn.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Like an --

10 THE WITNESS: Calls to --

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- advertisement for --

12 THE WITNESS: It's like a job call, basically.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh, okay. And that's something
14 from what you saw; someone would do that for that for the
15 entire semester?

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. The money that you've
18 received from Penn, as far as your stipend, do you -- have you
19 ever had to repay any of that?

20 THE WITNESS: No.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: You've done a lot of research
22 job -- research appointments and teaching appointments. Do you
23 know what would happen if you decided that you were unable to
24 teach or research in a semester?

25 THE WITNESS: I don't know. I assume that --

1 MR. FRYMAN: Objection to her speculating.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. You don't have to -- don't
3 answer that part. I just want to know if you know.

4 THE WITNESS: No.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Have you ever -- has there been,
6 since you've been a student and you've received your teaching
7 or research assignments, has there been a semester where you
8 told the University you could not do it?

9 THE WITNESS: No.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you know whether or not
11 you could be disciplined if you don't teach or research?

12 THE WITNESS: Can you clarify what you mean by
13 "discipline"?

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Have you ever been disciplined?

15 THE WITNESS: No.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I mean, it could take any
17 form.

18 THE WITNESS: Right.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: A write-up. Maybe removal from
20 the opportunity to teach or research?

21 THE WITNESS: No, I've never been.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. That's never happened to
23 you?

24 THE WITNESS: (No audible response.)

25 MR. FRYMAN: You need to verbalize that.

1 THE WITNESS: No, it's never happened to me.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Okay, I don't have any
3 other questions. Does the Union?

4 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Employer?

6 MR. FRYMAN: No further questions.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Thank you very much. I
8 appreciate your time today.

9 THE WITNESS: Sure.

10 (Witness excused.)

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can we go off the record for a
12 moment?

13 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

15 Okay, the Union can call its next witness.

16 MS. HOYE: The Union calls Allison Russell.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Good afternoon. You can
18 sit down.

19 MS. RUSSELL: Thanks.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Um-hum. Can you say and spell
21 your first and last name?

22 MS. RUSSELL: Yes, it's Allison, A-L-L-I-S-O-N, Russell,
23 R-U-S-S-E-L-L.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can you raise your right
25 hand?

1 (Whereupon,

2

ALLISON RUSSELL,

3 was called as a witness by and on behalf of the Petitioner and,

4 after having been duly sworn, was examined and testified as

5 follows:)

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

7

DIRECT EXAMINATION

8 BY MS. HOYE:

9 Q Good afternoon, Allison.

10 A Hello.

11 Q Are you currently a graduate student --

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh, she has to --

13 MR. JOHNS: The process.

14 MS. HOYE: Oh, the process.

15 MS. ROSENBERGER: Oh.

16 MS. HOYE: Of course, the process.

17 BY MS. HOYE:

18 Q Allison, were you here earlier today when Rosie Clark was
19 testifying?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Okay. And so, in the course of watching her testimony,
22 you saw that with respect to documents that were put into
23 evidence via direct examination, there was a series of
24 questions asked to her about -- about whether she provided that
25 document to the Union, whether she consents to it being used in

1 this proceeding.

2 A Yes.

3 Q Okay. And do you understand that process?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Okay. So, what that will me is that before I put in a
6 piece of evidence via you as a witness, I'll ask you if you
7 provided it to me, and whether you consent it to being used in
8 this proceeding.

9 A Okay.

10 Q With respect to cross-examination, as you probably saw
11 when Rosie was testifying, we took a break in-between direct
12 and cross-examination, and the Employer had the opportunity to
13 review some documents that they had pertaining to you, and then
14 you have the opportunity -- you will have the opportunity to
15 review those documents in a private room, if you would like, or
16 you can just consent to them being used as part of this
17 proceeding.

18 Do you understand that you'll have the opportunity to do
19 that?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Okay. So, you are currently a graduate student at Penn?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Okay. What school do you attend?

24 A I attend the School of Social Policy and Practice.

25 Q Okay. And is that school also commonly known as SP2?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Okay. So, if I refer to "SP2," you'll know what I'm
3 talking about?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q Okay. What degree are you pursuing?
- 6 A I'm pursuing the Ph.D. in Social Welfare.
- 7 Q Okay. And how far along are you in that program?
- 8 A I just completed my second year in that program.
- 9 Q So, you entered the program in fall of 2015; is that
10 right?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Before entering the program at Penn, were you in school?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Okay. Tell us about your educational background.
- 15 A So, prior to entering at Penn, I was getting a master's in
16 public administration at the University of North Carolina at
17 Wilmington from 2013 to 2015. And prior to that, I was getting
18 my undergraduate degree at Fordham University from 2009 to
19 2013.
- 20 Q And is it a requirement of the Ph.D. program at SP2 that
21 you enter with a master's degree already?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Do you have an advisor at Penn?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q Who is your advisor?

1 A Dr. Femida Handy.

2 Q And at SP2, do you refer to your advisor? As "your
3 advisor," we've heard multiple different terms for referring to
4 this person. Do you use advisor? Supervisor? Boss? PI?
5 Which term do you use?

6 A Advisor, typically.

7 Q Okay. Now, you testified that you began at Penn in the
8 fall of 2015. Prior to entering in the fall of 2015, did you
9 receive a offer of admission?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Okay. And did you provide that offer of admission to me
12 in the context of this proceeding?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. And do you have any objection to it being used as
15 an exhibit in this case?

16 A No.

17 (Petitioner's P-82 marked.)

18 BY MS. HOYE:

19 Q I'm handing you what's been marked as Union Exhibit 82.
20 Take a moment to review that document and let me know when
21 you've had a chance to do so.

22 A I reviewed it.

23 Q Okay. What is this that we're looking at?

24 A This is the offer of admission letter that I received from
25 the former program director in the -- in March of 2015, letting

1 me know that I had been accepted to the Ph.D. program, and
2 explaining what I was being offered as part of that admission.

3 Q Okay. And looking at this letter, it looks like you were
4 offered a four-year funding package; is that right?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And what is included in that package, looking at the four
7 bullet points listed there?

8 A Yeah, so the package includes four years of tuition, four
9 years of fees associated with the tuition, four years of a
10 health insurance plan that the University offers to students
11 specifically, and then also four years of a stipend that covers
12 nine-month academic year from September to May.

13 Q With respect to the remainder of the year, what are you
14 expected to do for funding during that period of time?

15 A You are allowed to seek outside funding of a variety of
16 sources. Whatever you can kind of come up with.

17 Q Okay. But the package that you received for four years
18 didn't include the summer period; is that right?

19 A Correct.

20 Q Okay. Looking at the, I guess it's the third paragraph,
21 it's the one below the bullet points beginning "Funding is
22 contingent," do you see that?

23 A Yes.

24 Q It says, "Funding is contingent upon your making
25 satisfactory progress in the program, working as a research

1 apprentice with the faculty member, and serving a teaching
2 assistant at least once. It is a commitment of 15 hours per
3 week during your first year, and 20 hours per week during Years
4 2 through 4."

5 Now, I understand that you are at the end of your second
6 year. So, with respect to your first year, did you work as a
7 research apprentice for 15 hours a week?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And with respect to your second year, did you work as a
10 research apprentice at 20 hours a week?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay. And have you worked as a teaching assistant yet?

13 A No.

14 Q Okay. Do you plan to do so?

15 A Yes.

16 Q When do you plan to do so?

17 A I plan to work as a teaching assistant in the fall of
18 2017.

19 Q So, that would be the fall of your third year?

20 A Correct.

21 Q Okay. What is the average time to completion of a Ph.D.
22 in SP2, if you know, based on what you've seen?

23 A From my experience, and what I've seen of upper year
24 cohorts, I would say it's about four and a half to five years.

25 Q Okay.

1 MS. HOYE: I would like to move Union 82 into evidence.

2 MS. DANTE: No objection.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 82 is received.

4 (Petitioner's P-82 received.)

5 (Petitioner's P-83 marked.)

6 BY MS. HOYE:

7 Q Okay, I'm going to show you another document, Allison,
8 that's marked Union 83. This is not a protected document, so
9 I'm not going to go through the whole back and forth with you
10 after that.

11 Okay, Allison, take a moment to review this document and
12 let me know when you've had a chance to do so.

13 A I'm familiar with this document.

14 Q Okay. And what is this that we're looking at?

15 A This is the student handbook for the Ph.D. program in
16 social welfare.

17 Q And that's the program that you're in; correct?

18 A Correct.

19 Q Okay. Let's turn to Page 21 of this document. Let me
20 know when you're there.

21 A Okay, I'm there.

22 Q Are you there?

23 A Um-hum.

24 Q Okay. And I'm looking at the section about halfway down
25 the page entitled "Financial Support." Do you see where I'm

1 referring to?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Okay. And I see that in Paragraph 1 of that section, the
4 final sentence states, "Full funding is contingent upon the
5 student working as a research assistant with a faculty member
6 or with one of the School's research centers." Is that right?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Okay. And then the next sentence or the next paragraph,
9 pardon me, goes on to describe the 15-hour a week commitment,
10 followed by the 20-hour a week commitment; is that right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay. So, is that consistent with the offer letter that
13 you received from Temple -- or I'm sorry, from Penn?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Okay. And I also see that it states, "Any teaching" -- in
16 the second paragraph, "Any teaching related hours associated
17 with the research assistantship counts towards the 20-hour
18 commitment."

19 So, as I'm reading the handbook, the handbook doesn't
20 specifically seem to set out a teaching assistantship
21 requirement, right?

22 A It seems to be the case.

23 Q But in your case, your offer letter does require you to do
24 the teaching assistantship; is that right?

25 A Yes. It states that I'm expected to TA at least once.

1 Q Okay. And what's your understanding of the semester in
2 which you TA, what were your obligations with respect to
3 serving as a research apprentice?

4 A So, during -- it depends on the semester. If it's during
5 the academic year, so spring or fall semester, my understanding
6 is that the hours you spend TA'ing count towards the overall 20
7 hour a week commitment. So, those teaching assistant hours
8 are, sort of, deducted from your research assistantship
9 obligation.

10 Q Okay. And what happens in the summer?

11 A In the summer, it's different. The summer you are not
12 working as a research assistant, in the sense that you're not
13 being paid to do that work. So, when you TA, it is just
14 however many hours you put into it for however much they're
15 paying you to do that work.

16 Q Okay. So, if you TA then during the fall or the spring
17 semester, that could count toward the 20 or 15 hour a week
18 requirement --

19 A Yes.

20 Q -- is that right?

21 Okay. But if you TA during the summer it does not?

22 A Correct.

23 Q Okay. And you're paid separately for that; is that right?

24 A Correct.

25 Q Okay. Now, with respect to this section, "Financial

1 Support," it says in the last paragraph, "Qualified candidates
2 may be admitted without guaranteed funding. These students
3 will be required to cover all tuition and living expenses on
4 their own. Attempts will be made to find financial resources
5 for those students in subsequent years. These students will
6 not be required to serve as research assistants, but it is
7 recommended for them to do so voluntarily." Do you see where
8 I'm referring to?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Are you aware of any graduate students in your program
11 that do not have funding?

12 A No.

13 Q Okay. Does that include part-time?

14 A No. I'm referring only to full-time students.

15 Q Okay. Are there any part-time graduate students in your
16 program that do not have funding?

17 A Yes. There's one person that I know of.

18 Q Okay. Let's turn next to Page 26 of the handbook. Let me
19 know when you're there.

20 A I'm there.

21 Q Okay. This is the section that's entitled "Teaching
22 Assistant and Instructor Assignment." And I'm looking at the
23 bullet points underneath, "The assignment procedure will follow
24 these guidelines." Do you see where I'm referring to?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And I'm looking in particular at the first bullet.
2 It says, "Students in the first year of the doctoral program
3 are not eligible for teaching assistantships." Do you see
4 that?

5 A Yes.

6 Q So, does that mean that in your case you wouldn't -- you
7 wouldn't have been allowed in your first year to complete that
8 teaching assistantship that you're required to do?

9 A That's correct.

10 Q Okay. And how about with respect to the second year?

11 A So, the way the school usually does it, is they don't
12 allow anyone who has not finished their coursework, which
13 happens in the first and second year to TA. So, it's possible
14 for you to get special permission to TA in second year, but
15 it's not encouraged and it's actually, I would say,
16 discouraged.

17 Q So, does that mean that typically the TAship occurs in the
18 third year of the program?

19 A Typically it would be the third or fourth year. Or
20 possibly the summer between second and third year, so that's a
21 little ambiguous, I guess, on what year.

22 Q Okay.

23 A I would say that counts as second year, but I don't know
24 how other people count it.

25 Q Okay. And I see in that third bullet point where it says,

1 "Students in the third year of the doctoral program are
2 eligible for teaching assistant or instructor positions," as
3 you just stated, "applications are submitted to the associate
4 dean for academic affairs for approval and consultation with
5 faculty and the director of the doctoral program. Extra
6 compensation will not be given for teaching during the academic
7 year. Compensation for those -- for these positions will be --
8 will be considered part of the student's doctoral program
9 stipend."

10 Is this what you were testifying about before, about the
11 teaching counting toward the 15 or 20 weeks [sic]?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Okay. And then it states, "However, compensation at the
14 regular part-time faculty rate will be given for summer
15 teaching."

16 Again, this is what you were talking about with respect to
17 TA'ing over the summer?

18 A Yes. Correct.

19 Q Okay. Do you know what the -- what "regular part-time
20 faculty rate" is? What that refers to?

21 A So, it refers to the rate that they pay per class for
22 adjunct faculty in SP2. And I believe that amount is \$5,000
23 per class in the summer.

24 Q Okay. Looking at the final bullet there, "Students in or
25 beyond the fourth year of the doctoral program are eligible for

1 teaching assistant and instructor positions. Applications are
2 submitted to the associate dean for academic affairs for
3 approval and consultation with faculty and the director of the
4 doctoral program. Students in or beyond their fourth year of
5 the doctoral program receive priority in teaching assignments
6 and will be compensated at the regular part-time faculty rate."

7 Do you see that?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Are you aware of any students beyond their fourth year in
10 your program?

11 A I'm aware of several students who have just finished their
12 fourth years.

13 Q Okay.

14 A And are still in the program.

15 Q Okay. Haven't finished their dissertation yet?

16 A Correct.

17 Q Okay. And at the end of your fourth year, you're stipend;
18 is that right?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Okay. So, do you have any knowledge of what those
21 students will be doing into the next -- to the fall in order to
22 get funding?

23 A Yeah, so the academic year ends on May 31st, so your last
24 paycheck would be at the end of May. So, I already know that
25 some of those students are teaching summer classes, starting

1 this summer, and intend to continue to TA in the fall and
2 spring, as long as they're still working on completing their
3 degree.

4 Q And that would be at the regular part-time faculty rate?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay. Is that -- is the regular part-time faculty rate
7 for a course enough to cover your tuition, health insurance,
8 fees, and living expenses?

9 A No. Not unless you were teaching at least probably five
10 or six classes in the fall.

11 Q Okay. I want to turn next to --

12 MS. HOYE: Oh, I'm going to move Union 83 into evidence,
13 please.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection to Union 83?

15 MS. DANTE: No objection.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 83 is received.

17 (Petitioner's P-83 received.)

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: We moved 82?

19 COURT REPORTER: Yes.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

21 BY MS. HOYE:

22 Q Allison, I want to next to your experience doing research.
23 So, you just completed your second year, right?

24 A Correct.

25 Q Okay. So, in your first year, you were doing the 15 hours

1 per week of research; is that right?

2 A Correct.

3 Q Okay. And the research that you were doing, who were you
4 doing that research with?

5 A I was doing it with my advisor, Dr. Handy.

6 Q And who determined what research you would be doing during
7 your first year?

8 A Dr. Handy.

9 Q How did you receive your research assignments?

10 A So, I would meet with her on a weekly or bi-weekly basis,
11 usually, and we would talk about what projects that she had
12 heard about or that she thought would be good ideas. We would
13 brainstorm ideas for research that I could work on. And then
14 we would -- she would advise me on which she thought would be
15 best for me to tackle, and that's what we would decide on.

16 Q Were you also taking a full course load during your first
17 year?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And the research that you were doing for Dr. Handy, is
20 that research that will be included in your dissertation?

21 A Some of it, but not all of it.

22 Q What proportion that research do you think will be
23 included in your dissertation?

24 A So, nothing in the first year would be used in my
25 dissertation. But in the second year, probably about a quarter

1 of what I was doing, I would say related directly to the
2 dissertation.

3 Q And what is your dissertation topic?

4 A My dissertation topic is on the connection between
5 volunteering and well-being. So, looking at how engagement in
6 volunteering improves well-being, specifically among older
7 adults, in the case of my study.

8 Q Okay. And you said with respect to that first year of
9 research, that 15 hours a week, am I correct in understanding
10 that that research will not be included in your dissertation?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Okay. And then, if we turn to the second -- your second
13 year, you were doing the 20 hours a week of research?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Okay. And tell us about that experience.

16 A So, I conduct several different projects at once, usually.
17 And I would -- have been working on a couple articles for
18 publication with my advisor. Also worked on a book chapter
19 with her. And I mean, primarily the research I engage with --
20 I engage in, we -- is for the purpose of generating
21 publications in peer reviewed journals.

22 Q And with respect to your second year, the research that
23 you were doing, again was this under the supervision of Dr.
24 Handy?

25 A The vast majority of it was. I actually am also working

1 on another paper with a different faculty member in SP2.

2 Q Okay. And who's that?

3 A Ezekiel Dixon-Roman.

4 Q And you said that some portion of the research that you
5 were doing in your second year would -- will be included in
6 your dissertation?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And what percentage do you think?

9 A About a quarter, I would say.

10 Q Okay. You also mentioned a book chapter that you had
11 authored; is that right?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Okay. Is that on a topic that is part of your
14 dissertation?

15 A No.

16 Q Okay. And you also mentioned a couple of articles that
17 are under review; is that right?

18 A Yes. I have two articles currently under review. One I'm
19 first author, and I worked on that with my advisor. The other
20 is the one I worked on with Ezekiel, and -- and I think that's
21 it at the moment.

22 Q Okay. And with respect to those two articles, do they
23 relate to your dissertation?

24 A The one I worked on with my advisor does relate to it.

25 Q And the one that you did not work on with your advisor?

1 A It's completely unrelated.

2 Q Okay. During your first and second years, you described
3 the research that you were doing. Did you do any other work at
4 Penn during your first and second years?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay. What did -- what else were you doing?

7 A So, in the summer between my first and second year, I also
8 worked as the interim managing editor of an academic journal,
9 Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly, which is operated out
10 of the School of Social Policy and Practice, at the moment.

11 Q And what were you doing for the journal?

12 A So, the job title was interim managing editor. And I was
13 assisting with the transition from the previous team of
14 editors, which had included my advisor to the new team of
15 editors, which includes another faculty member at SP2. So, I
16 was helping the new team of editors to learn the software that
17 we use for the journal, and learn the workflow involved with
18 accepting and processing new submissions, finding reviewers.
19 And I also assisted in the training of the incoming student
20 worker who was going to be heading up that position.

21 Q And you said you were doing this work in the summer
22 between your first and second years?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Okay. And were you paid separately for that work? Or was
25 that part of your stipend?

1 A I was paid separately.

2 Q Okay. Were you paid an hourly rate?

3 A No, it was a stipend.

4 Q Monthly?

5 A No, it was not put in as monthly. It was put in as a
6 single lump sum amount. But that was only because there was an
7 issue with the funding coming through in the proper timeframe,
8 and so I actually didn't receive that until December of 2016.

9 Q For the work you did that summer?

10 A Correct.

11 Q Okay. Were you also working on the journal during the
12 fall and spring of your first year?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. And what were you doing for the journal during your
15 fall and spring semester of your first year?

16 A I was working as an editorial assistant for my advisor,
17 who was the then -- one of the co-editors in chief, assisting
18 her with her specific manuscripts. And I was also assisting
19 the previous managing editor with a few of the duties related
20 to that position.

21 Q And that work that you were doing for the journal during
22 the fall and the spring, were you paid separately for that
23 work? Or was that part of your stipend?

24 A It was part of the stipend.

25 Q So, that counted toward your 15 hours a week of research?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Let's turn to your second year. You've talked about the
3 research that you were doing during your second year of the
4 program. Were you doing any other work at Penn during your
5 second year? And we'll talk about this summer, but before we
6 get to the summer I'm talking about fall and spring of your
7 second year.

8 A Yeah. So, I also worked as a trip advisor for a spring
9 break trip that my advisor leads in India through the Fox
10 Leadership program.

11 Q And when was that?

12 A That was Spring Break 2017, so March 2017.

13 Q And that involved a trip to India?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Okay. All right, let's turn now to this summer, the
16 summer of 2017. Are you working at Penn this summer?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. What are you doing this summer?

19 A I'm working at a research center in SP2 called the Center
20 for High Impact Philanthropy.

21 Q And what is the Center for High Impact Philanthropy?

22 A It is a research center that operates as part of the
23 University, but it has its own staff and executive director,
24 and its own mission. They work in advising philanthropic
25 donations. They do a lot of knowledge creation through

1 evidence-based practices for what -- what are the best
2 investments for philanthropic dollars. And they also do
3 education programs.

4 Q And what work are you doing for them this summer?

5 A I'm working with them, I -- as both helping with research
6 on one of their projects in -- called Pathways to Education,
7 which is related to what is the best time and form of
8 intervention in education related donations. And then I am
9 also working to help them conduct an evaluation of their
10 center.

11 Q Is that a full-time or part-time job this summer?

12 A Part-time.

13 Q And are you getting paid separately or is that part of
14 your stipend?

15 A It's separate.

16 Q Is it an hourly rate?

17 A No. It's monthly.

18 Q It's monthly?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Okay. Why are you working there this summer?

21 A Because I need money.

22 Q Are you working anywhere else this summer at Penn?

23 A No.

24 Q And the research that you're doing at the center, is that
25 going to go toward your dissertation?

1 A No.

2 Q I want to go back. I think we missed one thing from last
3 summer that I want to ask you about.

4 A Okay.

5 Q You talked about the journal work that you did in-between
6 your first and your second year. Did you do any other work for
7 Penn in-between your first year and your second year in the
8 summer?

9 A Yes. I did research. I applied for a research -- summer
10 research fellow position through my school to do my own
11 independent research, and got accepted for that, so I was
12 conducting research, as well.

13 Q And were you paid separately for that? Or was that part
14 of your stipend?

15 A It's separate.

16 Q How much money did you receive for that?

17 A \$6,100, I think.

18 Q And that research that you were doing last summer, what
19 was that research on?

20 A So, that research was on -- using an existing data set
21 that my advisor was aware of, to -- which was exploring this
22 relationship between volunteering and well-being. At the time,
23 it was -- I chose this topic because of the availability of the
24 data. And because of the feasibility of completing that
25 project in the time line that was stipulated in that location.

1 Q Okay. And are you now writing your dissertation on a
2 similar topic?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Okay. And when you started the summer research fellowship
5 last summer, did you know at that time what you wanted to do
6 your dissertation on?

7 A No.

8 Q All right. Let's talk about your upcoming third year.
9 You testified earlier that you plan to teach in the fall
10 semester of your third year?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Do you know what course you'll be teaching?

13 A Yes, it's ethics and social impact. It's a master's level
14 course in the nonprofit leadership master's in SP2.

15 Q And who's the professor that is going to be assigned to
16 that course?

17 A Dr. Femida Handy.

18 Q Your advisor?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Okay. And will you have coursework in the fall?

21 A I will be completing a once a week seminar that's required
22 until you defend your dissertation proposal, called Pro-
23 Seminar. And I will also be finishing up an independent study
24 that I'm starting in the summer.

25 Q Okay. It sounds like you're largely -- you -- you will be

1 largely done with your coursework by the time the teaching in
2 the fall -- just finishing up your independent study, and then
3 taking this one required course --

4 A Yes.

5 Q -- is that fair to say?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. And so, it sounds like the coursework is heavy in
8 the first year and the second year of your program; is that
9 right?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And then what is that coursework replaced with into your
12 third and fourth year?

13 A So, it's my understanding that that coursework is replaced
14 by your working towards your dissertation proposal in the third
15 year, and defending that proposal as soon as possible, given
16 the four-year funding. And then finishing once your
17 dissertation proposal passes, then working on the dissertation
18 and defending the dissertation.

19 Q And during those four years, whether you're doing the
20 coursework in the first or second years or the dissertation
21 work in the third and fourth years, you're also required to be
22 doing this research assistantship either 15 or 20 hours; is
23 that right?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Okay. Does SP2 have any undergraduate level courses?

1 A No.

2 Q And the teaching that you're doing in the fall, will that
3 fulfill your teaching requirement?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And what do you expect -- or do you have an understanding
6 of what your teaching responsibilities will be in the fall?

7 A Yes. I've had a conversation with my advisor about it,
8 and I will be -- likely what will happen is we'll meet once a
9 week, the day of the course, which I believe we'll meet on a
10 Thursday, several hours before the class, to go over the plan
11 for what we'll cover in that class. And basically, make our
12 lesson plan and coordinate, you know, who's going to do what
13 portions of the class. I will be responsible for the grading
14 of student work. And I'll be responsible for teaching any of
15 the sessions that my advisor will not be able to attend due to
16 other obligations.

17 Q Will you have responsibility for holding office hours or
18 meeting with students outside of class?

19 A I will make my available to do that. And I would probably
20 also be on that -- the day of the class at a time that is
21 convenient for the students and for me.

22 Q Okay. I'm going to show you -- I'm going to show you
23 another document. Before I do that, did you provide me with a
24 copy of your CV?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And do you have any objection to that being used in
2 the context of this proceeding?

3 A No.

4 Q Okay.

5 MS. HOYE: I'll mark this Union 84.

6 (Petitioner's P-84 marked.)

7 BY MS. HOYE:

8 Q Take a moment to review this, Allison, and let me know
9 when you've had a chance to do so.

10 A I've reviewed it.

11 Q Okay. And what is this that we're looking at?

12 A This is a copy of my CV that's available for download from
13 the SP2 website on my student profile page.

14 Q And is this updated as of today?

15 A No.

16 Q Okay. What's missing from this?

17 A Let's see. The book chapter is not on here, that's in
18 print actually. There are no listings of journals -- or
19 articles currently under review, which would be under
20 "Publications and Presentations." There's at least one
21 conference presentation missing. There's a -- I have a
22 forthcoming conference presentation in a couple of weeks that I
23 would have probably put on it. Let's see. There's a couple
24 honors and awards that are missing. And my current position at
25 CHIP isn't on here; Center for High Impact Philanthropy.

1 Q The one you're doing this summer?

2 A Correct.

3 Q Okay. So, looking at the first page of this, I see that
4 you have your degree in social welfare listed at top there
5 under "Education."

6 A Yes.

7 Q As well as your other degrees?

8 A Yeah.

9 Q Okay. And then if we turn to the second page, after
10 "Select Work Experience," you have your research assistant
11 position listed there.

12 A Yes.

13 Q And below that is the Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector
14 Quarterly; correct?

15 A Yes.

16 Q That's the journal that you described?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. And this has you still working there through the
19 present. I understand this isn't current. Can you tell us
20 when you stopped working for the journal?

21 A Yeah. So, I -- I have stopped being formerly paid for
22 that work at the end of August 2016. And I -- I actually am
23 still doing some editorial assistant work for that because
24 there's a special issue my advisor is working on, and she has
25 asked me to assist with a couple of things related to that, but

1 it's -- it's like very minimal.

2 Q Are you getting paid for that separate from your stipend?

3 A No. It's part of the stipend.

4 Q Okay. You testified about the TAship that you'll have in
5 the fall. Are you planning to do any additional TA'ing at SP2?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Okay. Tell us about that.

8 A I'm going to be TA'ing a Spring 2018 course that actually
9 meets over the winter break, between the fall and spring
10 semesters, but it's classified as a spring course. And that is
11 another course with my advisor on micro-finance in India. It's
12 an SP2 class for the master's programs in SP2. Typically,
13 master's in social work or a master's in social policy, or the
14 nonprofit leadership students.

15 Q And will that involve a trip to India?

16 A Yes.

17 Q With your advisor?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And the students in the class?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And will be paid separately for that work?

22 A No, I won't be paid.

23 Q Okay. Is that because teaching during the fall and the
24 spring is not separately compensated?

25 A Yes, that's correct.

1 Q Okay. How long is that trip, if you know?

2 A I believe it's 10 days.

3 MS. HOYE: Okay, I'm going to move Union 84 into evidence.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection from the Employer?

5 MS. DANTE: No objection.

6 MS. HOYE: And Allison, I don't have any other questions

7 for you at this time.

8 THE WITNESS: Okay.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 84 is received.

10 (Petitioner's P-84 received.)

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So, we can go off the record.

12 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

14 Okay, the Employer will now tell the Union what document

15 they wish to present.

16 MS. DANTE: Yes, a copy of Allison's redacted transcript.

17 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection from the Union?

18 MS. ROSENBERGER: No objection.

19 MS. HOYE: No objection.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: So, Allison, would you like to
21 look -- you can look at that in private and then tell us if you
22 have an objection to it being used. Or if you're okay with it
23 right now, you can just say you don't object to it being used.

24 THE WITNESS: I have no objection.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION

2 BY MS. DANTE:

3 Q Good afternoon, Ms. Russell. Why did you decide to apply
4 to a Ph.D. program in general?

5 A I hope to become a professor, so I -- that was a necessary
6 step in that process for me.

7 Q And why did you ultimately choose to pursue your Ph.D. at
8 Penn?

9 A My previous advisor at the University of North Carolina at
10 Wilmington was part of the co-editing team of the journal that
11 I worked on with my current advisor at Penn, so I met her
12 through him. And she encouraged me to apply to this program.
13 And I felt like working with her would be a good fit.

14 Q And that's Dr. Handy?

15 A Yes.

16 Q So, part of the reason why you ultimately chose Penn was
17 because of your current advisor, Dr. Handy?

18 A Yes.

19 Q So, I understand you're about -- you're two years through
20 your completion to your Ph.D.

21 A Yes.

22 Q And so what are your remaining academic goals? What do
23 you hope to accomplish between now and the time you defend your
24 dissertation?

25 A Well, I -- obviously I have plans to TA two classes, at

1 least. I also hope to publish a few more articles between now
2 and then. I have two upcoming conference presentations, and
3 I'm sure I'll do at least one or two others. Basically,
4 building my CV for when I go on the job market for a faculty
5 position.

6 Q And you mentioned some publications. Have you already
7 published?

8 A Yes, I have.

9 Q And you're looking to publish additional articles?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And I understand that you also are a co-author of a
12 chapter in a book?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Is that something that you collaborated with, with Dr.
15 Handy?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And why is it that you're looking to publish additional
18 articles?

19 A Having peer reviewed publications on your CV increases
20 your chances of -- of getting job interviews for faculty
21 positions immensely. So, it's very important for that process.

22 Q And in you work on the journal that you mentioned, do you
23 assist in or have you assisted in the selection of articles for
24 publication and then seeing them through, sort of, every step
25 of the way through publication?

1 A Yes, I have. I don't make decisions about whether the
2 articles get published or not, but I have assisted editors in
3 organizing the materials that enable them to make those
4 decisions.

5 Q So, would you say that that's given you, sort of, the
6 flipside view of publishing?

7 A In a sense, yeah, I would say that.

8 Q Okay. If you could take a look at U-82. I believe that's
9 your admission's letter.

10 A Yeah, I have it.

11 Q Okay. And is this something that -- is all the
12 information in here something that you reviewed and considered
13 before deciding to enroll at Penn?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And as part of the funding package, I see you're offered
16 four years of tuition; is that correct?

17 A Yes.

18 Q So, thus far at your time at Penn, you haven't had to pay
19 for your tuition for the Ph.D. program; is that correct?

20 A Correct.

21 Q And the package also includes health insurance coverage,
22 as well; is that right?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And so, thus far you haven't had to pay for health
25 insurance at -- while you're enrolled as a student at Penn; is

1 that correct?

2 A I have not had to pay for health insurance, no.

3 Q Okay. And I see that it also includes four years of the
4 general fee that the University charges to all students; is
5 that right?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And thus far you haven't had to pay the general -- those
8 general fees that the University charges to other students; is
9 that right?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And then I see then the final piece of it, which is the
12 stipend for four years, and that's at a level of \$25,500; is
13 that right?

14 A It was that for my entry year. It may have increased
15 slightly since the first year, but I don't know actually
16 whether it has.

17 Q Okay. And as far as the -- what this funding package is
18 contingent upon, I think you mentioned on direct that in the
19 next paragraph it's contingent upon making satisfactory
20 progress in the program working as a research assistantship
21 with a faculty member and serving as a teaching assistant at
22 least once; is that correct?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And that was your understanding of the conditions of the
25 funding package when you decided to enroll; is that right?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And in order to get your Ph.D. at Penn, you're required to
3 complete a certain amount of coursework, right?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And I see that the letter suggests that the coursework
6 generally can be completed in two years; is that right?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And I understand, I think from your testimony on direct,
9 that you have, in fact, in large part completed the required
10 coursework to obtain your Ph.D.; is that right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay.

13 (Employer's E-80 marked.)

14 BY MS. DANTE:

15 Q Ms. Russell, I've given you what I've marked for
16 identification as Employer 80. Do you recognize that document?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. And is that an unredacted version -- copy of your
19 unofficial transcript? I'm sorry; a redacted version --

20 A Yeah.

21 Q -- of your --

22 A It's -- yes, it's a redacted version. Yes.

23 Q Okay. And then if I turn to Page 2, I see that you have a
24 total of -- total credits of about -- of 21?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And so, to get your Ph.D., am I -- is my
2 understanding correct that you only need 20 credits of
3 coursework?

4 A That's correct.

5 Q Okay. And in looking at the courses on Page 1, were all
6 of these courses related to your dissertation topic?

7 A No.

8 Q Okay. And in addition to coursework, I understand that
9 you're also required to take certain examinations; is that
10 right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay. And have you taken those examinations?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And passed those examinations?

15 A Yes.

16 Q So, now you -- the remaining piece of the Ph.D. puzzle, so
17 to speak, is your dissertation; is that right?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. And I understand that you did not teach during your
20 first year; correct?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And you still received the stipend referenced in U-82; is
23 that correct?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And you also did not teach in your second year, but still

1 received the stipend referenced in U-82; is that correct?

2 A Yes.

3 Q How did you go about developing your dissertation topic?

4 A So, my dissertation topic came out of the work I did last
5 summer as a -- doing research at my school. I -- as I had said
6 previously, I chose the topic initially because of the
7 availability of the data and the feasibility of getting that
8 project done, and therefore getting it funded. And then I
9 ended up presenting the findings from that project at a
10 conference in -- last November, where I -- where one of the
11 members of the audience works in a medical center in Philly and
12 was very interested in this idea of the connection between
13 volunteering and well-being, and wanted to collaborate on a
14 study involving the volunteers she works with in her job. And
15 so, the dissertation topic kind of came out of that project and
16 presenting that, and making a connection with this person
17 who -- who I will be collaborating with in the dissertation
18 topic.

19 Q And during the course of developing the dissertation
20 topic, did you have meetings with your advisor, Dr. Handy?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Can you explain what types of conversations you had in
23 regard to your dissertation?

24 A Yes. The conversation that we've had since Day 1 has been
25 how to develop a topic that's interesting to me, but that's

1 feasible to complete in the funded amount of time, which is
2 four years. So, basically that's what our conversation largely
3 revolves around, is making sure that the project is feasible
4 for that time line.

5 Q Have you talked with Dr. Handy about other types of
6 research projects?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Okay. And would -- how often would you say you meet with
9 Dr. Handy?

10 A During the academic year, typically once a week, unless
11 she's traveling.

12 Q Okay. And are your discussions largely related to your
13 dissertation or other types of research projects?

14 A They're primarily related to other research. But as I
15 move into my third year, it will be more about the dissertation
16 probably.

17 Q And are some of these research projects, research projects
18 that you've expressed an interest in?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Okay. And you mentioned that the dissertation initially
21 stemmed from some research that you did last summer; is that
22 right?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And I think you mentioned that you had applied for a
25 fellowship for funding last summer; is that right?

1 A Yes.

2 Q So, if we look -- if I can direct your attention to U-84,
3 which I believe is your CV, it should be in front of you.

4 A Yes.

5 Q And if I look on Page 2 under "Grants and Funding," is
6 that the summer research fellowship that you were talking
7 about?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And that was something that was awarded to you so you
10 could focus on a -- your own independent research?

11 A Correct.

12 Q So, on direct you testified about your upcoming teaching
13 experience for this coming fall. And I believe you mentioned
14 the course was ethics and social impact; is that right?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And that is a course that -- where the primary instructor
17 is your advisor, Dr. Handy; correct?

18 A Yes.

19 Q How did you come to be assigned to that course?

20 A I have a requirement of TA'ing at least once, and that's
21 one of the courses my advisor is teaching, and so she suggested
22 that I work as a TA for that class, so that she could monitor
23 more closely how much time I have to commit to that.

24 Q Have you -- and you mentioned you also discussed some of
25 the teaching -- expectations when it comes to your role as a

1 teaching assistant in the fall; correct?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And I think some of things you mentioned were being
4 involved in grading; is that correct?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Have you ever assisted her in grading before?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Okay. When did you do that?

9 A Last fall. Fall 2016.

10 Q And you did that when you were just engaged in your
11 coursework?

12 A Not --

13 Q It was a TA?

14 A It was part of research assistant position. She asked me
15 to assist her with grading.

16 Q And I understand that -- I understand that the -- the
17 funding package, you say that you're required to be a teaching
18 assistant for one semester; is that right?

19 A Yes. I believe it says at least once.

20 Q And, so this course, ethics and social impact will satisfy
21 the teaching requirement as part of the funding package;
22 correct?

23 A Correct.

24 Q Even though it will satisfy the teaching requirement, you
25 expressed interest to TA'ing for Dr. Handy again for the micro-

1 finance and women's empowerment course in India; correct?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Okay. And that's, I think you described on direct, you
4 think that's about a 10-day course?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay. And that's something that you're doing because
7 you're -- you want the experience in teaching with Dr. Handy
8 again?

9 A Yes. But also because it gives me an opportunity to also
10 collaborate with her on research that she has -- that she will
11 be doing in India.

12 Q Why do you want to collaborate with her on that research?

13 A Because that research will be funded for next summer, and
14 it will enable me to have summer funding so that I will not
15 have to seek additional employment to live next summer.

16 Q And during the time when you're traveling to India, all of
17 your expenses are covered: lodging; travel; food; correct?

18 A As part of that class you mean?

19 Q Just generally.

20 A Yeah, for the class they will be. Yes.

21 Q Okay. And this is the second time that you'll be
22 traveling to India with Dr. Handy; correct?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And the first time you traveled with her was Spring Break
25 2017; correct?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And, in fact, you received an additional \$1,000 to go on
3 that trip; correct?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Okay. And earlier you mentioned, when you were talking
6 about the ethics and social impact course, you mentioned that
7 you wanted to work with -- or Dr. Handy suggested that you work
8 with her so she could monitor your hours. What did you mean by
9 that?

10 A Dr. Handy does not prioritize teaching as an important
11 component of doing my Ph.D. here at Penn. She believes that
12 research is more important. And so, I TA for her, it enables
13 her to make sure I'm not spending too much time TA'ing when I
14 could be doing research.

15 Q Including research towards your own dissertation?

16 A Yes.

17 Q You mentioned that you wanted to ultimately become a
18 professor; is that right?

19 A Yes.

20 Q So, is this teaching experience something that you intend
21 to put on your CV?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And is the additional teaching experience in India, beyond
24 the ethics and social impact class, is that something that you
25 also intend to put on your CV?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And would you agree that the skills that you're going to
3 obtain in working with Dr. Handy on -- in both of these courses
4 will be relevant in helping you secure a job as a professor
5 after you graduate?

6 A I do agree with that, yes.

7 Q You talked a little bit about teaching over the summer.
8 You've never been a teaching assistant over the summer, have
9 you?

10 A No, I have not.

11 Q And in order to receive your funding package, there's no
12 service requirement over the summer; correct?

13 A What do you mean by "service"?

14 Q There's no requirement that you engage in research for an
15 advisor or act as a teaching assistant or engage in
16 instructional activities; correct?

17 A No. But it would be impossible to do this program in four
18 years if you were doing none of things over the summer.

19 Q So, it would be -- it's your position that it would be
20 impossible for you to obtain your Ph.D. if you're not
21 continuing to engage in research and working towards your
22 dissertation over the summer, as well?

23 A It would be impossible to do it in a four-year time
24 period.

25 (Counsel confers.)

1 BY MS. DANTE:

2 Q Are you taking courses -- did you take any courses towards
3 your Ph.D. requirement over the summer?

4 A No.

5 Q So, when you mentioned that you felt it would be
6 impossible to complete within -- the degree requirements, you
7 were focusing more on the research that you would need to do to
8 be able to complete your Ph.D. within four years; is that
9 right?

10 A Correct.

11 Q Okay.

12 MS. DANTE: I don't have any further questions of this
13 witness.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the Union?

15 MS. HOYE: Just one brief follow-up.

16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. HENDERSON:

18 Q Allison, the Summer 2016 research fellowship that you had,
19 at the time that you applied for that, did you know what your
20 dissertation topic would be?

21 A No.

22 Q Okay.

23 MS. HOYE: That's all I have. Thank you.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I have a few questions for
25 you. Let's see, Year 1, when you said you were -- you were a

1 research assistant, that's the term you used, "RA"?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. With your advisor, what
4 were you researching? Is that -- well, I can switch it as, is
5 that the entire year for the -- both semesters or just one
6 semester?

7 THE WITNESS: That would be the entire year for both
8 semesters.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And what -- what were you
10 researching that year? Your first year.

11 THE WITNESS: I was researching for the book chapter that
12 I mentioned that has been accepted for publication, which was
13 on the interchangeability of paid and unpaid labor and
14 nonprofit organizations. I was also assisting her, as I
15 mentioned, as an editorial assistant for the academic journal
16 that she was editor in chief of. And I was also -- trying to
17 think of other projects. I honestly can't remember what other
18 projects I had the first year.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. For the -- the ones that
20 you mentioned, the book chapter, were you -- were you evaluated
21 on that work?

22 THE WITNESS: No.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: What about the -- when you were
24 the -- you call it editor or assistant editor?

25 THE WITNESS: Editorial assistant.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Were -- was there any
2 evaluation for that?

3 THE WITNESS: No.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And you said, just so I'm
5 clear on that, you said that that's the -- oh, don't worry
6 about it. That's fine. I'm clear on that now.

7 Let's see, then in the summer after Year 1 you were
8 interim managing editor of a journal. So, as part of your
9 funding package, you -- I want to be clear, you don't receive
10 funding in the summer, it's part of your package?

11 THE WITNESS: Correct.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So, then you said you were
13 paid separately to do the research. That's when you made this
14 \$6100?

15 THE WITNESS: That was for the summer research I did in
16 the summer between my first and second year. That was not for
17 the managing editor position. The managing editor position was
18 separate from that \$6100.

19 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh. That's when you said you
20 didn't get paid till December?

21 THE WITNESS: Correct.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And how much was that?

23 THE WITNESS: \$5,000.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Now, for the managing editor work,
25 were you evaluated?

1 THE WITNESS: No.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And for the other independent
3 research for which you were paid, were you evaluated?

4 THE WITNESS: No.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh. But, I'm sorry, you said
6 that's what you -- you were using that to do your own research,
7 right?

8 THE WITNESS: Correct. I proposed a research topic and
9 that was an independent research topic.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. All right, so now I'll move
11 on to Year 2 where you said you worked on multiple projects.
12 You mentioned two articles. You said one would relate to your
13 dissertation, one would not, and the book chapter. Regarding
14 the articles, were you offered any type of evaluation?

15 THE WITNESS: No.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: What about the book chapter?

17 THE WITNESS: No.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And then in March -- March
19 of this year, you went to India?

20 THE WITNESS: Correct.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And how long was that?

22 THE WITNESS: It was for the week of Spring Break.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

24 THE WITNESS: So, just a week.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: And were -- I believe the Employer

1 asked you -- mentioned you were paid \$1,000 for that?

2 THE WITNESS: Correct.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Okay, and I'll move on to
4 fall -- okay, wait, I'm sorry, Fall 2016. Oh, when you talked
5 about you did grading. Were you paid separately for that or
6 that's just included in your yearly stipend?

7 THE WITNESS: That was considered part of my work as a
8 research assistant because typically the faculty
9 advisor/supervisor can request you to do any number of tasks,
10 and that was one of the tasks I was asked to do in that
11 semester.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I might have to go back a
13 moment. I forgot to ask you when you were working, who would
14 oversee your work, so I'm just going to backtrack a little bit.
15 Year 1, when you worked with your advisor, is that who oversaw
16 your work?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And then summer when you
19 were managing editor of the journal, who would oversee your
20 work then?

21 THE WITNESS: There was another faculty member, who's now
22 the editor of that journal, and two other faculty of other
23 universities who are his co-editors in chief. They oversaw my
24 work.

25 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: The faculty member is -- what

1 department is that person in?

2 THE WITNESS: SP2.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And then Year 2, when you
4 worked on the multiple projects, the two articles, who would
5 oversee your work at that point?

6 THE WITNESS: My advisor oversaw my work. And then on
7 the -- the article I worked on with Dr. Dixon-Roman, he oversaw
8 the work on that.

9 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Is he also from your department?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And what about the book
12 chapter?

13 THE WITNESS: That was my advisor.

14 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. In March -- the March 2017
15 trip to India, the Spring Break trip, you went with your
16 advisor?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So, she would oversee your
19 work?

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And then this summer, the
22 Center that you working at, who's -- who would oversee your
23 work then?

24 THE WITNESS: I have a director supervisor, who is a staff
25 member at the Center.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Not a professor?

2 THE WITNESS: No.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I'm not sure if you said
4 this yet, but you teach your class in the fall, is that a grad
5 or undergraduate course?

6 THE WITNESS: It's a graduate course.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Did you mention how many
8 students would be in the class?

9 THE WITNESS: I did not.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Do you know?

11 THE WITNESS: Last year when she taught the course there
12 were 25 students. I would expect the enrollment to be similar.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Do you pay -- the stipend
14 money that you receive, do you pay taxes on that?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I'm going to ask you a question,
17 and I just want you to use your knowledge of it, and if you
18 don't know, just say you don't know. Do you know what would
19 happen if you didn't perform your research duties? The ones
20 that you've mentioned that you've done Year 1 and Year 2?

21 THE WITNESS: Well, I believe it says in the letter I --
22 of admission that that's considered part of satisfactory
23 progress toward the program. So, I'm assuming that there would
24 be some kind of disciplinary action or something that would
25 occur, but I'm not sure what the procedure for that would be.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And I'm assuming at this
2 point you haven't been disciplined or had any adverse action --

3 THE WITNESS: Correct.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- for not doing your work?

5 THE WITNESS: Correct.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Okay, I don't have any
7 other questions. Does the Union?

8 MS. HOYE: I just have on follow-up to your questions.

9 REDIRECT EXAMINATION (continued)

10 BY MS. HOYE:

11 Q The \$1,000 that you got for the trip to India in March, do
12 you know what that was for?

13 A It was for working as the trip advisor for that trip. And
14 the trip is conducted through the Fox Leadership Center, which
15 is in the School of Arts & Sciences.

16 Q Okay.

17 MS. HOYE: Thank you.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the Employer have anything?

19 MS. DANTE: No. No further questions.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, that's it. Thank you very
21 much. I appreciate your time today.

22 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

23 (Witness excused.)

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Can we go off the record?

25 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

2 Before we call the next witness -- you call the next
3 witness, the court reporter said we did not move in Employer
4 80, so any objection from the Union on Employer 80?

5 MS. DANTE: No.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, Employer 80 is received.

7 (Employer's E-80 received.)

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: That's it? Okay. All right, the
9 Union can call its next witness.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay, our next witness is Ozan Kiratli.

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Good afternoon.

12 MR. KIRATLI: Good afternoon.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can you say and spell your first
14 and last name?

15 MR. KIRATLI: Ozan Kiratli, O-Z-A-N K-I-R-A-T-L-I.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: K-I-R-A-T-L-I, okay. Can you
17 raise your right hand?

18 MR. KIRATLI: Yes.

19 (Whereupon,

20 OZAN KIRATLI,

21 was called as a witness by and on behalf of the Petitioner and,
22 after having been duly sworn, was examined and testified as
23 follows:)

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, thank you.

25 DIRECT EXAMINATION

1 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

2 Q Good afternoon, Ozan. May I call you Ozan?

3 A Yeah.

4 Q So, I know you've been here for some of the testimony
5 today, but just so we're clear, there's a process that we're
6 using today about -- since you are a graduate student at Penn,
7 right?

8 A Right.

9 Q And the process is, I'll be asking you questions on direct
10 examination and to the extent that we use any documents that
11 relate to your status as a student at Penn, I'll ask for your
12 permission to use them.

13 Once I'm finished asking my set of questions, we'll take a
14 break. The University's lawyers will determine whether they
15 have any documents relating to your status as a student at Penn
16 that they would like to use on cross-examination. When they
17 come back, you'll have an opportunity to hear what those are,
18 and to look at them in private if you choose to, or not if
19 don't choose to. And then to say whether or not you consent to
20 their use in this proceeding.

21 Do you consent to that process?

22 A I consent.

23 Q Okay. You are a graduate student at Penn, right?

24 A Right.

25 Q And what is the degree that you're pursuing?

- 1 A Ph.D.
- 2 Q Ph.D. in what?
- 3 A Ph.D. in biology.
- 4 Q And how many years have you been in the biology program?
- 5 A I completed my second year. I am starting my third year.
- 6 Q Okay. And do you have any particular area of -- I'm
- 7 sorry, let me step back a second.
- 8 Biology is in the School of Arts & Sciences, right?
- 9 A Right.
- 10 Q Do you have any particular focus within the field of
- 11 biology?
- 12 A Yes. It's evolutionary ecology.
- 13 Q Evolutionary ecology?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q I'm going to ask you to keep your voice up just a little
- 16 bit because --
- 17 A Okay. Yeah.
- 18 Q -- this ventilation system is bad.
- 19 Can you just briefly describe what evolutionary ecology
- 20 is?
- 21 A So, evolutionary ecology is -- there's a set -- the
- 22 ecology and evolution were separate fields for many years, so
- 23 we are trying to integrate these two fields and try to
- 24 understand how evolutionary process occur in nature, and try to
- 25 understand the adaptation and their -- its relationship with

1 evolutionary mechanisms.

2 Q Okay. And what was your educational background before you
3 came to the University of Pennsylvania?

4 A I completed my bachelors at the Middle East Technical
5 University in Ankara, Turkey in biology, with a minor in
6 physics. Then --

7 Q And -- go ahead.

8 A Then I started my master's there. When I was doing my
9 master's, I got accepted and started here and I completed my
10 master's when I was getting educated here.

11 Q So, you completed your masters at the Middle East
12 Technical University in Ankara while you were starting your
13 doctorate here at Penn?

14 A After I started my doctorate, yes.

15 Q Okay. Have you, at this point after two years at Penn,
16 have you settled on a dissertation topic?

17 A Yes.

18 Q What is it?

19 A So, I'm trying to understand how migration changes the
20 adaptation in natural populations of *Drosophila Melanogaster*,
21 which is, you know -- as they're know, they are fruit flies,
22 but they're not really fruit flies because they don't eat
23 fruit. So, they're really good flies, normally, yeah, but --
24 but they're -- they're called fruit flies.

25 Q But they're what a lay person like I would call a fruit

1 fly?

2 A Yeah.

3 Q Okay. And it's -- the name that you used is *Drosophila*
4 *Melanogaster*?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Okay. Do you have a sense at this point what you would
7 like to do once you complete your Ph.D.?

8 A Yes. I'll look for a post-doc because I think without a
9 post-doc it's not possible to get a permanent position as a,
10 you know, faculty in academia, and so I'm looking for jobs in
11 academia.

12 Q You're looking for jobs in?

13 An Academia.

14 Q Okay. But you'll need a post-doc along the way it sounds
15 like?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Okay. So, if you're in the second -- if you finished your
18 second year, when -- you were admitted to Penn's program in
19 2015?

20 A Yes. Yes, Fall 2015.

21 Q Okay. And when you were admitted, did you receive a
22 letter telling you that you were admitted?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And did you give me a copy of that letter?

25 A Yes.

1 Q And do you consent to that letter being placed into
2 evidence here?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Okay.

5 (Petitioner's P-85 marked.)

6 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

7 Q Ozan, I've handed you a document that I've marked Union
8 Exhibit 85. Do you recognize that document?

9 A Yes.

10 Q What is it?

11 A It's the admission letter that I got from the University
12 when I was admitted.

13 Q Okay. And that refers -- first of all, the first
14 paragraph tells them -- tells you they're happy to inform you
15 you were -- you're being recommended for admission, right?

16 A Right.

17 Q And then in the second year, it talks about the support
18 that you get through the Biology Graduate Group, right?

19 A Right.

20 Q And that -- in the first sentence that says it's for a
21 minute of five years through various fellowships and/or
22 training grants. And then I'm looking for where it says what
23 it is. Oh, in the third paragraph. So, your -- the support
24 that you receive from Penn includes your tuition?

25 A Right.

- 1 Q And fees?
- 2 A Right.
- 3 Q And health insurance?
- 4 A Right.
- 5 Q And you get a living stipend?
- 6 A True.
- 7 Q And that's for a minimum of five years, right?
- 8 A Right.
- 9 Q Okay. And then in one-, two-, three-, four-, the fourth
10 paragraph it talks about first year students.
- 11 A Um-hum.
- 12 Q And in the -- it talks about course -- there being a
13 minimum of seven courses, and then in the second sentence says,
14 "In addition, students do a minimum of three lab rotations
15 during the 2015-16 academic year." That was your first
16 academic year, right?
- 17 A Right.
- 18 Q Did you do courses plus three lab rotations in your first
19 year?
- 20 A Yes, I --
- 21 Q Plus a minimum of three lab rotations in your first year?
- 22 A Yes, I did, but not seven courses.
- 23 Q Okay. How many courses did you take?
- 24 A I think six, because I left one to second year.
- 25 Q Okay.

1 MS. ROSENBERGER: I move for the admission of Union
2 Exhibit 85.

3 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 85 is received.

5 (Petitioner's P-85 received.)

6 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

7 Q And in the biology program, is your funding -- we've heard
8 today, you may have heard witnesses talk about funding being
9 for only part of the -- only for the academic year, or in sort
10 of two separate pieces. Is the biology program funding that
11 you get 12 months a year or part of the year?

12 A So, in biology it's 12 months a year.

13 Q Okay.

14 A That -- that is if you're funding by just Biology
15 Department, not out -- so outside funding.

16 Q Okay. And have you obtained outside funding?

17 A No.

18 Q So, you're funded just by the Biology Department?

19 A Um-hum.

20 Q Okay. Do you have any idea -- well, withdrawn.

21 So, you are -- let's talk about your first year. You said
22 you took six courses in your first year, and then you did lab
23 rotations, right?

24 A Right.

25 Q And then the -- that Union Exhibit 85 says in the last

1 sentence of the second paragraph, "Satisfactory progress
2 includes the student's acceptance into a laboratory where
3 he/she will conduct thesis research by the beginning of the
4 second year." Do you see that?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Did you -- were you accepted into a lab where you conduct
7 thesis research?

8 A That was at the beginning of second year.

9 Q Um-hum.

10 A But not through the first three rotations. I did another
11 rotation, which was around a month-long, then I started my, you
12 know, lab work in the -- get accepted to a lab and work --
13 start working there.

14 Q Okay. And do you have -- at this stage in your career at
15 Penn, in your program, do you have an expectation of when your
16 dissertation will be completed? Or is it, sort of, too early
17 to tell?

18 A It's -- it's kind of early, but I can sense that it will
19 be around six years.

20 Q And what -- what is your basis for that sense?

21 A So, because of the nature of my experiments, if I want to
22 collect enough data to come up with a strong dissertation, I
23 need to collect data for at least three years. And the last
24 year will be all about writing and all that stuff, so it will
25 take around six years.

1 Q Okay. So, when you received the acceptance letter that is
2 Union Exhibit 85, you said you started the program in the fall
3 of 2015, right?

4 A Right.

5 Q Is that when you arrived? Or did you have additional
6 requirements?

7 A So, yes, I did -- I did have additional requirements,
8 since I'm an international student, I was required to complete
9 a teaching course in English. So, for that course, I arrived
10 here at the end of June. I believe it was 21st of June, 2015.

11 Q Okay. And that course lasted how long, approximately?

12 A Six weeks.

13 Q Okay. And so, you finished up a little before you had to
14 start the fall semester in your doctoral program?

15 A Yeah. But then the orientation program starts, by the
16 way, and it's like, you know --

17 Q Okay. And that's something, you said because you're an
18 international student you had to do that. Is that something
19 that's required of all international students?

20 A All international in SAS. But I don't know about the
21 others.

22 Q Okay. And "SAS" is the School of Arts & Sciences?

23 A Right.

24 Q So, the -- let's talk about the lab that you have been
25 accepted in -- were accepted into. Is there a particular

1 faculty member who is in charge of that lab?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Who's that?

4 A Dr. Paul Schmidt.

5 Q Okay. And then are there other people besides you and Dr.
6 Schmidt who work in the lab?

7 A Yes, there are. So, our lab consists of two post-docs,
8 one graduate student, it's me, and for now there are four
9 undergraduate student workers.

10 Q Okay. So, you're the only graduate student in the lab?

11 A Yes.

12 Q We've heard some testimony about what a post-doc is
13 already in this case. The undergraduate students in the lab,
14 are they studying at Penn? Or are they employed in the lab?

15 A So, they're -- three of them are study -- studying at
16 Penn, but they're also employed in the lab.

17 Q Okay.

18 A Because we are paying their salaries on a hourly basis.
19 You know, they have to -- they have to fill their time sheets
20 and all that stuff.

21 Oh, I forgot to tell. And we have a lab technician in the
22 lab.

23 Q And the lab technician, is that an employee of Penn?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Okay.

1 (Petitioner's P-86 marked.)

2 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

3 Q I've handed you a document marked Union Exhibit 86. Do
4 you recognize what that is?

5 A Yes.

6 Q What is it?

7 A That's my PI's website in the -- in that page of Penn.

8 Q Okay. And when you say your "PI," that's?

9 A Principle investigator.

10 Q And that's the gentleman who you mentioned is the head of
11 the lab where you work?

12 A Yes, Paul Schmidt.

13 Q Okay. And he -- on his -- this profile, there's a
14 description -- that's a picture of him, I assume, yes?

15 A Um-hum. Um-hum.

16 Q Okay. And there's a description there below his picture
17 that talks about -- it says, "As a research group, we are
18 broadly interested in the ecological and evolutionary dynamics
19 of populations that experience environmental," I'm not going to
20 read the whole thing, but it goes on to describe the work. Is
21 that -- when he says, "As a research group we are broadly
22 interested in [these things]," is that the group that you just
23 described?

24 A Yes.

25 Q The people who work in his lab?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Okay. Did you -- was you -- was one of your lab rotations
3 with Dr. Schmidt?

4 A Yes, the last one.

5 Q Is that -- that's how you got connected up with him?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Did you know about him before you came to Penn?

8 A No.

9 Q So, you didn't come saying, I want to work with Dr.
10 Schmidt?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Okay.

13 A Yeah, I mean no. I didn't understand.

14 Q Yes, that's correct you didn't come saying that?

15 A Yeah.

16 Q Okay. Got you. Sorry; that was a poorly asked question.

17 MS. ROSENBERGER: I would move for the admission of Union
18 Exhibit 86.

19 MR. FRYMAN: No objection.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Union 86 is received.

21 (Petitioner's P-86 received.)

22 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

23 Q Okay. So, in Dr. Schmidt's lab, what is the -- can you
24 describe what the work is that you do there?

25 A So, if I describe the work I do there, it will describe

1 the work anyone does in the lab, because we share the work. We
2 do the work together. We do the research together because it's
3 the nature of our work. This is -- this should be really
4 collaborative, because the things we are doing are labor
5 intensive. So, we are trying to integrate all the questions as
6 much as possible.

7 So, what I do is, so there are different levels of things
8 I'm doing in the lab. The -- let's start with field. So, we
9 go and collect flies from the field.

10 Q You said the flies that I would call a fruit fly?

11 A Yeah, fruit flies. We go and collect fruit flies from the
12 field. These collections are done with mostly living --
13 leaving traps with baits inside. And leaving them overnight
14 and getting them. The collection sites around Philadelphia
15 areas is Solebury Orchards, which is in North, and Indian
16 Orchards, which is like 30 minutes South. And there is Lohr's
17 Orchard in Maryland, which is like one and a half hours South.
18 And we also collect samples from Maine, Massachusetts,
19 Virginia, and Florida.

20 Q Okay.

21 A So, yeah.

22 Q So, let me ask you about that field work first, before you
23 go on to the next element of your work. So, when you say "we
24 collect this," do you, yourself, go -- you, the graduate
25 student in the lab, go and collect flies from these traps?

1 A Yes.

2 Q So, you have traveled to do this?

3 A Yes. I -- I went to Florida in December. And now I
4 started collecting flies from this Philadelphia area, so I'm
5 constantly traveling to these orchards and making -- now making
6 some assessments about where are the flies and all that stuff.
7 Then I'll -- I'll start collecting them in one or two weeks'
8 time.

9 Q In one or two weeks?

10 A In -- yeah.

11 Q And then is there -- does that happen over a period of
12 time where you collect them through --

13 A Yes.

14 Q -- beyond? I mean, is it a one-time thing?

15 A So, these collections should be done between June and late
16 October. Sometimes November if November is really warm. I --
17 we were collecting from two time points, now we are trying to
18 extend it to three time points. And down in Philadelphia, if
19 you're collecting from one point, one, you know, location, now
20 we're trying to extend it to three. So, and the coordination
21 of this work is on me.

22 Q Is?

23 A Is on me, right.

24 Q Is on you. You're the person who coordinates it?

25 A Um-hum.

1 Q So, you're not the only person who goes out and sets --

2 A No.

3 Q -- the traps and collects them?

4 A Um-hum.

5 Q But you coordinate it?

6 A Yeah.

7 Q And these are -- the specimens that you're collecting, are
8 they just for your research?

9 A No.

10 Q Who -- whose research are they for?

11 A So, these flies -- these -- collection of flies is like
12 building a library. So, when you collect flies, you just --
13 you don't just collect them and make some analysis with them
14 and then just throw them away. You collect those flies, create
15 some living stocks, which are -- which are continuous, and then
16 you collect them and make some, you know, frozen stocks in
17 minus 80. And then you create some stocks to make other kinds
18 of analysis, like ethanol stocks we call them; we put them in
19 ethanol, they're preserved pretty well.

20 So, it's like, you know, we're -- we're creating a whole
21 library out of these. So, they -- this will be for my research
22 and, you know, for everybody's research who are in the lab
23 right now, and who -- who will come to this lab and work in
24 this lab.

25 Q Okay. And the -- so, you talked about that some of them

1 come -- some of those specimens come back and they get
2 preserved, whether frozen or put in ethanol or what have you.
3 Do you also keep some live?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Keep livestock essentially?

6 A Yeah.

7 Q So, when you bring them in from the field, after you've
8 been out in the field, bring the specimens back, what happens
9 to them in the lab? What do you do with them in the lab? I
10 mean, to build this library.

11 A So, when we bring them, it's -- so, that -- that part is
12 also kind of labor intensive, because we have to find if
13 they're from the right species. And the species we're looking
14 for is really close to another species, we -- where we cannot
15 discriminate them looking at their females, because the females
16 are like completely cryptic. So, you have to take a female,
17 which is mated with some males, and put them in a -- in a vile
18 with food inside, then she'll lay eggs. When the eggs hatch
19 and then it grows, you get the males and look at the males
20 that -- to make the, you know, identification of the species.

21 Q Okay.

22 A So, yeah, this is -- but before that, we have to
23 quarantine the flies because they also bring mites to the lab
24 which are really dangerous for our work.

25 Q Okay. So, you're keeping the flies safe, alive, fed it it

1 sounds like?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And you're breeding them?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Okay. And is that for them to be then used in your
6 research?

7 A Not just mine, but yes.

8 Q Who else's?

9 A The post-docs, you know, and Paul, my PI.

10 Q Okay. Okay, so you have your duties related to building
11 this library of flies for the research. Are there other duties
12 that you do in -- for the lab?

13 A So, it's -- the -- this was the field part.

14 Q Um-hum.

15 A So, we have an experimental orchard in Penn Novation
16 Center.

17 Q And where's the Penn Novation Center?

18 A Penn Novation Center is on Grays Ferry Avenue, really
19 close to campus. I don't know the exact address.

20 Q Um-hum.

21 A It's like 20 minutes' walk, 2 minutes' drive.

22 Q It's part -- but it's -- the University of Pennsylvania's
23 facility?

24 A Yes. Yes.

25 Q Okay.

1 A Right.

2 Q So, you have an experimental orchard there you said?

3 A Yes. The experimental orchard consists of planted trees,
4 and on those planted trees we have some fine mesh cages to keep
5 the flies inside those cages. But the flies, which are used in
6 those cages, are coming from different places we collect.

7 Q So, you're taking the specimens that you've brought into
8 the lab, introducing them into --

9 A Yes.

10 Q -- the --

11 A Yes.

12 Q -- into the cage?

13 A Right. But before that, we -- I told before, we
14 separate -- separate all the lines.

15 Q Right.

16 A We have to build a population out of those lines first.
17 It's, you know, it's another level of work for -- you know,
18 that is for once a year, but it's kind of, you know --

19 Q What is for once a year?

20 A The -- we're building the populations for releasing into
21 the cages.

22 Q Okay. And so, do you work on building these cages?

23 A So, this specialty is now complete.

24 Q Okay.

25 A But it was not complete in the -- on February. So, we --

1 we started to build that around March, again, and we completed
2 to -- we completed all the cages, which is 54 now, and it was
3 like 30-something when we started to, you know, expand the
4 number of cages.

5 Q When you say, "We built the cages," who's that?

6 A It was Paul, me, and one of the post-doc's.

7 Q Okay. And again, are these -- these are cages around the
8 fruit trees?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And are these cages around fruit trees that are just for
11 your research?

12 A No.

13 Q Some of them will be used for your research, presumably?

14 A Yes. I -- 12 of them will be used for -- for my research.
15 And the others are used for the other people's research.

16 Q And you said there are 50?

17 A Fifty-four.

18 Q Okay. Does the work that you do with Dr. Schmidt's lab
19 also involve collecting data?

20 A Of course. So, collecting data is one part, and that's
21 also -- we collaborate to, you know, organize in a really nice
22 way to do it, because sometimes we -- it requires a sleepless
23 night or one -- one person to, you know -- the phenotyping
24 requires killing the flies.

25 Q What is phenotyping?

1 A Phenotyping is looking at their traits, let's say. Let's
2 say, we -- we starve them for -- like until they die.

3 Q Okay.

4 A So, when you starve the flies, you have to check them
5 regularly, half -- you know, like half an hour.

6 Q Um-hum.

7 A In half an hour periods to see how many of the flies are
8 dead inside the vial. So, it's -- to do that, and it takes
9 like sometimes 36 hours to -- for all of them to die. So, what
10 we do is one -- one night one person, you know, stays up, and
11 the other night the other person stays up.

12 Q And you used a term for when you're doing that, that's --
13 you said "phenotyping."

14 A Phenotyping.

15 Q What is that?

16 A Phenotyping is finding the -- taking data of the phenotype
17 of the flies. Phenotype is the trait we can observe.

18 Q Okay. And when you do that to get this information about
19 the flies, is that -- you said different people do that, sort
20 of, hanging around to see how -- whether -- to do the checking
21 on them. Is that all for the people who are doing that
22 research? Or is that to generate data for other people's
23 research?

24 A So, we generate the data together, again, because we're --
25 you know, our questions are integrated to each other's. So, we

1 generate the data together. And then we, you know, we put them
2 in our server, and everybody has -- can reach that data to, you
3 know, make some other -- you know, they can ask other
4 questions, as well with the available data, which is what we
5 are doing right at the moment, as well.

6 Q So, when you say you put them on your server, that's the
7 computer?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Okay. So, that data is there for anyone in the lab to
10 use?

11 A Um-hum.

12 Q You need to say "yes" or "no" for the court reporter.

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay. And is that true with regard to -- I mean, that's
15 one example, phenotyping is one example of some of the data
16 that you collect.

17 A Um-hum.

18 Q But there's other similar processes that you go through to
19 collect other data?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Okay. And the same, it gets put into the server?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And shared with anyone in the group?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And is it there for those who come after you to use?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Now that you've built the cages around all of the trees in
3 the experimental orchard, will you begin conducting experiments
4 there?

5 A Yes. In -- I think by the end of next week, I should be
6 ready. But you will never know when you're doing experiments
7 because sometimes -- sometimes something goes wrong. I -- I
8 was planning to start by the -- by 15th, but I had to, you
9 know, postpone it because my Florida flies didn't -- which
10 means they didn't, you know, they're not -- there weren't
11 enough adult flies in the cages on building for Florida.

12 Q Okay. You said you were hoping to start, did you say on
13 5/15?

14 A What?

15 Q You said you were hoping to start, I thought you said on
16 5/15?

17 A No, 6/15.

18 Q Oh, June 15th?

19 A Yeah.

20 Q Okay. So, when you're working with -- I gather, when
21 you're working with natural living things sometimes things
22 don't go --

23 A Yeah.

24 Q -- in a predictable fashion?

25 A Yeah.

- 1 Q Okay. Is your work in the lab funded by any external
2 grant?
- 3 A So, what part?
- 4 Q I'm sorry?
- 5 A What part?
- 6 Q Is any part of your work funded by an external grant?
- 7 A It's -- what do you mean by "external"?
- 8 Q Is any of your work at the lab funded by one of your PI's
9 grants?
- 10 A Yes. All of it.
- 11 Q All of it?
- 12 A Yeah, because you know, I'm doing my experiments on my
13 PI's grant.
- 14 Q Okay. And the work -- is all of the work in the lab being
15 done on the PI's grant?
- 16 A Right.
- 17 Q Okay.
- 18 A But -- but on the record, I -- I got an award for the
19 summer, so I will have \$1800 to, you know, use for my research.
- 20 Q You got a got a research grant for this summer?
- 21 A For this summer, yes.
- 22 Q Okay. That's in -- above and beyond your PI's funding?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q Is it above and beyond your stipend?
- 25 A Yes.

- 1 Q Okay. Did you get that from Penn?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Okay. I want to switch gears a little bit and talk with
4 you about in your offer letter that was Union Exhibit 85, it
5 says in the one-, two-, three-, four-, five, fifth paragraph,
6 "For at least two semesters during their second year at Penn,
7 graduate students must work as teaching assistants to fill the
8 teaching requirement of the program." Did you work as a
9 teaching assistant in your two semesters in your second year?
- 10 A Yes, I did.
- 11 Q Okay. So, let's talk first about the fall semester of
12 your second year.
- 13 A Sure.
- 14 Q What did you do as a -- what was your position as a
15 teaching assistant in the fall?
- 16 A So, you know, I -- what do you mean "position"?
- 17 Q What class did you -- what class were you assigned to?
- 18 A Oh, okay. So, I was assigned to Biology 101. It's a
19 service course with -- I think it was around 300 students.
- 20 Q It's like an introductory freshman --
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q -- like, just like it sounds, 101?
- 23 A Yeah.
- 24 Q Okay. How many TAs were there besides you in that class?
- 25 A Six or seven. I'm not really sure.

1 Q Okay. And how many instructors?

2 A Two.

3 Q And those two instructors were faculty members?

4 A Correct.

5 Q From the Biology Department?

6 A Correct.

7 Q And were all of the TAs graduate students like you?

8 A No. So, I know three of them were graduate students like
9 me. I'm not sure about the others. And the head TA is a, you
10 know, is an employee of the University.

11 Q So, not a graduate student, an employee?

12 A Yeah. Yeah.

13 Q Okay. And what were your responsibilities as a teaching
14 assistant for Biology 101 in the fall?

15 A So, Biology 101, they -- you know, they normally give you
16 two sections for labs. In the labs, we did the background of
17 the topic, you know, what -- let's say, there's an experiment,
18 and there's a related topic, so we have to prepare the related
19 background on the topic and present that to the students.

20 And then, there were quizzes we had -- we had to grade and
21 we -- we were preparing those quizzes on a weekly basis. So,
22 the -- since there are like many sections, we wanted to keep it
23 fair for all students, so one week's -- quizzes was prepared by
24 just one TA. So, on average people got, you know, had to
25 prepare two sets of quizzes for all sections.

1 Q Okay.

2 A And we were grading the exams. And exam grading was,
3 again, for consistency were done on the basis -- on like, one
4 student would grade a -- you know, a set of questions, and the
5 other would do the other set of questions for all the papers.

6 Q So, let me just stop you there to make sure I'm following
7 you. You're -- first of all, how many exams were there through
8 the semester?

9 A Two midterms and the final exam.

10 Q And on the quizzes, you said they happened how often?

11 A Every week.

12 Q Okay. And the quizzes, were they administered in the lab
13 section?

14 A Yes.

15 Q So, you divided them up and you might write two weeks'
16 worth of quizzes, right?

17 A Um-hum.

18 Q You need to say "yes" or "no."

19 A Yes. Sorry.

20 Q That's okay. And the other TAs would each write a couple
21 weeks' worth of quizzes?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And the week that your quiz was administered, everybody in
24 all the sections took your quiz?

25 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And then on the exams -- who wrote the exams, first
2 of all?

3 A The instructors wrote the exams.

4 Q And but you were involved in grading them?

5 A Yes. Correct.

6 Q And rather than splitting up the writing of the exam that
7 was done by the instructors, you split up the grading of the
8 exam?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And so you would be -- if it was an exam with say, I don't
11 know how many questions, maybe 50 questions, right?

12 A Right.

13 Q You would get maybe half a dozen of the questions would be
14 your responsibility to grade?

15 A So, the exam structure was multiple questions, multiple
16 choice questions to -- you know, fill in the blanks, you know,
17 short essays, essays, everything. So, the head TA was trying
18 to make it fair between the TAs, so if somebody's grading the
19 multiple-choice questions, they were grading all
20 multiple-choice questions.

21 Q I see.

22 A And if somebody was grading the essay questions, they were
23 grading just one because it's longer, and you know, if you --
24 we were grading 300, you know, student papers, it's -- it takes
25 a long time.

1 Q Okay. Was there any coordination on -- I understand that
2 you said to keep it fair you were having the same person grade,
3 say, Question 6, but was there any coordination with the
4 instructors, particularly with regard to the, you know, essay
5 or short answer type questions where they're not just, you
6 know, check the right letter? Was there coordination on making
7 sure that you were -- on how you would grade that?

8 A So, the coordination was made by head TA. We had weekly
9 meetings.

10 Q Um-hum.

11 A So, head TA was coordinating everything about those kind
12 of things. And the keys were ready. You know, they were
13 prepared by head TA, I think.

14 Q The answer key?

15 A Yeah, answer keys. So, we were grading according to
16 answer key.

17 Q Okay. And so, you said you had the lab section. You said
18 you had two lab sections?

19 A Yes.

20 Q How many students in each lab section?

21 A I think it should be around 21.

22 Q Okay. And when you were -- when you had a particular lab
23 section, were you the -- the instructor that was in the room
24 with those students? Or was there someone else?

25 A I was alone.

- 1 Q You were alone?
- 2 A Yeah.
- 3 Q Okay. Did you have to attend the lecture classes?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q Did you do guest lectures?
- 6 A No.
- 7 Q You just did the labs and the grading?
- 8 A Um-hum.
- 9 Q And writing quizzes?
- 10 A Um-hum.
- 11 Q That's a "yes"?
- 12 A Yes. Sorry.
- 13 Q Did you have regular meetings with the instructors?
- 14 A Yes. The instructors attending the weekly meetings of
- 15 lab.
- 16 Q Okay. Did you get evaluated when you were a TA for that
- 17 class?
- 18 A By students? Yes.
- 19 Q Okay. The normal, sort of, online student evaluation?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q We've heard some testimony today about a student
- 22 evaluation that that has to be completed for the student to see
- 23 their grades.
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q Is that the one you're referring to?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Okay. Any other evaluation by the head TA or the
3 instructors or anything?
- 4 A No.
- 5 Q Okay. Then you TA'd for another course in the spring?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q What was that class?
- 8 A Evolution.
- 9 Q And was that another undergraduate course?
- 10 A Yes, that's an undergraduate course.
- 11 Q And how many students in that class?
- 12 A It started with 125 students, and then it decreased to
13 113, I think, but I'm not sure about the real numbers. But it
14 was --
- 15 Q Somewhere in that vicinity?
- 16 A Yeah.
- 17 Q Okay. Some people dropped out of the class?
- 18 A Um-hum.
- 19 Q That's a "yes"?
- 20 A Yes. And also, we required some of the students to drop
21 the course because they wouldn't have succeeded.
- 22 Q They were what?
- 23 A They -- they would fail if they would continue.
- 24 Q Oh, okay. Okay. So, what was your -- how many -- I'm
25 sorry; how many teaching assistants were there in Evolution?

1 A Two.

2 Q So, you and one other person?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And was that person a graduate student?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And what were your responsibilities in connection with
7 that class?

8 A This class had a recitation, but this -- this recitation
9 is not problem solving or covering the material, you know, for,
10 you know, which is covered in the course. This was more like
11 making the students familiar with the relevant literature about
12 the topics we are covering in the lecture.

13 Q Okay.

14 A So, for that recitation, the instructor told -- gave us a
15 previous, you know, syllabus from the -- from the class, and he
16 said, you know, this is what -- what they did in the past.
17 But, you know, you can design your own class together. I'm
18 okay with that. So, we decided to design the class together
19 with the other TA.

20 Q Okay.

21 A So, we created this syllabus. We chose the relevant
22 papers with him. And then during the class, we were meeting
23 with the students in office hours. We were trying to make
24 us -- you know, ourselves available for most of the time for
25 the students because it was a hard course for the students to

1 get used to because it's a conceptual class.

2 So, we prepared exam questions relevant to the recitation
3 part of the course. We graded the exams. There was a term
4 paper, but we didn't grade that. But we helped the students
5 developing their ideas when writing this --

6 Q For writing their term papers?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And the exams that you graded, was it the similar process
9 where you split up the questions?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Did you say -- oh, and you said you wrote exam questions
12 from the recitations?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And did you lecture in the recitation sections?

15 A So, this is not an active kind of lecturing, because we
16 decided the students to present the material that they will,
17 you know --

18 So, when you assign students to read papers, most of the
19 times they don't read. So, we -- we just wanted to make sure
20 that they read, you know, at least two papers throughout the
21 semester in detail. So, we -- we were meeting with the
22 students twice to ensure that they're presenting the right
23 material. And then when they are presenting, we were just
24 helping them out to -- we'll walk through the, you know, right
25 path to, you know, come to right conclusions about those

1 papers. So, it's not really active lecturing, but it requires
2 kind of, you know, a little bit more work to do this kind of
3 thing because I -- I was meeting with every group and hour
4 every time. So, it -- it makes two hours per group. And there
5 were three sections. And then I go and attend the recitation.
6 It's just, you know, it's a lot of time, but you know, it --
7 it's worth it. So, yeah.

8 Q So, these were groups of students who would present a
9 particular paper --

10 A Paper.

11 Q -- or set of papers in one particular recitation section?

12 A Yes.

13 Q So, you were helping them prepare their presentation?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Did you also do presentation -- I mean, did that start off
16 right in Week 1 that they were doing those presentations?

17 Or --

18 A No, we -- we presented the first two weeks. The first two
19 weeks, we were reading Origin of Species by Darwin, so, and we
20 are -- it's a hard read, so we just wanted to walk them through
21 that.

22 Q Okay. And when you say "we were doing that," you were --
23 were both of the TAs in the room at the same time?

24 A No. We -- we were, you know, separate. I -- I had three
25 of the recitation sections, and the other TA had two.

1 Q Okay. And you were -- but you were coordinating what you
2 were doing?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Did you also meet -- was this -- did this course have one
5 instructor or more than one instructor?

6 A One instructor.

7 Q And did you meet and coordinate with the instructor, as
8 well?

9 A So, the instructor is my PI, Paul Schmidt.

10 Q Okay.

11 A We didn't meet with him in a weekly basis, but I was
12 seeing him all the time, so we were exchanging our opinions
13 about the course and the students, you know.

14 Q Okay. Did you get student evaluations for that class, as
15 well?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And for either or both of your classes that you TA'd, did
18 you get any other form of evaluation from the instructors or
19 anyone else?

20 A No.

21 Q Okay. So, you've now completed the TA requirement for the
22 biology program?

23 A Correct.

24 Q Do you have any plans for doing any further TA'ing?

25 A Yes, I do.

1 Q What's your plan?

2 A So, I'll continue TA'ing at least for another two years,
3 that is four semesters.

4 Q Why is that?

5 A So, this -- this is about my military service requirement
6 in Turkey. So, if you work as, you know, work in a role for
7 three years, then you are not required to have a military
8 service, you can just pay, you know, small amount of money --

9 MR. FRYMAN: I object to this.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: I'm just -- it's just to --

11 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I think he's just explaining --

12 MS. ROSENBERGER: -- explain why he's --

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- why he's teaching, so I will
14 allow that.

15 THE WITNESS: So, yeah, that -- that is why.

16 MS. ROSENBERGER: Okay.

17 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

18 Q So, it's for your own personal reasons?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And is that something that you had to -- did you have to
21 coordinate that with your PI, that you would take the time to
22 do that?

23 A So, when I first talked to Paul about working in his lab
24 as a grad student, he said he doesn't have salary line, but
25 I --

1 Q A "salary line"?

2 A Yes. A salary line for a grad student. And I -- I told
3 him I can TA, because here is -- here are my reasons.

4 Q Um-hum.

5 A And he was like, then it's good because, you know, this is
6 a win/win situation for both of us.

7 Q So, he doesn't have to -- because he doesn't have a salary
8 line, he doesn't have to fund your time for that part?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Have you published any scholarly articles yet?

11 A No.

12 Q In your work in the lab, are -- is every -- well, you're
13 the only other graduate student there, right? Was that --
14 were -- have you only been the only graduate student there?

15 A No.

16 Q Was there a graduate student there last year?

17 A Yes.

18 Q And is that person -- from what program?

19 A Biology.

20 Q Okay. And the other teaching assistants that you worked
21 with when you were a TA, do they know whether they were from
22 biology or some other program? Or --

23 A So, in Biology 101, I think there were people from
24 other -- other programs, but I don't know where they're from.

25 Q Okay.

1 A Because I know -- I know the people in my department.
2 They were not from our department.

3 Q Okay.

4 A So, but -- but the -- for the Evolution class, the other
5 TA is a grad student. He --

6 Q From biology?

7 A From biology. He finished his third year, he will be
8 fourth year next year.

9 Q Okay.

10 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all the questions I have for you
11 on direct exam. Now, we'll take a break like we talked about.

12 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, we can go off the record.

14 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: On the record.

16 Okay, so now the Employer will explain the document that
17 they would like to present.

18 MR. FRYMAN: Thank you. We would just like to introduce
19 Mr. Kiratli --

20 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

21 MR. FRYMAN: Am I saying that correctly?

22 THE WITNESS: It doesn't matter. That -- that's always
23 not -- you know, that's how it's in English, so I don't care.

24 MR. FRYMAN: Or Ozan. I --

25 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Sure.

1 MR. FRYMAN: Okay. That's the document I would like to
2 introduce.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Again, it's a transcript?

4 MR. FRYMAN: Yes.

5 MS. ROSENBERGER: The Union doesn't have an objection on
6 relevance grounds or anything.

7 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. So, you can -- would you
8 like an opportunity to review the document before its
9 presented? Or if no, you can just say you don't object to it
10 being presented.

11 THE WITNESS: I don't object.

12 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay.

13 CROSS-EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. FRYMAN:

15 Q Good afternoon, Ozan. Now, on direct examination, Ms.
16 Rosenberger showed you a copy of U-85, that was your admission
17 letter?

18 A Correct.

19 Q And you talked about how you had started down the road of
20 a masters in Turkey; correct?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And that you then completed that at Penn; is that right?

23 A Correct.

24 Q But you weren't admitted into a master's program, you were
25 admitted into the Ph.D. program; correct?

1 A From? I was admitted in both master's program in Turkey
2 and the Ph.D. program here.

3 Q Understand. I'm focused now just on Penn. With respect
4 to the program to which you were admitted at Penn --

5 A Okay.

6 Q -- that was a Ph.D. program, right?

7 A Correct.

8 Q Consistent with U-85, your -- your letter that you
9 received from Dr. Lampsen?

10 A Yes. Correct.

11 Q Okay. And you were awarded a master's degree after
12 completing a certain amount of coursework?

13 A Here?

14 Q Yeah.

15 A Here at Penn? I don't know. I -- if there is that
16 procedure, I'm not aware of it.

17 Q So, in fact, you're really at Penn seeking a Ph.D. degree;
18 correct?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And as far as you're aware, you have not been awarded a
21 master's from Penn?

22 A Correct.

23 Q Now, looking at U-85, that makes reference in the first
24 paragraph to -- that you will receive official notification of
25 your acceptance from the associate dean for graduate studies

1 shortly. Do you see that?

2 A Yes. Correct.

3 Q Okay. And I would like to show you what the Union marked
4 previously as Union 12. And you don't have to dig it out, I'll
5 just put it in front of you for a moment.

6 And that was a letter that was introduced more for
7 purposes of a -- a sample or a form of a letter -- of a letter
8 to a Ph.D. student in biology. Does this look like -- well,
9 let me first ask you, did you receive the official notification
10 that was referenced in U-85 at some point?

11 A So, I'm not sure. I went on my records, my email, but I
12 couldn't find. So, I -- if I received I and I deleted it
13 somehow, I don't know. But I -- I don't remember.

14 Q Okay.

15 A It's -- it's been some while.

16 Q So, you don't recall receiving a letter about your
17 acceptance or the terms of your fellowship or funding package,
18 other than U-85, which you had a record of?

19 A Yes. I don't remember.

20 Q Okay. Fair enough. And you said you checked your email.
21 Would you sometimes receive -- do you sometimes receive
22 notifications from the University of Pennsylvania by email?

23 A Correct.

24 Q And is that how you often receive communications from the
25 University or the Graduate Group?

1 A Correct. But the admission letter comes to my personal
2 email, other than my professional email right here.

3 Q That you got once you enrolled at Penn?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And so, if we're talking about U-85, that came to your
6 personal email?

7 A Correct.

8 Q Okay. Now, turning back to U-85 for a moment, that
9 acceptance letter or notification of -- that you had been
10 accepted, that advised you that you would have a minimum of
11 five years of funding; correct?

12 A Correct.

13 Q And so you knew going in that for at least five years you
14 would be fully funded?

15 A Correct.

16 Q Including those elements that Ms. Rosenberger reviewed
17 with you, the stipend, the tuition, the fees, the costs, the
18 health insurance; correct?

19 A Correct.

20 Q And that would be for 12 months?

21 A Correct. As long as I satisfy the requirements.

22 Q And that would be the requirements of the program?

23 A Correct.

24 Q The academic requirements of the program?

25 A Not just academic requirements. Teaching -- you know,

1 teaching -- teaching is, you know, a requirement which is a
2 work [sic].

3 Q Well, let's talk about that for a moment. Is it your
4 understanding that you could obtain a Ph.D. without satisfying
5 that teaching requirement?

6 A So, it depends where on -- you know, which scale are we
7 looking at. So, if you look at many Ph.D. programs, yes, you
8 do.

9 Q I want to talk about the Penn program.

10 A That's --

11 Q That's the one we're concerned with here.

12 A Yes. Penn --

13 Q And my question to you is, isn't it true that in order to
14 obtain a Ph.D. in biology, you must satisfy a teaching
15 requirement?

16 A Yes. Working as a TA.

17 Q Okay.

18 A Which is -- which is within the fifth paragraph, I guess.

19 Q Fifth?

20 A Yes.

21 Q For at least two semesters during your second year you
22 must work as a teaching assistant to fulfill the teaching
23 requirement of the program; correct?

24 A Correct.

25 Q And what's with this?

1 (Counsel confers.)

2 BY MR. FRYMAN:

3 Q And I mentioned at the outset here, that I wanted to show
4 you your transcript; correct?

5 A Correct.

6 Q What do you understand your transcript from the University
7 of Pennsylvania to reflect?

8 A My academic record.

9 Q I'm sorry?

10 A My academic record.

11 Q Your academic record?

12 A Yeah.

13 Q Okay.

14 (Employer's E-81 marked.)

15 BY MR. FRYMAN:

16 Q E-81, is this a copy of your unofficial transcript at the
17 University of Pennsylvania?

18 A Correct.

19 Q So, this is a copy of your academic record to date;
20 correct?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And it details that you were in the Graduate Arts &
23 Sciences division?

24 A Correct.

25 Q That you're seeking a Ph.D.?

- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q In the Graduate Group of Biology?
- 3 A Correct.
- 4 Q And starting in the fall of 2015, it lists your
5 coursework?
- 6 A Correct.
- 7 Q And it details your coursework, not only through the
8 spring, but that in -- starting this fall you'll be on
9 dissertation status; is that right?
- 10 A Right.
- 11 Q And then it, down toward the bottom, it notes that you
12 pass the qualifications evaluation in January of this year?
- 13 A Correct.
- 14 Q It lists a candidacy exam date of June 5th of this year?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And then on your -- on E-81, your academic record, it sets
17 forth that you satisfied the teaching requirement in the fall
18 of 2016, in the spring 2017; correct?
- 19 A Yes. In the "Comment" section, yes.
- 20 Q Okay. And did you review any materials or websites with
21 respect to the Graduate Group in Biology before you decided to
22 enroll at Penn?
- 23 A Yes, the website.
- 24 Q The website. And did that detail the program
25 requirements?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q That detailed that you would have to complete a certain
3 amount of coursework?
- 4 A Correct.
- 5 Q Take certain examinations?
- 6 A Correct.
- 7 Q That you would have to satisfy a teaching requirement?
- 8 A Correct.
- 9 Q And that you would have to develop, prepare, and defend a
10 dissertation?
- 11 A Correct.
- 12 Q Have you ever reviewed the graduate student handbook for
13 the Biology Graduate Group?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q And -- now, going back to U-85 for a moment, it advises
16 you that for the first year of your program you'll be on a
17 first year, what it calls an educational fellowship; correct?
- 18 A Correct.
- 19 Q And during that time you just take courses?
- 20 A Correct.
- 21 Q And then you rotate through different labs?
- 22 A Correct.
- 23 Q And in fact, you did that?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q And then following that first year, you will either be

1 serving as a teaching assistant or working with an advisor or a
2 PI in a lab?

3 A Wrong.

4 Q What's wrong about that?

5 A So, you have to be -- so, you have to teach during your
6 second year, and you should find a lab in the first semester
7 and start there. And the developing of dissertation topic in
8 the second semester.

9 Q Okay. But --

10 A It's not either, it's both.

11 Q Okay. So, starting with the first semester your second
12 year, you will be working in a lab with a PI for the remainder
13 of those three years of your five-year minimum guarantee
14 funding; correct?

15 A I don't understand what you -- what you're asking.

16 Q You need to identify a lab after you rotate through those
17 labs?

18 A Correct.

19 Q And that's where you're going to with a PI and work to
20 develop your dissertation?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And that starts in your second year; correct?

23 A Correct.

24 Q And you will be engaged in that activity, in that lab,
25 throughout the second year, throughout the third year,

1 throughout the fourth year, throughout the fifth year?

2 A Yes.

3 Q All those years when you know you will receive that
4 funding; correct?

5 A Correct.

6 Q And then in that second year, as well, you'll be
7 satisfying the teaching requirement?

8 A So, the second-year funding is through teaching. And I --
9 I believe they sent us a letter about that, for funding in the
10 second year, it comes through teaching. So, in the -- in the
11 third year and so on, the fund -- the whole funding will come
12 from your PI. And in the second year, I don't know how -- how
13 the things are because they're completely, you know, apart to
14 us, so we don't know.

15 Q So, in -- what you're telling me is, is that the funding
16 that you receive in Year 3 and 4 and 5, the source of that may
17 be different than the source of that funding in Year 2;
18 correct?

19 A Correct.

20 Q But it really, to use your word opaque, it's really
21 neither here nor there because in terms of the money you're
22 receiving, your receiving the stipend -- the same amount of the
23 stipend, although it may increase each year, whether it's Year
24 2, Year 3, Year 4, Year 5, you're getting --

25 A It doesn't increase, but yeah.

1 Q Okay. In your case it hasn't increased because you've
2 only been -- from the first year to the second year it did not
3 increase?

4 A Yeah.

5 Q But your understanding is that it will either stay the
6 same or increase slightly over the next three years?

7 A There is no guarantee.

8 Q There's no guarantee that it will increase?

9 A Yeah. It might decrease. There is no guarantee for that.

10 Q Well, doesn't your letter say that you'll receive a
11 minimum annual stipend of 29,500?

12 A Yes. Now, my stipend is 30,000 and it started like that.
13 It might decrease.

14 Q So, it actually started out higher than what's in your
15 letter?

16 A Yes.

17 Q The letter from a grant or from the University, your
18 understanding is that you're going to get a minimum of 29,500
19 for five years?

20 A Correct.

21 Q And in fact, for the first two years you got 30,000?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And whether you're teaching and doing research, or that
24 you're just doing research, you're going to get that stipend?

25 A Correct.

1 Q And sitting here today, just going into your third year,
2 you can't predict where you will be at the end of Year 5 in
3 terms of your progress; correct?

4 A Correct.

5 Q Now, before you came, you had to take this teaching course
6 in English, right?

7 A After I came here.

8 Q After you came here. And that's because the University
9 has a language proficiency requirement?

10 A Correct.

11 Q And if you don't satisfy that language proficiency, you
12 have to take this course; is that right?

13 A Correct.

14 Q And after rotating through some labs, you settled on Dr.
15 Schmidt's lab?

16 A Correct.

17 Q You talked about it, right?

18 And we took a look at U-86, which was a description of the
19 work in his lab?

20 A Correct.

21 Q And I think as you described it, it's everybody working in
22 that lab is working collaboratively, working together --

23 A Correct.

24 Q -- essentially research you're working on, research Dr.
25 Schmidt's working on, it all is, it's fair to say, intertwined

1 or integrated?

2 A Correct.

3 Q And you mentioned that there are others in the lab who you
4 described as hourly employees?

5 A Yes. Correct.

6 Q Now, you don't receive any hourly pay on top of your
7 stipend for the work you do in the lab; correct?

8 A Correct.

9 Q And whatever hours you work in the lab is unaffected -- or
10 your stipend is unaffected by the number of hours you --

11 A Correct.

12 Q And suffice it to say, the research that's going on in
13 this lab, the research that Dr. Schmidt is conducting dovetails
14 with your particular research interests and the research you're
15 now embarked -- you've now embarked upon for your dissertation?

16 A Yes. Since our research interests are similar, we are
17 working together, yes.

18 Q And you someday hope to join academia to be a professor at
19 a college or university?

20 A In academia, but yeah, I'll continue being in academia,
21 yes.

22 Q And I take it given your field of study, you want to
23 continue to conduct research?

24 A Yes. I will -- I will keep conducting research as well,
25 yes.

1 Q And given the nature of your -- your particular interests,
2 you will need to do that research in some form of a lab?

3 A Yes. Like, now it's the same with the situation right
4 now.

5 Q Yeah. So, you hope to someday be Dr. Schmidt, to be a PI
6 in a lab?

7 A Yes. And I'll keep learning.

8 Q As you're learning now, you'll continue to learn?

9 A Yes. Um-hum.

10 Q And you want to be in the position that Dr. Schmidt is in,
11 that is to provide guidance and mentorship and to develop other
12 young academics?

13 A Yes. Like now I do with the undergrads.

14 Q And you mentioned that you hadn't yet published any
15 papers. Do you seek to publish papers?

16 A Of course.

17 Q Why is that?

18 A Because academia is about publishing papers. You -- you
19 have to show your work to the others. You know, Dr. Schmidt is
20 also trying to publish papers.

21 Q And is your hope that you'll publish papers in
22 collaboration with Dr. Schmidt?

23 A Not just Dr. Schmidt, but with many other people, yes.

24 Q Other professors on the faculty?

25 A Other professors. Other doctors.

1 Q Other faculty in the Department of Biology?

2 A Not just faculty. I'm just, you know, trying to explain.
3 The doctors who are not faculty, as well.

4 Q I understand. But I'm talking about while you're
5 completing your Ph.D. at Penn, will you seek to collaborate
6 with any professors outside the Department of Biology?

7 A Of course.

8 Q Other professors within the School of Arts & Sciences?

9 A Maybe.

10 Q What about the School of Biomedical Graduate Studies?

11 A So, if I start some research on virology on drosophila,
12 why not?

13 Q And what about in the School of Engineering?

14 A If I start developing some methods to track the flies with
15 GPS, why not?

16 Q And to your knowledge, are there any biology graduate
17 students who work in engineering labs?

18 A I -- I don't know if there are. But I know people are
19 collaborating with engineers, yes.

20 Q When you say "people collaborating with engineers," who do
21 you mean?

22 A Biology people.

23 Q And that includes graduate students?

24 A I don't know.

25 Q Are you aware of any students, for example, in

1 bioengineering or biochemistry who participate in the work of
2 biology labs?

3 A I -- I don't know particularly, but it's, you know,
4 they're intertwined so it's possible.

5 Q Okay. Now, you gave us a very interesting and informative
6 lesson on the fruit or vinegar flies and how you go to these
7 orchards. Now have built these cages. And I take it before
8 you came to Penn you didn't have the opportunity to,
9 necessarily to work in a lab situation or have the resources to
10 do this field work or anything like that; is that right?

11 A That is wrong.

12 Q You did --

13 A Because I'm -- I'm coming from, you know, a really, you
14 know, well known institute in Turkey, so my -- you know, if you
15 just go check it, it's like, you know, they call it the Harvard
16 of Turkey. So, yeah.

17 Q But you -- but you weren't just taking courses there, you
18 actually got to engage in some lab and field work in --

19 A Of course.

20 Q Turning back to the experimental orchard, you talked about
21 the building of cages.

22 A Correct.

23 Q And in fact, how the PI, Dr. Schmidt, rolled up his
24 sleeves and was right in there with you and the others building
25 those cages; correct?

1 A Yes. Correct.

2 Q And is that atypical in a biology field work lab
3 situation?

4 A No.

5 Q So, something that you would expect to do with your
6 graduate students some day?

7 A Of course.

8 Q And when you talked about how now working in the lab
9 you're funded by an external grant, again, that funding is
10 simply the -- the source of the money for what was promised to
11 you in that admissions letter; the stipend that was promised in
12 there, correct?

13 A I don't understand your question.

14 Q Okay. Well, when you talked about that now you're --
15 you're funded by this grant, that's just a source for the --
16 the payment of the funding package in U-85, right?

17 A No, wrong.

18 Q What's wrong about that?

19 A That is wrong because that is the source of my research.
20 That funding. You know, they -- the funding that Paul has is
21 the source of my research. But not --

22 Q Okay.

23 A -- not -- not the part of -- you know, I don't know the
24 other parts of, you know, where the monies come from, where
25 it's going because it's -- it's not transferring to us. I

1 don't know.

2 Q Okay. And the grant that you're working on, that's Dr.
3 Schmidt's grant?

4 A Correct.

5 Q Okay. And that particular grant enables you to pursue the
6 research that you're conducting for your dissertation?

7 A Correct.

8 Q And I wanted to ask you a little bit about this, you said
9 that you got an award, an \$1800 award for the summer.

10 A Yes, correct.

11 Q That's for this summer?

12 A Correct.

13 Q And was that a -- your own personal grant?

14 A Correct.

15 Q What's the -- the source here? Is this a federal
16 agency --

17 A No.

18 Q -- where this came from? Or --

19 A So, a previous faculty, I think it was the Lee Peachy, he
20 donated some amount of money to the department, which should be
21 spend on the field research. So, they're opening applications
22 every summer until the money is, you know, completely spent.

23 Q So, did you apply for this award?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And was it a competitive process, do you know? Did others

1 apply for it, as well?

2 A I think there were 12 applicants, if I'm not mistaken, and
3 8 of them got the award.

4 Q And this is simply a cash award, and is it conditioned on
5 your doing anything, other than continuing to do your own
6 research?

7 A It's a cash award just to be spent on the field research.
8 So --

9 Q Research -- research that you would otherwise be doing?

10 A So, but this -- this allows me to -- allowed me to get my
11 own microscope, you know. So, it will make my life easier when
12 I'm in the field.

13 Q I understand that. It allowed you to get your own
14 microscope, but if you wanted to take that \$1800 and go up to
15 New York City for a long weekend, you could have used it for
16 that, too?

17 A No.

18 Q No? There was a stipulation in this award that said it
19 has to be used for your research?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Okay. But within your research how you wish to spend it?

22 A Of course, because I -- I need that money to continue
23 research.

24 Q So, let's talk a little bit about your teaching now you
25 just completed this year. You said you were, for the fall,

- 1 staring with the fall, you were one of six or seven TAs?
- 2 A Correct.
- 3 Q All right. And you were certain that three of the six or
- 4 seven -- I don't know if you included yourself in here --
- 5 A I included myself.
- 6 Q Okay. Were Ph.D. students.
- 7 A Correct.
- 8 Q Within the Biology Graduate Group?
- 9 A Correct.
- 10 Q Okay. And you're not sure about the others?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And so, could they have been graduate students from PGS?
- 13 A Might be, yeah.
- 14 Q Or engineering?
- 15 A You know, this -- this is open to, you know -- they open
- 16 some, you know, applications for this. So, it's possible if
- 17 they -- they have taken the Bio 101 and 102, I think.
- 18 Q And you mentioned that you -- in this course there was a
- 19 head TA.
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q All right. And -- and your understanding was that this
- 22 head TA was what -- what you called an employee?
- 23 A You know, he is an employee, yes.
- 24 Q Okay. Do you know that he's not a graduate student?
- 25 A Of course.

- 1 Q "Of course" being he is not a --
- 2 A He's not --
- 3 Q -- current --
- 4 A -- he's not a graduate student.
- 5 Q All right. And you had weekly with this head TA?
- 6 A You know, head TA and instructors in the room, yes.
- 7 Q Okay. And so, was this -- were these the same meetings?
- 8 Were they separate meetings with the head TA and instructors?
- 9 Or was this -- this was the same meeting?
- 10 A Same meeting.
- 11 Q Okay. So -- and when you say the instructors, that's the
- 12 faculty members who were serving as the primary instructor in
- 13 the course?
- 14 A Correct.
- 15 Q There were two of them, right?
- 16 A Correct.
- 17 Q And were -- these were faculty members in the Department
- 18 of Biology?
- 19 A Correct.
- 20 Q And what would you discuss in these weekly meetings?
- 21 A How we'll conduct the experiments. How we'll walk the
- 22 students through the experiments. How we'll -- what will be
- 23 include [sic] in the introduction, you know, how -- how to --
- 24 they were -- they were just giving us the -- this is -- this is
- 25 the experiment we are conducting, here are the steps, and these

1 are the points to touch and, you know, you can prepare your own
2 introduction according to this.

3 Q After you completed the English -- Teaching in English
4 course, did you receive any teaching training of any type?

5 A So, during the English course, I attended -- we were
6 required to attend some CTL workshops. And then when I was
7 TA'ing, I attended a couple of CTL workshops, as well. But I
8 don't remember what were, you know, they are.

9 Q So, before you commenced your teaching assistantship in
10 the second year, you attended some workshops at the Center for
11 Teaching and Learning?

12 A Yes. But they were required by my teaching program, which
13 is in English. The English Teaching program requires you to
14 attend some CTL workshops.

15 Q Okay. And looking at U-85 again, the letter you received,
16 if you look at the one-, two-, three-, four-, fifth paragraph,
17 the one that talks about teaching.

18 A Um-hum.

19 Q The last sentence of that paragraph says, "The Department
20 of" --

21 A Oh.

22 Q -- "Biology" -- let me finish, please. "Will provide you
23 with training prior to your teaching duties in your second
24 year." Is it your testimony that this -- you were only
25 required to attend CTL workshops because you were an

1 international student with -- that had this proficiency
2 requirement?

3 A I -- I forgot that, yes. We -- we had a two-day, kind of
4 -- two half days or something like, you know, workshop before
5 we started teaching in the second year.

6 Q And that was something in addition to the CTL workshops
7 that you said you were required by the -- by virtue of the
8 English proficiency piece?

9 A Um-hum.

10 Q Is that a "yes"?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And then after you started teaching, you attended yet
13 additional CTL workshops?

14 A Correct.

15 Q And those were just voluntary on your part?

16 A Yes. Correct.

17 Q And why did you attend those workshops?

18 A So, I'm -- I'm an international student working with
19 American students here. I -- so, some of the workshops seemed
20 relevant for my case, so I went and attended those courses --
21 those workshops.

22 Q And if I could ask you, so why is it that they seemed
23 relevant? Why is it that you wanted to attend those particular
24 workshops?

25 A Because I don't want to fail from my, you know, teaching

1 requirement.

2 Q All right. And do you also want to become a better
3 teacher?

4 A Of course.

5 Q Because that's something that you likely will have to do
6 in subsequent positions?

7 A Yes. And it's something I've been doing for all the time.

8 Q And then let's move on to the Spring 2017 TA assignment.
9 That was in the Evolution class, right?

10 A Correct.

11 Q Which is actually even more closely related to your
12 research interest?

13 A Correct.

14 Q And there you had an opportunity to engage with students
15 in this recitation section, right?

16 A Correct.

17 Q And in fact, you even had a hand in designing the
18 structure or the content of that recitation section; correct?

19 A Correct.

20 Q And when you were talking about -- I think what you were
21 talking about, this experience and the recitation where you
22 would be having them present, I think you said something like
23 it takes a lot of time but it's worth it.

24 A Correct.

25 Q Can you explain that?

1 A So, I had -- I had three sections. So, for each section,
2 I need to meet with the group that is presenting twice, which
3 are around an hour meetings, so that adds up to six hours. And
4 then I was, you know, going to the classes, which is like
5 another three hours. And then I go -- I go to, you know, just
6 attend the recitations, it's another three hours. And I -- I
7 was holding office hours, that's -- that was taking like a lot
8 of time. So, it -- it was a lot of time and commitment for a
9 course without, you know, not including any grading at all.
10 And not including any office hours before the exams, because
11 it -- you know, when there was exams, I never had time to work
12 on my own topics. It's like, you know, they are almost 50
13 hours for a week of office hours.

14 Q But why was it worth it?

15 A Because they succeeded.

16 Q And that was -- you were playing a role in helping
17 students become more confident, become more familiar with the
18 material?

19 A Yes.

20 Q You were essentially acting as a mentor to these students?

21 A Yeah.

22 Q And that's something that you hope to continue to do as
23 you proceed in academia?

24 A Yes. Correct.

25 Q You said that you prepared and graded exams, but you did

1 not grade the term paper, it was the -- did the faculty
2 instructor do that?

3 A Yes, because he -- he told us our workload is already too
4 much, so he got some -- some of it and graded those.

5 Q Have you been given a TA assignment for the upcoming
6 academic year?

7 A Not yet.

8 Q And as I understand it, this will be an assignment where
9 you will continue to receive the same funding that you're
10 currently receiving?

11 A I guess so, yeah.

12 MR. FRYMAN: I don't think I moved E-81.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Any objection from the Union?

14 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

15 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay, Employer 81 is received.

16 (Employer's E-81 received.)

17 MR. FRYMAN: That's all the questions I have, thank you.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Does the Union have any?

19 MS. ROSENBERGER: I have a couple of follow-ups. Just a
20 couple.

21 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MS. ROSENBERGER:

23 Q Just so that the record is clear, you have a master's
24 degree?

25 A Yes. Correct.

1 Q And from what institution did you earn your master's
2 degree?

3 A Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey.

4 Q And when did you earn that master's degree?

5 A February 2016.

6 Q So, you got the degree -- and you started at Penn in
7 August of 2015?

8 A Correct.

9 Q So, you got the degree from the University of Ankara after
10 you started at Penn?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Okay. In the class where you had the head TA, did -- was
13 the head TA -- did the head TA have a lab section or sections?

14 A So, when I was TA'ing, yes. But it's not, you know, we
15 don't know it happens all the time or not. Sometimes the head
16 TAs take sections because there's, you know, a lack of other
17 TAs. Or sometimes they don't.

18 Q But when you were TA'ing for Biology 101, the head TA had
19 lab sections?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Just like you?

22 A Yes.

23 MS. ROSENBERGER: That's all I have, thank you.

24 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Anything else from the Employer?

25 MR. FRYMAN: No.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: I just have a couple of follow-up.

2 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

3 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Are you okay?

4 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Yeah, okay. Biology 101 was
6 undergrads, right?

7 THE WITNESS: Yes. Correct.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I think now I've gotten a
9 little bit confused about the sections in Biology 101. You
10 said there were two sections for labs?

11 THE WITNESS: There were two sections, which is -- which I
12 taught.

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Oh, you -- okay. All right. You
14 taught two sections?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And 21 students each?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. You said you received
19 evaluations by students. Did anyone, like anyone either the
20 instructors or head TA ever talk to you about your evaluations?

21 THE WITNESS: No.

22 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. Moving on to the Evolution
23 course, you said you handled three sections. How many students
24 in each section?

25 THE WITNESS: So, they started around 25, but they dropped

1 like 20, 21.

2 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. That's when students
3 dropped the class?

4 THE WITNESS: Yes. Correct.

5 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: In that section, you said you got
6 evaluations. Did anyone talk to you about your evaluations?

7 THE WITNESS: No.

8 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Not the instructor?

9 THE WITNESS: No.

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And the times that you
11 teach, do the instructors oversee your teaching?

12 THE WITNESS: What does that mean?

13 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Who would you say is in charge of
14 your teaching when you're in that role?

15 THE WITNESS: It --

16 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Meaning, if you had a problem, who
17 would be above you?

18 THE WITNESS: So, the -- yeah, the instructor will be
19 above me if I had a problem. Yeah.

20 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. And the -- I should know
21 his name, the -- your advisor --

22 THE WITNESS: Yes.

23 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: -- that's who -- Dr. Schmidt, is
24 over you in the lab?

25 THE WITNESS: Yes. Yes, correct.

1 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. I don't have any other
2 questions. Does the Union have any other questions?

3 MS. ROSENBERGER: No.

4 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Employer?

5 MR. FRYMAN: No.

6 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Okay. You're done. Thank you
7 very much. I appreciate it.

8 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.

9 (Witness excused.)

10 HEARING OFFICER LEACH: Can we go off the record?

11 (Whereupon, at 5:55 p.m., the hearing in the
12 above-entitled matter adjourned.)

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

1

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION FOUR

In the Matter of:

TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA,

Employer,

And

GRADUATE EMPLOYEES TOGETHER-UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA (GET-UP), a/w AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 04-RC-199609

Date: June 29, 2017

Place: Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original transcript thereof for the files of the Board

Official Reporter

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660